
CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----------|
| <i>Preface</i> | xix |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | xxiii |
| CHAPTER I | |
| Defense Counsel | 1 |
| A. When Will Counsel Be Provided? | 1 |
| 1. Types of Charges | 1 |
| <i>Clarence Earl Gideon v. Louie Wainwright</i> | 3 |
| Florida Rule of Criminal Procedure 3.111 | 6 |
| Vermont Statutes Tit. 13, §§5231, 5201 | 7 |
| Notes | 7 |
| Problem 1-1. Advice on Counsel | 10 |
| Problem 1-2. Lawyers and Experts | 10 |
| Problem 1-3. Universal Appointment | 11 |
| 2. Type of Proceedings | 11 |
| Alabama Rule of Criminal Procedure 6.1(a) | 12 |
| Missouri Supreme Court Rules 31.01, 31.02 | 12 |
| <i>State v. John Arthur Senn, Jr.</i> | 13 |
| Notes | 18 |
| Problem 1-4. Lawyers in Psychiatric Examinations | 21 |
| B. Selection and Rejection of Counsel | 21 |
| <i>State v. Joseph Spencer</i> | 22 |
| Notes | 26 |
| Problem 1-5. Competence to Stand Trial and to Waive Counsel | 30 |
| C. Adequacy of Counsel | 31 |
| <i>Charles Strickland v. David Washington</i> | 31 |
| <i>Blaine Lafler v. Anthony Cooper</i> | 37 |
| Notes | 42 |
| Problem 1-6. <i>Cronic</i> Errors | 44 |
| American Bar Association, Criminal Justice Standards for the Defense Function | 45 |
| Rule 33, Court of Common Pleas, Cuyahoga County, Ohio | 47 |
| Notes | 48 |
| Problem 1-7. More Objective Competence Standards | 49 |
| D. Systems for Providing Counsel | 49 |
| Donald J. Farole & Lynn Langton, County-Based and Local Public Defender Offices, 2007 | 50 |
| <i>State v. Leonard Peart</i> | 52 |
| <i>Kimberly Hurrell-Harring v. State</i> | 54 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| American Bar Association, Model Rule of Professional Conduct 1.5(d) | 58 |
| Notes | 58 |
| Problem 1-8. Rights of Counsel | 63 |
| Problem 1-9. Flat Fees for Service | 63 |
| Problem 1-10. The Neighborhood Defender | 64 |
| E. The Ethics of Defending People Accused of Crime | 65 |
| Speeches of Lord Erskine | 65 |
| John Dos Passos, <i>The American Lawyer: As He Was—As He Is—As He Can Be</i> | 66 |
| American Bar Association and Association of American Law Schools, <i>Professional Responsibility: Report of the Joint Conference (1958)</i> | 66 |
| John Kaplan, <i>Defending Guilty People</i> | 68 |
| Letter from William Townsend | 69 |
| Notes | 69 |
| | |
| CHAPTER II | |
| Pretrial Release and Detention | 73 |
| A. Pretrial Release | 74 |
| 1. Standard Release Practices | 74 |
| American Bar Association, <i>Pretrial Release Standards</i> | 75 |
| Alabama Rules of Criminal Procedure 7.2, 7.3 | 75 |
| Thomas H. Cohen & Brian A. Reaves, <i>Pretrial Release of Felony Defendants in State Courts</i> | 76 |
| District Attorney, Suffolk County, Massachusetts, <i>The Rachel Rollins Policy Memo</i> | 79 |
| Notes | 79 |
| Problem 2-1. Automatic Delay | 82 |
| 2. Bail Reform Efforts | 83 |
| Vera Institute of Justice, <i>Fair Treatment for the Indigent: The Manhattan Bail Project</i> | 83 |
| Megan Stevenson & Sandra G. Mayson, <i>Pretrial Detention and Bail, Reforming Criminal Justice: Pretrial and Trial Processes 21-47</i> | 86 |
| <i>In re Kenneth Humphrey</i> | 90 |
| Notes | 96 |
| B. Pretrial Detention | 100 |
| U.S. Constitution Amendment VIII | 100 |
| <i>United States v. Anthony Salerno</i> | 100 |
| New Mexico Constitution Art. II, §13 | 106 |
| Oklahoma Constitution Art. II, §8 | 106 |
| Problem 2-2. The Next Danger | 107 |
| Notes | 108 |
| | |
| CHAPTER III | |
| Charging | 111 |
| A. Individual Prosecutor Discretion Not to Charge | 111 |
| Revised Code of Washington §9.94A.411(1) | 112 |
| Notes | 113 |
| Problem 3-1. Three Variations on a Theme | 116 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Problem 3-2. Passing a School Bus | 117 |
| B. Policies to Encourage or Mandate Charges | 118 |
| Florida Statutes §741.2901 | 118 |
| Wisconsin Statutes §968.075 | 119 |
| Italian Constitution Art. 112 | 119 |
| German Code of Criminal Procedure 152(2) | 119 |
| West Virginia Code §7-4-1 | 119 |
| <i>The Question on the Application of Peter Dennis v. DPP</i> | 119 |
| Notes | 123 |
| C. Policies to Discourage Charges | 125 |
| Office of the District Attorney, City of Philadelphia | 125 |
| Homicide Policies and Procedures, Florida State Attorney's Office, Fourth Judicial Circuit (2017) | 126 |
| Principles of Federal Prosecution of Business Organizations | 129 |
| Notes | 131 |
| D. Diversion of Charges | 134 |
| Montana Code §46-16-130 | 135 |
| Kitsap County Prosecuting Attorney, Mission Statement and Standards and Guidelines | 136 |
| Notes | 137 |
| Problem 3-3. Diversion Policies and Exceptions | 139 |
| E. Selection Among Charges | 140 |
| U.S. Department of Justice, Principles of Federal Prosecution | 140 |
| Minnesota Statutes §388.051 | 140 |
| <i>People v. Jaleh Wilkinson</i> | 140 |
| Notes | 144 |
| Problem 3-4. Available Charges | 146 |
| F. Which System, and Why It Matters | 147 |
| 1. Juvenile Versus Adult Justice System | 147 |
| Howard N. Snyder, Melissa Sickmund & Eileen Poe-Yamagata, Juvenile Transfers to Criminal Court in the 1990s: Lessons Learned from Four Studies | 148 |
| <i>State v. Jonas Dixon</i> | 149 |
| Notes | 153 |
| 2. Federal Versus State Justice System | 154 |
| Sara Sun Beale, The Unintended Consequences of Enhancing Gun Penalties: Shooting Down the Commerce Clause and Arming Federal Prosecutors | 156 |
| Scott Decker and Jack McDevitt, Project Safe Neighborhoods: Strategic Interventions: Gun Prosecution Case Screening | 158 |
| Problem 3-5. Federal Day | 160 |
| 3. Crimes Committed on Tribal Lands | 160 |
| James D. Diamond, Practicing Indian Law in Federal, State, and Tribal Criminal Courts: An Update About Recent Expansion of Criminal Jurisdiction over Non-Indians | 160 |
| Notes | 162 |
| G. Victim Input into Charging Decisions | 163 |
| Wisconsin Statutes §968.02 | 163 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Joseph Kennedy, Private Financing of Criminal Prosecutions and the Differing Protections of Liberty and Equality in the Criminal Justice System | 163 |
| Notes | 165 |
| Problem 3-6. Involved Citizens | 167 |
| H. Selective Prosecution | 167 |
| <i>United States v. Christopher Armstrong</i> | 168 |
| Notes | 172 |
| I. Pretrial Screening | 175 |
| New York Constitution Art. I, §6 | 175 |
| Illinois Annotated Statutes Ch. 725, Para. 5/111-2 | 176 |
| <i>Commonwealth v. Khari Wilcox</i> | 176 |
| Notes | 178 |
| | |
| CHAPTER IV | |
| Jeopardy and Joinder | 183 |
| A. Double Jeopardy | 183 |
| 1. Multiple or Dual Sovereigns | 184 |
| <i>Puerto Rico v. Luis Sánchez Valle</i> | 184 |
| U.S. Attorneys' Manual §9-2.031, Dual Prosecution and Successive Prosecution Policy (<i>Petite Policy</i>) | 188 |
| New Jersey Statutes §2C:1-11 | 190 |
| Ohio Revised Code §2925.50 | 191 |
| Problem 4-1. Rodney King's Attackers | 191 |
| Notes | 192 |
| 2. "Same Offence" | 194 |
| <i>Robert Taylor v. Commonwealth</i> | 195 |
| <i>People v. Melissa Nutt</i> | 198 |
| New York Criminal Procedure Law §40.20 | 203 |
| Notes | 203 |
| Problem 4-2. Multiplicity | 206 |
| Notes | 207 |
| 3. Collateral Estoppel | 207 |
| <i>Ex Parte Philip Taylor</i> | 208 |
| Notes | 212 |
| Problem 4-3. Rose Bowl | 213 |
| B. Joinder | 214 |
| 1. Discretionary Joinder and Severance of Offenses | 214 |
| Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 8(a) | 214 |
| Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 13 | 215 |
| Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 14 | 215 |
| Vermont Rule of Criminal Procedure 8(a) | 215 |
| Vermont Rule of Criminal Procedure 14 | 215 |
| <i>Damian Long v. United States</i> | 216 |
| Matthew J. Galluzzo, The New Predatory Sexual Assault Charges Against Weinstein Are Shrewdly Tactical | 220 |
| Problem 4-4. Compulsory Joinder | 221 |
| Problem 4-5. Protective Order | 222 |
| Notes | 223 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 2. Joint Trials of Defendants | 225 |
| Problem 4-6. Antagonistic Brothers | 226 |
| Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 8(b) | 227 |
| Vermont Rule of Criminal Procedure 8(b) | 227 |
| Vermont Rule of Criminal Procedure 14(b)(2) | 227 |
| Notes | 229 |
| | |
| CHAPTER V | |
| Discovery and Speedy Trial | 231 |
| A. Discovery | 231 |
| 1. Prosecution Disclosure of Exculpatory Information | 232 |
| <i>People v. Alan Beaman</i> | 233 |
| Notes | 237 |
| Problem 5-1. Preserving Evidence | 241 |
| American Bar Association, Model Rules of Professional Conduct 3.8 | 242 |
| U.S. Department of Justice, Memorandum for Department Prosecutors | 243 |
| Notes | 246 |
| 2. Prosecution Disclosure of Inculpatory Information | 247 |
| Problem 5-2. Exchanging Words | 248 |
| South Carolina Rule of Criminal Procedure 5(A) | 248 |
| North Carolina General Statutes §15A-903 | 249 |
| Notes | 250 |
| 3. Defense Disclosures | 253 |
| Pennsylvania Rule of Criminal Procedure 573(C) | 253 |
| Pennsylvania Rule of Criminal Procedure 567(A) | 254 |
| <i>Commonwealth v. Patrick Durham</i> | 254 |
| Notes | 256 |
| 4. Discovery Ethics | 258 |
| Standing Committee on Professional Responsibility and Conduct, State Bar of California, California Formal Ethics Opinion 1984-76 | 258 |
| North Carolina State Bar, Receipt of Evidence of Crime by Lawyer for Defendant, Ethics Opinion 221 | 259 |
| Notes | 261 |
| Problem 5-3. Defense Attorney as Repository | 262 |
| B. Speedy Trial Preparation | 262 |
| 1. Pre-Accusation Delay | 263 |
| New York Criminal Procedure Law §30.10 | 263 |
| <i>Commonwealth v. Stephen Scher</i> | 264 |
| Notes | 268 |
| Problem 5-4. Child Victims | 270 |
| 2. Constitutional Protections for Speedy Trial After Accusation | 271 |
| <i>Vermont v. Michael Brillon</i> | 271 |
| Notes | 276 |
| 3. Statutory Protections for Speedy Trial After Accusation | 278 |
| California Penal Code §1382 | 279 |
| California Penal Code §1387 | 279 |
| <i>People v. Michael Sutton</i> | 280 |
| 18 U.S.C. §3161 | 284 |
| 18 U.S.C. §3162 | 285 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Notes | 285 |
| Problem 5-5. Voluminous Discovery | 287 |
| CHAPTER VI | |
| Pleas and Bargains | 289 |
| A. Bargain About What? | 290 |
| Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 11(A), (C) | 290 |
| North Carolina Defender Manual | 291 |
| <i>State v. Ahmad Bey</i> | 291 |
| Notes | 295 |
| Problem 6-1. Waiving the Right to Appeal a Sentence | 298 |
| B. Validity of Guilty Pleas | 298 |
| 1. Lack of Knowledge | 299 |
| Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 11(B) | 299 |
| <i>Missouri v. Galin Frye</i> | 300 |
| Notes | 306 |
| Problem 6-2. Direct and Collateral Effects | 309 |
| Problem 6-3. Pre-Plea Discovery | 309 |
| 2. Involuntary Pleas | 310 |
| a. Large Plea Discounts | 310 |
| <i>Robert Brady v. United States</i> | 310 |
| Notes | 312 |
| b. Judicial Overinvolvement | 314 |
| <i>State v. Landour Bouie</i> | 314 |
| Notes | 319 |
| c. <i>Alford</i> Pleas: Voluntariness and Factual Basis | 321 |
| Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 11(B) | 321 |
| <i>State v. Edwin Urbina</i> | 321 |
| Notes | 327 |
| C. Categorical Restrictions on Bargaining | 328 |
| 1. Legislative Limits | 328 |
| California Penal Code §1192.7 | 328 |
| New York Criminal Procedure Law §220.10 | 329 |
| Revised Code of Washington §§9.94A.450, 9.94A.460 | 330 |
| Notes | 331 |
| 2. Judicial Rules | 332 |
| Problem 6-4: Rejecting Plea Bargains | 332 |
| Notes | 334 |
| 3. Prosecutorial Plea Negotiation Guidelines | 336 |
| U.S. Department of Justice, Principles of Federal Prosecution | 337 |
| Notes | 338 |
| U.S. Sentencing Guidelines §§6B1.2, 6B1.4 (Policy Statements) | 341 |
| Janet Reno, Attorney General, Charging and Plea Decisions (“Reno Bluesheet”) | 341 |
| Notes | 342 |
| <i>State v. Christopher Brimage</i> | 343 |
| Problem 6-5. Statewide Bargaining Guidelines | 348 |
| Problem 6-6. Sharkfest | 348 |
| Notes | 349 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 4. Victim Consultation | 350 |
| Maine Revised Statutes Tit. 15, §812; Tit. 17-A, §§2102, 2103 | 350 |
| <i>State v. Patrick William Casey</i> | 351 |
| Notes | 355 |
| D. Alternatives to Plea Bargaining | 355 |
| Albert W. Alschuler, Implementing the Criminal Defendant's Right to Trial: Alternatives to the Plea Bargaining System | 356 |
| J. Harvie Wilkinson, III, In Defense of American Criminal Justice | 357 |
| Ronald Wright & Marc Miller, The Screening/Bargaining Tradeoff | 359 |
| Notes | 364 |
| | |
| CHAPTER VII | |
| Decisionmakers at Trial | 369 |
| A. Judge or Jury? | 370 |
| <i>Jean-Baptiste Bado v. United States</i> | 370 |
| Maryland Courts and Judicial Proceedings Code §12-401 | 376 |
| Notes | 376 |
| Problem 7-1. Judge Shopping and Jury Trial Waivers | 380 |
| B. Selection of Jurors | 380 |
| 1. Voir Dire | 381 |
| <i>Keith Filmore v. State</i> | 383 |
| Notes | 385 |
| Problem 7-2. Defendant Bias and Voir Dire | 387 |
| 2. Dismissal for Cause | 387 |
| Texas Code of Criminal Procedure Art. 35.16 | 388 |
| <i>State v. Reche Smith</i> | 389 |
| Notes | 391 |
| 3. Peremptory Challenges | 392 |
| <i>James Batson v. Kentucky</i> | 393 |
| <i>Curtis Giovanni Flowers v. Mississippi</i> | 398 |
| Washington General Rule 37, Jury Selection | 405 |
| Notes | 406 |
| Problem 7-3. The Reach of <i>Batson</i> | 410 |
| C. Jury Deliberations and Verdicts | 410 |
| <i>Evangelisto Ramos v. Louisiana</i> | 411 |
| <i>State v. Ronald Bean</i> | 417 |
| Notes | 420 |
| Problem 7-4. Someone Is Not Talking or Someone Is Not Listening | 426 |
| Problem 7-5. Jury Nullification and Social Justice | 426 |
| D. Public Access and Influence | 427 |
| <i>State v. Manuel Turrietta</i> | 428 |
| Notes | 433 |
| Problem 7-6. Measures for Justice | 437 |
| | |
| CHAPTER VIII | |
| Witnesses and Proof | 439 |
| A. Confrontation of Witnesses | 439 |
| 1. The Value of Confrontation | 439 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>Israel Romero v. State</i> | 440 |
| Notes | 444 |
| Problem 8-1. Child Testimony | 446 |
| Problem 8-2. Anonymous Witnesses in an Inquisitorial System | 447 |
| 2. Out-of-Court Statements by Unavailable Witnesses | 448 |
| <i>Michael Crawford v. Washington</i> | 448 |
| Notes | 454 |
| 3. Statements by Co-Defendants | 456 |
| <i>Commonwealth v. John Bacigalupo</i> | 456 |
| Notes | 460 |
| B. Self-Incrimination Privilege at Trial | 463 |
| <i>Eddie Dean Griffin v. California</i> | 464 |
| <i>Kevin Sean Murray v. United Kingdom</i> | 466 |
| Notes | 472 |
| Problem 8-3. Telling the Jury | 476 |
| Problem 8-4. Pre-Arrest Silence | 476 |
| C. Ethics and Lies at Trial | 477 |
| <i>People v. Derek Andrades</i> | 478 |
| Notes | 480 |
| Problem 8-5. The Do-Not-Call List | 482 |
| D. Burden of Proof | 482 |
| <i>State v. Denise Frei</i> | 483 |
| Notes | 487 |
| Problem 8-6. Words and Numbers | 492 |
| Problem 8-7. A Doubt with a Reason | 492 |
| Problem 8-8. Presumption in the Fire | 493 |
| | |
| CHAPTER IX | |
| Sentencing | 495 |
| Code of Hammurabi | 495 |
| A. Who Sentences? | 496 |
| 1. Indeterminate Sentencing | 496 |
| <i>Samuel Williams v. New York</i> | 496 |
| Notes | 499 |
| 2. Legislative Sentencing | 501 |
| U.S. Sentencing Commission, Mandatory Minimum Penalties in the Federal Criminal Justice System | 501 |
| Problem 9-1. The Golf Club Odyssey | 503 |
| Notes | 504 |
| 3. Sentencing Commissions | 506 |
| Dale Parent, Structuring Criminal Sentencing | 507 |
| Richard S. Frase, State Sentencing Guidelines: Diversity, Consensus, and Unresolved Policy Issues | 511 |
| Notes | 514 |
| B. New Information About the Offender and the Victim | 516 |
| 1. Offender Information | 516 |
| a. Criminal History | 516 |
| Washington State Sentencing Guidelines | 516 |
| Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, Rule 32 | 517 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Notes | 519 |
| Problem 9-2. Personal History and Prospects | 520 |
| b. Cooperation in Other Investigations | 522 |
| <i>Taggart Parrish v. State</i> | 522 |
| U.S. Sentencing Guidelines §5K1.1 | 525 |
| Notes | 525 |
| 2. New Information About the Victim and the Community | 526 |
| Michigan Constitution Article I, §24 | 526 |
| Notes | 527 |
| Problem 9-3. The Community as Victim | 529 |
| Problem 9-4. Sentencing Hearings, Guilty Plea Hearings | 530 |
| C. Revisiting Points in the Criminal Process | 530 |
| 1. Revisiting Investigations | 530 |
| <i>People v. Deon Lamont Claypool</i> | 531 |
| Notes | 534 |
| Problem 9-5. Learning a Lesson | 535 |
| Problem 9-6. Reversing the Exclusion | 535 |
| 2. Revisiting Charging Decisions: Relevant Conduct | 535 |
| U.S. Sentencing Guidelines §1B1.3(a) | 536 |
| Florida Rule of Criminal Procedure 3.701(d)(11) | 537 |
| <i>State v. Douglas McAlpin</i> | 537 |
| Notes | 539 |
| 3. Revisiting Proof at Trial | 541 |
| <i>Ralph Blakely v. Washington</i> | 542 |
| Notes | 550 |
| 4. Revisiting Jury Verdicts and Guilty Pleas | 551 |
| U.S. Sentencing Guidelines §3E1.1 | 552 |
| Notes | 552 |
| Problem 9-7. Trial Penalty or Reward for Plea? | 554 |
| D. Race and Sentencing | 554 |
| 1. Race and the Victims of Crime | 555 |
| <i>Warren McCleskey v. Ralph Kemp</i> | 556 |
| Notes | 562 |
| 2. Race and Discretionary Decisions Affecting Punishment | 563 |
| <i>Freddie Stephens v. State</i> | 563 |
| Notes | 568 |
| Problem 9-8. The Crack-Powder Differential | 570 |
| | |
| CHAPTER X | |
| Appeals | 571 |
| A. Who Appeals? | 571 |
| 1. Right to Appeal | 571 |
| Arkansas Statutes §16-91-101 | 571 |
| Arkansas Rule of Criminal Procedure 24.3(B) | 571 |
| California Penal Code §1237.5 | 572 |
| California Rule of Court 8.304(B)(4) | 572 |
| Notes | 572 |
| 2. Appeals by Indigent Defendants | 573 |
| <i>Bryan Mosley v. State</i> | 573 |
| Notes | 576 |

| | |
|---|---------|
| 3. Interlocutory Appeals | 577 |
| Delaware Code Tit. 10, §§9902, 9903 | 578 |
| <i>State v. Matthew Medrano</i> | 578 |
| Notes | 581 |
| B. Appellate Review of Factual Findings | 583 |
| <i>Kelvin Brooks v. State</i> | 584 |
| Notes | 587 |
| Problem 10-1. Edited Trials | 588 |
| C. Harmless Error | 588 |
| Federal Rule of Criminal Procedure 52 | 589 |
| Tennessee Rule of Appellate Procedure 36(B) | 590 |
| <i>Kentel Weaver v. Massachusetts</i> | 590 |
| Notes | 596 |
| Problem 10-2. Preserving Error | 598 |
| D. Retroactivity | 599 |
| <i>George Membres v. State</i> | 599 |
| Notes | 605 |
| <i>Table of Cases</i> | 609 |
| <i>Index</i> | 619 |