

A detailed oil painting of Rembrandt van Rijn, showing him from the chest up. He is wearing a white turban-like headpiece and a dark, heavy fur-lined coat over a red garment. The background is a soft, neutral tone with a faint circular shape on the right side.

STEPHANIE S. DICKEY [ED.]

Rembrandt and his Circle

Insights and Discoveries

Amsterdam
University
Press

AMSTERDAM STUDIES IN THE DUTCH GOLDEN AGE

Rembrandt and his Circle

AMSTERDAM STUDIES IN THE DUTCH GOLDEN AGE

Editorial Board

Frans Blom, University of Amsterdam
Michiel van Groesen, Leiden University
Geert H. Janssen, University of Amsterdam
Elmer E.P. Kolfin, University of Amsterdam
Nelleke Moser, VU University Amsterdam
Henk van Nierop, University of Amsterdam
Claartje Rasterhoff, University of Amsterdam
Emile Schrijver, University of Amsterdam
Thijs Weststeijn, University of Amsterdam

Advisory Board

H. Perry Chapman, University of Delaware
Harold J. Cook, Brown University
Benjamin J. Kaplan, University College London
Orsolya Réthelyi, Eötvös Loránd University Budapest
Claudia Swan, Northwestern University

Rembrandt and his Circle

Insights and Discoveries

Stephanie S. Dickey (ed.)

Amsterdam University Press



The publication of this book is made possible by support from
Drs Alfred and Isabel Bader and from Queen's University
(Kingston, Canada).

Cover illustration: Front: Rembrandt, *Self-Portrait with Two Circles*, c. 1662-63, oil on canvas, 113 × 94 cm, London, Kenwood House, Inv. No. 57 Back: Rembrandt, *The Hundred Guilder Print*, c. 1649, etching, drypoint, and engraving, state II/II, 280 × 393 mm, New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, H.O. Havemeyer Collection, Bequest of Mrs. H.O. Havemeyer, 1929, inv. 29.107.35

Cover design: Kok Korpershoek, Amsterdam

Lay-out: Crius Group, Hulshout

Amsterdam University Press English-language titles are distributed in the US and Canada by the University of Chicago Press.

ISBN 978 94 6298 400 4

e-ISBN 978 90 4853 452 4

DOI 10.5117/9789462984004

NUR 654

© All authors / Amsterdam University Press B.V., Amsterdam 2017

All rights reserved. Without limiting the rights under copyright reserved above, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the written permission of both the copyright owner and the author of the book.

Every effort has been made to obtain permission to use all copyrighted illustrations reproduced in this book. Nonetheless, whosoever believes to have rights to this material is advised to contact the publisher.

This book is dedicated
with respect, affection, and admiration
to Dr. Alfred Bader and Dr. Isabel Bader.

Contents

Acknowledgements	9
Introduction	11
<i>Stephanie S. Dickey</i>	
1. Rembrandt and Frans Hals Painting in the Workshop of Hendrick Uylenburgh	17
<i>S.A.C. Dudok van Heel</i>	
2. Rembrandt and the Germanic Style	44
<i>Thijs Weststeijn</i>	
3. Rembrandt and the Humanist Ideal of the Universal Painter	67
<i>Boudewijn Bakker</i>	
4. Curiosity and Desire: Rembrandt's Collection as Historiographic Barometer	99
<i>H. Perry Chapman</i>	
5. Painted Landscapes by Lievens and Rembrandt: The View from Seventeenth-Century Amsterdam Collections	122
<i>Jacquelyn N. Coutré</i>	
6. Jan Lievens in Antwerp: Three Rediscovered Works	151
<i>Stephanie S. Dickey</i>	
7. Gerrit Dou as a Pupil of Rembrandt	169
<i>Martin Bijl</i>	
8. A New Painting by Jan van Noordt in Budapest	189
<i>Ildikó Ember</i>	
9. Rembrandt's First Nude? The Recent Analysis of <i>Susanna and the Elders</i> from Rembrandt's Workshop	197
<i>Katja Kleinert and Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg</i>	
10. Rembrandt's <i>Head of Christ</i> : Some Technical Observations concerning Matters of Style	216
<i>Arie Wallert and Michel van der Laar</i>	
11. A Rediscovered <i>Head of John the Baptist on a Platter</i> from Rembrandt's Studio	223
<i>Lloyd DeWitt</i>	

12. Rembrandt's <i>One Guilder Print</i> : Value and Invention in 'the most beautiful [print] that ever came from the burin of this Master'	230
<i>Amy Golahny</i>	
13. Rembrandt, Ferdinand Bol, and Tobit: The Emergence of a <i>Pathosträger</i>	252
<i>Jan L. Leja</i>	
14. Biblical Iconography in the Graphic Work of Rembrandt's Circle	268
<i>Peter van der Coelen</i>	
15. Jan van Vliet and Rembrandt van Rijn: Their Collaboration Reassessed	285
<i>Jaco Rutgers</i>	
16. Printmaking among Artists of the Rembrandt School	305
<i>Nadine M. Orenstein</i>	
17. Chain Line Pattern Matching and Rembrandt's Prints	319
<i>C. Richard Johnson, Jr., William A. Sethares, Margaret Holben Ellis, Saira Haqqi, Reba Snyder, Erik Hinterding, Idelette van Leeuwen, Arie Wallert, Dionysia Christoforou, Jan van der Lubbe, Nadine M. Orenstein, Angela Campbell, and George Dietz</i>	
List of Illustrations	335
Bibliography	347
Index Nominum	375

Acknowledgements

This book owes its genesis to a series of conferences held in 2009, 2011, and 2013 at Queen's University's Bader International Study Centre at Herstmonceux Castle in East Sussex, UK. These meetings brought together distinguished art historians, museum curators, conservators, and conservation scientists concerned with the study of Rembrandt and artists in his circle. The Castle was a gift to Queen's University by alumnus Dr. Alfred Bader and his wife, Dr. Isabel Bader. In addition to being an internationally renowned chemist, entrepreneur, and philanthropist, Alfred Bader is a connoisseur whose passion for collecting and studying Dutch art has endured for more than fifty years. Tangible proof of this passion is The Bader Collection at the Agnes Etherington Art Centre on Queen's University's home campus in Kingston, Ontario. It was Alfred's vision that brought our conference series into being, and his generous support that has made the conferences, and this book, a reality.

In planning and organizing the Herstmonceux conferences, and in compiling and editing this volume, it has been a pleasure to collaborate with Queen's colleagues including Jacquelyn Coutr , David de Witt, Franziska Gottwald, and Ron Spronk. David and Franziska's move to Amsterdam, where David is now senior curator at Museum Het Rembrandthuis, has only strengthened their commitment to the cause. At each conference, efficient Castle staff and a terrific team of student volunteers helped the proceedings to run smoothly. We are honoured to thank the Samuel H. Kress Foundation for supporting conference participants' travel from North America. And most of all, we are grateful to Alfred and Isabel Bader. We acknowledge their generosity, and, equally important, their enduring commitment to fostering scholarly exchange and especially the study of

Rembrandt and the many talented artists who surrounded him in Leiden and Amsterdam.

The business of illustrating an art historical text is fraught with complications for authors who must grapple with diverse policies and costs for reproduction of works of art. This book, and the scholarly community as a whole, owe a tremendous debt to the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, the Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam, the National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC, and the J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles, for pioneering open access to high quality images of objects in their care. Other institutions that kindly cooperated in the illustration of this book are acknowledged in the pages that follow. In preparing the text, Elmer Kolfin and Eddy Schavemaker offered useful editorial advice. Matthew Hayes, Jennifer Kilian and Katy Kist produced elegant translations. At Amsterdam University Press, Inge van der Bijl and her colleagues guided the publication process with kindness and patience.

Sincere thanks must be offered to the authors represented here, and to all our other conference participants who contributed to our stimulating discussions and have shared their results in other forms. Their names are listed in the captions of the group photographs that accompany the Introduction. Lastly, I am grateful to Boudewijn Bakker, Christopher Brown, Marten Jan Bok, H. Perry Chapman, S.A.C. Dudok van Heel, the late Egbert Haverkamp-Begemann, and Eric Jan Sluijter for wise counsel along the way.

Stephanie S. Dickey
Bader Chair in Northern Baroque Art
Queen's University
Kingston, Canada
September 1, 2017

Introduction

Stephanie S. Dickey

Stephanie S. Dickey (ed.), *Rembrandt and his Circle. Insights and Discoveries*. Amsterdam University Press, 2017

DOI: 10.5117/9789462984004/INTRO

Rembrandt van Rijn is an artist whose paintings, prints, and drawings have continued to move, perplex, and surprise viewers for nearly four hundred years. Despite the wealth of publications that have been devoted to Rembrandt's art, there is always something to discover.¹ Since 2009, Queen's University's Bader International Study Centre at Herstmonceux Castle, East Sussex, UK, has become the venue for an ongoing series of international colloquia on Rembrandt and his circle.² These meetings have brought together a distinguished roster of academic art historians, museum professionals, conservators, and conservation scientists (figs. I.1, I.2, I.3) to share ideas about current and future directions in the study of Rembrandt, and to learn more about the talented artists who worked with him in Leiden and Amsterdam over the course of his long and influential career.

In the first conference at Herstmonceux, 'Expanding the Field of Rembrandt Studies', held in June 2009, our mandate was to take a fresh look at the scholarship around Rembrandt using every current means, from iconographic, contextual and archival study to technical examination and scientific analysis. By bringing together art historians and scientists whose research examines Rembrandt and his circle from different points of view, we were able to pose new questions, stimulate new projects, and spark new conversations. The lively discussions

that continued in the conferences that followed ('Rembrandt and his Circle: International Colloquium', July 2011, and 'New Directions in the Study of Rembrandt and his Circle', July 2013) have contributed to a variety of initiatives and projects: publications, museum exhibitions, technical investigations, and online research tools that are shaping the field of Rembrandt studies.³ This book presents a selected group of independent insights and discoveries first discussed at Herstmonceux. Each of the seventeen chapters examines a particular work of art or issue related to Rembrandt or an artist associated with him. Each essay stands on its own, and together they reflect the many ways in which current scholarship continues to open new perspectives and raise new questions about Rembrandt and his impact.

A key goal of our colloquia has been to explore the implications of Rembrandt's activities not only as a practicing artist, but as a colleague, teacher and mentor. Far from being the isolated genius imagined by nineteenth-century Romantics, Rembrandt was surrounded by friends and acolytes throughout his career; at least forty documented pupils are known.⁴ Related artists considered in this volume include his Leiden colleagues Jan van Vliet, Jan Lievens, and Gerrit Dou and his Amsterdam associates Ferdinand Bol, Gerbrand van den Eeckhout, and Samuel van Hoogstraten, as well

as artists such as Salomon Koninck and Jan van Noordt, whose work reflects the broader reach of Rembrandt's competitive presence in Amsterdam. Perhaps the most surprising connection traced here is with an artist who was already an established master when Rembrandt arrived in Amsterdam. S.A.C. Dudok van Heel presents compelling evidence that the renowned Haarlem portraitist Frans Hals rubbed elbows with Rembrandt when he came to Amsterdam to paint the group portrait now known as *The Meagre Company*. Hals returned to Haarlem, leaving the monumental canvas to be completed by Pieter Codde, but also leaving his mark on portraiture in Amsterdam.

From the first, our gatherings were designed to promote the exchange of ideas across disciplines. Thus, the contributions in this book have been shaped by diverse methodologies. Several authors consider contextual factors and literary evidence to explore what it meant for Rembrandt to establish himself as an artist of international stature in the thriving city of Amsterdam: how he positioned himself as artist and art collector. Thijs Weststeijn shows that Rembrandt and his contemporaries took a deep and even archaeological interest in their Teutonic past, thus shedding new light on the commission of the Batavian cycle for the Amsterdam Town Hall, including Rembrandt's *Conspiracy of the Batavians under Claudius Civilis* (1661–1661, Stockholm, Nationalmuseum). Boudewijn Bakker considers Rembrandt's engagement with the ideal of the 'universal painter', well-versed in all aspects of his art. This was an aim and an accomplishment that set Rembrandt apart in an era when artistic specialization was becoming the norm. Bakker traces the theoretical tradition that must have inspired Rembrandt's lofty ambition and discerns how this ideal may have shaped the magisterial *Self-Portrait* in Kenwood House. Perry Chapman traces the history of critical

responses to Rembrandt's activity as a collector of art and curiosities and considers what this activity meant for the artist himself. Jacquelyn Coutr  examines the taste for landscape paintings by Rembrandt and Jan Lievens on the Amsterdam art market of their time. Essays by Stephanie Dickey, Ildik  Ember, Lloyd DeWitt, and Martin Bijl present recently rediscovered paintings that can be attributed to artists in Rembrandt's circle. Their arguments depend on evidence ranging from contemporaneous visual and print sources to connoisseurship and scientific analysis.

Technical methods of examination and treatment play an increasingly important role in current approaches to the understanding of Rembrandt's working methods and their adaptation by his associates. In this volume, Arie Wallert and Michel van der Laar show how technical examination can shed light on a thorny question of attribution; their precise observations provide fresh insights into Rembrandt's complex painterly technique and confirm an attribution to the master himself. Katja Kleinert and Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg present technical analysis of a small and perplexing painting in Berlin that may well have begun as Rembrandt's first foray into painting the female nude. Moving beyond the technical study of paintings, materials scientist C. Richard Johnson and an interdisciplinary team of researchers demonstrate an innovative new method for identifying papers used in the printing of Rembrandt's etchings.

In studies of Rembrandt and the graphic arts, drawings and their uses in the artist's workshop have become a topic of great interest.⁵ Here, Jan Leja shows how drawings played a crucial role in Ferdinand Bol's production as a student of Rembrandt and later as a mature master and teacher himself. Rembrandt's brilliant approach to printmaking never ceases to

be admired, but relatively little attention has been given to how his innovative process might have been absorbed by his followers. This book presents three essays, by Jaco Rutgers, Peter van der Coelen, and Nadine Orenstein, that explore Rembrandt's impact as a printmaker and the network of artists who followed his example in etching. While Rutgers and Van der Coelen offer different perspectives on Rembrandt's collaboration with Jan van Vliet in Leiden, Orenstein demonstrates that the culture of printmaking around Rembrandt in Amsterdam was surprisingly extensive and deserves further inquiry. Circling back to the master himself, Amy Golahny examines *The Hundred Guilder Print* as a reflection of Rembrandt's competitive engagement with Italian Renaissance antecedents such as Marcantonio Raimondi's mysterious *Il Morbetto*, engraved after a design by Raphael, for which Rembrandt exchanged an impression of his own masterpiece. Golahny's study adds weight to Perry Chapman's assertion that Rembrandt's creative activities and his collecting of art were closely linked – just one of many productive connections that can be traced among the essays collected here.

Notes

1. For a recent review of the field, see Stephanie S. Dickey, 'Rembrandt and his Circle', in: Wayne Franits (ed.), *Ashgate Research Companion to Dutch Art* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2016), pp. 169–201.
2. Three conferences on Rembrandt and his circle took place at Herstmonceux on 27–29 June 2009, 21–24 July 2011, and 18–21 July 2013. Results of a fourth conference on 16–19 July 2015, focused on the work of Govert Flinck and Ferdinand Bol, will be published separately as Stephanie S. Dickey (ed.), *Ferdinand Bol and Govert Flinck: New Research* (Zwolle: W Books, 2017). A fifth meeting is in the works. These conferences have been made possible by generous support from Drs Alfred and Isabel Bader, the Samuel H. Kress Foundation, and Queen's University (Kingston, Canada).
3. Among publications discussed at Herstmonceux in formative stages are Erik Hinterding and Jaco Rutgers, *Rembrandt van Rijn, New Hollstein Dutch and Flemish Etchings, Engravings, and Woodcuts 1450–1700* (Oudekerk aan den IJssel: Sound & Vision, 2013); Eric Jan Sluijter, *Rembrandt's Rivals: History Painting in Amsterdam 1630–1650* (Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 2015); Thijs Weststeijn, *Art and Antiquity in the Netherlands and Britain: The Vernacular Arcadia of Franciscus Junius (1591–1677)* (Leiden: Brill, 2015), and numerous journal articles and technical reports. The conferences also fostered collegial exchange in advance of exhibitions such as *Rembrandt and the Face of Jesus* (Philadelphia Museum of Art, Milwaukee Art Museum, and Musée du Louvre, Paris, 2011–2012); *Rembrandt in America* (Raleigh, North Carolina Museum of Art, Cleveland, Art Institute, and Minneapolis, Institute of Arts, 2011–2012); *Rembrandt and the Dutch Golden Age* (Szépművészeti Múzeum, Budapest, 2014); and *Rembrandt. The Late Works* (National Gallery, London, and Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam, 2014–2015), and contributed to the development of two open access digital research archives, www.remdoc.org, hosted by Radboud University, Nijmegen, and www.rembrandtdatabase.org, hosted by the Rijksbureau voor Kunsthistorische Documentatie, The Hague.
4. For a recent overview, see David de Witt *et al.*, *Rembrandt's Late Pupils. Studying under a Genius*, Museum Het Rembrandthuis, Amsterdam, 2015.
5. For recent studies of drawing in Rembrandt's circle see, e.g., Holm Bevers *et al.*, *Drawings by Rembrandt and His Pupils. Telling the Difference*, J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles, 2009; Judith Noorman and David de Witt (eds), *Rembrandt's Naked Truth. Drawing Nude Models in the Golden Age*, Museum Het Rembrandthuis, Amsterdam, 2016, with further references.



▲ I-1. *Expanding the Field of Rembrandt Studies*, Queen's University Bader International Study Centre, Herstmonceux Castle, UK, 26 June 2009. Front Row (L-R): Ron Spronk, Eric Jan Sluijter, S.A.C. Dudok van Heel. Second Row: Isabel Bader, Alfred Bader, Stephanie Dickey, Ronni Baer, Taco Dibbits, Emilie Gordenker, Peter Schatborn, Christopher Brown, Shelley Perlove, H. Perry Chapman, Albert Blankert, Astrid Tumpel. Third Row: Ernst van de Wetering, Egbert Haverkamp-Begemann, Volker Manuth, David Bomford, Amy Golahny, Michael Zell, Betsy Wieseman, William Robinson, Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg, Paul Crenshaw, Melanie Gifford, Ashok Roy, Margriet van Eikema-Hommes, Petria Noble, Erma Hermens, Karin Groen, Thijs Weststeijn, Erik Hinterding. Back Row: David de Witt, Michiel Roscam Abbing, Pieter Roelofs, Friso Lammertse, Gregor Weber, Edwin Buijisen, Michiel Franken, Marten Jan Bok, Walter Liedtke, Jaco Rutgers, Gary Schwartz, Arie Wallert, Lloyd DeWitt, Christian Tumpel, Jeroen Giltaij, Martin Bijl, Janrense Boonstra, Jonathan Bikker, Doron Lurie, Holm Bevers. Not pictured: Boudewijn Bakker



▲ 1-2. *Rembrandt and his Circle: International Colloquium*, Queen's University Bader International Study Centre Herstmonceux Castle, 22 July 2011. Front Row (L-R): Stephanie Dickey, David de Witt, Marten Jan Bok, S.A.C. Dudok van Heel, Second Row: Ron Spronk, Erna Kok, Margriet van Eikema-Hommes, Jeroen Giltaij, Ernst van de Wetering, Alfred Bader, Isabel Bader, Ben Broos, Christopher Brown, Marieke de Winkle. Third Row: Claudia Laurenze-Landsberg, Amy Golahny, Petria Noble, Catherine Scallen, Michael Zell, Ann Adams, H. Perry Chapman, Nadine Orenstein, Ronni Baer, Egbert Haverkamp-Begemann, Ildikó Ember, Thijs Weststeijn, Jaco Rutgers, Loekie Schwartz, Peter van der Coelen, Ann Woollett, Lee Hendrix, Jan Leja. Fourth Row: Albert Blankert, Arie Wallert, Boudewijn Bakker, Volker Manuth, Paul Crenshaw, Dennis Weller, Melanie Gifford, Bob van den Boogert, Karin Groen, Janrense Boonstra, Erik Hinterding, Eric Jan Sluijter, Jacquelyn Coutré, Shelley Perlove, Gary Schwartz, Gregor Weber, Michiel Franken, David Bomford. Back Row: Betsy Wieseman, William Robinson, George Keyes, Tom Rassieur, Peter Schatborn, Christian Tico Seifert, Tom van der Molen, Jonathan Bikker, Ige Verslype



1-3. *New Directions in the Study of Rembrandt and his Circle*, Queen's University Bader International Study Centre, Herstmonceux Castle, 20 July 2013. Front Row (L-R): Jacquelyn Coutré, Erik Hinterding, Arie Wallert, Jaco Rutgers, Ben Broos, Amy Golahny, Michael Zell, David de Witt, Second Row: Hannah Woodward, Christopher White, Christopher Brown, Egbert Haverkamp-Begemann, Paul Crenshaw, Petria Noble, Volker Manuth, Melanie Gifford, Loekie Schwartz, Erna Hermens, Perry Chapman, Nadine Orenstein, Peter van der Coelen, Anne Woollett, Erna Kok, Ildikó Ember, Jeroen Giltaij, Dominique Surh, Robert Erdmann, Arthur Wheelock, Peter Schatborn. Third Row: Stephanie Dickey, Boudewijn Bakker, Robert Fucci, Marieke De Winkel, Gregor Weber, S.A.C. Dudok van Heel, Paul Crenshaw, David Bomford, C. Richard Johnson, Gary Schwartz, Jan Leja, Tom Rassiieur, Eric Jan Sluijter, Ronni Baer, Friso Lammertse, Ron Spronk, Michiel Franken, Annelies van Loon, Martin Bijl, Pieter Roelofs, Rудie van Leeuwen, Betsy Wieseeman, Marten Jan Bok, Lloyd DeWitt, Ilona van Tuinen, Thijs Weststeijn, Annelies van Loon, Ad Stijnman. Not pictured: Joris Dik, Anna Krekeler