

VISUAL AND MATERIAL CULTURE, 1300-1700



Edited by Piers Baker-Bates
and Irene Brooke

Portrait Cultures of the Early Modern Cardinal

Amsterdam
University
Press

Portrait Cultures of the Early Modern Cardinal

Visual and Material Culture, 1300-1700

A forum for innovative research on the role of images and objects in the late medieval and early modern periods, *Visual and Material Culture, 1300-1700* publishes monographs and essay collections that combine rigorous investigation with critical inquiry to present new narratives on a wide range of topics, from traditional arts to seemingly ordinary things. Recognizing the fluidity of images, objects, and ideas, this series fosters cross-cultural as well as multi-disciplinary exploration. We consider proposals from across the spectrum of analytic approaches and methodologies.

Series Editor

Dr. Allison Levy, an art historian, has written and/or edited three scholarly books, and she has been the recipient of numerous grants and awards, from the National Endowment for the Humanities, the American Association of University Women, the Getty Research Institute, the Dumbarton Oaks Research Library of Harvard University, the Whiting Foundation and the Bogliasco Foundation, among others. www.allisonlevy.com.

Portrait Cultures of the Early Modern Cardinal

*Edited by
Piers Baker-Bates and
Irene Brooke*

Amsterdam University Press



Amsterdam
University
Press

This publication has been made possible by a grant from the Scouloudi Foundation in association with the Institute of Historical Research.

Cover illustration: Scipione Pulzone, *Cardinal Ferdinando de' Medici*, 1580, oil on canvas, Art Gallery of South Australia, Adelaide (© Art Gallery of South Australia, Adelaide/Mrs Mary Overton Gift Fund 1998)

Cover design: Coördesign, Leiden

Lay-out: Crius Group, Hulshout

ISBN 978 94 6372 551 4

e-ISBN 978 90 4854 456 1

DOI 10.5117/9789463725514

NUR 685

© The authors / Amsterdam University Press B.V., Amsterdam 2021

All rights reserved. Without limiting the rights under copyright reserved above, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the written permission of both the copyright owner and the author of the book.

Every effort has been made to obtain permission to use all copyrighted illustrations reproduced in this book. Nonetheless, whosoever believes to have rights to this material is advised to contact the publisher.

This book is dedicated to the memory of two people. First, we would like to remember especially Professor Clare Robertson, who was integrally involved in the genesis of this volume and was to have written a preface for it. Much of the scholarship that follows draws on Clare's pioneering work on the cardinalate. Her friendship and scholarly generosity inspired the editors and many of the contributors. Secondly, Piers Brooke would have smiled at the serendipity that brought about this project.

Table of Contents

Illustrations	9
Abbreviations	15
Acknowledgements	17

Introduction: Cardinals and their Images

1. Portraying the Princes of the Church <i>Piers Baker-Bates and Irene Brooke</i>	21
2. The Early Modern Cardinal An Historical Appraisal <i>Miles Pattenden</i>	43

Part I – Individuality and Identity: Florence and Rome

3. Visual and Verbal Portraits of Cardinals in Fifteenth-Century Florence <i>Brian Jeffrey Maxson</i>	69
4. Dead Ringers: Cardinals and their Effigies, 1400–1520 <i>Carol M. Richardson</i>	91

Part II – Divided Loyalties: Venice and Rome

5. The Role of Cardinals' Portraits in Venice: The Case of the Grimani Family and Some Thoughts on the Correr MS Morosini Grimani 270 <i>Sarah Ferrari</i>	117
6. Role Playing: Cardinals in Historical Action in Leandro Bassano's <i>Honorius III Approving the Rule of St. Dominic in 1216</i> and the War of the Interdict <i>Alessandra Pattanaro</i>	149

Part III – Collecting and Display: Portraits and Worldly Goods

7. Renaissance Cardinals and Pontifical Mules 181
Philippa Jackson
8. Portraits as Symbols: Cardinals' Portraits in the Roman and Local
 Collections of Some Counter-Reformation Cardinals 201
Thomas-Leo True
9. Portraits as a Sign of Possession: Cardinals and their Protectorships in
 Early Modern Rome 231
Arnold Witte

Part IV – Post-Tridentine Piety: The Devout Cardinal

10. Group Portraits of Cardinal Bembo and his Friends in the Wake of Trent 261
Irene Brooke
11. Two Cardinal Portraits by Scipione Pulzone in the Harvard Art
 Museums and their Related Versions 285
Danielle Carrabino
12. Miracle-Working Portraits of a Cardinal Saint: Managing the
 Devotional Medals of San Carlo Borromeo 319
Minou Schraven

Conclusion: Cardinal Portraits beyond Italy

13. Portraying the Ideal Spanish Tridentine Prelate 343
Piers Baker-Bates
- Index 371

Illustrations

Colour Plates

- Plate 1 Bastiano di Niccolò, Matteo and Bartolomeo Torelli, historiated initial and border with Angelo Acciaiuoli's portrait from the cardinal's missal, 1402-1405, MS 30, Cambridge, The Fitzwilliam Museum (© The Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge).
- Plate 2 Titian, *Cardinal Pietro Bembo*, c. 1540, oil on canvas, Washington, DC, The National Gallery of Art (© National Gallery of Art, Washington).
- Plate 3 Unknown artist (Palma il Giovane?), *Double Portrait of Cardinals Domenico and Marino Grimani*, late sixteenth century, oil on canvas, Venice, Gallerie dell'Accademia (© Gallerie dell'Accademia di Venezia).
- Plate 4 Raphael, *Meeting of Leo I with Attila*, 1514, fresco, Vatican City, Musei Vaticani (© Scala).
- Plate 5 Leandro Bassano, *Honorius III Approving the Rule of St. Dominic in 1216*, 1607-1608, oil on canvas, Venice, Santi Giovanni e Paolo, Sacristy (© Venice, Fondazione Giorgio Cini—Matteo de Fina).
- Plate 6 Detail of Leandro Bassano, *Honorius III Approving the Rule of St. Dominic in 1216*, 1607-1608 (© Venice, Fondazione Giorgio Cini—Matteo de Fina).
- Plate 7 Cristoforo Roncalli (Pomarancio), *Cardinal Antonio Maria Gallo*, 1616, Loreto, Palazzo Apostolico (© Fondazione Cassa di Risparmio di Loreto)
- Plate 8 Unknown artist, *Portrait of Cardinal Francesco Barberini Senior as Cardinal Protector*, seventeenth century, oil on canvas, Minerva Auctions, May 2017 (© courtesy of Minerva Auctions—Gruppo Finarte).
- Plate 9 Taddeo Zuccaro and workshop, *Investiture of Orazio Farnese as Prefect of Rome by Paul III*, 1562-1563, fresco, Caprarola, Palazzo Farnese (© akg-images; by permission of the Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali e per il Turismo – Palazzo Farnese Caprarola).
- Plate 10 Scipione Pulzone, *Michele Bonelli, called 'Cardinal Alessandro'*, 1586, oil on canvas, Cambridge, MA, Harvard Art Museums/Fogg Museum (© President and Fellows of Harvard College).

- Plate 11 *The Healing of Paola Giustina Casati*, 1610, oil on canvas, Milan, Duomo (© Veneranda Fabbrica del Duomo di Milano).
- Plate 12 El Greco, *Cardinal Fernando Niño de Guevara*, c. 1600, oil on canvas, New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art (© The Metropolitan Museum of Art, H. O. Havemeyer Collection, bequest of Mrs H. O. Havemeyer).

Figures

- Fig. 1.1 Sebastiano del Piombo, *Cardinal Bandinello Sauli, His Secretary, and Two Geographers*, 1516, oil on canvas, Washington, DC, National Gallery of Art (© National Gallery of Art, Washington). 27
- Fig. 1.2 Leonardo Parasole, *Effigies cum insignibus nominibus, cognominibus, patria, titulis et nuncupationes reverendissimorum [...] Cardinalium nunc viventium*, 1593, hand-coloured woodcut, London, The British Museum (© The Trustees of the British Museum). 29
- Fig. 1.3 Francesco Francia, *Cardinal Francesco degli Alidosi*, 1505-1511, bronze, New York, Metropolitan Museum (© Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, Robert Lehmann Collection, 1975). 31
- Fig. 1.4 Gian Lorenzo Bernini, *Cardinal Scipione Borghese*, 1632, marble, Rome, Galleria Borghese (© Galleria Borghese). 34
- Fig. 1.5 Unknown artist, *Cardinal Reginald Pole*, 1540s, oil on canvas, St Petersburg, The State Hermitage Museum (© The State Hermitage Museum, photo by Leonard Kheifets). 35
- Fig. 3.1 Bicci di Lorenzo, *Confirmation of Santa Maria Nuova*, c. 1424-1425 or 1440, detached fresco, Florence, Ospedale di Santa Maria Nuova (© Erich Lessing/Art Resource, NY). 70
- Fig. 3.2 Francesco di Antonio del Chierico, *Arrival of Pope Eugenius IV at Santa Maria del Fiore for its Consecration Ceremony*, c. 1470, illumination, Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, MS Plut. f.1.56, fol. 7v (© Firenze, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, by permission of the Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali e per il Turismo). 71
- Fig. 4.1 View of fifteenth-century cardinals' effigies in the Grotte Vaticane including, first left, Berardo Eruli, second left, Pietro Fonseca, third right, Ardicino della Porta Junior, first right, Ardicino della Porta Senior (© Carol M. Richardson). 94

- Fig. 4.2 Ardicino della Porta Senior, effigy, Grotte Vaticane (© Carol M. Richardson). 100
- Fig. 4.3 Ardicino della Porta Junior, effigy, Grotte Vaticane (© Carol M. Richardson). 100
- Fig. 4.4 Ardicino della Porta Junior, detail of upper part of effigy, Grotte Vaticane (© Carol M. Richardson). 101
- Fig. 4.5 Funerary monument to Cardinal Alain Coetivy, detail, Rome, Santa Prassede (© Conway Library, Courtauld Institute). 107
- Fig. 5.1 Titian and workshop (?), *Girolamo and Cardinal Marco Corner Investing Marco, Abbot of Carrara, with his Benefice*, c. 1525, oil on canvas, Washington, DC, National Gallery of Art (© National Gallery of Art, Washington). 125
- Fig. 5.2 Unknown artist (after Lorenzo Lotto?), *Portrait of Cardinal Domenico Grimani*, 1520s-1540s, oil on canvas, London, Schorr Collection (© Schorr Collection). 127
- Fig. 5.3 Jacopo Tintoretto, *Portrait of Giovanni Grimani, Patriarch of Aquileia*, 1560s, oil on canvas, London, Schorr Collection (© Schorr Collection). 130
- Fig. 5.4 Unknown artist (Baldassarre d'Anna?), *Portrait of Cardinal Domenico Grimani*, c. 1627, pen and ink drawing with wash, MS Morosini Grimani 270, fol. 19, Venice, Biblioteca del Museo Correr (© Biblioteca del Museo Correr). 136
- Fig. 5.5 Unknown artist (Baldassarre d'Anna?), *Recovery of the Christian Standard by Nicolò Grimani*, c. 1627, pen and ink drawing with wash, Venice, Biblioteca del Museo Correr, MS Morosini Grimani 270, fol. 19 (© Biblioteca del Museo Correr). 138
- Fig. 5.6 Unknown artist (Baldassarre d'Anna?), *Pope Urban II adding the Red Cross to the Grimani Coat of Arms*, c. 1627, pen and ink drawing with wash, Venice, Biblioteca del Museo Correr, Ms. Morosini Grimani 270, fol. 44 (© Biblioteca del Museo Correr). 139
- Fig. 5.7 Baldassarre d'Anna (attributed), *Recovery of the Christian Standard by Nicolò Grimani*, 1620s-1630s, oil on canvas, Padua, Convento della Basilica di Sant'Antonio (© Centro Studi Antoniani). 140
- Fig. 5.8 Baldassarre d'Anna (attributed), *Pope Urban II adding the Red Cross to the Grimani Coat of Arms*, 1620s-1630s, oil on canvas, Padua, Convento della Basilica di Sant'Antonio (© Centro Studi Antoniani). 141

- Fig. 6.1 Leandro Bassano, *Portrait of Cardinal Giovanni Dolfin*, 1604, oil on canvas, Padua, Musei Civici (© Padua, Musei Civici—Giuliano Ghiraldini). 158
- Fig. 6.2 Gian Lorenzo Bernini, *Portrait of Agostino Valier*, 1629, marble, Venice, Gallerie dell'Accademia (in deposit at Ca d'Oro) (© Venice, Gallerie dell'Accademia). 160
- Fig. 6.3 Thierry Bellange, *François Cardinal de Joyeuse*, early seventeenth century Pau, Musée National du Château de Pau (© RMN–Grand Palais (Château de Pau)/René-Gabriel Ojéda). 162
- Fig. 6.4 Leandro Bassano, sketch for *Honorius III Approving the Rule of St. Dominic in 1216*, 1607–1608, art market (© Fondazione Federico Zeri). 163
- Fig. 6.5 *Petrus Aldobrandinus* (in *Speculum Romanae Magnificentiae, Effigies cum insignibus, nominibus, cognominibus, patria, titulis et nuncupationes Reverendissimorum Dominorum S.R.E. Cardinalium nunc viventium*) (© The Trustees of the British Museum). 164
- Fig. 6.6 Thierry Bellange, *Jacques Davy du Perron*, early seventeenth century, lead pencil and red chalk with gold highlights on parchment, Pau, Musée National du Château de Pau (© RMN–Grand Palais (Château de Pau)/René-Gabriel Ojéda). 167
- Fig. 6.7 Rubens, *Cardinal Ferdinando Gonzaga*, 1604–1605, oil on canvas, Mamiano di Traversetolo, Collezione Magnani Rocca (© Fondazione Magnani Rocca). 168
- Fig. 6.8 *Carolus Emanuel [...] car. Pius* (in *Speculum Romanae Magnificentiae, Effigies cum insignibus, nominibus, cognominibus, patria, titulis et nuncupationes Reverendissimorum Dominorum S.R.E. Cardinalium nunc viventium*) (© Alamy). 170
- Fig. 6.9 Ottavio Leoni, *Portrait of Cardinal Scipione Borghese*, oil on canvas, Ajaccio, Musée Fesch (© RMN–Grand Palais (Palais Fesch, Musée des Beaux-Arts)). 172
- Fig. 7.1 Pisanello, *Mule*, Paris, Musée du Louvre (© RMN–Grand Palais (Musée du Louvre)/Michèle Bellot). 184
- Fig. 7.2 Detail of Robert Péril, *Cavalcata at the Coronation of Charles V in Bologna*, 1530, woodcut, colourised with handwritten annotations, Antwerp, Plantin Moretus Museum (© akg-images/Erich Lessing). 190
- Fig. 7.3 Detail of Robert Péril, *Cavalcata at the Coronation of Charles V in Bologna*, woodcut, colourised with handwritten annotations, Antwerp, Plantin Moretus Museum (© akg-images/Erich Lessing). 191

- Fig. 7.4 Anonymous Italian School 17th Cent, *Cardinal Francesco Angelo Rapacciolo (d.1657) Fleeing on a Mule, under a shower of Turnips*, 1643, pen and ink, New York, The Morgan Library and Museum (© The Morgan Library and Museum, III, 6g). 195
- Fig. 8.1 Funerary monument to Cardinal Mariano Pierbenedetti, Rome, Santa Maria Maggiore (© Nicholas True). 215
- Fig. 8.2 Funerary monument to Cardinal Francesco Alciati, Rome, Santa Maria degli Angeli e dei Martiri (© Martina Caruso). 216
- Fig. 9.1 Albert Clouet after Carlo Cesio, frontispiece of *Effigies, nomina et cognomina S.D.N. Alexandri papae VII et RR. DD. S.R.E. Cardd. nunc viuentium*, Rome, 1660 (© Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam). 233
- Fig. 9.2 Gérard Audran after Cyro Ferri, frontispiece of *Effigies nomina et cognomina S.D.N. Innocentii PP XI. et RR.DD.S.R.E Cardd. nunc viventium*, Rome, 1667-69 (© Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam). 234
- Fig. 9.3 Cover of a presentation copy of the rules of St Susanna, Fondo Varia 30, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale Vittorio Emanuele II, Rome (© Arnold Witte). 242
- Fig. 9.4 Johann Martin Bernigeroth, *Portrait of Cardinal Vincenzo Gotti*, engraving, London, British Museum (© The Trustees of the British Museum). 245
- Fig. 10.1 Taddeo Zuccaro and workshop, *Paul III Nominating Cardinals*, 1562-1563, fresco, Caprarola, Palazzo Farnese (© by permission of the Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali e per il Turismo – Palazzo Farnese Caprarola). 268
- Fig. 10.2 Danese Cattaneo, portrait medal of Cardinal Pietro Bembo, c. 1547, bronze, Washington, DC, The National Gallery of Art (© National Gallery of Art, Washington). 269
- Fig. 10.3 Taddeo Zuccaro and workshop, *Paul III Receiving Charles V after his Victory at Tunis in 1535*, 1562-1563, fresco, Caprarola, Palazzo Farnese (© by permission of the Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali e per il Turismo – Palazzo Farnese Caprarola). 270
- Fig. 10.4 Danese Cattaneo, *Cardinal Pietro Bembo*, 1547-1548, marble bust, Padua, Basilica of San Antonio (© Giuliano Ghiraldini). 271
- Fig. 10.5 Valerio Zuccato after a design by Titian, *Portrait of Cardinal Pietro Bembo*, 1542, mosaic, Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello (© by permission of the Ministero per i Beni e le Attività Culturali e per il Turismo – Museo Nazionale del Bargello). 273

- Fig. 11.1 Scipione Pulzone, *Portrait of Cardinal Giovanni Ricci*, 1569, oil on canvas, Cambridge, MA, Harvard Art Museums/Fogg Museum (© President and Fellows of Harvard College). 291
- Fig. 11.2 Scipione Pulzone, *Portrait of Cardinal Giovanni Ricci*, oil on panel, Rome, Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica, Palazzo Barberini (© Gallerie Nazionali di Arte Antica–Biblioteca Hertziana Max Planck per la Storia dell'Arte/Enrico Fontolan). 294
- Fig. 11.3 Scipione Pulzone, *Portrait of Cardinal Michele Bonelli (also known as Cardinal Alessandrino)*, 1572, oil on canvas, Gaeta, Museo Diocesano (© Museo Diocesano, Gaeta). 298
- Fig. 11.4 X-radiograph of Fig. 11.3 (© Museo Diocesano, Gaeta). 303
- Fig. 11.5 Scipione Pulzone, *Portrait of Giacomo Savelli*, 1576, oil on canvas, Rome, Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica in Palazzo Corsini (© Gallerie Nazionali di Arte Antica-Biblioteca Hertziana Max Planck per la Storia dell'Arte/Enrico Fontolan). 304
- Fig. 11.6 Scipione Pulzone, *Cardinal Antoine Perrenot de Granvelle*, 1576, oil on copper, London, Courtauld Gallery of Art (© Courtauld Gallery of Art). 306
- Fig. 12.1 Giovanni Antonio de' Rossi (signed), portrait medal of Carlo Borromeo, 1563, silver, Vienna, Münzkabinett (© Vienna, KHM–Museumsverband). 322
- Fig. 12.2 Anonymous portrait medal of Carlo Borromeo, c. 1580, bronze, London, British Museum (© The Trustees of the British Museum). 323
- Fig. 12.3 Fede Galizia, *Portrait of Federico Zuccari*, 1604, oil on canvas, Florence, Gallerie degli Uffizi (© Florence, Gallerie degli Uffizi). 328
- Fig. 12.4 Devotional medal of Carlo Borromeo (Domenico Pellegrini?), silver, Milan, Castello Sforzesco, Gabinetto Numismatico e Medagliere (© Milan, Castello Sforzesco, Gabinetto Numismatico e Medagliere). 329
- Fig. 13.1 Funerary Monument to Cardinal Francisco de Toledo, Rome, Santa Maria Maggiore (© Chris Siwicki). 355
- Fig. 13.2 Giambologna, *Cardinal Rodrigo de Castro Osorio*, Monforte de Lemos, Colegiata de la Antigua (© Piers Baker-Bates). 357
- Fig. 13.3 Unknown artist, *Francisco de Reinoso*, Palencia, Convento de Augustinas Recoletas (© Piers Baker-Bates). 360
- Fig. 13.4 Unknown artist, *Cardinal Francisco de Ávila*, Ávila, Cathedral (© Piers Baker-Bates). 361

Abbreviations

b.	busta
c.	cartella
cap.	caput
col./s.	column/s
n.d.	no date
fasc.	fascicolo/i
fol./s.	folio/s
L&P	Letters and Papers, Foreign and Domestic
MS	manuscript
off.	office
prot.	protocollo
sc.	<i>scudo/i</i>
scr.	scritture
sez.	sezione
AGPPO	Archivio Gallo Pantoli Piletti, Osimo
AGS	Archivo General de Simancas
AMP	Archivio Mediceo del Principato, Florence
APUG	Archivio Storico della Pontificia Università Gregoriana
ASF	Archivio di Stato di Firenze
ASR	Archivio di Stato di Roma
ASS	Archivio di Stato di Siena
ASSC	Archivio di Stato di Macerata, sezione di Camerino
ASV	Archivio di Stato di Venezia
ASVR	Archivio Storico del Vicariato di Roma, Rome
AVCA	Archivum Venerabilis Colleggii Anglorum de Urbe, Rome
BAV	Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana
BL	British Library, London
BMC	Biblioteca del Museo Correr, Venice
BNCVEII	Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale Vittorio Emmanuele II, Rome
L&P	<i>Letters and Papers, Foreign and Domestic, of the Reign of Henry VIII, 1509–1547</i> , ed. John S. Brewer and others, 21 vols. (London, 1862–1932)

Acknowledgements

This project has been several years in the making and the editors are grateful to all the authors for their hard work in seeing it to completion, despite the challenges presented by a global pandemic. The anonymous reader of the original manuscript must be thanked for their careful consideration of and detailed comments on each essay. All of us involved in the project have benefitted over its gestation from conversations with many colleagues who are too numerous to include here. As noted in the dedication a great debt is owed to the late Clare Robertson. Special mention must also be made of Paul Joannides, Guido Rebecchini, and Patricia Lee Rubin, who provided particular support at crucial moments. Last but in no way least, the editors would like to thank Amsterdam University Press for all their hard work and invaluable assistance in helping to complete the volume at a particularly difficult time. Of particular note are the series editor, Allison Levey, and our commissioning editor, Erika Gaffney, whose patience knows no bounds. Finally, we are grateful to the Scouloudi Foundation in association with the Institute of Historical Research whose generous grant enabled the publication of this volume.

Introduction

Cardinals and their Images

1. Portraying the Princes of the Church

Piers Baker-Bates and Irene Brooke

Abstract

This chapter gives a brief overview of the place of cardinal portraits within early modern portraiture as a whole. It explores how certain typologies specific to cardinals evolved in different media over the period. It also considers how these images carried unique meanings and functions that depended on the particular office and duties of the cardinal.

Keywords: cardinals; popes; portraiture; Renaissance; Counter-Reformation

The visual legacy of early modern cardinals constitutes a vast and extremely rich body of artworks – many of superb quality – in a variety of media. Despite the wealth of images of cardinals and the clear relevance of these works to a variety of disciplines, there is no comprehensive study dedicated to the subject of cardinal portraits: existing scholarship consists of a handful of articles and an exhibition, which primarily approach the topic from a formal perspective.¹ The late Clare Robertson, to whom this volume is dedicated, highlighted this in her chapter on the subject in the recent *Companion to the Early Modern Cardinal*, asserting that cardinal portraits form ‘a significant subset’ of early modern portraiture, and noting the limited scholarship on the topic.²

It is the aim of the essays in the present volume to investigate portraits of cardinals as a distinct category within early modern portraiture and as a specific art historical phenomenon. Examining in what ways the production, collection, and status of such portraits were influenced by a set of identities, experiences, values, and interests unique to cardinals as a group, the following

We are indebted to Paul Joannides, Carol M. Richardson, and Patricia Lee Rubin for reading drafts of this essay and providing many helpful comments and corrections.

1 Notably Kempers, ‘Canonical Portrait’, 2001; Tittoni and Petrucci, eds., *La porpora romana*, 2006; Tostmann ‘Sebastiano del Piombos Bildnis’, 2011.

2 Robertson, ‘Portraits of Early Modern Cardinals’, 2020, p. 557.

Baker-Bates, P. and I. Brooke (eds.), *Portrait Cultures of the Early Modern Cardinal*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2021

DOI 10.5117/9789463725514_CH01



Amsterdam
University
Press

essays complement the scholarship on the history of cardinals undertaken in the *Companion* volume. While the chronological parameters of our inquiry are slightly more restricted, running from the accession of Martin V in 1420 until the death of Innocent X in 1655, we also employ the term ‘early modern’ to characterize the period, primarily for its flexibility and convenience.³ In these years, around 675 men from a wide range of socio-economic and geographic backgrounds – although predominantly from the Italian peninsula – passed through the Sacred College. The likenesses of many of them were constructed, either of their own volition or at the request of others; in many cases more than one portrait was executed and in more than one medium. Acknowledging the diversity of such images, the essays in this volume investigate intersections of meaning, function, and visual semantics that arise from the shared historical reality of cardinals in this period.

Inevitably, the methodologies of many authors in this volume draw upon the vast body of art historical literature addressing the topic of portraiture. Despite the subordinate status assigned to the genre by art theorists in the period, portraiture’s fundamental role within the visual arts in early modern Europe has long been recognized, although there remain avenues of inquiry and methods of interpretation that have yet to be pursued. Since Jacob Burckhardt’s influential study of Renaissance culture, interpretations of early modern portraits have often hinged on a perceived reawakening of awareness of the ‘individual’; portraits have been read to reflect a new interest in what Pope-Hennessy termed ‘the cult of the personality’.⁴ Stephen Greenblatt’s seminal study on Renaissance self-fashioning has led to recognition of the crucial role played by portraiture in the construction of identity.⁵ The diverse meanings and functions that portraits could assume – donor, commemorative, propagandistic, exemplary, votive – have been explored by scholars, as has the contemporary rhetoric, based on classical sources and taken up by Alberti, surrounding portraiture’s ostensible function of ‘making the absent present’, together with its qualitative value in being ‘lifelike’.⁶ The role of portraits within early modern collections has also been examined. Paolo Giovio established a model for collecting series of portraits of illustrious men (*uomini famosi*), images

3 Only Arnold Witte’s essay extends beyond this date range.

4 Burckhardt, *Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy*, 1892; see also Pope-Hennessy, *Portrait*, 1966, and Burke, ‘Renaissance, Individualism’, 1995.

5 Greenblatt, *Renaissance Self-Fashioning*, 1984.

6 Several studies and exhibitions in recent decades have investigated many of these same issues. See Brilliant, *Portraiture*, 1991; Woodall, ed., *Portraiture*, 1997; Mann and Syson, *Image of the Individual*, 1998; Cranston, *Poetics of Portraiture*, 2000; Syson, *Renaissance Faces*, 2008; Christiansen and Weppelmann, eds., *Renaissance Portrait*, 2012.

which more often prioritized social roles than accurate likeness.⁷ These became a component not only of princely and noble collections but also of those formed by scholars, merchants, and clerics, including of course cardinals, who also often featured among the worthies on display.⁸

Portraits of cardinals naturally functioned in ways similar to other categories of portraiture. And yet as material objects, cardinal portraits were clearly embedded with meanings specific to the class of individuals represented. On account of their dress, cardinals are in fact among the most recognizable public figures portrayed in the visual arts of the early modern period.⁹ While many representations of cardinals can be identified, countless others remain anonymous, but still carry a message relating to the authority – both spiritual and secular – of the pope and the hierarchy of the Catholic Church. Furthermore, cardinal portraits often assumed special functions relating specifically to the duties and offices of the rank. And yet, given that cardinals in this period represented a diversity of nationalities, social status, as well as political and theological outlooks, the significance, values, and uses of their portraits could vary widely depending on the individual – or individuals – portrayed and the context.

The current volume seeks to address this range of issues specific to cardinal portraits in four thematic sections. The first section, 'Individuality and Identity: Florence and Rome', examines specific types of cardinal images in relation to questions of individual likeness and collective identity, while the second section, 'Divided Loyalties: Venice and Rome', explores how the often conflicted political allegiances of cardinals could be manifested in their imagery. The diverse roles fulfilled by cardinals' images within different types of collections, as well as questions relating to wealth and ritualistic display, are examined in 'Collecting and Display: Portraits and Worldly Goods'. The fourth section, 'Post-Tridentine Piety: The Devout Cardinal', examines how the portraiture of cardinals was impacted by the shifting religious climate of the years around and after Trent. The final chapter, which forms a conclusion to the volume, examines the issue of cardinal portraits beyond Italy, considering the case of Spanish cardinals. The topics addressed in these sections comprise some of the crucial elements that shaped the various 'cultures' in which cardinal portraits were produced and received by both contemporary and later viewers.

7 Burke, 'Renaissance, Individualism', 1995, p. 395.

8 Klinger, *Portrait Collection*, 1991, and Klinger, 'Images of Identity', 1998; see also Thomas-Leo True's essay in this volume. For cardinals as collectors in general, see Hollingsworth and Richardson, eds., *Possessions of a Cardinal*, 2010; Chambers, *Renaissance Cardinal*, 1992; Chambers, *Renaissance Cardinals*, 1997; Feigenbaum, *Display of Art*, 2014, and Baker-Bates *et al.*, 'Cardinals as Patrons of the Visual Arts', 2020.

9 Richardson, 'Cardinal's Wardrobe', 2020.

Identifying the Cardinal

Over the course of the sixteenth century, as the number of cardinals – and their portraits – increased exponentially, a typology for painted portraits, related to papal portraiture, gradually evolved. However, portraits of cardinals appear in a variety of media with some regularity from the early fourteenth century. Some of the earliest extant portraits of a cardinal in any medium were executed by Giotto, the artist credited by Vasari with initiating a renewal in the arts that involved ‘introducing the drawing from nature of living persons’.¹⁰ This mimetic quality of portraiture was consistently discussed by early modern writers on art and defined as its critical value. However, Giotto’s portraits of Cardinal Giacomo Gaetano Stefaneschi who appears as a donor in the triptych that he commissioned from the artist for old St. Peter’s (c.1330, Pinacoteca Vaticana), are to the modern eye very generalized.¹¹ Indeed, in terms of physiognomy, Stefaneschi does not appear so different to the famous donor portrait of Enrico Scrovegni that Giotto included in the Arena Chapel in Padua. This introduces questions of value relating to individualized likeness versus idealization or type which run throughout ecclesiastical portraiture in the period covered in this volume.¹²

In the case of Giotto’s portraits of Cardinal Stefaneschi, it is only because we are informed about the historical personage that we can identify him as a cardinal. While his pontifical of dalmatic and mitre shown on the front of the triptych indicate that he is a churchman of high rank, he does not wear the scarlet choir dress that make early modern cardinals immediately recognizable.¹³ Although, cardinals were not consistently portrayed wearing this until the sixteenth century, when their dress is outlined in Paolo Cortesi’s *De Cardinalatu*, from an early point cardinals were depicted in at least one of what became their canonical apparel, usually accompanied by the red *galero*, or wide-brimmed hat.¹⁴ These were reserved for cardinals by Innocent IV at the Council of Lyon in 1245, and several fourteenth- and fifteenth-century manuscript illuminations include members of the papal entourage identifiable as cardinals through their red hats.

10 Vasari, *Le vite*, 1881, pp. 373–374; Rubin, ‘Understanding Renaissance Portraiture’, 2012, p. 3.

11 Ibid. See also Steinke, ‘Giotto und Physiognomik’, 1996; Seiler, ‘Giotto als Erfinder des Porträts’, 2002.

12 Jacobus, ‘Propria Figura’, 2017. For a discussion of the issue see Brian Jeffrey Maxson’s and Carol M. Richardson’s essays in this volume.

13 Although the date of the Stefaneschi altarpiece is much debated, it seems highly likely to have been executed after the cardinal’s nomination in 1295. See Gardner, ‘Stefaneschi Altarpiece’, 1974, pp. 57–103. St. Peter here wears a red cloak emphasizing his role as the first pope. In conversation, Carol Richardson has observed that the fact that Stefaneschi is depicted holding a model of the altarpiece places a corporal emphasis on the liturgical aspect of his gift.

14 See Richardson, ‘Cardinal’s Wardrobe’, 2020.

A late fourteenth-century manuscript of the Decretals of Boniface VIII, now in the British Library, and the early fifteenth-century *Très Riches Heures du duc du Berry* (Chantilly, Musée Condé) both include images of generalized figures surrounding the pope; the men are recognizable as cardinals from their red *galero* and serve to reinforce the identity and authority of the pontiff.¹⁵ Besides such collective, anonymous representations, there are also early portrait illuminations of individual cardinals, including Stefaneschi himself, who are identifiable through their coat of arms and red choir dress.¹⁶ An early fifteenth-century example occurs on the first folio of the *Missal of Cardinal Angelo Acciaiuoli* (Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum), datable to 1405 (Plate 1).¹⁷ Produced in Florence nearly a century after the Stefaneschi altarpiece, the portrait of Acciaiuoli is still very idealized and his dress remains a fundamental marker of his identity. While the *galero*, shown in all these examples, served primarily as a symbol of the office – replaced by the biretta in later representations – the fundamental purpose of the red choir dress was to designate the cardinals' relationship to the pope, signifying their combined role as 'the head and members of the papal body'.¹⁸

Nevertheless, dress has not always led to accurate identifications; there is much debate as to whether Van Eyck's portrait now in the Kusthistorisches Museum, Vienna – usually taken as one of the earliest extant examples of an independent portrait of a cardinal – does in fact portray Cardinal Niccolò Albergati.¹⁹ Sometimes cardinals deliberately chose not to be represented in their red choir dress. In the 1530s there is the famous case of Ippolito de' Medici – always a reluctant cardinal – who was portrayed by Titian in an extravagant Hungarian hunting costume (Florence, Palazzo Pitti) and may have also been depicted by Sebastiano del Piombo, both in secular dress and armour in paintings now in private collections.²⁰

Cardinals occasionally might be represented in domestic attire considered acceptable for their office, rather than in choir dress, although this was rare following

15 BL add MS 23923, and Musée Condé, Chantilly, MS 65, fol. 197r; for further discussion of anonymous representations of cardinals in illuminations, see Brian Jeffrey Maxson's essay in this volume, esp. Fig. 3.2.

16 Stefaneschi is portrayed in his red choir dress in the Vatican Codex of St. George; see Gardner, 'Stefaneschi Altarpiece', 1974, p. 69.

17 Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, MS 30; for a recent discussion of the manuscript, see Kerr-Di-Carlo, 'Making the Cardinal's Missal', 2017.

18 Richardson, 'Cardinal's Wardrobe', 2020, p. 535. As Richardson explains, red was historically the colour of the popes.

19 Hunter, 'Who Is Jan van Eyck's "Cardinal Nicolo Albergati"', 1993.

20 Scarpa, 'Ritratto del cardinale Ippolito de' Medici', 2006; Rebecchini, *Un altro Lorenzo*, 2010, pp. 160–163; Baker-Bates, 'Technical Experimentation', 2020. Ippolito appears in his red choir dress in a double portrait with Marco Bracci now in the National Gallery, London, tentatively attributed to Girolamo da Carpi, though the likeness in this seems to be based on Titian's portrait; see Mancini and Penny, *National Gallery Catalogues*, vol. 3: *Bologna and Ferrara*, pp. 286–295.

the convocation of the Council of Trent in 1545. In cases like Pier Francesco Foschi's portrait of Antonio Pucci (Corsini Gallery, Florence), the sitter's identity as a cardinal appears not to have been prioritized. While such images certainly represent members of the Sacred College, they open up the category of cardinal portraits, as they do not explicitly communicate their sitters' status as 'princes of the church', emphasizing instead other aspects of their identity – in Pucci's case his wealth and learning. Sometimes cardinals might also be represented in the dress of their order or of a specific office, as in the case of Antonio Pucci's uncle, Lorenzo, who is shown in a portrait by Parmigianino (ex-Abercorn collection) as the Major Penitentiary, one of the most prestigious offices in the Curia, which he held from 1520–1529. Images such as these reflect the multilayered identities of cardinals in the period.²¹

Pictorial Portraits: Evolution of a Genre and Type

In the early sixteenth century, Raphael's portrait of Julius II now in the National Gallery, London, supplied a fundamental model for cardinal portraiture.²² The iconographic derivation of cardinal portraits from a papal model created a visual reference that reflected their official relationship, like their dress.²³ However, cardinals seem to have enjoyed a slightly greater degree of iconographic flexibility than popes, and in the second decade of the sixteenth century, both Raphael and Sebastiano del Piombo experimented with compositional solutions that would provide prototypes for artists working in Rome and throughout Europe for the next century.²⁴

The iconography of Raphael's portrait of Julius II is reflected in images of cardinals produced by him and his workshop: a portrait of an unidentified cardinal now in the Prado, Madrid, and that of Cardinal Bibbiena (Florence, Palazzo Pitti) show their subjects seated at bust length, angled toward the picture plane at 45 degrees.²⁵ Following these examples, cardinals would, for the next two centuries, most often appear seated, with varying degrees of their stature included. However, an important precedent was also set by the three-quarter-length, standing portrait of Cardinal Alessandro Farnese (Museo di Capodimonte, Naples), which is often attributed

21 Pilliod, 'In Tempore Poenitentiae', 1988; Hirst, 'Portrait of Lorenzo Pucci', 2000.

22 For Raphael's portrait of Julius II, which refers back to Justus of Ghent's portrait of Sixtus IV; see Partridge and Starn, *Renaissance Likeness*, 1980, and Chapman *et al.*, *Raphael*, 2004, pp. 272–275. For its legacy see Mansour, 'Prince and Pontiff', 2008, pp. 209–229.

23 Woodall, ed., *Portraiture*, 1997, p. 2.

24 Kempers, 'Canonical Portrait', 2001; Petrucci, 'Tipologie della ritrattistica cardinalizia', 2006; Robertson, 'Portraits of Early Modern Cardinals', 2020, pp. 559–565.

25 For both of these portraits, see Henry and Joannides, *Late Raphael*, pp. 265–268, with bibliography. These authors identify the Prado cardinal as Francesco Alidosi whose portrait medal is discussed below.



Fig. 1.1 Sebastiano del Piombo, *Cardinal Bandinello Sauli, His Secretary, and Two Geographers*, 1516, oil on canvas, Washington, DC, National Gallery of Art (© National Gallery of Art, Washington).

to Raphael, though it may have been executed by a member of his workshop.²⁶ Cardinal Farnese, the future Paul III, is positioned before a window with a view onto an idyllic landscape, a variant on the dark green or grey-black backgrounds which characterize the other portraits. Sebastiano's group portrait of *Cardinal Bandinello Sauli, his Secretary, and Two Geographers* (Washington, DC, National Gallery; Fig. 1.1) further expanded the iconographic possibilities for cardinal portraiture, incorporating additional figures and props to emphasize his rank.²⁷

A few decades later, in Venice, Titian played a leading role in developing such models further, executing his bust-length portrait of Cardinal Pietro Bembo (Washington, DC; Plate 2), which communicates the sitter's status, character, and intellectual prowess through a penetrating gaze and rhetorical gesture.²⁸ Titian's meticulous

26 Leone de Castris, 'Raffaello Sanzio, Ritratto del cardinal Alessandro Farnese', 1995, pp. 168–169.

27 Tostmann, 'Sebastiano del Piombos Bildnis', 2011, pp. 311–348.

28 See Peter Humfrey's entry on the National Gallery website: www.nga.gov/collection/art-object-page.41638.html#entry (accessed May 2020).

attention to the texture and detail of the cardinal's shimmering silk mozzetta set an important example for the next generation of painters who, following the conclusion of the Council of Trent, fully exploited the canonical type. This now fulfilled the requirements of the new religious climate in presenting a consistent image of the cardinal as a noble and dignified proponent of Catholic orthodoxy. Indeed, the established formats for cardinal portraiture accorded perfectly with Cardinal Gabriele Paleotti's insistence, in his *Discorso intorno alle immagini sacre e profane* of 1582, that 'portraits of persons of rank and dignity [...] must ensure that [the sitters] are depicted with the gravity and decorum appropriate to their status [...] most especially ecclesiastics'.²⁹ As 'heirs in waiting' to the papal throne, cardinals' in particular were required through their imagery to communicate ecclesiastical authority and unity.

With a marked increase in demand in the years during and after Trent, every major artist active at Rome produced one or more cardinal portraits. Scipione Pulzone was particularly successful at reinterpreting the established formula. In his numerous portraits, which often exist in multiple versions, cardinals are generally shown either at half or three-quarter length, often seated, though occasionally standing. They are inevitably clothed in their official red choir dress, usually holding a letter, alluding to their duties and office, or a small book, suggesting their learning and piety. Sometimes accompanied by secondary figures, Scipione's cardinals are frequently distinguished by lavish fabrics and intricate accessories.³⁰

In the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries there emerged a popular genre of printed cardinal portraits known as the *Effigies cardinalium nunc viventium*. Ottavio Leoni, known for his *ritratti di macchia*, or portrait sketches executed from memory, helped to disseminate cardinals' images through his collaboration on the 1608 *Effigies*, a series of 77 engraved cardinal portraits, published under the auspices of Paul V and based on likenesses taken by Leoni.³¹ This project was an important precedent for the De Rossi printers' highly successful and long-running collection of engraved cardinal portraits, the *Libro de' Ritratti degli Eminentissimi Signori Cardinali, dall'anno MDCLVIII*, which, at its conclusion in 1863, contained 831 images of past and present members of the Sacred College.³² Such collections were inspired by compilations of cardinals' biographies, which had begun to appear towards the end of the sixteenth century and which often included likenesses of

29 Paleotti, *Discorso*, 1582, cap. xx, p. 340.

30 See Danielle Carrabino's essay in this volume.

31 Tittoni and Petrucci, eds., *La porpora romana*, 2006, p. 25, and nos. 14, 18, and 20; Primarosa, 'Ottavio Leoni', 2013, pp. 55–72; Primarosa, 'Fermare il modello', 2014. Many of the portraits that appear in the *Effigies* were used in at least one manuscript compendium that included biographies: Mucanzio's *Cardinalium nunc viventium Elogia*, compiled in 1615 (ASV, Fondo Borghese, ser. IV, 201); for this work, see Cavero de Carondelet, 'El viaje a Roma de Luis de Oviedo', 2020.

32 See Tozzi, 'Libro de' ritratti', 2006, and Arnold Witte's essay in this volume.



Fig. 1.2 Leonardo Parasole, *Effigies cum insignibus nominibus, cognominibus, patria, titulis et nuncupationes reverendissimorum [...] Cardinalium nunc viventium*, 1593, hand-coloured woodcut, London, The British Museum (© The Trustees of the British Museum).

their subjects; a notable example is the volume by the Spanish Dominican, Alfonso Chacón, or Ciacconius, first published in Rome in 1601.³³ The wider popularity of and demand for images of cardinals is demonstrated by a large woodcut (nearly A1 in size) containing small portraits of all living cardinals, engraved by Leonardo Parasole and printed by Paolo Blado (Fig. 1.2). Organized in horizontal rows according to nominating pope and clerical ranking, each portrait was carved by Parasole on an individual block, so that the image could be regularly updated by the woodcutter and printer, with new cardinals added and the deceased removed.³⁴ In an example of this woodcut dating to 1593, now in the British Museum, the cardinals' scarlet attire has been hand-coloured, again revealing the importance of their unifying attribute.

Finally, alongside independent portraits, cardinals could also be shown together in groups, as demonstrated in the early manuscript illuminations discussed above, reflecting the collective nature of their status. Portraits of cardinals also began to be incorporated into large-scale, painted historical narratives decorating the interiors of public and private buildings, both in and outside of Rome. In such images, cardinals often seem to be 'role playing' in scenes celebrating their papal or familial patrons, such as the well-known fresco in the Vatican by Melozzo da Forlì of *Sixtus IV Appointing Platina*, where the two papal nephews stand behind the pope.³⁵ This image underscores the dynastic ambitions of the pope, and indeed such group portraits frequently reflect the nepotistic set of relations that characterized the papacy in the period.³⁶ However, larger scenes incorporating many figures of cardinals often reflect broader networks operating within the Sacred College. In many such cases individual cardinals' names have been forgotten. It is occasionally possible to rediscover their identities through pictorial and historical evidence.³⁷ Such identifications often shed light on the political alliances or theological sympathies of certain factions within the Curia at a given moment.

Cardinals and Sculpture

As with other categories of portraiture, cardinals' portraits were also executed in a variety of sculpted forms. While painted or illuminated portraits were often high-status products intended for an elite audience, the production of medallic portraits, like engravings, ensured a wide dissemination of cardinals' images.

33 Chacón, *Vitae et res gestae*, 1601.

34 Bury, *Print in Italy*, 2002, pp. 156–157.

35 Clark, *Melozzo da Forlì*, 1990, pp. 21–41; see also Philippa Jackson's essay in this volume.

36 For the case of Venetian cardinals, who tended to come only from certain families, see Sarah Ferrari in this volume.

37 See the essays by Alessandra Pattanaro and Irene Brooke in this volume.



Fig. 1.3 Francesco Francia, *Cardinal Francesco degli Alidosi*, 1505-1511, bronze, New York, Metropolitan Museum (© The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, Robert Lehmann Collection, 1975).

These were usually executed by goldsmiths within the papal mint to celebrate an individual's elevation to the cardinalate; however, wealthy cardinals might also memorialize specific events by commissioning finer specimens, like that of Cardinal Francesco degli Alidosi, whose portrait medal attributed to Francesco Francia, probably commemorated his appointment as papal legate to Bologna in 1508 (Fig. 1.3).³⁸ Close to and rapidly promoted by Julius II, Alidosi followed the pope's lead in exploiting the portrait medal's potential as a propagandistic tool, at once glorifying the church and self.³⁹ The reverse of Alidosi's medal, showing Jupiter brandishing thunderbolts in his eagle-drawn cart above the god's star signs, Sagittarius and Pisces, claims a favourable astrological prognostication for the cardinal's career. Such overtly pagan imagery was rare on cardinals' medals, which usually feature Christian or allegorical symbols.⁴⁰ In the fervid religious climate

38 Warren, 'Francesco Francia', 1999, pp. 217–218; Pollard, *Renaissance Medals*, 1987, p. 226, no. 211; for Alidosi, see De Caro, 'Alidosi, Francesco', 1960.

39 For Julius II's medals, see Weiss, 'Medals of Pope Julius II', 1965, and Fishburne, 'Casting an Ecclesiastical Prince', 2014.

40 Although a complete study of cardinals' medals is lacking in the scholarship, a useful table of cardinal medals in the British Museum, and their reverse imagery, can be found in Hendrickson, 'Bronze Portrait

after Trent, posthumous medals bearing images of cardinals deemed particularly holy, like Carlo Borromeo, could become venerated items and even assume agency as miracle-performing objects.⁴¹

The posthumous image and '*memoria*' of a cardinal was frequently fashioned through a sculpted effigy or portrait on a funerary monument.⁴² In fifteenth-century Rome, several cardinals were memorialized through recumbent effigies placed on top of sarcophagi within vertical, wall-mounted monuments of a type established by non-native sculptors like Andrea Bregno.⁴³ Employing a triumphalist, *all'antica* vocabulary, such works more often communicate the cardinal's identity through an epigraph, coat of arms, or symbols of his office, rather than a specific likeness or even dress. Occasionally, however, a more individualized portrait might be included within a relief decorating the monument, as in the case of Cardinal Pietro Riario's tomb in Santissimi XII Apostoli.

The much more elaborate early sixteenth-century monuments of Cardinals Ascanio Sforza and Girolamo Basso della Rovere, designed by Andrea Sansovino in Santa Maria del Popolo, follow the triumphal arch, wall-mounted model, but turn the reclining effigy of the dead cardinal on his side, with head supported by his elbow; Panofsky identified this pose occurring first in Spanish tombs, though ultimately it harks back to Etruscan models.⁴⁴ Although the outward-facing effigy allowed for a more complete rendering of physiognomic details, the cardinals are still depicted deceased, with idealized features.⁴⁵ Wearing pontificals rather than choir dress, as was typical, the cardinals' status is designated by the form of the monument, as well as by the *galero* crowning their coats of arms. The similarity in type and ornamentation of these two tombs further asserts a shared social and political network.⁴⁶

In the years following the Council of Trent (1545–1563), wall-mounted, architectonic monuments more often incorporated a portrait bust rather than a recumbent effigy, showing the cardinal still alive and in his red *mozzetta*, though often with head bare. In many portraits of this kind, such as those of Cardinal Francisco de Toledo (Fig. 13.1) and Cardinal Mariano Pierbenedetti in Santa Maria Maggiore

Medal', 2017.

41 See Minou Schraven's essay in this volume.

42 For a discussion of cardinals' tombs and their important role in establishing '*memoria*' see Zitzlperger, 'Cardinals' Tombs', 2020; for the distinction between effigies and portraits, see Lavin, 'On the Sources and Meaning of the Renaissance Portrait Bust', 1970, pp. 211–212, and Luchs, 'Verrocchio and the Bust of Albiera degli Albizzi', 2012, p. 83.

43 For cardinals' tombs in Rome see Richardson, *Reclaiming Rome*, 2009, and the same author's essay in this volume, as well as Zitzlperger, 'Cardinals' Tombs', 2020, and Ruggero, 'Magnificenza cardinalizia', 2006; for Bregno's Roman *oeuvre*s, see Caglioti, 'Sui primi tempi romani', 1997.

44 Panofsky, *Tomb Sculpture*, 1964, pp. 81–82. See Piers Baker-Bates's essay in this volume.

45 Richardson, 'Andrea Sansovino', 2018; Langer, 'Maniera Moderna', 2019.

46 Zitzlperger, 'Cardinals' Tombs', 2020, p. 595.

(Fig. 8.2), the colour of the cardinal's mozzetta, and hence his status, is articulated through the use of porphyry which brilliantly contrasts with a white marble head.⁴⁷ The use of polychrome marble on these tombs echoes that of the much more elaborate monument of their patron, Sixtus V, located in the same basilica and linking the *memoria* of cardinals and pope. Such costly sculpted busts could be substituted by painted images on hard stone, like Domenichino's portrait of Girolamo Agucchi, which crowns the cardinal's monument in San Pietro in Vincoli; here Domenichino recycled the official portrait of Agucchi that he had executed while the cardinal was still alive.⁴⁸ This 'lifelike' portrait, characterized by the cardinal's intense, penetrating gaze, is a fitting culmination to a tomb which, positioned within Agucchi's titular church, promotes his secular memory, recording a network of patronal and familial ties.⁴⁹

Finally, although sculpted portraits of cardinals are most often found on funerary monuments, independent sculpted busts depicting living cardinals began to come into favour especially in the seventeenth century.⁵⁰ Related to sixteenth-century papal models like Guglielmo della Porta's c.1546 marble bust of Paul III (Naples, Museo di Capodimonte), the iconography of such portraits again underscores the cardinal's relationship to the pope and his place within the hierarchy the church.⁵¹ In early seventeenth-century Rome, Bernini revolutionized this type of portrait with his famous bust of Scipione Borghese (Rome, Galleria Borghese; Fig. 1.4). In this work the artist captures physiognomic details precisely and creates a likeness so lifelike that critics have, since its execution, remarked on the fact that the sitter appears to be 'speaking'.⁵² This bust would in turn influence Bernini's later papal portraiture, a genre which he transformed by replacing the pope's cope with the mozzetta; in doing so Bernini was following the tradition of painted portraits established by Raphael's Julius II, which, as observed, formed the fundamental basis for the typology of cardinal portraits.⁵³

47 Ruggero, 'Magnificenza cardinalizia', 2007, pp. 45–46; see the essays of Thomas-Leo True and Piers Baker-Bates in this volume.

48 Spear, *Domenichino*, 1982, p. 137, no. 14.

49 The execution of the tomb was overseen by the cardinal's younger brother who was a protector of the artist and had promoted his interests with the cardinal; see Ginzburg Carignani, 'Domenichino e Giovanni Battista Agucchi', 1996.

50 For the general development of independent portrait busts in the fifteenth and sixteenth century see Lavin, 'On the Sources and Meaning of the Renaissance Portrait Bust', 1970; Schuyler, *Florentine Busts*, 1976; and Martin, *Alessandro Vittoria*.

51 See Gramberg, 'Guglielmo dalla Porta's Grabmal für Paul III', 1984, and Caldwell, 'Knowing Likeness', 2018.

52 Wittkower, *Gian Lorenzo Bernini*, 1955, p. 194, no. 31; Coliva, 'Scipione Borghese', 1998; Zitzlsperger, 'Der Papst', 2001; Bacchi and Hess, 'Creating a New Likeness', 2008, p. 20.

53 Bacchi and Hess, 'Creating a New Likeness', pp. 34–36.



Fig. 1.4 Gian Lorenzo Bernini, *Cardinal Scipione Borghese*, 1632, marble, Rome, Galleria Borghese (© Galleria Borghese).



Fig. 1.5 Unknown artist, *Cardinal Reginald Pole*, 1540s, oil on canvas, St Petersburg, The State Hermitage Museum (© The State Hermitage Museum, photo by Leonard Kheifets).

Individual versus Collective Identity

In examples as spectacular as Bernini's portraits of Cardinal Borghese, the relationship between sitter and artist inevitably obtrudes. As with all types of portraiture, such outstanding works assume heightened worth through the fame of the artist, as well as the prestige of the sitter, and have therefore garnered

the most scholarly attention.⁵⁴ The fascination with historical personalities has frequently led to the neglect of portraits in which either the sitter or artist, or both, are unknown. There survive numerous cardinal portraits, many of superb quality, of which this is true. Two elevated examples are the portraits of Cardinal Reginald Pole in the Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg (Fig. 1.5) and of Cardinal Marcello Cervini in the Galleria Borghese, Rome. Both men were important members of the Sacred College, but the painters of their imposing portraits can no longer be named with certainty.⁵⁵

Even less studied are numerous images in which neither cardinal nor artist can now be identified. Especially after the Council of Trent (1545–1563), a flood of cardinal images, often of low quality and across all media, were produced; the value of these rested not on any intrinsic artistic worth but on the inherent importance and status of the cardinal within the Catholic Church. Despite the scholarly neglect of such works in the literature (both art historical and historical), clearly these images circulated widely. They therefore provide crucial visual evidence that testifies to the diverse roles that cardinals and their images could assume, functionally in terms of their office and duties, and propagandistically in terms of ideology.⁵⁶

Richard Brilliant has observed that ‘portraits make value judgments not just about the specific individual portrayed but about the general worth of individuals as a category’.⁵⁷ This assertion certainly applies to cardinal portraits as a subgenre within portraiture. The breadth and frequency of cardinal portraits clearly reveal the societal estimation of cardinals as a category of individuals. Thus, this volume considers both the development of the individual cardinal portrait and the significance of visual representations of the collective identity comprised by the Curia. This shift of emphasis indeed reflects the larger history of the Sacred College, as explored by Miles Pattenden in the following chapter.

54 For this phenomenon see Woodall, ed., *Portraiture*, 1997.

55 The stunning portrait of Cardinal Pole has over the years been attributed to almost every major Roman artist of the first half of the sixteenth century; for a summary of attributions see Hirst, *Sebastiano del Piombo*, 1981, pp.120–121; for the attribution to Perino del Vaga see Romani, ‘Piero Buonaccorsi, detto Perino del Vaga, *Ritratto del cardinale Reginald Pole*’, 2005.

56 See Arnold Witte’s contribution to this volume.

57 Brilliant, *Portraiture*, 1991.

Bibliography

- Bacchi, Andrea and Catherine Hess, 'Creating a New Likeness', in *Bernini and the Birth of Baroque Sculpture*, ed. by Andrea Bacchi, Catherine Hess, and Jennifer Montagu (Los Angeles/Ottawa: J. Paul Getty Museum/National Gallery of Canada, 2008), pp. 1–44.
- Baker-Bates, Piers, 'Technical Experimentation in the Art of Sebastiano del Piombo: Some Further Thoughts', *Colnaghi Studies Journal* 6 (2020): 86–97.
- Baker-Bates, Piers, Mary Hollingsworth, and Arnold Witte, 'Cardinals as Patrons of the Visual Arts', in *A Companion to the Early Modern Cardinal*, ed. by Mary Hollingsworth, Miles Pattenden, and Arnold Witte (Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2020), pp. 511–534.
- Bolton, Andrew, ed., *Heavenly Bodies: Fashion and the Catholic Imagination* (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2018).
- Brilliant, Richard, *Portraiture* (London: Reaktion, 1991).
- Burckhardt, Jacob, *Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy*, trans. by S.G.C. Middlemore (London: Swan, Sonnenschein, & Co., 1892).
- Burke, Peter, 'The Renaissance, Individualism, and the Portrait', *History of European Ideas* 21.3 (1995): 393–400.
- Bury, Michael, *The Print in Italy, 1550–1600* (London: British Museum Press, 2001).
- Caglioti, Francesco, 'Sui primi tempi romani d'Andrea Bregno: un progetto per il cardinale camerlengo Alvise Trevisan e un San Michele Arcangelo per il cardinale Juan de Carvajal', *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz* 41.3 (1997): 213–253.
- Caldwell, Dorigen, 'A Knowing Likeness: Artists and Letterati at the Farnese Court in Mid-Sixteenth-Century Rome', in *Et Amicorum: Essays on Renaissance Humanism and Philosophy in Honour of Jill Kraye*, ed. by Anthony Ossa-Richardson and Margret Meserve (Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2018), pp. 159–176.
- Cavero de Carondelet, Cloe, 'El viaje a Roma de Luis de Oviedo', *Cuadernos de Historia Moderna* 45 (2020): 55–79.
- Chacón, Alfonso, *Vitae et res gestae pontificum romanorum et S.R.E cardinalium an initio nascentis ecclesiae usque ad Clementem IX P.O.M.* (Rome: Stephanus Paulinus, 1601).
- Chambers, David, *A Renaissance Cardinal and his Worldly Problems: The Will and Inventory of Francesco Gonzaga (1444–1483)* (London: Warburg Institute, 1992).
- , *Renaissance Cardinals and their Worldly Problems* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1997).
- Chapman, Hugo, Tom Henry, and Carol Plazzotta, *Raphael: From Urbino to Rome* (London: National Gallery, 2004).
- Christiansen, Keith and Stefan Weppelmann, eds., *The Renaissance Portrait from Donatello to Bellini* (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2012).
- Coliva, Anna, 'Scipione Borghese', in *Bernini scultore: la nascita del barocco in Casa Borghese*, ed. by Anna Coliva and Sebastian Schütze (Rome: Edizione de Luca, 1998), pp. 276–289.
- Clark, Nicholas, *Melozzo da Forlì pictor papalis* (London: Sotheby's Publications, 1990).
- Cranston, Jodi, *The Poetics of Portraiture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).

- De Caro, Gaspare, 'Alidosi, Francesco', in *Dizionario biografico degli Italiani*, vol. 2 (Rome: Treccani, 1960), [www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/alidosi-francesco-detto-il-cardinal-di-pavia_\(Dizionario-Biografico\)/](http://www.treccani.it/enciclopedia/alidosi-francesco-detto-il-cardinal-di-pavia_(Dizionario-Biografico)/).
- Feigenbaum, Gail, ed., *Display of Art in the Roman Palace* (Los Angeles: Getty Research Institute, 2014).
- Fishburne, James, 'Casting an Ecclesiastical Prince: Portrait Medals of Pope Julius II', PhD thesis, University of California, Los Angeles, 2014.
- Ginzburg Carignani, Silvia, 'Domenichino e Giovanni Battista Agucchi', in *Domenichino, 1581–1641*, ed. by Richard Spear and Giovanna Grumo (Milan: Electa, 1996), pp. 121–137.
- Gardner, Julius, 'The Stefaneschi Altarpiece: A Reconsideration', *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 37 (1974): 57–103.
- Gramberg, Werner, 'Guglielmo dalla Portas Grabmal für Paul III: Farnese in San Pietro in Vaticano', *Römisches Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte* 21 (1984): 253–364.
- Greenblatt, Stephen, *Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to Shakespeare* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1984).
- Hendrickson, Emilee Barrow, 'The Bronze Portrait Medal of Cardinal Andrea della Valle', MA diss., University of Alabama, 2017.
- Henry, Tom and Paul Joannides, *Late Raphael* (Madrid: Museo del Prado, 2012).
- Hirst, Michael, 'A Portrait of Lorenzo Pucci by Parmigianino', *Apollo* 151.460 (2000): 43–47.
- Hirst, *Sebastiano del Piombo* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981).
- Hollingsworth, Mary and Carol M. Richardson, eds., *The Possessions of a Cardinal: Politics, Piety, and Art, 1450–1700* (Leiden: Brill, 2020).
- Hunter, John, 'Who Is Jan van Eyck's "Cardinal Nicolo Albergati"', *Art Bulletin* 75.2 (1993): 207–218.
- Jacobus, Laura, "'Propria Figura": The Advent of Facsimile Portraiture in Italian Art', *Art Bulletin* 99.2 (2017): 72–101.
- Kempers, Bram, 'The Canonical Portrait of a Cardinal: Bandinello Sauli, Raphael and Sebastiano del Piombo', in *I cardinali della Santa Romana Chiesa: collezionisti e mecenati*, ed. by Marco Gallo (Rome: Shakespeare and Company, 2001), pp. 6–21.
- Kerr-Di-Carlo, Éowyn, 'Making the Cardinal's Missal: Looking Anew at the Circle of Lorenzo Monaco and the Illuminators of Fitzwilliam MS 30', in *Manuscripts in the Making: Art and Science*, vol. 1, ed. by Stella Panaytova and Paola Ricciardi (London/Turnhout: Harvey Miller/Brepols, 2017), pp. 87–95.
- Klinger, Linda Susan, 'Images of Identity: The Portrait Collections of the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Century', in *The Image of the Individual Portraits in the Renaissance*, ed. by Nicholas Mann and Luke Syson (London: British Museum Press, 1998).
- , 'The Portrait Collection of Paolo Giovio', PhD thesis, Princeton University, 1991.
- Langer, Lara, 'The Maniera Moderna of Andrea Sansovino's Cardinal Tombs at Santa Maria del Popolo', *Sculpture Journal* 28 (2019): 75–102.

- Lavin, Irving, 'On the Sources and Meaning of the Renaissance Portrait Bust', *Art Quarterly* 33 (1970): 207–226.
- Leone de Castris, Pierluigi, 'Raffaello Sanzio: ritratto del cardinal Alessandro Farnese, futuro papa Paolo III', in *I Farnese: arte e collezionismo*, ed. by Lucia Fornari Schianchi (Milan: Mondadori Elects, 1995), pp. 168–169.
- Luchs, Alison, 'Verrocchio and the Bust of Albiera degli Albizzi: Portraits, Poetry and Commemoration', *Artibus et Historiae* 33.66 (2012): 75–98.
- Mancini, Giorgia and Nicholas Penny, *The National Gallery Catalogues*, vol. 3: *Bologna and Ferrara* (London: The National Gallery, 2016).
- Mann, Nicholas and Luke Syson, eds., *The Image of the Individual Portraits in the Renaissance* (London: British Museum Press, 1998).
- Mansour, Opher, 'Prince and Pontiff: Secular and Sacred Authority in Papal State Portraiture between Raphael's *Julius II* and the Portraits of Pius V and Clement VIII', in *Art and Identity in Early Modern Rome*, ed. by Michael Bury and Jill Burke (Farnham: Ashgate, 2008), pp. 209–229.
- Martin, Thomas, *Alessandro Vittoria and the Portrait Bust in Renaissance Venice* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998).
- Mucanzio, Giovanni Battista, *Cardinalium nunc viventium Elogia*, 1615, ASV, Fondo Borghese, ser. IV, 201.
- Paleotti, Gabriele, *Discorso intorno alle immagini sacre e profane* (1582), in *Accademia della Crusca*, ed., *Trattati d'arte del Cinquecento* [online resource], Fondazione Memofonte, <http://memofonte.accademiadellacrusca.org/pdf/5.pdf> (accessed May 2020).
- Panofsky, Erwin, *Tomb Sculpture: Its Changing Aspects from Ancient Egypt to Bernini*, ed. by H.W. Janson (London: Thames & Hudson, 1964).
- Partridge, Loren and Randolph Starn, *A Renaissance Likeness: Art and Culture in Raphael's Julius II* (Berkeley/Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1980).
- Petrucci, Francesco, 'Tipologie della ritrattistica cardinalizia tra '500 e '600', in *La Porpora Romana: ritrattistica cardinalizia a Roma dal Rinascimento al Novecento*, ed. by Francesco Petrucci and Maria Elisa Titton (Rome: Gangemi Editore, 2006), pp. 19–30.
- Pilliod, Elizabeth, "'In Tempore Poenitentiae": Pierfrancesco Foschi's Portrait of Cardinal Antonio Pucci', *Burlington Magazine* 130 (1988), pp. 679–687.
- Pollard, J. Graham, *Italian Medals* (Washington, DC: National Gallery, 1987).
- Primarosa, Yuri, 'Fermare il modello in posa con la matita, il bulino, il pennello: il cardinal Erminio Valenti nei ritratti di Ottavio Leoni', *Bollettino della Diputazione di Storia Patria per l'Umbria*, 111.1–2 (2014): 963–979.
- , 'Ottavio Leoni portraitiste de Paul V et du Collège des cardinaux Borghèse', in *Ottavio Leoni (1578–1630): les portraits de Berlin*, ed. by Francesco Solinas (Rome: De Luca Editori d'Arte, 2013), pp. 55–72.
- Pope-Hennessy, John, *The Portrait in the Renaissance* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1966).
- Rebecchini, Guido, *Un altro Lorenzo: Ippolito de' Medici tra Firenze e Roma* (Venice: Marsilio, 2010).

- Richardson, Carol M., 'The Cardinal's Wardrobe', in *A Companion to the Early Modern Cardinal*, ed. by Mary Hollingsworth, Miles Pattenden, and Arnold Witte (Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2020), pp. 535–556.
- , *Reclaiming Rome: Cardinals in the Fifteenth Century* (Leiden: Brill, 2009).
- , 'Reputation, Patronage and Opportunism: Andrea Sansovino Arrives in Rome', *Sculpture Journal* 27.2 (2018): 177–192.
- Robertson, Clare, 'Portraits of Early Modern Cardinals', in *A Companion to the Early Modern Cardinal*, ed. by Mary Hollingsworth, Miles Pattenden, and Arnold Witte (Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2020), pp. 557–580.
- Romani, Vittoria, 'Piero Buonaccorsi, detto Perino del Vaga, *Ritratto del ardinale Reginald Pole*', in *Vittoria Colonna e Michelangelo*, ed. by Pina Ragionieri (Florence: Mandragora, 2005), pp. 114–117.
- Patricia Lee, 'Understanding Renaissance Portraiture', in *The Renaissance Portrait from Donatello to Bellini*, ed. by Keith Christiansen and Stefan Weppelmann (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 2012), pp. 2–25.
- Ruggero, Cristina, 'Magnificenza cardinalizia nella ritrattistica funebre', in *La porpora romana: ritrattistica cardinalizia a Roma dal Rinascimento al Novecento* (Rome: Gangemi Editore, 2006), pp. 41–52.
- Scarpa, Tiziano, 'Ritratto del Cardinale Ippolito de' Medici', *Tiziano e il ritratto di corte da Raffaello ai Carracci* (Milan: Electa, 2006), pp. 118–119.
- Schuyler, Jane, *Florentine Busts: Sculpted Portraiture in the Fifteenth Century* (New York: Garland), 1976.
- Seiler, Peter, 'Giotto als Erfinder des Porträts', in *Das Portrat von der Erfindung des Porträts*, ed. by Martin Büchsel and Peter Schmidt (Mainz am Rhein: P. von Zabern, 2003), pp. 153–172.
- Spear, Richard E., *Domenichino*, 2 vols. (New Haven/London: Yale University Press, 1982).
- Steinke, Hubert, 'Giotto und Physiognomik', *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 59.4 (1996): 523–547.
- Syson, Luke, ed., *Renaissance Faces: Van Eyck to Titian* (London: National Gallery, 2008).
- Tittoni, Maria Elisa and Francesco Petrucci, eds., *La Porpora Romana: ritrattistica cardinalizia a Roma dal Rinascimento al Novecento* (Rome: Gangemi, 2006).
- Tostmann, Oliver, 'Sebastiano del Piombos Bildnis Bendinello Saulis und das Kardinalsporträt im frühen Cinquecento', *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 3 (2011): 311–348.
- Tozzi, Simonetta, 'Libro de' ritratti degli eminentissimi signori cardinali ... Ritratti incisi dei cardinali al Museo di Roma', in *La Porpora Romana: ritrattistica cardinalizia a Roma dal Rinascimento al Novecento*, ed. by Francesco Petrucci and Maria Elisa Titton (Rome: Gangemi Editore, 2006), pp. 31–39.
- Vasari, Giorgio, *Le vite de' più eccellenti pittori, scultori ed architettori* (1568), ed. by Gaetano Milanesi, vol. 1 (Florence: G.C. Sansoni, 1881).

- Warren, Jeremy, 'Francesco Francia and the Art of Renaissance Sculpture in Bologna', *Burlington Magazine* 141 (1999): 216–225.
- Weiss, Roberto, 'The Medals of Pope Julius II', *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 28.163–182 (1965): 163–182.
- Wittkower, Rudolf, *Gian Lorenzo Bernini: The Sculptor of the Roman Baroque* (London: Phaidon Press, 1955).
- Woodall, Joanna, ed., *Portraiture: Facing the Subject* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1997).
- Zitzlsperger, Philipp, 'Cardinals' Tombs', in *A Companion to the Early Modern Cardinal*, ed. by Mary Hollingsworth, Miles Pattenden, and Arnold Witte (Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2020), pp. 581–599.
- , 'Der Papst und sein Kardinal oder: Staatsporträt und Krisenmanagement im barocken Rom', *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 64.4 (2001): 547–561.

About the Authors

Piers Baker-Bates is a Visiting Research Associate at the Open University. He has published extensively on Sebastiano del Piombo and the cultural relations between Italy and Spain in the sixteenth century, including his monographic study *Sebastiano del Piombo and the World of Spanish Rome*.

Irene Brooke is an Associate Lecturer at the Courtauld Institute and editor of the *Colnaghi Studies Journal*. She has published articles on Cardinal Pietro Bembo's patronage and collecting strategies, as well as on the work and career of the engraver, Giulio Campagnola.