
CONTENTS

Preface	xxvii
Acknowledgments	xxxiii
Special Notice	xxxvii
Introduction	1
A. The Career of a Criminal Case	1
1. Procedure Before Trial	2
Donald Dripps, Criminal Justice Process	2
2. Substantive Legal Issues Before Trial	5
3. Procedure at Trial	6
4. Substantive Legal Issues on Appeal	8
B. Sources of Criminal Law	9
1. Statutes	9
2. Precedent	10
3. Constitutions	12
C. The Analysis of Criminal Liability	13
1. The Purpose of Analysis	13
2. The Model Penal Code Scheme	14
3. The German Scheme	14
D. Burdens of Proof and Due Process	15
PART I JUST PUNISHMENT	19
New York Penal Law	24
Chapter 1 The Purposes and Limits of Punishment	27
A. An Introductory Problem	27
Notes and Questions	28
B. Utilitarianism and Retributivism	29
John Braithwaite & Philip Pettit, Not Just Deserts: A Republican Theory of Criminal Justice	30
	xi

C. Utilitarian Punishment	32
1. The Utility Principle as a Limit on Punishment	32
Jeremy Bentham, <i>The Theory of Legislation</i>	32
2. Deterrence	32
Jeremy Bentham, <i>The Theory of Legislation</i>	32
James Q. Wilson, <i>Thinking About Crime</i>	33
Anthony N. Doob & Cheryl Marie Webster, <i>Sentence Severity and Crime: Accepting the Null Hypothesis</i>	34
Louis Seidman, <i>Soldiers, Martyrs, and Criminal Law: Utilitarianism and the Problem of Crime Control</i>	36
Randolph Roth, <i>American Homicide</i>	37
Notes and Questions	38
3. Rehabilitation	42
David Rothman, <i>The Discovery of the Asylum</i>	42
Francis A. Allen, <i>Criminal Justice, Legal Values, and the Rehabilitative Ideal</i>	44
Elliot Currie, <i>Confronting Crime: An American Challenge</i>	45
Michael Tonry, <i>Malign Neglect: Race, Crime, and Punishment in America</i>	45
Notes and Questions	46
4. Incapacitation	47
James Q. Wilson, <i>Thinking About Crime</i>	47
Franklin E. Zimring & Gordon Hawkins, <i>Incapacitation: Penal Confinement and the Restraint of Crime</i>	49
Guyora Binder & Ben Notterman, <i>Penal Incapacitation: A Situationist Critique</i>	49
Jessica M. Eaglin, <i>Constructing Recidivism Risk</i>	51
Notes and Questions	53
D. Retribution	55
1. Retribution as a Limit on Punishment	55
H. J. McCloskey, <i>A Non-Utilitarian Approach to Punishment</i>	55
John Rawls, <i>Two Concepts of Rules</i>	55
Guyora Binder & Nicholas J. Smith, <i>Framed: Utilitarianism and Punishment of the Innocent</i>	56
Herbert Packer, <i>The Limits of the Criminal Sanction</i>	57
David Dolinko, <i>Three Mistakes of Retributivism</i>	57
<i>Kansas v. Hendricks</i>	58
Notes and Questions	60
2. Retribution as an Affirmative Justification for Punishment	61

Contents	xiii
a. The Appeal to Intuition	61
Michael Moore, Placing Blame	61
Notes and Questions	62
b. The Argument from Social Contract	62
Herbert Morris, On Guilt and Innocence	62
Jeffrie Murphy, Marxism and Retribution	63
Notes and Questions	64
c. The Expressive Argument	66
Joel Feinberg, Doing and Deserving	66
John Braithwaite, Crime, Shame, and Reintegration	67
Jean Hampton, Punishment as Defeat	68
Aya Gruber, A Distributive Theory of Criminal Law	69
Notes and Questions	70
E. Critical Legal Realism About Punishment	72
1. Punishment as Subordination	72
Dorothy E. Roberts, Foreword: Abolition Constitutionalism	72
Alexandra Natapoff, Misdemeanors	75
Notes and Questions	77
2. Prison Abolition	77
Angela Y. Davis, Are Prisons Obsolete?	77
Notes and Questions	80
Snapshot Review	81
F. Proportionality	81
<i>Graham v. Florida</i>	82
Notes and Questions	87
<i>Kennedy v. Louisiana</i>	90
Notes and Questions	93
<i>Ewing v. California</i>	93
Notes and Questions	95
<i>Miller v. Alabama</i>	97
Notes and Questions	99
G. Modern Guidelines Sentencing	100
1. History and Concept	100
Kevin Reitz, Sentencing: Guidelines	102
2. Due Process, the Right to a Jury Trial, and Sentencing Designs	104
3. The <i>Blakely-Booker</i> Revolution in Sentencing	107
Snapshot Review	114

PART II	THE ELEMENTS OF THE CRIMINAL OFFENSE	115
Chapter 2	The Criminal Act	117
A.	The Need for an Actus Reus	118
	<i>Proctor v. State</i>	118
	Notes and Questions	121
B.	Omissions	123
	<i>Jones v. United States</i>	123
	Notes and Questions	126
C.	Possession	131
	<i>United States v. Maldonado</i>	132
	Notes and Questions	134
	<i>State v. Barger</i>	138
	Notes and Questions	142
D.	The Requirement of Harm	143
	<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	143
	Notes and Questions	149
E.	The Requirement of Voluntariness	152
	<i>Martin v. State</i>	152
	Notes and Questions	152
	<i>People v. Grant</i>	153
	Notes and Questions	156
F.	The Prohibition of “Status” Crimes	159
	<i>Robinson v. California</i>	159
	Notes and Questions	160
	<i>Grants Pass v. Johnson</i>	166
	Notes and Questions	174
G.	Legality	176
	<i>Keeler v. Superior Court</i>	176
	Notes and Questions	177
	<i>United States v. Hudson and Goodwin</i>	180
	Notes and Questions	181
	<i>Rogers v. Tennessee</i>	185
	Notes and Questions	189
H.	Specificity	190
	<i>Chicago v. Morales</i>	190
	Notes and Questions	194
	Snapshot Review	202

Contents	xv
Chapter 3 The Guilty Mind	205
A. The Requirement of a Guilty Mind	207
<i>Commonwealth v. Mixer</i>	207
Notes and Questions	209
<i>United States v. Wulff</i>	218
Notes and Questions	220
<i>Lambert v. California</i>	223
Notes and Questions	225
Snapshot Review	226
B. Categories of Culpability	227
<i>Regina v. Faulkner</i>	227
Notes and Questions	229
Model Penal Code	231
Notes and Questions	232
Snapshot Review	243
C. Mistake and Mens Rea Default Rules	243
<i>People v. Gory</i>	243
Notes and Questions	246
<i>Simms v. District of Columbia</i>	246
Notes and Questions	249
<i>People v. Ryan</i>	250
Notes and Questions	253
<i>Elonis v. United States</i>	256
Notes and Questions	259
Snapshot Review	263
D. “Mistake of Law”	264
1. Introduction to Mistake of Law	264
2. Mistake of Law and Mens Rea	267
<i>People v. Bray</i>	267
Notes and Questions	269
<i>United States v. Baker</i>	270
Notes and Questions	271
<i>Cheek v. United States</i>	273
Notes and Questions	277
3. Mistake of Law as an Excuse	278
<i>Commonwealth v. Twitchell</i>	278
Notes and Questions	281

xvi	Contents
E. Capacity for Mens Rea	283
1. Voluntary Intoxication	284
<i>State v. Cameron</i>	284
Notes and Questions	287
2. Mental Illness or Impairment	292
<i>State v. Joseph</i>	292
Notes and Questions	296
Snapshot Review	298
Chapter 4 Causation	299
A. “But-For” Causation	301
<i>Regina v. Martin Dyos</i>	301
Notes and Questions	303
B. Violent Acts	311
<i>Hubbard v. Commonwealth</i>	311
Notes and Questions	313
C. Proximate Cause: Foreseeability and Related Limitations	314
<i>Commonwealth v. Rhoades</i>	314
Notes and Questions	315
Snapshot Review	316
D. Intervening Causes	320
<i>Commonwealth v. Root</i>	320
Notes and Questions	323
<i>United States v. Hamilton</i>	326
Notes and Questions	328
<i>People v. Kevoorkian</i>	332
Notes and Questions	335
<i>Commonwealth v. Carter</i>	337
Notes and Questions	341
E. Causation by Omission: Duties	343
<i>Commonwealth v. Levesque</i>	344
Notes and Questions	346
Snapshot Review	351
PART III CRIMES AGAINST THE PERSON	355
A. The Building Block of Crimes Against the Person: Assault	357

Contents	xvii
<i>Hernandez v. United States</i>	357
Notes and Questions	360
Chapter 5 Intentional Homicide	363
A. Intentional Murder (Second Degree)	365
<i>Francis v. Franklin</i>	365
Notes and Questions	368
B. Premeditated Murder (First Degree)	372
<i>United States v. Watson</i>	372
Notes and Questions	376
C. Voluntary Manslaughter	383
1. The Theory of Mitigation	383
<i>People v. Walker</i>	383
Notes and Questions	385
2. “Cooling Time”	390
<i>Ex Parte Fraley</i>	390
Notes and Questions	392
3. Adultery as “Adequate Provocation”	395
<i>Rowland v. State</i>	395
Notes and Questions	397
Snapshot Review	403
4. Provocation Under Reform Rules	403
<i>People v. Berry</i>	403
Notes and Questions	406
5. Cultural Norms and the Reasonable Person	413
<i>People v. Wu</i>	413
Notes and Questions	422
Snapshot Review	426
Chapter 6 Unintentional Homicide	427
A. Involuntary Manslaughter: Negligent and Reckless Homicide	427
<i>Commonwealth v. Welansky</i>	427
Notes and Questions	430
<i>State v. Williams</i>	434
Notes and Questions	437
B. Reckless Murder	440
<i>Mayer v. The People</i>	440
Notes and Questions	443

C. Homicide in the Course of Another Crime	452
1. Felony Murder: An Introduction	452
<i>State v. Martin</i>	452
Notes and Questions	457
2. Attribution of Death to the Felony	468
a. Felony-Murder Liability of Accomplices	469
Notes and Questions	471
b. Felony-Murder Liability for Killings by Nonfelons	472
<i>People v. Washington</i>	473
Notes and Questions	475
<i>People v. Hernandez</i>	477
Notes and Questions	479
c. Spatial and Temporal Scope of the Felony	480
3. The Independent Felonious Purpose Limitation	482
<i>State v. Shock</i>	482
Notes and Questions	484
4. Two Variants of Felony Murder	487
a. Misdemeanor Manslaughter	487
b. Death-Aggravated Felonies	488
Snapshot Review	489
Chapter 7 Capital Murder and the Death Penalty	491
A. A Historical and Constitutional Summary	491
B. The New Capital Statutes	500
1. The Structure of “Guided Discretion”: An Exemplary Case	501
<i>Olsen v. State</i>	501
Notes and Questions	511
2. Mitigating Circumstances	517
a. The Concept of Mitigation	517
b. The Scope of Mitigation	517
c. Limits on Mitigation	519
d. Reverse Mitigating Circumstances	520
3. Weighing the Circumstances	520
a. Formulas for the Jury	520
b. Standard of Proof for Mitigation	522
c. Ensuring Jury Responsibility	523
C. Categorical Limits on the Death Penalty	524
1. The Mens Rea Limit: A Reprise on Felony Murder	525

Contents	xix
<i>Tison v. Arizona</i>	525
Notes and Questions	530
2. Victim/Race Discrimination and the Eighth Amendment	532
<i>McCleskey v. Kemp</i>	532
Notes and Questions	537
Snapshot Review	542
Chapter 8 Sexual Assault	543
A. Introduction	543
1. Teaching Sexual Assault	543
Susan Estrich, Teaching Rape Law	543
Jeannie Suk Gersen, The Trouble with Teaching Rape Law	544
2. The Evolution of Sexual Assault Rules	545
3. Some Facts About Sexual Assault in the United States	551
B. Resistance Requirements	553
<i>People v. Dorsey</i>	554
Notes and Questions	557
C. Force	559
<i>People v. Barnes</i>	560
Notes and Questions	565
D. Nonconsent	572
<i>State v. Barela</i>	572
Notes and Questions	575
E. Lack of Affirmative Consent	579
<i>In the Interest of M.T.S.</i>	579
Notes and Questions	585
F. Mens Rea	590
<i>Commonwealth v. Lopez</i>	590
Notes and Questions	594
G. Incapacity to Consent	597
<i>People v. Hernandez</i>	598
Notes and Questions	600
<i>State v. Jones</i>	602
Notes and Questions	605
H. Sexual Assault by Extortion	609
<i>Commonwealth v. Mlinarich</i>	609
Notes and Questions	611
I. Sexual Assault by Fraud	614

xx		Contents
	<i>Boro v. People</i>	614
	Notes and Questions	616
J.	Evidentiary Reforms	620
	Snapshot Review	628
PART IV	JUSTIFICATION AND EXCUSE	629
A.	Distinguishing Justification And Excuse	629
B.	Justification, Excuse, and the Purposes of Punishment	631
Chapter 9	Defensive Force, Necessity, and Duress	635
A.	Defensive Force	635
1.	Elements and Rationales	635
	<i>People v. La Voie</i>	635
	Notes and Questions	637
	<i>People v. Gleghorn</i>	640
	Notes and Questions	642
2.	The Reasonable Self-Defender: The Case of the Battered Spouse	644
	<i>State v. Leidholm</i>	644
	Notes and Questions	652
3.	Reprise on the Reasonable Self-Defender	666
	<i>People v. Goetz</i>	667
	Notes and Questions	670
4.	Defensive Force to Protect Property or Habitation	672
	<i>People v. Ceballos</i>	673
	Notes and Questions	677
5.	Defensive Force and Law Enforcement	679
	<i>Tennessee v. Garner</i>	683
	Notes and Questions	686
B.	Choice of Evils: Necessity	693
1.	The Moral Issue	693
	<i>The Queen v. Dudley & Stephens</i>	693
	Notes and Questions	698
2.	Escape from Intolerable Prison Conditions	705
	<i>People v. Unger</i>	705
	Notes and Questions	709
3.	“Political” Necessity	710

Contents	xxi
<i>State v. Warshow</i>	710
Notes and Questions	712
C. Duress	715
<i>State v. Crawford</i>	715
Notes and Questions	721
<i>State v. Hunter</i>	726
Notes and Questions	729
Snapshot Review	735
Chapter 10 Mental Illness as a Defense	739
A. Introduction	739
B. The <i>M’Naghten</i> Rule and Cognition	741
<i>People v. Serravo</i>	741
Notes and Questions	750
C. Cognition and Volition: The Road from <i>M’Naghten</i> and Back	760
<i>Smith v. State</i>	763
Notes and Questions	767
D. Reprise: Reassessing the Insanity Defense	777
E. “Quasi-Insanity” Defenses	781
1. Alcohol and Other Drugs	781
2. Posttraumatic Stress Disorder	783
3. Postpartum Psychosis	787
4. “Multiple Personality” Disorder	788
5. The Antisocial Personality	790
Snapshot Review	791
PART V ATTRIBUTION OF CRIMINALITY	793
Chapter 11 Attempt	795
A. The Punishment of Attempt	795
1. Why Punish Attempt?	795
2. The Emergence of Attempt Liability	796
George Fletcher, Rethinking Criminal Law	796
3. The Grading of Attempt	797
Model Penal Code	797
B. The Mens Rea for Attempt	799
<i>State v. Lyerla</i>	799

Notes and Questions	801
<i>People v. Bland</i>	806
Notes and Questions	811
C. The Actus Reus of Attempt	812
1. Preparation vs. Attempt	812
<i>People v. Murray</i>	812
Notes and Questions	813
<i>McQuirter v. State</i>	815
Notes and Questions	817
<i>People v. Rizzo</i>	818
Notes and Questions	821
Snapshot Review	822
2. Abandonment	824
<i>People v. Staples</i>	824
Notes and Questions	826
3. Solicitation	829
<i>People v. Lubow</i>	829
Notes and Questions	831
D. Impossibility	835
<i>Booth v. State</i>	835
Notes and Questions	841
<i>People v. Thousand</i>	848
Notes and Questions	850
<i>People v. Dlugash</i>	852
Notes and Questions	855
Snapshot Review	856
Chapter 12 Complicity	859
A. The Accessorial Act	862
<i>State v. Ochoa</i>	862
Notes and Questions	867
<i>State v. Tally</i>	876
Notes and Questions	884
<i>State v. Formella</i>	887
Notes and Questions	890
B. Mens Rea of Complicity	890
1. Intent to Aid or Encourage	891
<i>People v. Beeman</i>	891
Notes and Questions	895

Contents	xxiii
2. The Mental Element of the Offense	899
<i>Wilson v. People</i>	899
Notes and Questions	902
3. Combined Standards and Unintended Harm	904
<i>State v. Anthony</i>	904
Notes and Questions	907
4. Culpability for Secondary Crimes	911
<i>Rosemond v. United States</i>	911
Notes and Questions	914
<i>People v. Kessler</i>	916
Notes and Questions	918
C. Relations of Parties	919
Snapshot Review	923
D. Criminal Liability of Corporations	925
1. Respondeat Superior and the Premises of Corporate Liability	925
<i>State v. Christy Pontiac-GMC, Inc.</i>	925
Notes and Questions	927
<i>United States v. Hilton Hotels Corp.</i>	933
Notes and Questions	934
2. The MPC and the “Corporate Mind”	935
Notes and Questions	936
Snapshot Review	938
Chapter 13 Conspiracy	939
<i>Chapline v. State</i>	940
Notes and Questions	943
1. Termination of the Agreement	956
<i>United States v. Recio</i>	956
Notes and Questions	958
A. The Mens Rea of Conspiracy	961
<i>People v. Lauria</i>	961
Notes and Questions	967
B. Special Mens Rea Problems of Conspiracy	970
C. The Incidents of Conspiracy	973
<i>United States v. Diaz</i>	973
Notes and Questions	975
D. The Parties to and Objects of Conspiracy	979
1. The Problem of Disparate Liability	979
a. Bilateral and Unilateral Conspiracies	979

xxiv	Contents
2. The Scope of the Conspiracy	983
a. Single vs. Multiple Conspiracies	983
b. Chains, Wheels, Etc.	987
<i>United States v. Caldwell</i>	991
Notes and Questions	993
E. The RICO Statute and the Frontier of Conspiracy	995
1. The Statute	995
2. Elements of Racketeering	997
3. RICO Conspiracies	999
Snapshot Review	1003
PART VI	ADDITIONAL OFFENSES
	1007
Chapter 14	Theft and Other Property Offenses
	1009
A. Theft	1009
1. The Meaning of Theft	1009
<i>Commonwealth v. Mitchneck</i>	1009
Notes and Questions	1010
2. The Development of Theft Offenses	1010
<i>The Case of the Carrier Who Broke Bulk Anon v. the Sheriff of London</i>	1012
<i>Rex v. Chisser</i>	1013
<i>The King v. Pear</i>	1013
Notes and Questions	1014
B. Fraud	1021
1. False Pretenses	1021
<i>People v. Sattlekau</i>	1021
Notes and Questions	1025
2. Scheme to Defraud in Federal Law	1026
<i>Durland v. United States</i>	1026
Notes and Questions	1028
3. Bank Fraud	1033
<i>United States v. Phillips</i>	1033
Notes and Questions	1038
C. Extortion	1039
<i>People v. Dioguardi</i>	1039
Notes and Questions	1043

Contents	xxv
D. Robbery	1050
<i>Lear v. State</i>	1050
Notes and Questions	1052
E. Burglary	1056
<i>State v. Colvin</i>	1056
Notes and Questions	1059
F. Other Real Property Offenses	1065
<i>In re Jason Allen D.</i>	1066
Notes and Questions	1069
Snapshot Review	1071
Chapter 15 Perjury and False Statements	1073
A. Perjury	1073
<i>Bronston v. United States</i>	1074
Notes and Questions	1078
Stuart Green, Lying, Misleading, and Falsely Denying: How Moral Concepts Inform the Law of Perjury, Fraud, and False Statements	1086
Notes and Questions	1091
B. False Statements	1091
<i>United States v. Moore</i>	1092
Notes and Questions	1094
<i>Brogan v. United States</i>	1096
Notes and Questions	1098
Snapshot Review	1098
Appendix A A Note on the Model Penal Code	1101
Appendix B The Model Penal Code	1105
Appendix C Homicide Statutes	1167
Appendix D Selected State Sexual Assault Statutes	1179
Table of Cases	1197
Table of Model Penal Code Sections	1209
Index	1211