

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

CASES AND MATERIALS ON TORTS



THIRTEENTH EDITION

RICHARD A. EPSTEIN

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law

New York University School of Law

Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow

The Hoover Institution

Stanford University

James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law

Emeritus and Senior Lecturer

The University of Chicago

CATHERINE M. SHARKEY

Segal Family Professor of Regulatory Law and Policy

New York University School of Law



SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

<i>Contents</i>	xi
<i>Preface</i>	xix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxiii
<i>Introduction</i>	xxvii
Torts: <i>List of Chapters</i>	xxxiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxxv
CHAPTER 1	
Intentional Harms: The Prima Facie Case and Defenses	1
CHAPTER 2	
Strict Liability and Negligence: Historic and Analytic Foundations	63
CHAPTER 3	
Negligence	109
CHAPTER 4	
Plaintiff's Conduct	219
CHAPTER 5	
Causation	289
CHAPTER 6	
Affirmative Duties	389
CHAPTER 7	
Strict Liability	451
CHAPTER 8	
Products Liability	545
CHAPTER 9	
Damages	645
<i>Table of Cases</i>	691
<i>Table of Restatement Sections</i>	713
<i>Table of Secondary Authorities</i>	717
<i>Index</i>	731

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxiii
<i>Introduction</i>	xxvii
Torts: <i>List of Chapters</i>	xxxiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxxv
CHAPTER 1	
Intentional Harms: The Prima Facie Case and Defenses	1
Section A. Introduction	1
Section B. Physical Harms	2
1. Trespass to Person and Land	2
<i>Vosburg v. Putney</i>	2
<i>Dougherty v. Stepp</i>	7
2. Defenses to Intentional Torts	11
a. Consensual Defenses	11
<i>Mohr v. Williams</i>	11
<i>Canterbury v. Spence</i>	19
<i>Hudson v. Craft</i>	19
b. Mental Disability	24
<i>McGuire v. Almy</i>	24
c. Self-Defense	27
<i>Courvoisier v. Raymond</i>	27
d. Defense of Property	31
<i>Bird v. Holbrook</i>	31
e. Necessity	37
<i>Ploof v. Putnam</i>	37
<i>Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co.</i>	39
Thomson, The Trolley Problem	44
Section C. Emotional and Dignitary Harms	46
1. Assault	46
<i>I. de S. and Wife v. W. de S.</i>	46
<i>Tuberville v. Savage</i>	46
Blackstone, Commentaries	47
2. Offensive Battery	49
<i>Alcorn v. Mitchell</i>	49
3. False Imprisonment	51
<i>Coblyn v. Kennedy's, Inc.</i>	51
4. The Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress: Extreme and Outrageous Conduct	55
<i>Wilkinson v. Downton</i>	55

CHAPTER 2	
Strict Liability and Negligence: Historic and Analytic Foundations	63
Section A. Introduction	63
Section B. The Formative Cases	63
<i>The Thorns Case (Hull v. Orange)</i>	63
<i>Weaver v. Ward</i>	68
Section C. The Forms of Action	70
1. The Significance of the Forms of Action	70
2. Trespass and Case	71
<i>Scott v. Shepherd</i>	72
3. The Breakdown of the Forms of Action	75
Section D. Strict Liability and Negligence in the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century	77
<i>Brown v. Kendall</i>	78
<i>Fletcher v. Rylands (1865)</i>	81
<i>Fletcher v. Rylands (1866)</i>	83
<i>Rylands v. Fletcher</i>	85
<i>Brown v. Collins</i>	89
<i>Powell v. Fall</i>	92
Holmes, The Common Law	94
Section E. Strict Liability and Negligence in Modern Times	99
<i>Stone v. Bolton</i>	99
<i>Bolton v. Stone</i>	100
<i>Hammontree v. Jenner</i>	105
CHAPTER 3	
Negligence	109
Thayer, Public Wrong and Private Action	109
Green, Judge and Jury	109
Section A. Introduction	109
Section B. The Reasonable Person	111
<i>Vaughan v. Menlove</i>	111
Holmes, The Common Law	115
<i>Roberts v. Ring</i>	116
<i>Daniels v. Evans</i>	119
<i>Breunig v. American Family Insurance Co.</i>	122
<i>Fletcher v. City of Aberdeen</i>	126
<i>Denver & Rio Grande R.R. v. Peterson</i>	128
Section C. Calculus of Risk	128
<i>Blyth v. Birmingham Water Works</i>	129
Terry, Negligence	130
Seavey, Negligence—Subjective or Objective?	131
<i>Osborne v. Montgomery</i>	132
<i>Cooley v. Public Service Co.</i>	134
<i>United States v. Carroll Towing Co.</i>	136
Ross, Settled Out of Court	143
<i>Andrews v. United Airlines</i>	143

Section D. Custom	146
1. Custom in General	146
<i>Titus v. Bradford, B. & K. R. Co.</i>	146
<i>Mayhew v. Sullivan Mining Co.</i>	148
<i>The T.J. Hooper (1931)</i>	150
<i>The T.J. Hooper (1932)</i>	151
2. Medical Malpractice	155
<i>Lama v. Borrás</i>	155
<i>Murray v. UNMC Physicians</i>	162
3. Informed Consent	166
Schuck, Rethinking Informed Consent	166
<i>Canterbury v. Spence</i>	166
Section E. Statutes and Regulations	176
<i>Anon.</i>	177
Thayer, Public Wrong and Private Action	177
<i>Osborne v. McMasters</i>	179
<i>Martin v. Herzog</i>	183
<i>Uhr v. East Greenbush Central School District</i>	186
Section F. Judge and Jury	188
Holmes, The Common Law	191
<i>Baltimore and Ohio R.R. v. Goodman</i>	192
<i>Pokora v. Wabash Ry.</i>	193
Section G. Proof of Negligence	199
<i>Byrne v. Boadle</i>	199
<i>Colmenares Vivas v. Sun Alliance Insurance Co.</i>	204
<i>Ybarra v. Spangard</i>	211
CHAPTER 4	
Plaintiff's Conduct	219
Section A. Introduction	219
Section B. Contributory Negligence	220
1. Basic Doctrine	220
<i>Butterfield v. Forrester</i>	220
<i>Beems v. Chicago, Rock Island & Peoria R.R.</i>	221
Schwartz, Tort Law and the Economy in Nineteenth-Century America: A Reinterpretation	221
<i>Gyerman v. United States Lines Co.</i>	224
<i>LeRoy Fibre Co. v. Chicago, Milwaukee & St. Paul Ry.</i>	231
<i>Derheim v. N. Fiorito Co.</i>	234
2. Last Clear Chance	237
<i>Fuller v. Illinois Central R.R.</i>	237
Section C. Imputed Contributory Negligence	240
Section D. Assumption of Risk	242
1. Industrial Accidents	242
<i>Lamson v. American Axe & Tool Co.</i>	242
2. The Workmen's Compensation Acts	246
<i>Ives v. S. Buffalo Ry.</i>	246

3. Nonindustrial Accidents	252
<i>Murphy v. Steeplechase Amusement Co.</i>	252
<i>Dalury v. S-K-I Ltd.</i>	259
Section E. Comparative Negligence	264
1. At Common Law	264
Lombard Laws, King Liutprand	264
Beach, Contributory Negligence	264
Prosser, Comparative Negligence	265
<i>Li v. Yellow Cab Co. of California</i>	265
2. By Legislation	276
Section F. Modern No-Fault Systems	279
1. Automobile No-Fault Plans	279
<i>Pinnick v. Cleary</i>	280
2. No-Fault Insurance for Medical and Product Injuries	283
CHAPTER 5	
Causation	289
Section A. Introduction	289
Section B. Cause in Fact	291
1. The “But For” Test	291
<i>New York Central R.R. v. Grimstad</i>	291
<i>Zuchowicz v. United States</i>	294
2. Joint and Several Liability and Multiple Causes	299
a. Joint and Several Liability	299
<i>Union Stock Yards Co. of Omaha v. Chicago, Burlington, & Quincy R.R.</i>	299
<i>American Motorcycle Association v. Superior Court</i>	302
b. Multiple Sufficient Causes	310
<i>Kingston v. Chicago & N.W. Ry.</i>	310
3. Indeterminate Causes	314
a. Alternative Liability	314
<i>Summers v. Tice</i>	314
b. Market Share Liability	317
<i>Sindell v. Abbott Laboratories</i>	317
c. Loss of Chance of Survival	325
<i>Herskovits v. Group Health Cooperative</i>	325
4. Proof of Factual Causation	331
<i>General Electric Co. v. Joiner</i>	331
Section C. Proximate Cause (Herein of Duty)	338
1. Physical Injury	338
Bacon, The Elements of the Common Lawes of England	338
Hume, An Enquiry Concerning Human Under Standing	338
Street, Foundations of Legal Liability	338
<i>Ryan v. New York Central R.R.</i>	339
<i>Berry v. Sugar Notch Borough</i>	342
<i>Brower v. New York Central & Hudson River R.R.</i>	345
<i>Wagner v. International Ry.</i>	349
<i>In re Polemis & Furness, Withy & Co.</i>	351
<i>Overseas Tankship (U.K.) Ltd. v. Morts Dock & Engineering Co., Ltd.</i> (<i>Wagon Mound (No. 1)</i>)	354

<i>Palsgraf v. Long Island R.R.</i>	360
<i>Marshall v. Nugent</i>	371
<i>Viriden v. Betts and Beer Construction Co.</i>	374
<i>Hebert v. Enos</i>	375
2. Emotional Distress	376
<i>Mitchell v. Rochester Ry.</i>	377
<i>Dillon v. Legg</i>	379
CHAPTER 6	
Affirmative Duties	389
Section A. Introduction	389
Section B. The Duty to Rescue	390
Luke 10:30-37 (King James Translation)	390
<i>Buch v. Amory Manufacturing Co.</i>	391
<i>Hurley v. Eddingfield</i>	393
Bohlen, The Moral Duty to Aid Others as a Basis of Tort Liability	394
Ames, Law and Morals	394
Epstein, A Theory of Strict Liability	395
Posner, Epstein's Tort Theory: A Critique	397
Fletcher, Law and Morality: A Kantian Perspective	397
Bender, An Overview of Feminist Torts Scholarship	398
<i>Montgomery v. National Convoy & Trucking Co.</i>	401
Section C. Duties of Owners and Occupiers	405
<i>Robert Addie & Sons (Colliers), Ltd. v. Dumbreck</i>	405
<i>Rowland v. Christian</i>	412
Section D. Gratuitous Undertakings	420
<i>Coggs v. Bernard</i>	420
<i>Erie R.R. v. Stewart</i>	422
<i>Moch Co. v. Rensselaer Water Co.</i>	426
Section E. Special Relationships	432
<i>Kline v. 1500 Massachusetts Avenue Apartment Corp.</i>	433
<i>Tarasoff v. Regents of University of California</i>	441
CHAPTER 7	
Strict Liability	451
Section A. Introduction	451
Section B. Trespass to Chattels and Conversion	451
1. Trespass to Chattels	451
<i>Intel Corp. v. Hamidi</i>	452
2. Conversion	458
<i>Poggi v. Scott</i>	458
<i>Moore v. Regents of the University of California</i>	461
Section C. Animals	468
<i>Gehrts v. Batteen</i>	468
Section D. Ultrahazardous or Abnormally Dangerous Activities	474
<i>Spano v. Perini Corp.</i>	474
<i>Indiana Harbor Belt R.R. v. American Cyanamid Co.</i>	482

Section E. Nuisance	489
1. Private Nuisance	489
<i>Vogel v. Grant-Lafayette Electric Cooperative</i>	489
<i>Michalson v. Nutting</i>	494
<i>Fontainebleau Hotel Corp. v. Forty-Five Twenty-Five, Inc.</i>	497
<i>Rogers v. Elliott</i>	502
<i>Ensign v. Walls</i>	505
<i>Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co.</i>	508
2. Public Nuisance	515
<i>Anonymous</i>	515
<i>Burgess v. M/V Tamano</i>	517
<i>City of New York v. Chevron Corp.</i>	520
<i>City & County of San Francisco v. Purdue Pharma L.P.</i>	525
Section F. Vicarious Liability	530
<i>Ira S. Bushey & Sons, Inc. v. United States</i>	531
<i>Search v. Uber Technologies, Inc.</i>	536
CHAPTER 8	
Products Liability	545
Section A. Introduction	545
Section B. Exposition	547
<i>Winterbottom v. Wright</i>	547
<i>MacPherson v. Buick Motor Co.</i>	550
<i>Escola v. Coca Cola Bottling Co. of Fresno</i>	557
Section C. The Restatements	565
1. A Tale of Two Texts	565
2. The Theory of Products Liability: Tort or Contract	569
<i>Casa Clara Condominium Association, Inc. v. Charley</i>	
<i>Toppino & Sons, Inc.</i>	570
3. Proper Defendants Under Section 402A	575
<i>Loomis v. Amazon.com LLC</i>	575
Section D. Product Defects	581
1. Manufacturing Defects	581
<i>Speller v. Sears, Roebuck and Co.</i>	581
2. Design Defects	585
<i>Campo v. Scofield</i>	585
2 Harper and James, Torts §28.5	585
Wade, On the Nature of Strict Tort Liability for Products	585
a. Development of the Negligence Test	586
<i>Volkswagen of America, Inc. v. Young</i>	586
b. Consumer Expectations versus Risk-Utility Tests	593
<i>Barker v. Lull Engineering Co.</i>	593
c. The Third Restatement Reasonable Alternative Design Test	599
3. The Duty to Warn	603
<i>MacDonald v. Ortho Pharmaceutical Corp.</i>	603
<i>Vassallo v. Baxter Healthcare Corp.</i>	611
<i>Hood v. Ryobi America Corp.</i>	614
<i>Air & Liquid Systems Corp. v. DeVries</i>	619

Section E. Plaintiff's Conduct	622
<i>Daly v. General Motors Corp.</i>	622
Section F. Federal Preemption	629
<i>Geier v. American Honda Motor Co.</i>	630
<i>Wyeth v. Levine</i>	635
CHAPTER 9	
Damages	645
<i>Sullivan v. Old Colony Street Ry.</i>	645
<i>Zibbell v. Southern Pacific Co.</i>	645
Section A. Introduction	645
Section B. Compensatory Damages	646
1. Nonpecuniary Damages	646
<i>McDougald v. Garber</i>	646
2. Pecuniary Damages	653
<i>O'Shea v. Riverway Towing Co.</i>	653
<i>Duncan v. Kansas City Southern Ry.</i>	659
Section C. Wrongful Death and Loss of Consortium	664
1. Wrongful Death	665
a. History	665
b. Measure of Damages	666
2. Survival of Personal Injury Actions	667
3. Actions for Loss of Consortium	668
a. History	668
b. Parents and Children	668
c. Nontraditional Families	669
d. Damages in Consortium Cases	670
Section D. Punitive Damages	671
<i>Kemezy v. Peters</i>	671
<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i>	676
Section E. Collateral Benefits	684
<i>Harding v. Town of Townshend</i>	684
<i>Table of Cases</i>	691
<i>Table of Restatement Sections</i>	713
<i>Table of Secondary Authorities</i>	717
<i>Index</i>	731