

Kirstin Kennedy

Alfonso X of Castile-León

Royal Patronage, Self-Promotion and Manuscripts in Thirteenth-Century Spain

Alfonso X of Castile-León

Church, Faith and Culture in the Medieval West

The essential aim of this series is to present high quality, original and international scholarship covering all aspects of the Medieval Church and its relationship with the secular world in an accessible form. Publications have covered such topics as The Medieval Papacy, Monastic and Religious Orders for both men and women, Canon Law, Liturgy and Ceremonial, Art, Architecture and Material Culture, Ecclesiastical Administration and Government, Clerical Life, Councils and so on. Our authors are encouraged to challenge existing orthodoxies on the basis of the thorough examination of sources. These books are not intended to be simple text books but to engage scholars worldwide.

The series, originally published by Ashgate, has been published by Amsterdam University Press since 2018.

Series editors: Brenda Bolton, Anne J. Duggan and Damian J. Smith

Alfonso X of Castile-León

Royal Patronage, Self-Promotion, and Manuscripts in Thirteenth-Century Spain

Kirstin Kennedy

Cover illustration: Alfonso as the planet-god Jupiter, with disciples. *Libro de las formas & ymagenes*, Escorial MS h.I.16, fol. 1r. ©Patrimonio Nacional

Cover design: Coördesign, Leiden Lay-out: Crius Group, Hulshout

ISBN 978 94 6298 897 2 e-ISBN 978 90 4854 138 6 DOI 10.5117/9789462988972

NUR

© K. Kennedy / Amsterdam University Press B.V., Amsterdam 2019

All rights reserved. Without limiting the rights under copyright reserved above, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the written permission of both the copyright owner and the author of the book.

Every effort has been made to obtain permission to use all copyrighted illustrations reproduced in this book. Nonetheless, whosoever believes to have rights to this material is advised to contact the publisher.

To Ana Domínguez Rodríguez for her generosity – intellectual and material – and her kindness.

To Anne J. Duggan, without whose encouragement and advice this book would never have been published.

Contents

Acknowledgements	9
List of Figures	11
Abbreviations	13
Introduction: 'the king makes a book'	15
ı. Alfonso X, his Literary Patronage, and the Verdict of Historians	45
2. Alfonso in his Texts: literary models and royal authorship	89
3. Reality, Politics, and Precedent in Images of Alfonso	111
4. Codices Laid Out for a King: the appearance and production of Alfonsine manuscripts	153
5. The Circulation of Alfonsine Texts: astrological works and chronicles	185
Concluding Remarks	215
Manuscript Sources	221
Index	225

Acknowledgements

An author who has taken twenty years to complete her manuscript will have incurred many intellectual debts along the way, and the list that follows records my gratitude to those who have helped and inspired me. At every stage, I have been fortunate to work in well-stocked libraries with friendly, knowledgeable librarians. In Oxford, I would like to thank in particular the staff of the Modern Languages Faculty Library (especially Roger Shilcock), the staff of the Taylorian Library (particularly Jill Hughes, David Thomas, and John Wainwright), and the staff of the Bodleian Library. In Spain I was most grateful for the assistance of librarians in the Archivo Capitular, Seville, the Biblioteca Menéndez y Pelayo, Santander, and the Biblioteca de Catalunya, Barcelona. It was also a pleasure to examine two Alfonsine manuscripts in the Vatican Library. Most codices copied for Alfonso are now in Madrid or in the palace and monastery founded by Philip II at the nearby town of El Escorial. I am grateful to Cristina Guillén, rare books librarian at the Biblioteca Nacional, and Elena Luxán, of the Museo del Libro (now the Museo de la Biblioteca Nacional), for allowing me to study some of the library's most precious manuscripts. Manuel Sánchez Mariana and his small team at the Complutensian University library, the Biblioteca Histórica Marqués de Valdecilla, kindly brought me the Alfonsine Libros del saber de astrología to examine on numerous mornings. I would also like to extend my warmest thanks to the director of the Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de El Escorial, Padre José Luis del Valle Merino, and to his colleague Padre Teodoro† for welcoming me and supporting me during my many visits to study the Alfonsine treasures in their collection.

The origin of this book is a doctoral thesis supervised by Stephen Parkinson and submitted to the Faculty of Medieval and Modern Languages, Oxford, in Hilary Term 1999. The gathering of evidence for the arguments presented here would not have been possible without the generous support of the British Academy (at both doctoral and post-doctoral level), the Trustees of the Lady Allen Scholarship, the Trustees of the de Osma Studentship, the Curators of the Taylor Institution, and the fellows of The Queen's College, Oxford. I am extremely grateful for their largesse, without which I could not have carried out the crucial task of repeatedly examining the manuscripts.

Alan Deyermond†, Tom Earle, Jeremy Lawrance, Ian Macpherson†, Ian Michael, Malcolm Parkes†, Stephen Parkinson, David Rundle, Peter Russell†, and Ronald Truman were instrumental in steering the book in its early days as a thesis. I would also like to thank Simon Doubleday for

his measured comments and suggestions at book manuscript stage, and Erika Gaffney and Chantal Nicolaes of AUP for their patience and advice. I must also extend my gratitude to those responsible for photography and image rights at the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, the Biblioteca Nacional, Madrid, and at Spain's Patrimonio Nacional (in particular to María Belén Dotú Montes). There would have been no manuscript at all, though, were it not for the conversation and encouragement of my friends and colleagues over the years. I have particularly appreciated the constant friendship and support of: Simon Barton†, Antony and Marieta Coleridge, Marian Campbell, Paloma Castellanos Mira, Richard Edgcumbe, Ken Emond, Laura Fernández Fernández, Manuel Pedro Ferreira, Francisca Figueira, Christine Finn, Irene Frazão, Melanie Florence, Alejandro García Avilés, Nigel Griffin, Thomas Heneage, Martin Henig, David Hook, Ma Jesús Iglesias, Deirdre Jackson, Kris Kalinski, Kenneth, Christine and Claire Kennedy, Teresa Laguna Paúl, Ma Jesús López de Lerma Lázaro, Santiago López Ríos, John Lowden, Mark P. MacDonald, Giles Mandelbrote, Elizabeth Miller, Lesley Miller, Jesús Montoya Martínez†, Manuel Moreno, Peta Motture, Garry Mullender, Bernadette Nelson, Tom Nickson, Joanna Norman, Ma José Pérez Garrido, Carlos Rocha, Xon de Ros, Mariam Rosser-Owen, Alison Ribeiro de Menezes, Joseph T. Snow, Eric Southworth, Nigel Tattersfield, Barry Taylor, Holly Trusted, Rose Walker, Rowan Watson, Jane Whetnall, and Tom Windross. All errors are, naturally, my own.

Alfonso X was devoted to the Virgin Mary, but I must declare my allegiance to her mother, St Anne. Two scholars who bear her name, Ana Domínguez Rodríguez and Anne J. Duggan, have been instrumental in bringing this book to press, and it is to them that I dedicate this work, with enormous gratitude and affection.

List of Figures

Figure 1:	Alfonso, wearing the livery of the royal Order of Santa	
	María de la Estrella, with scribes, singers, and	
	musicians. Cantigas, códice rico, Escorial MS T.I.1,	
	fol. 5r. © Patrimonio Nacional	121
Figure 2:	Type and anti-type: the early years of Nebuchadnezzar	
	(below), whose life prefigures that of Alfonso (above).	
	General estoria IV, BAV MS Urb. Lat. 539, fol. 2v.	
	Reproduced by permission of the Biblioteca Apostolica	
	Vaticana, with all rights reserved. ©2018 Biblioteca	
	Apostolica Vaticana	127
Figure 3:	A scribe writes out a treatise on games played with	
	dice on the orders of Alfonso and supervised by his	
	agent. Libro de los juegos (Libro de los dados), Escorial	
	MS T.I.6, fol. 65r. © Patrimonio Nacional	132
Figure 4:	Book rubric framed by a roundel and square at the	
	start of the General estoria IV, BAV MS Urb. Lat. 539,	
	fol. 1r. Reproduced by permission of the Biblioteca	
	Apostolica Vaticana, with all rights reserved. ©2018	
	Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana	154
Figure 5:	Imperfect circles and untidy layout in the <i>Libro delas</i>	
	cruzes, Madrid MS 9294, fol. 136v. ©Biblioteca Nacional	
	de España	189
Figure 6:	Marginal note citing the opinion of 'the translators and	
	the emendator', with underdotting in the main text.	
	Libro conplido en los iudizios de las estrellas, Madrid,	
	MS 3065, fol. 142v. ©Biblioteca Nacional de España	199
Figure 7:	Marginal note in a reader's hand that refers to 'the	
	translators'. Libro conplido en los iudizios de las	
	estrellas, Madrid, MS 3065, fol. 46r. ©Biblioteca	
	Nacional de España	207
Figure 8:	Rubric announcing book number and contents, framed	
	in a roundel. <i>General estoria</i> I, Madrid MS 816, fol. 231v.	
	©Biblioteca Nacional de España	213

Abbreviations

BAV Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Vatican City

BL British Library, London

c. chapter

Cantigas, Códice rico Alfonso X, Las Cantigas de Santa María, Códice (2011) rico, MS T.I.1 Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de San

Lorenzo de El Escorial, ed. L. Fernández Fernández

and J.C. Ruiz Souza, 2 vols, (Madrid, 2011)

CCCM Corpus Christianorum, Continuatio medievalis

EHR English Historical Review

Emperor of Culture Emperor of Culture: Alfonso X the Learned of Castile

and his thirteenth-century renaissance, ed. R.I.

Burns (Pennsylvania, 1990)

Escorial Real Biblioteca del Monasterio de El Escorial, El

Escorial

HRJ Hispanic Research Journal

JWCI Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes

Madrid Biblioteca Nacional, Madrid
MGH Monumenta Germaniae historica

Murcia 2009 Alfonso X el Sabio, ed. I.G. Bango Torviso. Published

in conjunction with the exhibition at the Sala San

Estebán, Murcia (Murcia, 2009)

PL Patrologiae cursus completus, series latina (Patrolo-

gia latina), 221 vols, ed. J.P.Migne (Paris, 1841–1864)

Sevilla 1248 Congreso internacional conmemorativo del 750

aniversario de la conquista de la ciudad de Sevilla por Fernando III, Rey de Castilla y León, Sevilla, Real Alcázar, 23–27 de noviembre de 1998, ed. M.

González Jiménez (Madrid, 2000)

Introduction: 'the king makes a book'

From the vantage point of today, the literary patronage of Alfonso X (reigned 1252–1284) 'the Learned' (el Sabio) –, ruler of Castile and León (united in 1230 under his father Fernando) and of Islamic kingdoms recently incorporated into Christian ones such as Murcia, Seville, and Niebla – seems extraordinary for its time, in the context not only of Spain but also of the whole of thirteenth-century Europe. Praised by a contemporary for studying 'worldly and heavenly kinds of knowledge', he initiated what appears to have been a coherent programme of scholarship in Castilian, commissioning translations from the Arabic of astronomical works, sponsoring legal and historical compilations, as well as composing devotional poetry in praise of the Virgin Mary. His decision to promote the Castilian language was not a casual one. It was the principal language of his chancery and of the Christian population in the largest of his kingdoms, Castile, a kingdom which from the 1230s until the 1260s had undergone a period of further expansion as it absorbed the Islamic states which had submitted to his father Fernando and to Alfonso himself while still a prince and later when he became king.³

Alfonso's consistent patronage of works in the vernacular, at a date when Latin was the language of European scholarship, was remarkable, although the immediate consequence was that the works bearing his name, even the scientific ones, enjoyed limited circulation beyond his kingdoms. Despite this, some historians have argued that his decision was due to his desire to unite a kingdom of disparate languages (principally Arabic and Castilian) and faiths (Christian, Muslim, and Jewish) in a language and culture that would be common to all.⁴ More recently, however, the utopian ideal that this analysis implies has yielded to more hard-headed reassessments of his literary patronage. In the words of one historian, 'The Alphonsine cultural project should not, perhaps, be understood as an abstract reflection of

¹ For the extent of Alfonso's kingdoms, see J.F. O'Callaghan, *The Learned King: the reign of Alfonso X of Castile* (Philadelphia, 1993), 11–15.

^{2 &#}x27;Animum suum transtulit ad investigandas et perscrutandas mundanas scientias et divinas': F. Fita, 'Biografías de San Fernando y de Alfonso el Sabio por Gil de Zamora', *Boletín de la Real Academia de la Historia*, 5 (1884), 308–28, at 321.21.

³ For an assessment of Alfonso's cultural achievements in the context of those of his contemporaries, see R.I. Burns, 'Stupor Mundi: Alfonso X of Castile, the Learned', in Emperor of Culture, 1–13, at 5. For the increasing dominance of Castile in the Peninsula, see H. Kamen, Imagining Spain: historical myth and national identity (New Haven and London, 2008), 17.

⁴ A. Castro, España en su historia. Cristianos, moros y judíos (Buenos Aires, 1948), but cf. Burns, 'Stupor Mundi', 8–12.

enlightened toleration; rather the king's interest in translation was [...] an instrument of proto-absolutist, colonial control.'⁵

The ambitious scope of his literary legacy — or campaign for cultural dominance — is apparent in the fifteen manuscripts which survive today that have been attributed to his patronage and which are dated or dateable to his reign. Among these are a magnificently illuminated compilation on astronomical and horological instruments, the *Libros del saber de astrología*, and the *Lapidario*, a translation of three treatises on the virtues that precious and semi-precious stones receive from the movements of the constellations throughout the year. Alfonso is also credited with the patronage of legal compilations, two chronicles (unfinished at his death), and works on astrological prediction and magical talismans. Despite this emphasis on the Castilian language, the compilations of poems which narrate miracles of the Virgin Mary, the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, follow poetic conventions of the time and are composed in Galician-Portuguese. The text in two of the four surviving thirteenth-century copies of the *Cantigas* is illustrated with full folio panels of six and twelve miniatures.

Alfonso was not the only European ruler of the period to have a scholarly reputation, and his contemporaries, who were his relations as well, also commissioned translations of scientific works and compilations of chronicles and legal treatises. However, modern assessments of the scope of their patronage and the depth of their intellectual engagement suggest their achievements lagged behind those of the king of Castile. Frederick II, king of Naples and emperor of the Romans (ruled as emperor 1220–1250), who died just two years before Alfonso became king, was praised by the English chronicler Matthew Paris as a 'wonder of the world' ('stupor mundi')⁷ – a sobriquet prompted by his correspondence with the leading foreign scholars of his day, his patronage of philosophers and astronomers, and even his reputation as the father of Italian lyric poetry. However, Frederick's modern biographer, David Abulafia, has questioned such an uncritical assessment, and reinterpreted familiar evidence to argue that his scholarly interests were unexceptional for the period and inferior to the cultural activities taking

⁵ S.R. Doubleday, ""Criminal Non-Intervention": Hispanism, medievalism, and the pursuit of neutrality', in *In the Light of Medieval Spain: Islam, the West, and the Relevance of the Past*, ed. S.R. Doubleday and D. Coleman (New York, 2008), 1–31, at 16.

⁶ C. Álvar, 'Alfonso X', in *Diccionario filológico de literatura medieval española. Textos y transmisión*, ed. C. Álvar and J.M. Lucía Megías (Madrid, 2002), 3.

⁷ M. Parisiensis, *Chronica Majora*, ed. H. Richards Luard, 7 vols (London, 1872–1883), v (1880), 196 (for the year of Frederick's death, 1250).

place in contemporary Castile. 8 Nor does the patronage of the French kings who were Alfonso's contemporaries appear to match the Alfonsine cultural output – although arguably they provided him with a model to imitate and expand upon. Alfonso's first cousin, Louis IX of France (reigned 1226–1270), sought the company of learned men. According to Jean de Joinville, Seneschal of Champagne, Louis's fellow crusader, and his biographer, Louis regularly dined with the Parisian theologian Robert de Sorbonne, a man who Joinville described as a 'prud'homme', or a pious man of the world rather than a priest or member of a religious order. 9 Moreover, on his return from crusade in 1254, Louis established a royal library in the same room as the royal archives. His decision to do so was inspired by stories he had heard in the Holy Land about a great Saracen sultan who had founded a magnificent library to encourage the work of scholars and philosophers. Louis stocked his library with especially commissioned copies of devotional works and theological treatises. 10 His appetite for religious self-instruction was the subject of particular comment by his contemporary biographers, but, as Louis's modern biographer Jacques Le Goff noted recently, this did not distinguish him as a theologian or intellectual. 11 Within the Iberian Peninsula itself, Jaume I of Aragon (reigned 1213–1276), Alfonso's father-in-law, was a patron of troubadours and wrote an autobiography in vernacular Catalan, the Llibre del rei En Jaume (re-titled Crònica and Llibre dels fets by much later historians).¹² Despite this, Jaume does not appear to have wished to promote his association with letters, and never seems to have referred to himself as author of any work.13

- D. Abulafia, Frederick II: a medieval emperor (London, 1988; repr. 1992), chapter 8, especially 270.

 J. de Joinville, Vie de Saint Louis, ed. J. Monfrin (Paris, 1995), 15, paragraph 31. On his use of the term 'prud'homme', see Joinville, Vie, ed. Monfrin, cxviii—cxix, and M. Kauffmann, 'The Image of St Louis', in Kings and Kingship in Medieval Europe, ed. A.J. Duggan (London, 1993), 265—86 and plates 1–17 (271). Robert founded the Maison de Sorbonne, the hostel for poor students in Paris, which came in time to be the most distinguished college in the University of Paris: see A.L. Gabriel, The Paris Studium: Robert of Sorbonne and his legacy (Notre Dame, in/Frankfurt am Main, 1992).

 The account of the origin of Louis's library is given in the Vita written by his Dominican confessor Geoffrey of Beaulieu: see J. Le Goff, Saint Louis (Paris, 1996), 755—6; on Louis's library, see R. Branner, 'Saint Louis et l'enluminure parisienne au troisième siècle', in Septième centenaire de la mort de Saint Louis. Actes des colloques de Royaumont et de Paris (21–27 mai 1970) (Paris, 1976), 69—84, at 71.
- 11 Le Goff, Saint Louis, 754.
- 12 J.M. Pujol, 'The Llibre del rei En Jaume: a matter of style', in Historical Literature in Medieval Iberia, ed. A. Deyermond (London, 1996), 35–65, at 40, n. 8. For an English translation, see The Book of Deeds of James I of Aragon: a translation of the medieval Catalan Llibre dels Fets, trans. D.J. Smith and H. Buffery (Farnham, 2003).
- 13 Pujol, 'The Llibre del rei En Jaume', 35.

The distinctiveness of Alfonso's patronage lies not only in the range of works which bear his name, but also in the fact that he was apparently personally involved in writing some texts, and closely supervised the composition of others. The ostensibly documentary aspect of the miniatures and prologues to the works he commissioned, which show him dictating to scribes and which thereby stress his participation in the process of composition, appears to be corroborated posthumously by his nephew Juan Manuel in his *Crónica abreviada* (c. 1324), itself derived in part from a contemporary variant of the Alfonsine chronicles. ¹⁴ In the prologue to the work, Juan Manuel describes Alfonso as a benign patron with wide-ranging interests:

In all branches of knowledge he made many books and all of them very good, and also because he had much leisure to study the topics on which he wished to compose some books, because he lived in some places for a year, and two and longer still, according to those who lived by his patronage, so that whoever wished it spoke with him and when he wished it. And thus he had leisure to look into things he wanted for himself, as well as [time to] see and determine the elements of branches of knowledge which he had ordered the teachers and learned men to find out, whom he kept for this purpose at his court.\(^{15}

Juan Manuel's description of Alfonso presiding over scholarly research and debate as he travelled in a leisurely fashion around his kingdoms was doubtless intended to present readers with a favourable context for his own work. However, like the images of Alfonso in his royal manuscripts, it also suggests that the king's relationship with the scholars he patronized was an active one, in which the king pursued his own research as well. ¹⁶ Crucially, in Juan Manuel's account, Alfonso's court was not perpetually peripatetic,

- 14 C. Benito-Vessels, *Juan Manuel. Escritura y recreación de la historia* (Madison, wi, 1994), 13. 15 'En todas las ciencias fizo muchos libros e todos muy buenos. E lo al, por que auia muy grant espacio para estudiar en las materias de que queria componer algunos libros. Ca morava
- grant espacio para estudiar en las materias de que queria conponer algunos libros. Ca morava en algunos logares vn anno e dos e mas, avn, segunt dizen los que viuian a·la su merced, que fablauan con·el los que querian e quando el queria, e ansi auia espacio de estudiar en·lo que el queria fazer para si mismo, e avn para veer e esterminar las cosas de·los saberes quel mandaua ordenar a·los maestros e a·los sabios que traya para esto en su corte': J. Manuel, *Crónica abreviada*, in *Obras completas*, ed. J.M. Blecua, 2 vols (Madrid, 1983), ii, 575–6. My translation.
- 16 See M. Álvar, 'Alfonso X contemplado por Don Juan Manuel', in *La literatura de Sancho IV* (Actas del congreso internacional, Alcalá de Henares, 21–24 de febrero de 1994), ed. C. Álvar and J.M. Lucía Megías, (Alcalá de Henares, 1996), 98–100; see also F. Márquez Villanueva, *El concepto cultural alfonsí* (Madrid, 1992), 22. This is the edition to which I will refer throughout, except when I cite the additional essay included in the 2004 reprint.

and he implies that Alfonso's royal residences included areas where access to the king was more restricted, and where he would have been able to consult books for reference and study purposes instead of listening to them read aloud in a public setting.¹⁷

One of Alfonso's principal residences was the Seville *alcázar*, which during the second half of his reign he completely remodelled in the latest European gothic style (eliminating, in the process, almost all the pre-existing palace buildings of his Muslim predecessors). 18 There is scant evidence for the floorplan, however. The few surviving contemporary documents that refer to Alfonso's gothic palace concern the logistics of water supply, and stipulate the masses to be celebrated in 'our chapel of St Elizabeth' and in 'our chapel of St Clement in the *alcázar*'. 19 References to secular spaces in the building, however, are practically non-existent, although as might be expected, there is some evidence that these included a large hall for public gatherings. The fourteenth-century Crónica de Alfonso XI described the alcázar as the 'palace which is under the [sign of the] snail' ('[el] palaçio que es so el caracol'), and recorded how Alfonso XI summoned all his subjects to assemble there in September 1340.²⁰ Presumably, though, Alfonso X's rebuilt royal residence would have included spaces appropriate for study and scholarly discussion, as this distinction between public and more restricted areas of the royal household was beginning to emerge in the architecture of the castles and palaces built and adapted by his English and French contemporaries. Henry III of England had remodelled the royal apartments at Windsor on at least two occasions, and the final renovation of 1257 included privy chambers that had 'a turret with a certain oriel' for his queen, Eleanor of Provence.²¹

Kings also needed privacy beyond the confines of the palace. In 1298, local officials ordered the streets of York to be cleaned and pigsties removed in advance of Edward I's visit there because, as the bailiff observed, 'great people began to need more privacy [...] because repugnance overtakes the king's ministers staying in that town and also there dwelling and passing

¹⁷ On books read aloud at Charles V's court in 1370s France, see M.-H. Tesnière, 'Les manuscrits de la librairie de Charles V ont-ils été lus? L'enseignement des tables', in *Les manuscrits médiévaux, témoins de lectures*, ed. C. Croizy-Naquet, L. Harf-Lancner, and M. Szkilnik (Paris, 2015), 47–63, at 48.

¹⁸ M.A. Tabales Rodríguez, 'La transformación palatina del alcázar de Sevilla', *Anales de Arqueología Cordobesa*, 12 (2001), 195–213 (207–9).

¹⁹ R. Cómez Ramos, Arquitectura alfonsí (Barcelona, 1974), 28 and 138-9.

²⁰ Gran crónica de Alfonso XI, ed. D. Catalán, 2 vols (Madrid, 1976), ii, 350, c.296.

²¹ V. Jansen, 'Henry III's Windsor: castle-building and residences', in *Windsor: medieval archaeology, art and architecture of the Thames Valley*, ed. L. Keen and E. Scarff (Leeds, 2002), 95–109 (102).

through'.²² Alfonso in particular may have experienced the need for more secluded spaces because of the decline in his health as his reign progressed, and paradoxically this may also have favoured his activities as a patron of letters. The serious bouts of illness that increasingly afflicted him from the 1270s would have been followed by periods of convalescence away from public life, and these periods arguably provided further opportunities for study.²³

In recent decades, scholars have shown how themes and passages in the texts he patronized reflect his personal reactions to the events of his reign, ²⁴ and have sought to identify his hand in particular passages or poetic compositions. The devotional theme of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, which lends itself to personal, confessional subject-matter, has proved more fertile ground for this approach than analysis of chronicles, scientific works, and legal texts. That said, the passage cited most frequently to prove Alfonso's personal intervention in his works is in fact found in the account of the Book of Genesis included in the first part of the *General estoria*. ²⁵ Paradoxically, no evidence of Alfonso's handwriting survives. He did not add his signature (or sign-manual, as opposed to a seal) to the subscription on documents: it was his successor, Sancho IV, who was the first Castilian monarch to do this. ²⁶ A modern suggestion that marginal annotations in an astrological manuscript (Madrid MS 3065) are in his hand is unlikely. ²⁷

Few contemporary accounts and documents survive to offer a broader perspective on how Alfonso organized his cultural endeavours. It is ironic

²² D. Shaw, 'The Construction of the Private in Medieval London', Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies, 26 (1996), 447–77, at 453.

²³ H. Salvador Martínez, *Alfonso X, the Learned: a biography*, trans. O. Cisneros (Leiden, 2010), in particular c.7, 'Illness and Intellectual Pursuits', 213–50.

²⁴ For example J.F. O'Callaghan, Alfonso X and the 'Cantigas de Santa Maria': a poetic biography (Leiden/Boston/Cologne, 1998); S.R. Doubleday, The Wise King: a Christian prince, Muslim Spain, and the birth of the Renaissance (New York, 2015).

²⁵ *General estoria* i.16, c.14: Alfonso X, el Sabio, *General estoria*, ed. P. Sánchez-Prieto Borja, Biblioteca Castro, 10 vols (Madrid, 2009), ii, 393.

²⁶ The charter signed by Sancho is dated 18 January 1285: see F.J. Hernández, 'Two Weddings and a Funeral: Alfonso X's monuments in Burgos', in *Picturing Kingship in Medieval Castile*, ed. K. Donahue-Wallace and T. Nickson, Special Issue, HRJ, 13, no. 5 (2012), 407–33, at 431, n. 47. Edward III was the first English king to add his sign-manual to a document of June 1362 – in imitation of Pedro I of Castile, to whom the letter was addressed. See P.D.A. Harvey and A. McGuinness, *A Guide to British Medieval Seals* (London, 1996), 2. On the importance of signatures generally, see D. Ganz, "Mind in Character": ancient and medieval ideas about the status of the autograph as an expression of personality', in *Of the Making of Books: medieval manuscripts, their scribes and readers*, ed. P.R. Robinson and R. Zim (Aldershot, 1997), 280–99.

²⁷ A. Galmés de Fuentes, *Influencias sintácticas y estilísticas del árabe en la prosa medieval castellana* (Madrid, 1956), 7–8 (but cf. Chapter five below).

that while he instigated the practice of compiling registers of chancery documents, none from his reign survive. Of the nearly 2000 extant documents that were issued by his chancery, only a handful refer to his support of cultural institutions (such as universities) or to artists and craftsmen in royal employ. Key among these are a 1254 charter in which he founded a 'studium and general schools of Latin and Arabic' at Seville, and a snippet from a 1260 document that refers to foreign physicians brought to the city at the king's behest. Both these texts are frequently associated in modern narratives of Alfonsine patronage, 28 although in reality the foundation of the *studium* and the visit of the physicians were probably quite separate events, albeit both prompted by royal interest in learning. Therefore, just as recent research on the workings of the Alfonsine chancery has focused on a close reading of the documents themselves in order to understand how duties were apportioned and how the institution functioned, ²⁹ so too a close study of the codicological and palaeographical features of the manuscripts themselves can reveal something of the circumstances under which they were assembled. Perhaps what is most striking about the codices produced for Alfonso is that nearly all reveal an extraordinary number of changes to layout, miniatures, content, and order of contents at a late stage in the copying process. These multiple alterations suggest a constant reworking and reconfiguring of the scribes' exemplars, which in turn implies a high level of supervision and control at the stage of manuscript production.³⁰ The physical evidence of the books themselves, then, confirms the personal involvement of the king implied by the texts and images they contain.

The rare surviving contemporary accounts and the testimony of the manuscripts themselves reveal Alfonso's exceptionally close involvement in the preparation of the works he commissioned. Yet while this distinguishes him from other contemporary royal patrons, the aims of his patronage and the way in which it is presented echo the cultural ambitions and depictions of princely patrons elsewhere in Europe. The richly produced codices that

²⁸ For example, M. González Jiménez, Alfonso X el Sabio (Barcelona, 2004), 424-5.

²⁹ E.S. Procter, 'The Castillian Chancery during the Reign of Alfonso X, 1252–1284', in *Oxford Essays in Medieval History Presented to H.E. Salter*, introduced by F.M. Powicke (Oxford, 1934), 104–21 (116 and 120). The close readings by Marina Kleine of Alfonsine documents have revealed how chancery practice differed from the theory recorded in Alfonsine legal writings: *La cancillería real de Alfonso X. Actores y prácticas en la producción documental* (Puerto de Santa María/Seville, 2015), for example at 118, on the division of the tasks of scribes.

³⁰ E. Ruiz García, *'Rex scribens.* Discursos de la conflictividad en Castilla (1230–1350)', in *La monarquía como conflicto en la corona castellano-leonesa (c. 1230–1504*), ed. J.M. Nieto Soria (Madrid, 2006), 359–422, at 375.

Alfonso commissioned and the illuminated chronicles, Bibles, and Psalters copied for the thirteenth-century kings of France all aimed to convey at the most basic level the same messages – that is to say, they were symbols which reinforced the royal and imperial status of their patrons. Toloser to Alfonso's home, the *Liber feudorum maior*, a cartulary compiled in the course of the late twelfth century by the counts of Barcelona, conveyed complex statements of comital and royal power by a combination of splendid illuminations and the careful selection, juxtaposition, and rubrication of documents. Alfonso's aggressive promotion of Castilian also had echoes in the linguistic policy of his thirteenth-century Capetian contemporaries, who equally sought to unite their linguistically diverse territories under the banner of the French language.

The ways in which Alfonso's learned activities were presented, therefore, owe much to literary and iconographical precedent. Juan Manuel's evocation of Alfonso's scholarly court also evoked the bygone worlds of Caesar and Charlemagne, two emperors who similarly embraced learning. Readers of the Crónica abreviada might have recalled the description in Alfonso's own Estoria de Espanna, derived from Suetonius's biographies of the Roman emperors, of Julius Caesar's remarkable ability to find moments day and night in which to study and read, even while on military campaign.34 Alternatively, Alfonso may have reminded them of Charlemagne, who ruled as the Roman emperor Charles I (800-814) and whose biographer, Einhard, described how the emperor 'paid the greatest attention to the liberal arts' and commissioned copies of chronicles and also 'began a grammar of his native tongue'.35 (A century later, when Charles V of France's chaplain Pierre Bohier praised his master's enthusiasm for having literary texts read aloud to him, even on days when he was about to join battle, it was with Charlemagne and not with Caesar that he drew his comparison.³⁶) Tellingly

³¹ Le Goff, Saint Louis, 580.

³² A.J. Kosto, 'The *Liber feudorum maior* of the Counts of Barcelona: the cartulary as an expression of power', *Journal of Medieval History*, 27 (2001), 1–22.

³³ A. Blanc, La langue du roi est le français. Essai sur la construction juridique d'un principe d'unicité de la langue de l'État royal (Paris, 2010), 200–206.

³⁴ *Primera crónica general de España*, ed. R. Menéndez Pidal and D. Catalán, 2 vols, 3rd edn (Madrid, 1977), i, 94 (c.117); Gaius Suetonius Tranquillus, *The Twelve Caesars*, trans. R. Graves, rev. M. Grant, 3rd edn (London, 2003), 28–9 (i.56). I am grateful to Mary Beard for this reference.

³⁵ Einhard, 'The Life of Charlemagne', in Einhard and Notker the Stammerer, *Two Lives of Charlemagne*, trans. L. Thorpe (Harmondsworth, 1969), book iii: 'The Emperor's Private Life', at 82. For Charlemagne as a model for Alfonso, see Doubleday, *The Wise King*, at 163.

³⁶ C. Daniel, 'Le livre et l'exercice du pouvoir: culture livresque du monarque et symbole politique de la bibliothèque royale', in *L'Univers du livre médiéval. Substance, lettre, signe*, ed. K. Ueltschi (Paris, 2014), 73–92, at 85.

in the context of Alfonso's own political ambitions, which in the *Cantigas* merge with his Marian devotion, the *Estoria de Espanna* does not refer to Charlemagne's learning, but instead records how he had been devoted to the Virgin Mary since childhood and 'was called "the Great" because he performed great and illustrious deeds, both in the expansion of his kingdom and in the organization of the affairs of the holy church'.³⁷

The imperial echoes in Juan Manuel's description of Alfonso's active participation in the work of the scholars he patronized at court were made explicit in several of the works the king himself commissioned. Alfonso's reign was marked by his repeated attempts to be elected and acknowledged as *Rex Romanorum* ('King of the Romans'). It was a title he believed to be rightfully his because his mother, Beatriz, was the granddaughter of the emperor Frederick I Barbarossa (d. 1190), and the daughter of Philip of Swabia (assassinated 1208), duke of Swabia and king of Germany, who had unsuccessfully sought election as emperor himself. For almost two decades – between 1257, the date of his disputed election, and 1275, when Pope Gregory X forced him to renounce his claims to the imperial crown – Alfonso maintained an imperial chancery that issued documents in Latin designating him *Rex Romanorum semper Augustus* (indicative of his status as emperor-in-waiting), and which were authenticated with a seal that was closely modelled on the one that had been used by Frederick II.³⁸

In the context of Alfonso's Castilian chancery, meanwhile, the seal appended with threads of blue silk to a 1262 letter patent on the consecration of the bishops-elect of Osma and Cuenca in Seville cathedral includes the impressions of eight intaglios.³⁹ This may also have been intended to have

³⁷ Primera crónica general, c.597 (ii, 340) on his devotion to the Virgin, and c.623 (ii, 357): 'Este Carlos fue llamado el Grant por que fizo grandes fechos et granados, asi en ensanchamiento de su reyno commo en ordenamiento del estado de la sancta eglesia.' On the negative and positive images of Charlemagne presented in the Alfonsine chronicle, see C.F. Fraker, 'Alfonso X, the Empire and the *Primera crónica*', *Bulletin of Hispanic Studies* 55 (1978), 95–102.

³⁸ On the imperial chancery, see E.S. Procter, *Alfonso X of Castile: patron of literature and learning* (Oxford, 1951), 129–30, and O'Callaghan, *Learned King*, at 202. For Alfonso's imperial seal in 1266, see J.M. de F. Olmos, 'El sello diplomático real en los reinos de Castilla y León en el siglo XIII', in *Murcia 2009*, 62–75, at 73; see also 68. A depiction of Frederick's seal bearing the inscription 'FRIDERICVS D[E]I GRA[TIA] IMPERATOR ROMANORV[M] SEMP[ER] AVGVST[VS]' forms the frontispiece for the *Historia diplomatica Friderici secundi*, ed. J.L.A. Huillard-Bréholles, 6 vols (Paris, 1852–1861), ii (1852).

³⁹ Madrid: Archivo Historico Nacional, Sigilografía-Impronta no. 31; *Murcia 2009*, 73; A. Guglieri Navarro, *Catálogo de sellos de la sección de sigilografía del Archivo Historico Nacional. I: sellos reales* (Madrid, 1974), no. 88.

imperial resonance: Charlemagne had used antique gems as seal matrices. ⁴⁰ Even after Pope Gregory had definitively quashed his imperial ambitions, Alfonso styled himself 'by the grace of God king of the Romans' in documents issued in connection with the weddings of two of his sons at Burgos in 1281. ⁴¹ His choice of title on this particular occasion was motivated by the fact that his third son, Juan, was marrying Juana, daughter of William, seventh marquis of Montferrat (in the northern Italian region of Lombardy). William had been a staunch supporter of Alfonso's imperial pretensions since the late 1260s, an allegiance which was formally cemented when he married Alfonso's (legitimate) daughter, Beatriz, at Murcia in 1271. ⁴²

While the miniatures in the manuscripts that bear his name do not depict him wearing an imperial crown (he was never formally crowned as such), the images of him do include elements of imperial symbolism, and Alfonso's imperial destiny is a thread that runs through the narrative fabric of the *Estoria de Espanna*. The high, backless thrones draped with rich red, blue, or black cloths striped with gold on which he sits in the miniatures that introduce the manuscripts he commissioned recall the backless throne on his imperial seal. However, it falls short of the splendour of the actual imperial throne which, gilded and studded with gems and cameos, was captured by Charles I d'Anjou from the Hohenstaufen emperor's army in February 1266. ⁴³ This may have provided the model for the king's throne – described as a chair plated with gold and silver, and set with many precious stones – in the *Castigos e documentos*, a mirror for princes attributed to the patronage of Alfonso's son Sancho. ⁴⁴

The depiction of Alfonso's throne in his manuscripts is also unlike contemporary painted images of the thrones of the kings of France, though

⁴⁰ P. Worm, 'From Subscription to Seal: the growing importance of seals as signs of authenticity in early medieval royal charters', in *Strategies of Writing: studies on text and trust in the Middle Ages. Papers from 'Trust in Writing in the Middle Ages' (Utrecht, 28–29 November, 2002)*, ed. P. Schulte, M. Mostert, and I. van Renswoude (Turnhout, 2008), 63–83 (at 66). Cameos and intaglios, ancient and medieval, were highly prized in the thirteenth century: H. Wentzel, "Portraits à l'antique" on French Mediaeval Gems and Seals', *JWCI*, 16 (1953), 342–50 (at 342-3).

⁴¹ O'Callaghan, Learned King, 252.

⁴² Crónica de Alfonso X Según el Ms. n/2777 de la Biblioteca del Palacio Real (Madrid), ed. M. González Jiménez with an index by MªA. Carmona Ruiz (Murcia, 1998), 212, n. 315 (c.75); O'Callaghan, Learned King, 252 and 211; González Jiménez, Alfonso X (2004), 233–4.

⁴³ J. Gardner, 'Likeness and/or Representation in English and French Royal Portraits c.1250–c.1300', in *Das Porträt vor der Erfindung des Porträts*, ed. M. Buchsel and P. Schmidt (Mainz, 2003), 141–52, at 146.

⁴⁴ Cited in I.G. Bango Torviso, 'Las señas de identidad del monarca y su linaje', in *Murcia 2009*, 42–53, at 48.

these too were intended to reinforce French imperial pretensions. From the mid twelfth century onwards, French monarchs were shown seated on an x-frame chair, a form which had originated in the Ancient world and which came to symbolize the authority and imperial ambitions of the Capetian monarchy. Within the folios of the Alfonsine manuscripts themselves, imperial heraldry occasionally appears on the robes Alfonso wears, and in the borders of the miniatures in the *códice rico* of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*. Eagles and fleurs-de-lis, symbols of the Staufen dynasty, decorate Alfonso's robe in one of the miniatures which accompanies *cantiga* 90, a poem that praises the power of the Virgin's virtue to defeat the devil. References in royal documents to tailors and dressmakers employed by the royal household suggest the importance of clothes to promote Alfonso's vision of kingship and dynasty at court; and the archaeological evidence of the textiles recovered from royal tombs demonstrates the prominent role of heraldry on the garments Alfonso and his family actually wore. The suggestion of the same of the same of the same of the prominent role of heraldry on the garments Alfonso and his family actually wore.

The use of heraldry, incorporated into clothing or applied to buildings, monuments and tombs, in order to proclaim identity and lineage, was a device that Alfonso's royal and noble European contemporaries also drew upon. Pierre Flote (d. 1302), chancellor to Philip IV, 'the Fair', of France (r. 1285-1314), commissioned an heraldic frieze to decorate the great hall of his château in Ravel (in the Auvergne region of southern-central France), while the image of a late thirteenth-century English noblewoman which prefaces a devotional miscellany made for her shows her dressed in garments coloured to reflect the heraldry of her family and that of her husband. ⁴⁸ By contrast, from the 1240s onwards Louis IX of France had increasingly and

⁴⁵ C. Lagane, 'Les sièges en "x" au Moyen Âge. De la *sella castrensis* au *faldistorium*', *Cahiers LandArc* 17 (2016), 1–11, at 8. Available at www.landarc.fr [accessed 24 September 2017].

⁴⁶ Escorial MS T.I.1, fol. 132r (panel 5): see L. Fernández Fernández, "Este Livro, com' achei, fez á onr' e a loor da Virgen Santa Maria". El proyecto de las *Cantigas de Santa María* en el marco del escritorio regio. Estado de la cuestión y nuevas reflexiones', in Cantigas, *Códice rico* (2011), ii, 45–78 (74).

⁴⁷ Hernández, 'Two Weddings and a Funeral', at 427–8. On the importance of colour and (heraldic) signs as a way of providing a coherent identity for a medieval household, see C.M. Woolgar, *The Great Household in Late Medieval England* (New Haven/London, 1999), 170–1. For the enthusiastic adoption of heraldry by the ruling classes in Spain, see L. Grant, 'The Castle of Castile. An Image of Power, or the Power of an Image?', in *Images, pouvoirs et norms. Exégèse visuelle de la fin du Moyen Âge (XIIIe-XVe siècle)*, ed. F. Collard, F. Lachaud and L. Scordia (Paris, 2017), 215–35 (especially 219–20).

⁴⁸ S. Berger, 'La mise en scène du pouvoir par les arts. Commandes artistiques et grands programmes édilitaires des conseillers des derniers Capétiens autour de 1300', in *Images, pouvoirs et norms*, ed. Collard, et al., 25–45 (at 37). A. Bennett, 'A Book Designed for a Noblewoman: an illustrated *Manuel des Péchés* of the thirteenth century', in *Medieval Book Production: assessing*

deliberately dressed in robes of blue, and as a consequence the colour came to symbolize his government and the Capetian dynasty.⁴⁹

The dynastic and political messages contained in the depictions of Alfonso as patron and author in the manuscripts he commissioned demonstrate that his intellectual curiosity went hand in hand with a practical desire to exploit this curiosity as a vehicle for the promotion of himself and his kingship. This double purpose, which underpins all the works which bear his name, is widely acknowledged by scholars. However, their analysis of the ways in which he presents himself in the manuscripts he commissioned often assumes that the primary purpose of these images is to offer an accurate reflection of his role as patron and of the process by which these codices were produced. In fact, the main function of the prologues and miniatures to these Alfonsine works is to present a message about his kingship to a particular audience, and the ways in which Alfonso is depicted to convey that message are determined by the type of text in question. In other words, Alfonso may have been more involved in the composition of the works bearing his name than other patrons of his day; but his involvement is stressed in the works themselves only insofar as it offers a useful means of conveying a particular political message.

A similar caveat applies to attempts to elucidate the process of copying the manuscripts with reference to the manuscript miniatures. And while codicology crucially supports arguments that Alfonso maintained close contact with his translators, compilers, scribes, and artists, it also suggests that the king remained distant from the mechanical process of coping and assembling the manuscripts. Moreover, aspects of the materials and layout of three codices widely held to have been made for the king (Madrid, MS 816, *General estoria* I; Madrid, MS 3065, *Libro conplido en los iudizios de las estrellas*, and Madrid, MS 9294, *Libro de las cruzes*) suggest that they were in fact commissioned for other readers, albeit ones close to court circles.

The first part of this book assesses the evidence for royal authorship in the manuscripts themselves. This subject has been tackled before, but with the assumption that these representations of Alfonso constitute a unique documentary record of the extent of his personal involvement in each work. If, however, these representations are considered in terms of their intended audience, it becomes clear that every text offered writers and artists the opportunity to frame Alfonso's kingship in a new and specific way. The fact

the evidence. Proceedings of the Second Conference of the Seminar in the History of the Book to 1500, Oxford, July 1988, ed. L.L. Brownrigg (Los Altos Hills, ca, 1990), 163–81.

49 Le Goff, Saint Louis, 139 and 631.

they do precisely that suggests the works being produced were meticulously planned for an audience that would appreciate the carefully presented text.⁵⁰ This does not diminish Alfonso's involvement in the process of composition; but it does suggest that the differences in the depictions of him as patron and author in the manuscripts he commissioned are not primarily intended to document his role as author or coordinator of a work, but are designed to show how he projects the vision of his kingship onto a given text for the benefit of a particular readership.⁵¹ The juxtaposition of miniatures at the beginning of the Vatican manuscript of Part IV of the General estoria, for example, shows him not only as the guardian of the history of his people, but also as a king whose right to rule is established by Nebuchadnezzar's biblical precedent (see Figure 2). The pairing of these two images recalls the system of types and anti-types in biblical scholarship whereby events in the Old Testament are shown to prefigure those in the New. In this case, the New Testament event is substituted by an idealized depiction of Alfonso surrounded by courtiers. On the other hand, the only surviving image of Alfonso to preface a compilation of astrological works – the historiated initial which opens the two extant quires of the *Libro de las formas & ymagenes* – depicts him clad in purple garments (see the image on the cover of this book), a clear allusion to Jupiter, the planet-god, law-maker, and scholar-king. The two images of Alfonso that accompany the prologues in two of the manuscripts of the Cantigas de Santa Maria – the códice rico (Escorial, MS T.I.1, fol. 5r, and see Figure 1) and the códice de los músicos (Escorial, MS b.I.2, fol. 29r) – are at once emblematic of his role as patron and author,⁵² and a statement of his intention to usurp the traditional role of the clergy and present himself as mediator between the divine and the earthly.⁵³

⁵⁰ In this respect, see the comments by R.M. Rodríguez Porto, 'Inscribed/effaced: the *Estoria de Espanna* after 1275', in *Picturing Kingship in Medieval Castile*, *HRJ*, 13, no. 5 (2012), 387–406, at 393.

⁵¹ Cf A. Liuzzo Scorpo, 'The King as Subject, Master and Model of Authority: the case of Alfonso X of Castile', in *Every Inch a King: comparative studies on kings and kingship in the ancient and medieval worlds*, ed. L. Mitchell and C. Melville (Leiden, 2013), 269–84, on Alfonso's legal and literary works as vehicles to consolidate different aspects of his kingship.

⁵² On the *Cantigas* miniatures as evidence of royal authorship and manuscript production, see G. Menéndez Pidal, 'Los manuscritos de las *Cantigas*. Cómo se elaboró la miniatura alfonsí', *Boletín de la Real Academia de Historia*, 150 (1962), 25–51, at 28 and 49; G. Menéndez Pidal, 'Cómo trabajaron las escuelas alfonsíes', *Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica*, 5 (1951), 363–80, repr. in *Varia Medievalia II* (Madrid, 2003), 13–41; and more recently, with colour plates, see I.G. Bango Torviso, "Nós, Don Alfonso, mandamos fazer", in *Murcia* 2009, 202–7, at 204–5.

⁵³ A. García Avilés, "Este rey tenno que enos ídolos cree". Imágenes milagrosas en las *Cantigas de Santa María*', in Cantigas, *Códice rico* (2011), ii, 523–59, at 559.

Despite the similarity in the presentation of Alfonso in the two miniatures, the colours of the clothes which the king and his entourage wear differ markedly, suggesting the images were not aimed at the same audience. In the códice rico the king and his musicians wear the black and red livery of the confraternity-cum-military Order of Santa María de la Estrella (or 'of Cartagena', as it was also known initially, because it was attached to the monastery at Cartagena), which the king had established in around 1272.54 In the *códice de los músicos*, the king's red cloak and blue tunic covered in gold stars distinguish him as Mary's troubadour, and anticipate the way he will be depicted later in the manuscript. Of the magnates, tonsured clerics, and musicians grouped around him, only the musicians wear black and red. These differences suggest that the *códice rico*, with its depiction of scribes and musicians dressed in the colours of the Order of Santa María, could have been destined for a chapel restricted to members of the Order, whereas the códice de los músicos, which depicts nobles gathered behind the king as he dictates to a group of scribes, was aimed at a wider, courtly audience.

The close working relationship which these changing representations imply between Alfonso X, the scholars responsible for translating, compiling, and composing the texts, and those who produced them in lavish manuscript form is explored further in the second part of this book. Codicological evidence aside, theories about where and how the Alfonsine scriptorium functioned have been influenced by close textual readings of the Alfonsine works themselves, which reveal a remarkably consistent and carefully constructed image of Alfonso as the fundamental source of all legal, historical, and scientific knowledge in his kingdoms.⁵⁵ The frequent erasures, alterations, and additions in many of the codices associated with Alfonso support this impression of a carefully constructed royal persona; but while it seems the king exercised close control over the content of a work, he probably did not direct the copying process as well. Instead, there is evidence in the manuscripts associated with him, and in other thirteenth-century documents, to suggest that he was not involved in the physical production of the codices that bear his name. This work was probably coordinated by a scribe or agent appointed to act on his behalf, who recruited scribes and artists as required. On at least one occasion, moreover, this agent relied on

⁵⁴ C. de Ayala Martínez, Las órdenes militares hispánicas en la Edad Media (siglos XII–XV) (Madrid, 2003), 108–12.

⁵⁵ J. Rodríguez-Velasco, 'Theorizing the Language of Law', *Diacritics*, 36, nos $_3$ –4 (2006), 64–86 analyses how Alfonso's compilers rework their sources and suppress reference to other authors, past and present, to present the king as the sole authority of learning in his kingdom.

the work of professional scribes working outside the court. This seems to have been the case for the (now fragmentary) work on angels and talismanic magic, the *Astromagia* (BAV, MS Reg. Lat. 1283^a). Alfonso's willingness to delegate his authority to different trusted representatives is echoed in the way his chancery functioned, as Marina Kleine has recently shown. Her study of the dating clauses in Alfonsine charters identified a group of fifty-three people who drew up documents in the king's name, of whom twenty-three did not meet the professional requirements stipulated for their role by Alfonso in his legal codes, as they were neither notaries nor 'alcaldes' (judges responsible for ordinary judicial business).⁵⁶

The scattered evidence for book production in the Iberian Peninsula suggests that it would have been possible for Alfonso and his circle to draw on the work of lay and ecclesiastical *scriptoria* to produce the manuscripts that bear his name. Certainly the scribes responsible for the copies of the chronicles were familiar with earlier legal manuscripts copied in the Peninsula, as the layout they adopt contains echoes of the layout of the Visigothic lawcode. Long before Alfonso's reign, moreover, there had been centres of monastic and secular book production in the Christian territories of the Peninsula. In Lorvão, northern Portugal, the Benedictine monastery of S. Mamede, perhaps founded by Ordoño I of León (r. 850-866), had become an important centre of manuscript production by the mid twelfth century. Surviving codices copied in the Lorvão scriptorium include the magnificent Livro das aves (dated 1184), an illustrated summary of De bestiis et aliis rebus by Hugues de Fouilloy, and a copy of Beatus of Liébana's commentary on the Apocalypse made by the scribe Egas in 1189.⁵⁷ As a centre for book production in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, Lorvão was second only to the Augustinian monastery of Santa Cruz de Coimbra, which had been founded in 1131 with royal support, while the Cistercian monastery established at Alcobaça in the 1150s equally became an important centre of learning and book production.⁵⁸

⁵⁶ Kleine, La cancillería real, 50, 58-9, and 87.

⁵⁷ Both manuscripts are now in Lisbon, Arquivo Nacional da Torre do Tombo, MSS Lorvão 5 and Lorvão 43 respectively. For an edition and Portuguese translation of the *Livro das aves*, see: *Livro das aves*, ed. M.I. Rebelo Gonçalves (Lisbon, 1999). For the commentary on the Apocalypse, see A. De Egry, *O Apocalipse de Lorvão e a sua relação com as ilustrações medievais do apocalipse* (Lisbon, 1972).

⁵⁸ M.A. Miranda, *A iluminura de Santa Cruz no tempo de Santo António* (Lisbon, 1996); M.A. Miranda, 'A iluminura românica em Portugal', in *A iluminura em Portugal. Identidade e influências*, ed. A.A. Nascimento. Published in conjunction with the exhibition at the Biblioteca Nacional, Lisbon (Lisbon, 1999), 127–235; A. Duggan, 'The Lorvão Transcription of Benedict of Peterborough's

Late thirteenth-century artisans in Portugal could produce sophisticated manuscripts, as evinced by the *Cancioneiro da Ajuda* (so-called after the royal library at the Ajuda Palace in Lisbon, where it has been kept since 1832), but this is a unique survival and as such cannot be attributed to a particular workshop. ⁵⁹ Meanwhile, a rare surviving library inventory from the same period provides evidence for the crucial role played by the Lisbon monastery of São Vicente de Fora in the copying and circulation of manuscripts, while the prestige of French universities in the thirteenth century meant scholars and books travelled to and fro across borders from Portugal to Paris. ⁶⁰ The medieval kingdom of Aragon was also home to a flourishing culture of letters in secular and ecclesiastical, royal and non-royal contexts. ⁶¹

In general, the surviving manuscripts dateable to the twelfth and thirteenth centuries suggest that methods of Castilian book production followed the same models as those of the rest of Europe. ⁶² Palaeographic and stylistic uniformity coupled with the comparative paucity of documentary sources make study of the location and process of book production and the book trade in the twelfth- and thirteenth-century Christian kingdoms of Castile and León difficult. ⁶³ However there was a *scriptorium* in Toledo associated with the figure of the town's archbishop, Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, in the first half of the thirteenth century; and the existence of *scriptoria* can be

Liber Miraculorum Beati Thome: Lisbon, Cod. Alcobaça CCXC/143', Scriptorium 51, no. 1 (1997), 51–67.

- 59 P. Nabais et al., 'Singing with Light: an interdisciplinary study on the medieval Ajuda Songbook', *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies*, 8, no. 2 (2016), 283–312 (307).
- 60 A.A. Nascimento, 'Livros e claustro no século XIII em Portugal. O inventário da Livraria de S. Vicente de Fora em Lisboa', *Didaskalia*, 15 (1985), 229–42; M.A. Bilotta, 'Un manuscrit des *Décrétales* de Grégoire IX à l'usage de l'université de Toulouse conservé dans les archives nationales de la Torre do Tombo à Lisbonne: quelques aspects iconographiques', in *Portuguese Studies on Medieval Illuminated Manuscripts*, ed. M.A. Miranda and A. Miguélez Cavero (Barcelona/Madrid, 2014), 81–103.
- 61 F.M. Gimeno Blay, 'Produir llibres manuscrits catalans (segles XII–XV)', in *Literatura i cultura a la corona d'Aragó* (segles XIII–XV). Actes del III colloqui 'Problems i mètodes de la literatura catalana antiga', Universitat de Girona, 5–8 juliol de 2000, ed. L. Badia, M. Cabré, and S. Martí (Barcelona, 2002), 117–49.
- 62 See the opening comments in E.E. Rodríguez Díaz, 'La factura del códice gótico castellano. Un avance de resultados', *Gazette du livre médiéval*, 47 (Autumn 2005), 1–13, at 3. For a Latin poem on manuscript production at Calahorra cathedral, see J. Leclercq, 'Textos y manuscritos de algunas bibliotecas de España', *Hispania Sacra*, 2 (1949), 106–7.
- 63 See the comments in J. Fernández Valverde and P. Ostos Salcedo, 'El MS. 131 de la Biblioteca Pública de Córdoba', *Scriptorium*, 52 (1998), 37–65 and plates 16 and 17, at 64–5; Rodríguez Díaz, 'La factura del códice gótico', 8, and Rodríguez Díaz, 'La manufactura del libro en la Castilla cristiana: artesanos judíos y conversos (ss.XIII–XV)', *Gazette du Livre Médiéval*, 33 (Autumn 1998), 29–34, at 29–30.

inferred from the foundation of universities such as Salamanca, established by Alfonso IX of León at an unspecified date during his reign (1188–1229) and modelled on the earlier university at Palencia. ⁶⁴ University tutors and scholars required books, and Alfonso X included the position of 'stationarius', or 'book-seller', in the statutes he granted Salamanca in 1254 in response to a petition by the masters and students there. Alfonso's original charter has been lost, although a copy from the late thirteenth century, made in Salamanca, survives in the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris. ⁶⁵ Unfortunately, no surviving documents record the names or activities of the thirteenth-century Salamanca stationers, ⁶⁶ but it is likely that they operated in a manner not unlike that of fellow professionals in the kingdom of Aragon, where the evidence for university stationers and scribal activity does survive. The Liber constitutionum et statutorum generalis studii Illerdensis (1300) records that Andrea de Espenso was beadle and stationer for the university of Lleida (Lérida), while documents show that in late twelfth- and thirteenth-century Barcelona scribes skilled in diplomatic and book hands copied school textbooks and legal works, and wrote out formal documents. 67

The demand for books would also have encouraged the book-making industry more generally. In Castile, for example, the scholars who had flocked to Toledo during the 1160s and 1170s to make or to obtain translations of Arabic works on science, philosophy, and medicine must have required the services of parchment or paper sellers, scribes, and bookbinders, although evidence for the organization of these trades in the city is scant. What little survives suggests that although these translations were commissioned by clerics, the church itself did not have a monopoly on book production. The cathedral chapter in Toledo used commercial *scriptoria* in the city to supply the books it needed. Such commercial scribal activity was not exceptional in the wider European context: the many secular workshops that flourished

⁶⁴ For Jiménez de Rada and a manuscript copied for him, see A. Claret García Martínez and E.E. Rodríguez Díaz, 'Un códice de la biblioteca de Alfonso X en la catedral de Sevilla. Estudio codicológico y paleográfico de la *Biblia de Pedro de Pamplona*', in *Sevilla 1248*, 919–28. On Salamanca, see C.Mª. Ajo G. y Sáinz de Zúñiga, *Historia de las universidades hispánicas*. *Orígenes y desarrollo desde su aparición a nuestros días*, 6 vols (Madrid, 1957–1967), i: *Medioevo y renacimiento universitario*, 199–201.

⁶⁵ G. Murano, 'Alfonso il Savi, l'Università di Salamanca e l'ufficio dello stazionario', *Codices Manuscripti & Impressi*, 44–5 (2003), 1–2. I am grateful to Rowan Watson for this reference. See also G. Murano, *Opere diffuse per exemplar e pecia* (Turnhout, 2005), 67.

⁶⁶ Rodríguez Díaz, 'La manufactura del libro', 30.

⁶⁷ J. Alturo, 'Le statut du scripteur en Catalogne (XII^e–XIII^e siècles)', in *Le statut du scripteur au moyen âge. Actes du XII^e colloque scientifique du comité internationale de paléographie latine, ed. M.-C. Hubert et al. (Paris, 2000), 41–56, at 46–7.*

in thirteenth-century Paris were a magnet for miniaturists and manuscript illuminators. The multiple copies of identical books which they produced relied on collaboration between workshops, a system inspired by the book production methods of Dominican friars. 68

Books were also copied for individuals on an *ad hoc* basis, and it seems scribes worked wherever the exemplar was available. Indeed, such work did not even have to be carried out by adult professionals. A contract drawn up in Seville in July 1295 between the parents of 'Jacomo' and the chaplain of the convent of San Clemente, acting on behalf of Teresa, a nun, established that over a period of eight months Jacomo would copy a breviary for Teresa in 'good script'. The chaplain undertook to provide the exemplar and ruled parchment. Jacomo would carry out his work either in the convent or in the nearby buildings of the military order of Calatrava (referred to in the document as the 'casa de Calatrava'). ⁶⁹ The mendicant orders which established themselves in the Peninsula as the thirteenth century progressed also required books. A 1270 charter issued by Alfonso at Burgos exempted Dominican friars from paying duty either on their books or on the parchment for these. ⁷⁰

The evidence for the bookish activities of the non-Christian communities in twelfth- and thirteenth-century Iberia, and their relationship with Christian readers, is even more fragmentary and tantalizing. In Burgos, the royal monastery of Las Huelgas called upon the services of Jewish binders, and three documents from the 1260s and 1270s refer to Jewish sellers of parchment or paper who traded in Salamanca (the Spanish word *pergaminero* is ambiguous because the term *pergamino* was used in conjunction with both skins and rag paper). Their activities, however, are not connected explicitly

68 R. Gonzálvez Ruiz, Hombres y libros de Toledo (1086–1300) (Madrid, 1997), at 111 and 143–4. For the translating activity, see F. Márquez Villanueva, 'In lingua tholetana', in Márquez Villanueva, El concepto cultural alfonsí, 2nd edn, expanded (Barcelona, 2004), 283–302. For Paris, see R.H. Rouse and M.A. Rouse, Illiterati et Uxorati. Manuscripts and their Makers: commercial book producers in medieval Paris 1200–1500, 2 vols (Turnhout, 2000); G. Bevilacqua, D. Catalunya and N. Torres, 'The Production of Polyphonic Manuscripts in Thirteenth-century Paris: new evidence for standardised procedures', Early Music History 37 (2018), 91–139 (at 132-4).

69 R. Menéndez Pidal, *Documentos lingüísticos de España, I: reino de Castilla* (Madrid, 1966), 470–1 (no. 356). The convent was in the district of San Lorenzo and the 'casa de Calatrava' was in the neighbouring one of Omnium Sanctorum: see the map 'Esquema del espacio urbano de Sevilla' in M.Á. Ladero Quesada, *Historia de Sevilla. La ciudad medieval (1248–1492*), Colección del Bolsillo 49, 3rd edn (Seville, 1989). The convent of San Clemente was important in a city where there were few nunneries; it was founded by Remondo, first archbishop of Seville after Fernando's conquest, and confidant of Alfonso.

70 M. González Jiménez and M.A. Carmona Ruiz, *Documentación de Alfonso X el Sabio* (Seville, 2012), 418 (no. 2235).

with the university, and they probably supplied the town at large.⁷¹ Jewish involvement in the book trade at Salamanca echoes not just wider Jewish concerns in the skin and fur trades, but also reflects the importance of books for the Jewish religion. The earliest surviving Sephardic decorated Bible dates from 1232, and the evidence of surviving manuscripts points to at least two Jewish scriptoria active in Toledo in the second half of the thirteenth century. Although no pre-thirteenth-century illustrated Jewish books copied in areas of the Peninsula under Islamic control have survived,72 the layout and decoration of thirteenth- and fourteenth-century Hebrew Bibles copied in Andalusia seem to derive mostly from Islamic models (although there is some evidence that specific motifs, such as the depiction of Noah's Ark, were inspired by the imagery in early Latin copies of the Old Testament).⁷³ Indeed, the intricate monochrome geometric designs, calligraphic decoration, and foliage motifs employed by the Andalusian scribes and artists arguably suggest they deliberately revived earlier Islamic models of book art in order to define their art against a Christian culture that was increasingly dominant.⁷⁴ It is difficult to pinpoint the influence of Jewish books on the appearance of Alfonsine manuscripts, but the Jewish scholars who played such a crucial role in the translation and composition of the works he commissioned may have made exemplars available, as appropriate, to scribes and artists.

Concrete evidence for book production in al-Andalus when it was under Muslim rule, and among the Mudejars (Muslims subject to a Christian ruler) after the Christian conquest, is also practically non-existent but can be inferred from accounts of book-loving rulers and from the circulation of Islamic artistic models which found their way into Hebrew and Christian manuscripts. Certainly the rulers of tenth- and eleventh-century Islamic Spain used books and libraries to further their political ambitions, and the private libraries of the

⁷¹ Rodríguez Díaz, 'La manufactura del libro', 31-2.

⁷² K. Kogman-Appel, Jewish Book Art between Islam and Christianity: the decoration of Hebrew Bibles in medieval Spain, trans. J. Davidson (Leiden, 2004), 5.

⁷³ Kogman-Appel, Jewish Book Art, at 61, 87, and 95; A. Contessa, 'Noah's Ark and the Ark of the Covenant in Spanish and Sephardic Medieval Manuscripts', in *Between Judaism and Christianity:* art historical essays in honor of Elisheva (Elizabeth) Revel-Neher, ed. K. Kogman-Appel and M. Meyer (Leiden/Boston, 2009), 171–89, at 181–5.

⁷⁴ L.U. Afonso, T. Moita, and D. Matos, 'La Biblia de Coimbra y la "Escuela andaluza" de iluminación hebraica', *Archivo Español de Arte*, 88 (January–March 2015), 53–68 (62–5); E. Frojmovic, 'Jewish Mudejarismo and the Invention of Tradition', in *Late Medieval Jewish Identities: Iberia and beyond*, ed. C. Caballero-Navas and E. Alfonso (New York, 2010), 233–58 (237–8).

⁷⁵ On the cultural and historical pitfalls of the terms 'Muslim Spain' and 'Christian Spain', see R. Hitchcock, 'Christian-Muslim Understanding(s) in Medieval Spain', *HRJ* 9, no. 4 (2008), 314–25, at 315. For the term 'Mudejar', see L.P. Harvey, *Islamic Spain* 1250 to 1500 (Chicago/London, 1994), 3–4.

wealthy supported the scholarly activities of librarians and scribes. ⁷⁶ Even as Christian forces advanced down the Peninsula, this patronage and intellectual activity continued. Ja'far Aḥmad III Sayf al-Dawla, the last ruler of the Banū Hūd dynasty of Zaragoza, transferred his library to Rueda Jalón after his kingdom fell to the Christians in 1118, and made some of the works available to his neighbour, Bishop Michael of Tarazona. ⁷⁷ In 1140 Ja'far exchanged his property in Rueda Jalón for part of the city of Toledo, and texts from his library began to circulate there, too. The works on mathematics, astronomy, astrology, and magic which the prolific translator and Toledo cathedral cleric Gerard of Cremona (1114–1187) chose to translate into Latin belong to the same family of texts as those which derive from late eleventh-century versions in the royal Banū Hūd library; and it was to Gerard of Cremona's version of Al-Fargānī's work on astronomy, the *Liber de aggregationibus scientie stellarum*, that Pedro Gallego, the Franciscan bishop of Cartagena, turned when he compiled his own *Summa astronomica* in the thirteenth century. ⁷⁸

The early twelfth century had seen the development of a distinctive style of North African-Andalusí script, and the increasing use of paper rather than parchment helped reduce the cost of books and widened their circulation. Once again, however, few books survive to bear material witness to the intensity of book production which such a development implies. A sixteen-volume Koran copied at Seville in 1234, fourteen years before the kingdom surrendered to Christian besiegers led by Fernando III, is preserved in the Ibn Yūsuf Library, Marrakesh, but only three Western Islamic manuscripts with pictures survive today. Despite these losses, the number of visual and textual exemplars that the artists and authors working

⁷⁶ D. Wasserstein, 'The Library of al-Hakam II al-Mustansir and the Culture of Islamic Spain', *Manuscripts of the Middle East*, 5 (1990–1991), 99–105; E.R. Hoffman, 'The Beginnings of the Illustrated Arab Book: an intersection between art and scholarship', *Muqarnas*, 17 (2000), 37–52, at 45–6; R. Collins, 'Literacy and the laity in early medieval Spain', in *The Uses of Literacy in Early Medieval Europe*, ed. R. McKitterick (Cambridge, 1990), 109–133.

⁷⁷ C. Burnett, 'The Translating Activity in Medieval Spain', in *The Legacy of Muslim Spain*, ed. S. Khadra Jayyusi (Leiden, 1992), 1036–58, at 1041–3.

⁷⁸ On Gerard, see C. Burnett, 'The Coherence of the Arabic-Latin Translation Program in Toledo in the Twelfth Century', *Science in Context*, 14, nos 1–2 (2001), 249–88, at 251 and n. 5; J. Martínez Gázquez, 'La *Summa de astronomía* de Pedro Gallego y el *Liber de Aggregationibus Scientie Stellarum* de al-Fargānī', in *De Astronomia Alphonsi Regis. Actas del simposio sobre astronomía alfonsí celebrado en Berkeley (agosto 1985) y otros trabajos sobre el mismo tema*, ed. M. Comes et al. (Barcelona, 1987), 153–79.

⁷⁹ Hoffman, 'Beginnings of the Illustrated Arab Book', 45-6.

⁸⁰ S. Khemir, 'The Arts of the Book', in *Al-Andalus: the art of Islamic Spain*, ed. J.D. Dodds Published in conjunction with the exhibition at the Alhambra, Granada, and the Metropolitan Museum, New York. (New York, 1992), 115-22.

for Alfonso drew upon when they compiled the *Cantigas*, treatises on board games, chronicles, and astrological works for the king testifies to the wealth of literary and artistic sources, Muslim and Christian (and presumably also Jewish), available in the Iberian Peninsula during the thirteenth century. ⁸¹ The halo which marks the status of the king of India, the black and red chess pieces, and the Arabic inscriptions incorporated into the miniatures of the *Libros de los juegos* suggest that the artists working for Alfonso drew on visual sources from the Arab world, sources which may have included depictions and inscriptions on objects and architecture, as well as any manuscripts which remained in the libraries of Cordoba and Seville post-conquest. ⁸²

There is more evidence for the scholars involved in the compilation and composition of the works patronized by Alfonso (as distinct from those who copied, illustrated, or bound them up) because their names are cited in the prologues and colophons to some of the manuscripts themselves, particularly those included in the translations of scientific and astrological works, and in contemporary documents as well. The naming of scholars and translators in these works reflects literary convention, in this case the need to establish the intellectual authority of a particular genre of text. Nonetheless, this identification provides evidence for the pivotal role played by Jewish scholars in Alfonso's cultural patronage, and the notable absence of Muslim involvement in the translation of Arabic texts. Bernardo the Arab' ('el arauigo'), identified as one of the translators in the compilation of treatises on astronomy and astronomical instruments, was almost certainly a Christian convert from Islam, as his Christian forename

81 For Seville as a centre for Arab texts and, consequently, for its importance as a centre of Alfonsine cultural patronage, see J. Samsó, 'Sevilla y la obra científica de Alfonso X', in Sevilla 1248, 567–77, at 571. On the wealth of visual exemplars in Seville, see the comments in G. Menéndez Pidal, La España del siglo XIII leída en imágenes (Madrid, 1986), 104. On contact between the three cultures of Spain more generally, see J.D. Dodds, M.R. Menocal, and A. Krasner Balbale, The Arts of Intimacy: Christians, Jews, and Muslims in the making of castilian culture (New Haven/London, 2008), especially c.6, 'Adab', 191–239.

82 K. Kennedy, 'Influence and Power: Islamic iconography in Alfonso X's Book of Chess', in *Under the Influence: the concept of influence and the study of illuminated manuscripts*, ed. J. Lowden and A. Bovey (Turnhout, 2007), 89–96, at 91–2; D.J. Roxburgh, 'Los libros árabes y el *scriptorium* de Alfonso X', in *Murcia 2009*, 258–65, at 264; J. Samsó, 'Sevilla y la obra científica de Alfonso X', in *Sevilla 1248*, 567–77, at 573–6.

83 Burnett, 'Translating Activity in Medieval Spain', at 1047. For Jewish scholars patronized by Alfonso, see G. Hilty, 'El *Libro conplido en los iudizios de las estrellas*', *Al-Andalus*, 20 (1955), 1–74; D. Romano, 'El papel judío en la transmisión de la cultura', *Hispania Sacra*, 40 (1988), 972–3; N. Roth, 'Jewish Collaborators in Alfonso's Scientific Work', in *Emperor of Culture*, 59–71; D. Romano, *La ciencia hispanojudía* (Madrid, 1992); J. Samsó, 'Dos colaboradores científicos musulmanes de Alfonso X', *Llull*, 4 (1981), 171–9.

suggests. ⁸⁴ Although some historians have argued that Alfonso called upon the scholarly services of the sage Muhammed Ibn Abu Bakr al-Riquti (known in the West as al-Ricotí), who lived in Murcia, there is also evidence to suggest he abandoned Christian Spain in disgust at efforts to convert him. ⁸⁵

The references to rabbinical and Arabic sources in the Estoria de Espanna and the *General estoria* strongly suggest that there were Jewish masters among the anonymous groups of scholars responsible for translating and compiling these two Alfonsine chronicles. 86 Such key involvement of Jewish scholars in Alfonso's cultural patronage reflects the historic prominence enjoyed by the Jewish community among the intellectual élite of the Peninsula, a prominence they had also enjoyed during the caliphate, for example at the court of the tenth-century caliph of Cordoba, al-Hakam II al-Mutansir. 87 The directives of the Christian church, expressed in decrees drawn up by Innocent III at the Fourth Lateran Council (1215), 88 imposed restrictive laws on Jewish dress, and on the ability of Jews to hold public office. These directives were echoed and magnified in thirteenth-century royal legal codes such as Alfonso's Siete Partidas; 89 but in fact Christian monarchs in the Peninsula valued their Jewish subjects not only for their learning but also, more practically, for their wealth, linguistic skills, and the diplomatic role they could play in negotiations between Christians and Muslims. 90 Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, the ambitious archbishop of Toledo

⁸⁴ Márquez Villanueva, Concepto cultural, 127, n. 1.

⁸⁵ For al-Ricotí as a scholar who worked for Alfonso, see J. Torres Fontes, 'La cultura murciana en el reinado de Alfonso X', *Murgetana*, 14 (1960), 57–89, and Márquez Villanueva, *Concepto cultural*, 164–5. For a different view, see F. de la Granja, 'Una polémica religiosa en Murcia', *Al-Andalus* 31 (1966), 47–72.

⁸⁶ E.C. Francomano, 'Castilian Vernacular Bibles in Iberia, c. 1250–1500', in *The Practice of the Bible in the Middle Ages: production, reception and performance in Western Christianity*, ed. S. Boynton and D.J. Reilly (New York, 2011), 315–37, at 323.

⁸⁷ Wasserstein, 'The Library of al-Hakam II', at 103.

⁸⁸ Constitutiones Concilii quarti Lateranensis una cum comentariis glossatum, ed. A. García y García, Monumenta Iuris Canonici, ser. A, vol. 2 (Vatican City, 1981), c.67–c.70. For an English translation, see Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils, ed. and trans. N.P. Tanner, 2 vols (Washington, dc, 1990), i, Nicea to Lateran V, 265–7.

⁸⁹ H. Salvador Martínez, La convivencia en la España del siglo XIII. Perspectivas alfonsíes (Madrid, 2006), 165 and 355; M. Ratcliffe, 'Judíos y musulmanes en la jurisprudencia medieval española', in Homenaje a Alfonso X, el Sabio (1284-1984), Special Issue, Revista Canadiense de Estudios Hispánicos, 9, no. 3 (1985), 423-38; D.E. Carpenter, Alfonso X and the Jews: an edition of and commentary on 'Siete Partidas' 7.24 'De los Judíos' (Berkeley, 1986); C. Devia, Disidentes y minorías religiosas en las Partidas de Alfonso X el Sabio (Vigo, 2009).

⁹⁰ See the comments in M. González Jiménez, 'Alfonso X, rey de Castilla y León (1252–1284)', in El Scriptorium alfonsí. De los Libros de Astrología a las 'Cantigas de Santa María', ed. J. Montoya Martínez and A. Domínguez Rodríguez (Madrid, 1999), 1–15, at 11–13.

(who drowned in the Rhône in June 1247 en route to the Council of Lyon to defend the primacy of his See) had exempted the local Jewish community from ecclesiastical strictures, such as regulations on dress, and cultivated its wealthy members in order to consolidate and extend the territory under his control.⁹¹

The short section in the Alfonsine *Partidas* on relations between Christians and Jews which stressed that contact between them should be strictly limited (to avoid the danger of Christian apostasy) nevertheless reflected economic and political necessity by allowing Jewish landowners to employ Christian agricultural labourers and bodyguards, and by permitting Christians to consult Jewish physicians. ⁹² Both Jaume I of Aragon and Alfonso X employed a Jewish physician, although Alfonso retained a Christian one as well; Fernando III sent Jewish ambassadors to negotiate with the Almohad caliph of Morocco and was rebuked for doing so by Pope Honorius III (1216–1227), who feared that Jews could not be trusted to keep the secrets of Christians. ⁹³

In the cultural sphere, Jewish scholars had always played a key role in the transfer of Arab learning to the Latin world. It was a role which became increasingly prominent in the twelfth century as Christian clerics from Northern Europe and from within Spain itself gravitated to Toledo in order to discover the works of Ancient Greek authors, such as Ptolemy's second-century treatise on astronomy, the *Almagest*, which had been preserved in Arabic translation. They included Hermann of Carinthia (*fl.* 1138–1143) and, among the second generation of scholars, Gerard of Cremona (1114–1187).⁹⁴ Like their Christian counterparts, known as 'mozarabs', who lived under Muslim rule, Jewish scholars were fluent in both Arabic and in the vernacular, and so could prepare a vernacular translation of an Arabic text, which a Christian scholar could then translate into Latin.⁹⁵ This two-step process of translation

⁹¹ L.K. Pick, 'Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada and the Jews: pragmatism and patronage in thirteenth-century Toledo', *Viator*, 28 (1997), 203–22, at 221. For Rodrigo's death, see P. Linehan, *History and the Historians of Medieval Spain* (Oxford, 1994), 410.

⁹² D.E. Carpenter, 'Jewish-Christian Social Relations in Alphonsine Spain: a commentary on Book VII, Title xxiv, Law 8 of the *Siete Partidas*', in *Florilegium Hispanicum: medieval and Golden Age studies presented to Dorothy Clotelle Clarke*, ed. J.S. Geary (Madison, wi, 1983), 61–70, at 67; R.I. Burns, 'Jews and Moors in the *Siete Partidas* of Alfonso X the Learned: a background perspective', in *Medieval Spain: culture, conflict and coexistence. Studies in Honour of Angus MacKay*, ed. R. Collins and A. Goodman (Basingstoke, 2002), 46–62.

⁹³ Salvador Martínez, La convivencia, 165 and 358 n. 8.

⁹⁴ Burnett, 'Coherence of the Arabic-Latin Translation Program', 254.

⁹⁵ See Romano, 'El papel judío', for an overview of the Jewish contribution to translations produced in twelfth- and thirteenth-century Spain.

is documented in around 1170 by the English cleric Daniel of Morley, who explained how the vernacular served as the bridge between Arabic and Latin scholarship, and cited as an example his own conversations with 'Galippus', a mozarab scholar and translator who had worked with Gerard of Cremona. ⁹⁶ The translation activity in twelfth-century Toledo was described by the French historian and Oriental scholar Amable Jourdain in his posthumously published 1819 study of Latin translations of Aristotle as the work of a 'school of translators', and his attribution has proved as enduring as it is misleading. ⁹⁷ In fact, there was no formal, institutional framework for the translators' work, although successive archbishops and canons of Toledo cathedral were significant patrons of, as well as participants in, this scholarly labour. The absence of formal, institutional, approval was to be expected, as much of the demand for translations came from visiting foreign scholars, who did not know Arabic and who wished to expand their intellectual horizons beyond the subjects offered by the traditional Western university curriculum. ⁹⁸

This situation changed in the thirteenth century as the balance of power in the Peninsula began to shift from Muslim to Christian rulers. The choice of language for a text became a more overtly political one, and the etymology of a word could be used to question the religious orthodoxy of a section of the population: Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada derived 'mozarab' (Arabic-speaking Christians who had lived under Muslim rule) from the Latin 'mixti Arabes' ('part Arab'). ⁹⁹ It is not a coincidence that the linguistic goal of translators working for Alfonso was to produce a finished text not in Latin but in the vernacular, the language which in the previous century had served as the bridge to the final, Latin, version. Alfonso's continuous promotion of the Castilian language gave the works bearing his name a nationalistic feel, and may also have suggested to his subjects that his revised legal codes were simply the natural evolution of established traditions. ¹⁰⁰ The political

⁹⁶ C. Burnett, 'A Group of Arabic-Latin Translators Working in Northern Spain in the Mid-12th Century', *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* (1977), 62–108; Burnett, 'Translating Activity in Medieval Spain', 1045; Márquez Villanueva, 'In lingua tholetana', 299.

⁹⁷ Márquez Villanueva, 'In lingua tholetana', 284; P. Racine, 'Y a-t-il eu une "école de Tolède"?' in *Tolède (1085–1095)*. Des traductions médiévales au mythe littéraire. Colloque de Mulhouse, Decembre 1985, ed. J. Huré, Special Issue, Bulletin de la Faculté des Lettres de Mulhouse, 16 (Paris, 1989), 31–40.

⁹⁸ Márquez Villanueva, 'In lingua tholetana', 285; Burnett, 'Coherence of the Arabic-Latin Translation Program', 250–4.

⁹⁹ F.J. Hernández, 'Language and Cultural Identity: the Mozarabs of Toledo', *Boletín Burriel*, 1 (1989), 29–48, cited in Hitchcock, 'Christian-Muslim Understanding(s)', at 320.

¹⁰⁰ See the comments in Burnett, 'The Translating Activity in Medieval Spain', 1047; Liuzzo Scorpo, 'The King as Subject', 272.

undertones of language are evident in other decisions made by his translators. Sometimes they preferred a neologism to a more familiar Spanish word, as is the case in their treatment of the title of al-Zarqālī's treatise on a type of astrolabe, 'al-Ṣafīḥa' (from the Arabic 'Ṣafīḥa' or 'table'). Instead of translating the title using the familiar (and accurate) Castilian word 'lamina', the Alfonsine scholars chose instead to make the Arabic word sound Spanish, and transformed it into 'açafea'.' Alfonsine translators also devised a Latin equivalent for the name of Maslama al-Majrīţī, the famous Arabic author whose name had been attached to the $Gh\bar{a}yat~al-hak\bar{t}m$, a widely circulated handbook of magic. On one level this can be read as a linguistic joke, but on another their decision effectively turned a Muslim scholar into a Spanish – and by implication a Christian – one. 102

Christian scholars also took part in this learned activity during Alfonso's reign, although they are named less frequently in prologues. The 'king's cleric' Juan d'Aspa assisted Yehuda, Alfonso's Jewish physician, in the 1259 translation of the *Libro de las cruzes*, reorganized the divisions of the work, and, according to the prologue and colophon of the work, composed new rubrics. Earlier, during the 1240s, Yehuda had worked to translate treatises on the virtues of stones (the *Lapidario*) with another cleric in royal service, Garci Pérez (a man 'very learned in the art of astrology', according to the translation prologue). Other courtiers linked directly to the composition of works patronized by Alfonso include the Franciscan Bernardo de Brihuega, whose five-volume compilation of saints' lives in their historical context made at Alfonso's request survives incomplete in later manuscripts, and 'Maestro Roldán', named in the prologue to the legal code on gamblers and gambling, the *Libro de las tahurerías*, drawn up on the orders of Alfonso and probably completed by October 1276. The Franciscan friar Gil de Zamora

101 L.P. Harvey, 'The Alphonsine School of Translators: translation from Arabic into Castilian produced under the patronage of Alfonso the Wise of Castile', *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* (1977), 109–17, at 112; and for its Arabic sense of 'table', see Roth, 'Jewish Collaborators', 61 and 68. For 'lamina', see J. Samsó, 'Las traducciones astronómicas alfonsíes y la aparición de una prosa científica castellana', *Alcanate*, 6 (2008–2009), 39–51, at 46.

102 Burnett, 'Translating Activity in Medieval Spain', 1047; J. Thomann, 'The Name Picatrix: transcription or translation?' *JWCI*, 53 (1990), 289–96.

103 E.S. Procter, 'The Scientific Works of the Court of Alfonso X of Castille: the king and his collaborators', *Modern Language Review*, 40 (1945), 12–29, at 22.

104 Procter, 'Scientific Works', 23–4; L. Fernández Fernández, *Arte y ciencia en el scriptorium de Alfonso X el Sabio* (Seville, 2013), 77–8 and 142.

105 M.C. Díaz y Díaz, 'La obra de Bernardo de Brihuega', in *Strenae. Estudios de filología e historia dedicados al Profesor Manuel García Blanco* (Salamanca, 1962), 145–61; *idem*, 'Tres compiladores latinos en el ambiente de Sancho IV', in *La literatura en la época de Sancho IV*, ed. Álvar and

was tutor to Alfonso's son Sancho, to whom he dedicated a short chronicle in Latin on the reigns of Sancho's grandfather and father. He also wrote a treatise on music and another one in defence of the virginity of the Virgin Mary; and the range of his literary activity and closeness to royalty suggest he was probably involved in the preparation of texts for Alfonso, particularly the chronicles and the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*. ¹⁰⁶

The participation of other figures in the king's circle in the cultural activities he patronized remains obscure for lack of specific evidence, although it seems likely that the clerics employed by Alfonso as royal administrators could have applied their intellectual training to his scholarly endeavours as well. 107 Pedro Gallego, Alfonso's confessor and the first Bishop of Cartagena (1250–1267), compiled a work on astronomy drawn principally from Gerard of Cremona's translation of al-Fargānī's Liber de aggregationibus scientie stellarum, but which also included translations by Pedro himself of Arabic sources. 108 Despite sharing Alfonso's interest in astronomy, Pedro Gallego's name does not appear in surviving royal documents in connection with the king's cultural activities; however that of another cleric in Alfonso's confidence, Fernán García (fl. 1260–after 1285), does. Fernán García played a key role in the ecclesiastical reforms which gradually followed the conquest of Seville from the Moors in 1248. In 1261 he was appointed doctor of decrees (doctor decretorum) in the city's new cathedral school founded by Archbishop Remondo Losana, one of the king's closest advisers. While bishop of Segovia in the early 1250s, Remondo had acted as the key figure in Fernando III's chancery, in the role of notarius regis or 'king's notary', and he was also Fernando's confessor. 109 Shortly before he was appointed archbishop of Seville (around 1259, to replace Alfonso's brother and archbishop-elect Felipe, who had married Christina of Norway), Remondo seems to have acted as

Lucía Megías, 37–41; Libro de las Tahurerías: a special code of law, concerning gambling, drawn up by Maestro Roldán at the command of Alfonso X of Castile, ed. R.A. MacDonald (Madison, wi, 1995), 15–16.

¹⁰⁶ Díaz y Díaz, 'Tres compiladores', 46-9.

¹⁰⁷ On ecclesiastics as administrators at Alfonso's court, see González Jiménez, $Alfonso\,X$ (2004), 406–7.

¹⁰⁸ Martínez Gázquez, 'La Summa de Astronomia', 153–79. See also A. Pelzer, 'Un traducteur inconnu. Pierre Gallego, franciscain et premier évêque de Carthagène (1250–67)', in Miscellanea F. Ehrle. Histoire de la théologie et de la philosophie. Scritti di storia e paleografia, pubblicati [...] in occasione dell'ottantesimo natalizio dell' E^{mo} Cardinale F. Ehrle, Studi e Testi, 37–42, 5 vols (Rome, 1924), i, Histoire de la théologie et de la philosophie, 407–56; J. Torres Fontes, 'El obispado de Cartagena en el siglo XIII', Hispania, 13, no. 52 (1953), 339–401 and Hispania 13, no. 53 (1953), 515–80.

¹⁰⁹ Kleine, Cancillería real, 47-8.

Alfonso's ambassador (and guardian of the interests of the diocese of Seville) in Rome. ¹¹⁰ In his Constitutions for the cathedral chapter, which included the foundation of the cathedral school, Remondo had lamented the intellectual poverty of the church in Seville, an institution which, he observed, had only recently been returned to the Christian religion and which he compared to a delicate seedling that required nurture by a literate clergy. ¹¹¹

As *doctor decretorum*, Fernán García's role in this new organization was to lecture on Gratian's *Decretum*, the twelfth-century compilation of ancient canons completed in Bologna in around 1145, the study of which formed the foundation course of canon law in the medieval schools. ¹¹² In 1261 Fernán García also became archdeacon of Niebla, a formerly independent Muslim kingdom of strategic importance which had come under Castilian rule earlier in that year thanks to a combination of siege warfare and negotiated surrender (Archbishop Remondo had been the first to rush towards its walls after the inhabitants capitulated). He was closely involved in organizing the redistribution of lands following the Christian occupation, although unusually the terms of the surrender also permitted the Muslim residents to remain there. ¹¹³ Documents issued by Alfonso's chancery demonstrate that Fernán enjoyed a high level of royal trust: he is referred to as a 'clérigo del rey', and between 1263 and 1274 he issued 27 documents on the king's behalf. ¹¹⁴ In 1275, while Alfonso travelled abroad to meet Pope Gregory X at

The earliest significant source for the life and career of this important yet shadowy archbishop — who sought pardon from the pope because he poked out his brother's eye, and who outlived two royal masters (he died in 1286) — is D. Ortíz de Zúñiga, *Annales eclesiasticos y seculares de la muy noble y muy leal ciudad de Sevilla* (Madrid, 1677), 88.a. For his visit to Rome, see I. Montes Romero-Camacho, 'La iglesia de Sevilla en tiempos de Alfonso X', in *Sevilla en tiempos de Alfonso X*, ed. M. González Jiménez, M. Borrero Fernández, and I. Montes Romero-Camacho (Seville, 1987), 158–221, at 194. See P. Linehan, 'La conquista de Sevilla y los historiadores', in *Sevilla 1248*, 229–44, at 235 n. 39 for recent, inaccurate, assessments of Losana's literary activities.

111 For the Seville cathedral school, see E. Costa y Belda, 'Las constituciones de Don Raimundo de Losaña para el cabildo de Sevilla (1261)', *Historia. Instituciones. Documentos*, 5 (1978), 219–33, esp. 224 for the state of the Seville church. Extensive corrections to Belda's article in M. González Jiménez, 'Los ritmos de repoblación. El reino de Sevilla en vísperas de la conquista de Niebla', *Estudios de historia medieval en homenaje a Luís Suárez Fernández*, ed. V.Á. Álvarez Palenzuela et al. (Valladolid, 1991), 215–27. The foundation of the cathedral school is sometimes mistakenly related to the 1254 royal charter establishing 'schools of Latin and Arabic' in Seville (see below, Chapter 1); on Remondo himself, see A. Ballesteros Beretta, *Sevilla en el siglo XIII* (Seville, 1913), 89–99.

- 112 Gratian, Decretum Gratiani, Corpus Iuris Canonici, i, ed. E. Friedberg, 2nd edn (Graz, 1959).
- 113 González Jiménez, Alfonso X (2004), 146-50; Ballesteros Beretta, Sevilla en el siglo XIII, 92.
- 114 For a list and summary of the contents of the documents, see Kleine, *Cancillería real*, CD-ROM: *Apéndice: catálogo prosopográfico*, 114–20 (no. 38: 'Fernán García').

Beaucaire, Fernán García remained behind to act as a key member of the chancery run by Alfonso's son and heir, Fernando de la Cerda. ¹¹⁵ In July 1269 he was one of two representatives chosen to accompany the prince's future wife Blanche from France to Burgos for their wedding, which took place on 30 November. ¹¹⁶ Fernán García's involvement in the king's foreign affairs was not unusual. The Franciscan Lope Fernández, first bishop of Morocco, had played a key role in plans made by Alfonso early in his reign to form an alliance with England and mount a joint crusade against Northern Africa. ¹¹⁷

Despite his closeness to the king, however, Fernán García did not share Alfonso's support of the mendicant orders. The latter part of his career was spent as archdeacon of Burgos cathedral (1272–1285), during which time he worked energetically to promote the interests of the cathedral chapter over those of the local Dominican friars, who had established themselves in the city in the 1240s. His tactics included the use of provocation and threats to prevent the friars settling on land near the cathedral which had been granted to them by royal decree. Nevertheless, he did not forget his loyalty to the king, and in 1282 he witnessed a document drawn up by the bishops of Burgos and Palencia in which they alleged they had been forced to take part in an assembly summoned by his rebellious son Sancho at Valladolid. 119

There is some evidence that Fernán García's court duties extended to working with Alfonso in the cultural sphere as well. Although many of the documents he issued on the king's behalf related to Andalusia, and were concerned with matters such as exemptions from duty payments or grazing rights, ¹²⁰ in February 1270 he issued two letters patent (in Castilian, *cartas*) on Alfonso's behalf which listed books lent to the king by the town council of Albelda and the monastery of Santa María de Nájera. ¹²¹ The letters solemnly recorded that Alfonso was bound to return these books once he had ordered

¹¹⁵ Kleine, Cancillería real, 87–90, 271. For his role in land distribution, see González Jiménez, Alfonso X (2004), 97, n. 75.

¹¹⁶ González Jiménez, *Alfonso X* (2004), 216–17.

¹¹⁷ O.C. Méndez González, 'Lope Fernández, Bishop of Morocco: his diplomatic role in the planning of an Anglo-Castilian crusade into Northern Africa', in *Thirteenth Century England XIV:* proceedings of the Aberystwyth and Lampeter conference, 2011, ed. J. Burton et al. (Woodbridge, 2013), 101–13.

¹¹⁸ P. Linehan, 'A Tale of Two Cities: capitular Burgos and mendicant Burgos in the thirteenth century', in *Church and City 1000–1500: essays in honour of Christopher Brooke*, ed. D. Abulafia, M. Franklin, and M. Rubin (Cambridge, 1992), 81–110, at 93 and 98.

¹¹⁹ Kleine, Cancillería real, 'Apéndice' (CD-ROM), no. 38.

¹²⁰ Kleine, Cancillería real, 'Apéndice: catálogo prosopográfico', no. 38.

¹²¹ Procter, 'The Castillian Chancery', 108.

copies to be made of the texts.¹²² It is tempting to wonder whether this trusted *doctor decretorum*, whose title 'maestre' (*magister*) reflected his university training, was involved in selecting the royal requests for the loan of books, since they comprised standard works of the medieval academic repertoire, such as the *Etymologies* of Isidore of Seville and Boethius's *Consolation of Philosophy*.¹²³ Given Fernán's legal specialism, it is also tempting to interpret the book of *Canones* which heads the first request list as a legal work; but in fact textual analysis shows this was the comparative chronology of biblical and contemporary history by Eusebius of Caesarea (†c. 340) in Jerome's late fourth-century translation.¹²⁴

It would not be surprising that Alfonso should have taken men such as Remondo and Fernán García into his confidence; but although their association with books and education is suggestive, the lack of evidence for their specific participation in the king's literary projects in documentary sources or within the works themselves (a silence which surely reflects Alfonso's deliberate promotion of himself as the principal intellectual authority for many of his works) means that their role must remain speculation. 125 Nevertheless, intellectuals such as these men would also have constituted a receptive audience for the works commissioned by Alfonso, and the final section of this monograph will argue that three manuscripts which have been identified as books made for the king in fact are copies made for other people and reflect wider thirteenth-century interest in the works he commissioned. Two manuscripts, Madrid MS 3065 and Madrid MS 9294, are fair copies of draft translations of astrological works that were in the process of being prepared for the king. Another manuscript, Madrid MS 816, is an early copy of the first part of a universal chronicle, the General estoria,

122 'Maestro Fernán García, Arcediano de Niebla la mandó facer por mandado del Rey. Pero Alvarez la fizo escrivir.' Both documents are published in *Memorial Histórico Español. Colección de documentos, opúsculos y antigüedades* (Madrid, 1851), i, docs CXVII and CXVIII, dated 22 and 25 February, both issued at Santo Domingo de la Calzada. On the division of authority in the dating clause between the person who draws up the document on the king's behalf and the person who writes it out, see Kleine, *Cancillería real*, 58–9.

123 On the term maestre, see Kleine, Cancillería real, 74, n. 117 and A. de Iglesia Ferreirós, 'Escuela, estudio y maestros', Historia. Instituciones. Documentos, 25 (1998), 313–26. The popularity of Isidore's text is suggested by the number of surviving twelfth- and thirteenth-century manuscripts listed in J.M. Fernández Catón, Las Etimologías en la tradición manuscrita medieval estudiada por el Prof. Dr. Anspach (San Isidoro, 1966). For Boethius, see The Medieval Boethius: studies in the vernacular translations of De Consolatione Philosophiae, ed. A.J. Minnis (Cambridge, 1987). 124 Ballesteros Beretta, Alfonso X (1963), 498, suggested that the Canones was a legal text; for Eusebius in the Alfonsine chronicles, see I. Fernández-Ordóñez, Las 'estorias' de Alfonso el Sabio (Madrid, 1992).

125 Rodríguez-Velasco, 'Theorizing', 83.

and the subject-matter highlighted in the rubrics and the content of tiny marginal pen trials suggest that it was made for an ecclesiastical readers. The existence of these copies suggests significant interest by contemporaries in the compilations and translations patronized by the king, such that even unfinished versions of works quickly circulated beyond the immediate confines of the court.

The manuscripts of the works translated, compiled, and composed for Alfonso X are the principal source of evidence for his modern reputation as author and engaged patron, and for him as a king who channelled legal, historical, and scientific learning to his subjects. Although it has been argued that the two surviving depictions of him in the scientific works show him simply as promotor of the work, while the literary and legal texts depict him as a scholar actively involved in the composition process, in fact this distinction is misleading. 126 Close study of elements in every representation of Alfonso – from the colour symbolism of his robes to the late adjustments to the composition of a miniature or text – show that the images of the king in all his manuscripts were aimed at specific audiences who would be able to appreciate the different messages about his kingship. In other words, these are works that present royal ideology to a literate, élite section of society, not to the wider population. 127 The carefully controlled royal agenda which these alterations and features imply supports arguments for Alfonso's personal interest and guiding role in the preparation of these manuscripts, while at the same time the changes also conjure up a circle of intellectuals who advised him on the presentation of his role, and the teams of scribes and illuminators who collaborated closely with them to realize this vision. Careful study of the iconography, text, and codicology of the manuscripts Alfonso commissioned, then, brings into focus the qualities that distinguished him as a patron, while at the same time providing evidence for a more nuanced view of that patronage.

¹²⁶ Fernández Fernández, Arte y ciencia, 170.

¹²⁷ Cf. the depiction of the Tower of David in the Toledo moralized Bible copied for Louis IX, which offers a literal and political illustration of Song of Songs 4: 4. See Grant, 'The Castle of Castile', 227.