

---

# CONTENTS

<i>Preface to the Sixth Edition</i>	xxi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv

## CHAPTER 1

<b>Introduction</b>	1
The Role of Remedies	1
Classifying Remedies	2
Substitutionary and Specific Remedies	4
Legal and Equitable Remedies	5
Note on the Nature of Remedies	5

## CHAPTER 2

<b>Paying for Harm: Compensatory Damages</b>	7
A. The Basic Principle: Restoring Plaintiff to the Rightful Position	7
<i>United States v. Hatabley</i>	7
Notes on the Basic Principle	10
B. Value as the Measure of the Rightful Position	13
<i>In re September 11th Litigation</i>	13
Notes on Market Value	16
Notes on “Value to the Owner”	19
<i>Trinity Church v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co.</i>	20
Notes on Special-Purpose Property	23
Notes on Repair Costs	24
Note on Property That Fluctuates in Value	26
C. Expectancy and Reliance as Measures of the Rightful Position	26
<i>Neri v. Retail Marine Corp.</i>	26
Notes on §2-708(2) and Attempts to Codify Remedies	28
Notes on Expectancy and Reliance	30
Notes on Compensating Expectancies	32
<i>Chatlos Systems, Inc. v. National Cash Register Corp.</i>	34
Notes on Excessive Expectancies	36
<i>Smith v. Bolles</i>	38
Notes on Expectancy in Tort	38
D. Consequential Damages	39
<i>Buck v. Morrow</i>	39
Notes on General and Special Damages	40
Notes on the Vocabulary of Damages	42
<i>Meinrath v. Singer Co.</i>	45
Notes on Consequential Damages from Failure to Pay Money	47

E. Limits on Damages	48
1. The Parties' Power to Specify the Remedy	48
<i>Kearney &amp; Trecker Corp. v. Master Engraving Co.</i>	48
Notes on Limitation-of-Remedy Clauses	52
<i>Commercial Real Estate Investment, L.C. v. Comcast of Utah II, Inc.</i>	54
Notes on Liquidated-Damage and Penalty Clauses	58
Notes on Underliquidated-Damage Clauses	61
2. Avoidable Consequences, Offsetting Benefits, and Collateral Sources	62
<i>S.J. Groves &amp; Sons Co. v. Warner Co.</i>	62
Notes on Avoidable Consequences	64
Notes on Offsetting Benefits	67
<i>Oden v. Chemung County Industrial Development Agency</i>	68
Notes on the Collateral-Source Rule	71
3. The Scope of Liability	75
<i>Pruitt v. Allied Chemical Corp.</i>	75
Notes on the Scope of Liability	78
Notes on the Economic-Loss Rules	81
<i>Sunnyland Farms, Inc. v. Central New Mexico Electric Cooperative, Inc.</i>	85
More Notes on the Scope of Liability	88
4. Substantive Policy Goals	89
<i>Brunswick Corp. v. Pueblo Bowl-O-Mat</i>	89
Notes on Remedial Implications of Substantive Policy	93
5. The Requirement of Reasonable Certainty	94
<i>Bigelow v. RKO Radio Pictures</i>	94
Notes on the Requirement of Reasonable Certainty	98
Notes on Litigating Commercial Damages	101
F. Taxes, Time, and the Value of Money	102
1. The Impact of Taxes	102
<i>Norfolk &amp; Western Railway v. Liepelt</i>	102
Notes on Taxes	106
2. Interest on Past Damages	107
<i>City of Milwaukee v. Cement Division, National Gypsum Co.</i>	107
Notes on Interest	110
3. The Net Present Value of Future Damages	112
<i>Jones &amp; Laughlin Steel Corp. v. Pfeiffer</i>	112
Notes on Discounting to Present Value	118
Notes on Race- and Sex-Based Data	121
G. Damages Where Harm Cannot Be Valued in a Market	123
1. Personal Injuries, Pain and Suffering, and Death	123
<i>Debus v. Grand Union Stores</i>	123
Notes on Pain and Suffering	126
Notes on Wrongful Death	129
Notes on Attempts at Market-Based Valuation of Pain and Suffering and Human Life	133
2. Emotional Distress, Dignitary Harm, and Constitutional Harm	137
<i>Levka v. City of Chicago</i>	137
Notes on Recovering for Emotional Distress	140
Notes on Judicial Review of Emotional Distress Damages	142
<i>Carey v. Piphus</i>	147
Notes on Valuing Dignitary Harm and Constitutional Rights	150

3. The Controversy over Tort Law	153
<i>Arbino v. Johnson &amp; Johnson</i>	153
Notes on the Constitutionality of Limiting Tort Remedies	159
Notes on the Empirical Debate: How Big Is the Problem?	162
<b>CHAPTER 3</b>	
<b>Punitive Remedies</b>	169
A. Punitive Damages	169
1. Common Law and Statutes	169
<i>Exxon Shipping Co. v. Baker</i>	169
Notes on Awarding Punitive Damages	177
Notes on Measuring Punitive Damages	181
2. The Constitution	183
<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i>	183
Notes on Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages	188
<i>Philip Morris USA v. Williams</i>	191
More Notes on Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages	195
3. Punitive Damages in Contract	197
<i>Formosa Plastics Corp. USA v. Presidio Engineers and Contractors, Inc.</i>	197
Notes on Punitive Damages in Contract	201
B. Other Punitive Remedies	204
1. Statutory Recoveries by Private Litigants	204
2. Civil Penalties Payable to the Government	206
<b>CHAPTER 4</b>	
<b>Preventing Harm: The Measure of Injunctive Relief</b>	209
A. The Scope of Injunctions	209
1. Preventing Wrongful Acts	209
<i>Almurbati v. Bush</i>	209
Notes on Ripeness	210
<i>Marshall v. Goodyear Tire &amp; Rubber Co.</i>	214
Notes on the Scope of Injunctions to Prevent Wrongful Acts	215
Notes on Individual Injunctions, Class Injunctions, and Universal Injunctions	217
<i>United States v. W.T. Grant Co.</i>	220
Notes on Voluntary Cessation of Wrongful Acts	222
2. Preventing Lawful Acts That Might Have Wrongful Consequences	224
<i>Nicholson v. Connecticut Half-Way House, Inc.</i>	224
Notes on Ripeness and Uncertain Consequences	225
<i>PepsiCo, Inc. v. Redmond</i>	226
Notes on Prophylactic Injunctions	230
3. Repairing the Consequences of Past Wrongful Conduct	234
<i>Forster v. Boss</i>	234
Notes on Reparative Injunctions	236
Notes on Coordinating Multiple Remedies	238
<i>Winston Research Corp. v. Minnesota Mining &amp; Manufacturing Co.</i>	239
Notes on Reparative Injunctions and the Rightful Position	241
<i>Bailey v. Proctor</i>	242

Notes on Equitable Discretion	244
4. Institutional Reform Litigation (Structural Injunctions)	246
Introductory Note: The School Desegregation Cases	246
<i>Brown v. Plata</i>	248
Notes on the Prison Cases	261
Notes on Paying for the Remedy	263
Notes on the Future of Institutional Reform Litigation	264
B. Modifying Injunctions	265
Introductory Notes	265
<i>Horne v. Flores</i>	269
Notes on Modification of Decrees	277
Notes on Modification Under the Prison Litigation Reform Act	278
Notes on Modifying School Desegregation Decrees — and Maybe Decrees More Generally	279
C. The Rights of Third Parties	280
<i>Hills v. Gautreaux</i>	280
Notes on Relief Against Third Parties	283
<i>General Building Contractors Association v. Pennsylvania</i>	285
More Notes on Relief Against Third Parties	289
 <b>CHAPTER 5</b>	
<b>Choosing Remedies</b>	291
A. Substitutionary or Specific Relief	291
1. Irreplaceable Losses	291
a. Injunctions	291
<i>Pardee v. Camden Lumber Co.</i>	291
F.W. Maitland, Equity	293
Note on Equity in the United States	296
Notes on the Reasons for the Irreparable Injury Rule	296
<i>Brook v. James A. Cullimore &amp; Co.</i>	299
Notes on Replevin and Injunctions	300
<i>Continental Airlines, Inc. v. Intra Brokers, Inc.</i>	301
Notes on the Content of the Irreparable Injury Rule	303
b. Specific Performance of Contracts	305
<i>Campbell Soup Co. v. Wentz</i>	305
Notes on Specific Performance of Contracts	307
Notes on Efficient Breach of Contract	308
Notes on Specific Performance Where Cover Is Possible	312
<i>Van Wagner Advertising Corp. v. S &amp; M Enterprises</i>	313
Notes on Irreparable Injury and Undue Hardship	316
Notes on Personal Service Contracts	318
2. Burdens on Defendant or the Court	318
<i>Whitlock v. Hilander Foods, Inc.</i>	318
Notes on Undue Hardship	320
Notes on the Economics of Undue Hardship	322
<i>Lord &amp; Taylor LLC v. White Flint, L.P.</i>	324
Notes on Practicality, Burdens on the Court, and Private Litigation	328
3. Other Policy Reasons	330
<i>Willing v. Mazzocone</i>	330

Notes on Defamation Damages and Insolvent Defendants	334
Notes on Prior Restraints	335
Notes on the Right to Jury Trial	336
Notes on Avoiding a “Multiplicity of Suits”	337
4. <i>eBay Inc. v. MercExchange LLC</i> : A New Federal Standard for Permanent Injunctive Relief	338
<i>eBay Inc. v. MercExchange, LLC</i>	338
Notes on Permanent Injunctions in Federal Courts After <i>eBay</i>	340
B. Preliminary or Permanent Relief	344
1. The Substantive Standards for Preliminary Relief	344
<i>Winter v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	344
Notes on Preliminary Relief	347
Notes on Preserving the Status Quo	352
<i>National Collegiate Athletic Association v. Governor of New Jersey</i>	353
Notes on Injunction Bonds	357
2. The Procedure for Obtaining Preliminary Relief	359
<i>Carroll v. President and Commissioners of Princess Anne</i>	359
Notes on Temporary Restraining Orders	361
<i>Sampson v. Murray</i>	363
More Notes on Irreparable Injury	366
Notes on Preliminary Procedure	367
C. Prospective or Retrospective Relief	371
1. Suits Against Officers in Their Official Capacities (and the Law of Sovereign Immunity)	371
<i>Edelman v. Jordan</i>	371
Notes on Prospective-Only Remedies	375
Notes on the Evolution of Eleventh Amendment Doctrine	377
Notes on the Reasons for Sovereign Immunity	381
2. Suits Against Officers in Their Personal Capacities (and the Law of Qualified Immunity)	383
<i>Harlow v. Fitzgerald</i>	383
Notes on Qualified Official Immunity	386
Notes on the Fear of Damage Remedies	393

## CHAPTER 6

### Remedies and Separation of Powers 395

A. More on Governmental Immunities	395
1. Consented Suits Against the Government	395
<i>Stone v. North Carolina Department of Labor</i>	395
Notes on the Public Duty Doctrine	398
Notes on the Governmental/Proprietary Distinction	402
Notes on the Discretionary Function Exception	403
Notes on Federal Waivers of Immunity	405
2. Suits Against Officers — Absolute Immunity	407
<i>Van de Kamp v. Goldstein</i>	407
Notes on Prosecutorial Immunity	412
Notes on Other Absolute Immunities	415
B. Creating Causes of Action	420
<i>Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents</i>	420

Notes on Implied Remedies for Constitutional Violations	423
Notes on Implied Remedies for Statutory Violations	426
<i>Armstrong v. Exceptional Child Center, Inc.</i>	428
Notes on Enforcing Federal Statutes with Injunctions	433
C. The Right to Jury Trial	434
<i>Securities &amp; Exchange Commission v. Jarkesy</i>	434
Notes on the Federal Right to Jury Trial	442
Notes on <i>Jarkesy</i> , Public Rights, and Specialized Tribunals	445
 <b>CHAPTER 7</b>	
<b>Preventing Harm Without Coercion: Declaratory Remedies</b>	447
A. Declaratory Judgments	447
1. The General Case	447
<i>Nashville, Chattanooga, &amp; St. Louis Railway v. Wallace</i>	447
Notes on Declaratory Judgments and Ripeness	449
Notes on Declaratory Judgments, Irreparable Injury, and Supplemental Relief	450
<i>Cardinal Chemical Co. v. Morton International, Inc.</i>	452
Notes on the <i>Young</i> Dilemma	455
Notes on Declaratory Judgments, Judicial Discretion, and Tactical Advantage	458
2. The Special Case of Interfering with State Enforcement Proceedings	461
<i>Steffel v. Thompson</i>	461
More Notes on the <i>Young</i> Dilemma	464
Notes on the <i>Steffel</i> Solution	466
<i>Doran v. Salem Inn, Inc.</i>	468
Notes on Preliminary Injunctions Against Prosecution	470
B. Quiet Title and the Like	472
<i>Newman Machine Co. v. Newman</i>	472
Notes on Bills to Quiet Title and Related Actions	475
C. Reformation	477
<i>Hand v. Dayton-Hudson</i>	477
Notes on Reformation	480
D. Declaratory Relief at Law	482
Notes on Nominal Damages	482
 <b>CHAPTER 8</b>	
<b>Benefit to Defendant as the Measure of Relief: Restitution</b>	485
A. Restitution from Innocent Defendants—and Some Who Are Treated as Innocent	485
1. Introducing Restitution—Mistake	485
<i>Blue Cross Health Services, Inc. v. Sauer</i>	485
Introductory Notes on Restitution	487
Notes on the Grounds for Restitution	490
<i>Somerville v. Jacobs</i>	492
Notes on Mistaken Improvers	495
Notes on Other Grounds for Restitution	497
2. Measuring Restitution from the Innocent—and More Restitutionary Causes of Action	499
<i>Bonina v. Sheppard</i>	499

Notes on Measuring Restitution from Innocent Defendants	503
<i>Farash v. Sykes Datatronics, Inc.</i>	505
Notes on the Benefit Requirement	507
More Notes on the Murky Borders of Contract and Restitution	510
B. Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	511
1. Disgorging the Profits of Conscious Wrongdoers	511
<i>Olwell v. Nye &amp; Nissen Co.</i>	511
Notes on Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	513
Notes on the Restitutionary Causes of Action Against Wrongdoers	517
<i>Maier Brewing Co. v. Fleischmann Distilling Corp.</i>	519
More Notes on Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	522
2. Measuring the Profits	524
<i>Sheldon v. Metro-Goldwyn Pictures Corp.</i>	524
Notes on Apportioning Profits	528
<i>Hamil America, Inc. v. GFI</i>	530
Notes on Calculating Profits	534
3. Breach of Contract	536
a. Disgorging the Profits from Opportunistic Breach	536
<i>May v. Muroff</i>	536
Notes on Disgorging the Profits from Breach of Contract	537
b. Rescission	541
<i>Mobil Oil Exploration &amp; Producing Southeast, Inc. v. United States</i>	541
Notes on Rescission for Breach of Contract	542
Notes on Election of Remedies	545
Notes on Other Grounds for Rescission	546
C. Restitutionary Rights in Specific Property	547
1. Constructive Trusts	547
<i>Paoloni v. Goldstein</i>	547
Notes on Constructive Trusts	549
<i>Ruffin v. Ruffin</i>	551
More Notes on Constructive Trusts	552
<i>In re Leitner</i>	554
Notes on Constructive Trusts in Bankruptcy	557
2. Tracing the Property	559
<i>In re Erie Trust Co.</i>	559
Notes on Tracing	561
<i>In re JD Services, Inc.</i>	565
Notes on the Mechanics of Tracing	567
Notes on Advanced Tracing Issues	568
Tracing Problems	569
3. Equitable Liens and Subrogation	570
<i>In re Mesa</i>	570
Notes on Equitable Liens	573
<i>Mort v. United States</i>	575
Notes on Subrogation	577
D. Defenses and the Rights of Third Parties	580
1. Bona Fide Purchasers	580
<i>Newton v. Porter</i>	580
Notes on Tracing into the Hands of Third Parties	582
2. Bona Fide Payees	585

<i>Banque Worms v. BankAmerica International</i>	585
Notes on Paying Debts with Other People's Property	589
E. Replevin, Ejectment, and the Like	593
<b>CHAPTER 9</b>	
<b>Ancillary Remedies: Enforcing the Judgment</b>	595
A. Enforcing Coercive Orders: The Contempt Power	595
1. The Three Kinds of Contempt	595
<i>Town of West Lakeland v. Auleciems</i>	595
Notes on the Three Kinds of Contempt	598
Notes on Coercive Contempt	601
Colin Diver, <i>The Judge as Political Powerbroker: Superintending Structural Change in Public Institutions</i>	606
2. How Much Risk of Abuse to Overcome How Much Defiance?	607
a. Perpetual Coercion?	607
<i>Anyanwu v. Anyanwu</i>	607
Notes on Perpetual Coercion	610
b. Anticipatory Contempt	613
<i>Griffin v. County School Board</i>	613
Notes on Contempt of Anticipated Injunctions	617
Notes on Contempt Statutes	619
3. The Collateral Bar Rule	619
<i>Walker v. City of Birmingham</i>	619
Notes on the Duty to Obey Erroneous Injunctions	626
John Leubsdorf, <i>Constitutional Civil Procedure</i>	628
4. The Rights of Third Parties	629
<i>Planned Parenthood Golden Gate v. Garibaldi</i>	629
Notes on Contempt Proceedings Against Third Parties	634
Notes on the Array of Theories for Binding Third Parties	636
Notes on the Notice Requirement	639
5. Drafting Decrees	640
Notes on the Requirement That Injunctions Be Specific	640
Notes on the Rule Against Incorporating Other Documents	644
Drafting Your Own Injunction	646
B. Collecting Money Judgments	647
1. Execution, Garnishment, and the Like	647
<i>Credit Bureau, Inc. v. Moninger</i>	647
Notes on Execution	649
Notes on Exemptions	651
<i>Dixie National Bank v. Chase</i>	652
Notes on Garnishment	654
Notes on Other Means of Collecting	655
Note on Bankruptcy	658
2. Coercive Collection of Money	658
<i>In re Marriage of Logston</i>	658
Notes on Collecting Family Support	663
More Notes on the Irreparable Injury Rule	667
3. Preserving Assets Before Judgment	668
<i>In re Hypnotic Taxi, LLC</i>	668



Notes on Attachment	674
Notes on Prejudgment Freeze Orders	675
<i>W.E. Erickson Construction, Inc. v. Congress-Kenilworth Corp.</i>	676
Notes on Receivership	679
 <b>CHAPTER 10</b>	
<b>More Ancillary Remedies: Attorneys' Fees</b>	683
A. Fee-Shifting Statutes	683
<i>City of Riverside v. Rivera</i>	683
Notes on the American Rule	687
Notes on Exceptions to the American Rule	688
Notes on One-Way Fee Shifting	690
Notes on the Amount of the Judgment as a Constraint on Attorneys' Fees	693
Notes on the Prevailing-Party Requirement	694
Notes on Calculating the Lodestar	696
B. Attorneys' Fees from a Common Fund	698
<i>In re Cabletron Systems, Inc. Securities Litigation</i>	698
Notes on the Common-Fund Rule	702
Notes on Contingency Enhancements	704
Notes on Competing Approaches to Calculating Fee Awards	705
C. Ethical Issues in Fee Awards	709
<i>Evans v. Jeff D.</i>	709
Notes on Ethical Problems in Fee-Shifting Cases	716
Notes on Ethical Problems in Common-Fund Cases	720
 <b>CHAPTER 11</b>	
<b>Remedial Defenses</b>	723
A. Unconscionability and the Equitable Contract Defenses	723
<i>James v. National Financial, LLC</i>	723
Notes on the Reach of Equitable Defenses	729
Notes on Unconscionable Contracts	730
Notes on Arbitration Clauses	731
B. Unclean Hands and <i>In Pari Delicto</i>	732
<i>Pinter v. Dahl</i>	732
Notes on Unclean Hands and <i>In Pari Delicto</i>	735
C. Estoppel and Waiver	738
1. Equitable Estoppel	738
<i>Geddes v. Mill Creek Country Club, Inc.</i>	738
Notes on Equitable Estoppel	741
2. Waiver	743
<i>Carr-Gottstein Foods Co. v. Wasilla, LLC</i>	743
Notes on Waiver	746
D. Laches	748
<i>Arizona Libertarian Party v. Reagan</i>	748
Notes on Laches	751
Notes on the Relation Between Laches and Statutes of Limitations	753
E. Statutes of Limitations	755
1. Continuing Violations	755

---

<i>Klehr v. A.O. Smith Corp.</i>	755
Notes on Continuing Violations	757
Notes on Limitations of Federal Claims	760
2. The Discovery Rule	761
<i>Debiec v. Cabot Corp.</i>	761
Notes on the Discovery Rule	767
3. Fraudulent Concealment	770
<i>Knaysi v. A.H. Robins Co.</i>	770
Notes on Fraudulent Concealment	772
Notes on Estoppel to Assert Limitations	774
Notes on the Policy Choices in Statutes of Limitations	775
 <b>CHAPTER 12</b>	
<b>Fluid-Class and Cy Pres Remedies</b>	777
<i>In re Pharmaceutical Industry Average Wholesale Price Litigation</i>	777
Notes on Class Actions for Damages	781
Notes on Fluid-Class Recoveries and Cy Pres Distributions	783
Notes on Affirmative Action as a Fluid-Class Remedy	787
Notes on Partly Identifiable Victims	789
 Appendix Present Value Tables	791
 <i>Table of Cases</i>	795
<i>Table of Statutes, Rules, Constitutions, Treaties, Restatements, and More</i>	813
<i>Table of Secondary Authorities</i>	819
<i>Index</i>	829