

---

# CONTENTS

<i>Preface to the Sixth Edition</i>	xxi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv
<b>CHAPTER 1</b>	
<b>Introduction</b>	1
The Role of Remedies	1
Classifying Remedies	2
Substitutionary and Specific Remedies	5
Legal and Equitable Remedies	5
Note on the Nature of Remedies	6
The Modern Remedies Course	8
<b>CHAPTER 2</b>	
<b>Paying for Harm: Compensatory Damages</b>	9
A. The Basic Principle: Restoring Plaintiff to the Rightful Position	9
<i>United States v. Hatabley</i>	9
Notes on the Basic Principle	12
B. Value as the Measure of the Rightful Position	16
<i>In re September 11th Litigation</i>	16
Notes on Market Value	19
Notes on “Value to the Owner”	23
<i>Trinity Church v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co.</i>	25
Notes on Special-Purpose Property	28
Notes on Repair Costs	29
Notes on Property That Fluctuates in Value	32
C. Expectancy and Reliance as Measures of the Rightful Position	32
<i>Neri v. Retail Marine Corp.</i>	32
Notes on §2-708(2) and Attempts to Codify Remedies	34
Notes on Expectancy and Reliance	37
Notes on Compensating Expectancies	39
<i>Chatlos Systems, Inc. v. National Cash Register Corp.</i>	43
Notes on Excessive Expectancies	45
<i>Smith v. Bolles</i>	47
Notes on Expectancy in Tort	48
D. Consequential Damages	49
<i>Buck v. Morrow</i>	49
Notes on General and Special Damages	50
Notes on the Vocabulary of Damages	52
<i>Meinrath v. Singer Co.</i>	56
Notes on Consequential Damages from Failure to Pay Money	58

E. Limits on Damages	60
1. The Parties' Power to Specify the Remedy	60
<i>Kearney &amp; Trecker Corp. v. Master Engraving Co.</i>	60
Notes on Limitation-of-Remedy Clauses	64
<i>Commercial Real Estate Investment, L.C. v. Comcast of Utah II, Inc.</i>	67
Notes on Liquidated-Damage and Penalty Clauses	71
Notes on Underliquidated-Damage Clauses	75
2. Avoidable Consequences, Offsetting Benefits, and Collateral Sources	76
<i>S.J. Groves &amp; Sons Co. v. Warner Co.</i>	76
Notes on Avoidable Consequences	79
Notes on Offsetting Benefits	84
<i>Oden v. Chemung County Industrial Development Agency</i>	86
Notes on the Collateral-Source Rule	88
3. The Scope of Liability	93
<i>Pruitt v. Allied Chemical Corp.</i>	93
Notes on the Scope of Liability	96
Notes on the Economic-Loss Rules	99
<i>Sunnyland Farms, Inc. v. Central New Mexico Electric Cooperative, Inc.</i>	104
More Notes on the Scope of Liability	107
4. Substantive Policy Goals	109
<i>Brunswick Corp. v. Pueblo Bowl-O-Mat</i>	109
Notes on Remedial Implications of Substantive Policy	113
5. The Requirement of Reasonable Certainty	115
<i>Bigelow v. RKO Radio Pictures</i>	115
Notes on the Requirement of Reasonable Certainty	119
Notes on Litigating Commercial Damages	122
F. Taxes, Time, and the Value of Money	125
1. The Impact of Taxes	125
<i>Norfolk &amp; Western Railway v. Liepelt</i>	125
Notes on Taxes	129
2. Interest on Past Damages	131
<i>City of Milwaukee v. Cement Division, National Gypsum Co.</i>	131
Notes on Interest	134
3. The Net Present Value of Future Damages	138
<i>Jones &amp; Laughlin Steel Corp. v. Pfeiffer</i>	138
Notes on the September 11 Calculations	144
Notes on Discounting to Present Value	147
Notes on Race- and Sex-Based Data	150
Notes on Periodic Payments and Structured Settlements	152
Notes on Damages in Foreign Currency	154
G. Damages Where Harm Cannot be Valued in a Market	155
1. Personal Injuries, Pain and Suffering, and Death	155
<i>Debus v. Grand Union Stores</i>	155
Notes on Pain and Suffering	158
Notes on Wrongful Death	164
Notes on Attempts at Market-Based Valuation of Pain and Suffering and Human Life	169
2. Emotional Distress, Dignitary Harm, and Constitutional Harm	173
<i>Levka v. City of Chicago</i>	173
Notes on Recovering for Emotional Distress	176

Notes on Judicial Review of Emotional Distress Damages	179
<i>Carey v. Piphus</i>	184
Notes on Valuing Dignitary Harm and Constitutional Rights	188
Note on Defamation Damages	191
3. The Controversy over Tort Law	191
<i>Arbino v. Johnson &amp; Johnson</i>	191
Notes on the Constitutionality of Limiting Tort Remedies	198
Notes on the Empirical Debate: How Big Is the Problem?	201
 <b>CHAPTER 3</b>	
<b>Punitive Remedies</b>	207
A. Punitive Damages	207
1. Common Law and Statutes	207
<i>Exxon Shipping Co. v. Baker</i>	207
Notes on Awarding Punitive Damages	215
Notes on Measuring Punitive Damages	221
2. The Constitution	224
<i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell</i>	224
Notes on Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages	228
<i>Philip Morris USA v. Williams</i>	232
More Notes on Constitutional Limits on Punitive Damages	236
3. Punitive Damages in Contract	239
<i>Formosa Plastics Corp. USA v. Presidio Engineers and Contractors, Inc.</i>	239
Notes on Punitive Damages in Contract	243
B. Other Punitive Remedies	248
1. Statutory Recoveries by Private Litigants	248
2. Civil Penalties Payable to the Government	251
 <b>CHAPTER 4</b>	
<b>Preventing Harm: The Measure of Injunctive Relief</b>	257
A. The Scope of Injunctions	257
1. Preventing Wrongful Acts	257
<i>Almurbati v. Bush</i>	257
Notes on Ripeness	258
<i>Marshall v. Goodyear Tire &amp; Rubber Co.</i>	263
Notes on the Scope of Injunctions to Prevent Wrongful Acts	265
Notes on Individual Injunctions, Class Injunctions, and Universal Injunctions	267
<i>United States v. W.T. Grant Co.</i>	272
Notes on Voluntary Cessation of Wrongful Acts	273
2. Preventing Lawful Acts That Might Have Wrongful Consequences	276
<i>Nicholson v. Connecticut Half-Way House, Inc.</i>	276
Notes on Ripeness and Uncertain Consequences	277
<i>PepsiCo, Inc. v. Redmond</i>	280
Notes on Prophylactic Injunctions	283
An Aside: Preventive Relief at Law	289
3. Repairing the Consequences of Past Wrongful Conduct	291
<i>Forster v. Boss</i>	291

Notes on Reparative Injunctions	294
Notes on Coordinating Multiple Remedies	296
<i>Winston Research Corp. v. Minnesota Mining &amp; Manufacturing Co.</i>	297
Notes on Reparative Injunctions and the Rightful Position	300
<i>Bailey v. Proctor</i>	301
Notes on Equitable Discretion	304
4. Institutional Reform Litigation (Structural Injunctions)	306
Introductory Note: The School Desegregation Cases	306
<i>Brown v. Plata</i>	308
Notes on the Prison Cases	321
Notes on Paying for the Remedy	325
Notes on the Future of Institutional Reform Litigation	326
B. Modifying Injunctions	328
Introductory Notes	328
<i>Horne v. Flores</i>	331
Notes on Modification of Decrees	339
Notes on Modification Under the Prison Litigation Reform Act	342
Notes on Modifying School Desegregation Decrees — and Maybe Decrees More Generally	344
C. The Rights of Third Parties	345
<i>Hills v. Gautreaux</i>	345
Notes on Relief Against Third Parties	348
<i>General Building Contractors Association v. Pennsylvania</i>	352
More Notes on Relief Against Third Parties	355
 <b>CHAPTER 5</b>	
<b>Choosing Remedies</b>	361
A. Substitutionary or Specific Relief	361
1. Irreplaceable Losses	361
a. Injunctions	361
<i>Pardee v. Camden Lumber Co.</i>	361
F.W. Maitland, Equity	363
Note on Equity in the United States	366
Notes on the Reasons for the Irreparable Injury Rule	366
<i>Brook v. James A. Cullimore &amp; Co.</i>	370
Notes on Replevin and Injunctions	371
<i>Continental Airlines, Inc. v. Intra Brokers, Inc.</i>	373
Notes on the Content of the Irreparable Injury Rule	375
b. Specific Performance of Contracts	379
<i>Campbell Soup Co. v. Wentz</i>	379
Notes on Specific Performance of Contracts	380
Notes on Efficient Breach of Contract	383
Notes on Specific Performance Where Cover is Possible	388
<i>Van Wagner Advertising Corp. v. S &amp; M Enterprises</i>	390
Notes on Irreparable Injury and Undue Hardship	392
Notes on Personal Service Contracts	395
2. Burdens on Defendant or the Court	396
<i>Whitlock v. Hilander Foods, Inc.</i>	396
Notes on Undue Hardship	398

Notes on the Economics of Undue Hardship	401
<i>Lord &amp; Taylor LLC v. White Flint, L.P.</i>	403
Notes on Practicality, Burdens on the Court, and Private Litigation	407
3. Other Policy Reasons	410
<i>Willing v. Mazzocone</i>	410
Notes on Defamation Damages and Insolvent Defendants	414
Notes on Prior Restraints	415
Notes on the Right to Jury Trial	418
Notes on Avoiding a “Multiplicity of Suits”	419
4. <i>eBay Inc. v. MercExchange LLC</i> : A New Federal Standard for Permanent Injunctive Relief	420
<i>eBay Inc. v. MercExchange, LLC</i>	420
Notes on Permanent Injunctions in Federal Court after <i>eBay</i>	423
B. Preliminary or Permanent Relief	428
1. The Substantive Standards for Preliminary Relief	428
<i>Winter v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	428
Notes on Preliminary Relief	432
Notes on Preserving the Status Quo	438
<i>National Collegiate Athletic Association v. Governor of New Jersey</i>	439
Notes on Injunction Bonds	443
2. The Procedure for Obtaining Preliminary Relief	446
<i>Carroll v. President and Commissioners of Princess Anne</i>	446
Notes on Temporary Restraining Orders	448
<i>Sampson v. Murray</i>	450
More Notes on Irreparable Injury	454
Notes on Preliminary Procedure	455
C. Prospective or Retrospective Relief	461
1. Suits Against Officers in Their Official Capacities (and the Law of Sovereign Immunity)	461
<i>Edelman v. Jordan</i>	461
Notes on Prospective-Only Remedies	464
Notes on the Evolution of Eleventh Amendment Doctrine	470
Notes on the Reasons for Sovereign Immunity	476
2. Suits Against Officers in Their Personal Capacities (and the Law of Qualified Immunity)	477
<i>Harlow v. Fitzgerald</i>	477
Notes on Qualified Official Immunity	481
Notes on Enforcing New Rules of Law	490
Notes on the Fear of Damage Remedies	492

## CHAPTER 6

### Remedies and Separation of Powers 495

A. More on Governmental Immunities	495
1. Consented Suits Against the Government	495
<i>Stone v. North Carolina Department of Labor</i>	495
Notes on the Public Duty Doctrine	498
Notes on the Governmental/Proprietary Distinction	503
Notes on the Discretionary Function Exception	504
Notes on Federal Waivers of Immunity	506

2. Suits Against Officers—Absolute Immunity	511
<i>Van de Kamp v. Goldstein</i>	511
Notes on Prosecutorial Immunity	516
Notes on Other Absolute Immunities	520
B. Creating Causes of Action	528
<i>Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents</i>	528
Notes on Implied Remedies for Constitutional Violations	531
Notes on Implied Remedies for Statutory Violations	536
<i>Armstrong v. Exceptional Child Center, Inc.</i>	539
Notes on Enforcing Federal Statutes with Injunctions	544
C. The Right to Jury Trial	547
<i>Securities &amp; Exchange Commission v. Jarkesy</i>	547
Notes on the Federal Right to Jury Trial	555
Notes on <i>Jarkesy</i> , Public Rights, and Specialized Tribunals	558

## CHAPTER 7

### **Preventing Harm Without Coercion: Declaratory Remedies** 561

A. Declaratory Judgments	561
1. The General Case	561
<i>Nashville, Chattanooga, &amp; St. Louis Railway v. Wallace</i>	561
Notes on Declaratory Judgments and Ripeness	563
Notes on Declaratory Judgments, Irreparable Injury, and Supplemental Relief	564
<i>Cardinal Chemical Co. v. Morton International, Inc.</i>	566
Notes on the <i>Young</i> Dilemma	570
Notes on Declaratory Judgments, Judicial Discretion, and Tactical Advantage	574
2. The Special Case of Interfering with State Enforcement Proceedings	577
<i>Steffel v. Thompson</i>	577
More Notes on the <i>Young</i> Dilemma	581
Notes on the <i>Steffel</i> Solution	583
<i>Doran v. Salem Inn, Inc.</i>	587
Notes on Preliminary Injunctions Against Prosecution	589
Notes on Federal Litigation After State-Court Judgments	592
B. Quiet Title and the Like	593
<i>Newman Machine Co. v. Newman</i>	593
Notes on Bills to Quiet Title and Related Actions	596
C. Reformation	599
<i>Hand v. Dayton-Hudson</i>	599
Notes on Reformation	601
D. Declaratory Relief at Law	605
Notes on Nominal Damages	605
Notes on Quo Warranto	606
Note on Coram Nobis	608

## CHAPTER 8

### **Benefit to Defendant as the Measure of Relief: Restitution** 609

A. Restitution from Innocent Defendants—and Some Who Are Treated as Innocent	609
1. Introducing Restitution—Mistake	609

<i>Blue Cross Health Services, Inc. v. Sauer</i>	609
Introductory Notes on Restitution	611
Notes on the Grounds for Restitution	615
<i>Somerville v. Jacobs</i>	617
Notes on Mistaken Improvers	620
Notes on Other Grounds for Restitution	623
2. Measuring Restitution from the Innocent — and More Restitutionary Causes of Action	625
<i>Bonina v. Sheppard</i>	625
Notes on Measuring Restitution from Innocent Defendants	629
<i>Farash v. Sykes Datatronics, Inc.</i>	632
Notes on the Benefit Requirement	635
More Notes on the Murky Borders of Contract and Restitution	638
B. Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	640
1. Disgorging the Profits of Conscious Wrongdoers	640
<i>Olwell v. Nye &amp; Nissen Co.</i>	640
Notes on Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	642
Notes on the Restitutionary Causes of Action Against Wrongdoers	646
<i>Maier Brewing Co. v. Fleischmann Distilling Corp.</i>	650
More Notes on Recovering More than Plaintiff Lost	652
2. Measuring the Profits	657
<i>Sheldon v. Metro-Goldwyn Pictures Corp.</i>	657
Notes on Apportioning Profits	661
<i>Hamil America, Inc. v. GFI</i>	664
Notes on Calculating Profits	668
3. Breach of Contract	671
a. Disgorging the Profits from Opportunistic Breach	671
<i>May v. Muroff</i>	671
Notes on Disgorging the Profits from Breach of Contract	672
b. Rescission	676
<i>Mobil Oil Exploration &amp; Producing Southeast, Inc. v. United States</i>	676
Notes on Rescission for Breach of Contract	678
Notes on Election of Remedies	680
Notes on Losing Contracts Where the Benefit Cannot Be Returned	682
Notes on Other Grounds for Rescission	684
C. Restitutionary Rights in Specific Property	686
1. Constructive Trusts	686
<i>Paoloni v. Goldstein</i>	686
Notes on Constructive Trusts	687
<i>Ruffin v. Ruffin</i>	690
More Notes on Constructive Trusts	691
<i>In re Leitner</i>	693
Notes on Constructive Trusts in Bankruptcy	696
2. Tracing the Property	699
<i>In re Erie Trust Co.</i>	699
Notes on Tracing	701
<i>In re JD Services, Inc.</i>	705
Notes on the Mechanics of Tracing	707
Notes on Advanced Tracing Issues	709
Tracing Problems	713

3. Equitable Liens and Subrogation	714
<i>In re Mesa</i>	714
Notes on Equitable Liens	717
<i>Mort v. United States</i>	721
Notes on Subrogation	724
Notes on Indemnity and Contribution	728
D. Defenses and the Rights of Third Parties	730
1. Bona Fide Purchasers	730
<i>Newton v. Porter</i>	730
Notes on Tracing into the Hands of Third Parties	732
2. Bona Fide Payees	736
<i>Banque Worms v. BankAmerica International</i>	736
Notes on Paying Debts with Other People's Property	740
E. Replevin, Ejectment, and the Like	744
 <b>CHAPTER 9</b>	
<b>Ancillary Remedies: Enforcing the Judgment</b>	749
A. Enforcing Coercive Orders: The Contempt Power	749
1. The Three Kinds of Contempt	749
<i>Town of West Lakeland v. Auleciems</i>	749
Notes on the Three Kinds of Contempt	752
Notes on Coercive Contempt	756
Colin Diver, <i>The Judge as Political Powerbroker: Superintending Structural Change in Public Institutions</i>	762
2. How Much Risk of Abuse to Overcome How Much Defiance?	763
a. Perpetual Coercion?	763
<i>Anyanwu v. Anyanwu</i>	763
Notes on Perpetual Coercion	766
b. Anticipatory Contempt	770
<i>Griffin v. County School Board</i>	770
Notes on Contempt of Anticipated Injunctions	774
Notes on Contempt Statutes	778
3. The Collateral Bar Rule	779
<i>Walker v. City of Birmingham</i>	779
Notes on the Duty to Obey Erroneous Injunctions	786
John Leubsdorf, <i>Constitutional Civil Procedure</i>	792
4. The Rights of Third Parties	793
<i>Planned Parenthood Golden Gate v. Garibaldi</i>	793
Notes on Contempt Proceedings Against Third Parties	798
Notes on the Array of Theories for Binding Third Parties	800
Notes on the Notice Requirement	805
5. The Maxim That Equity Acts in Personam	806
6. Drafting Decrees	808
Notes on the Requirement That Injunctions Be Specific	808
Notes on the Rule Against Incorporating Other Documents	814
Drafting Your Own Injunction	817
B. Collecting Money Judgments	818
1. Execution, Garnishment, and the Like	818
<i>Credit Bureau, Inc. v. Moninger</i>	818



Notes on Execution	820
Notes on Exemptions	823
<i>Dixie National Bank v. Chase</i>	825
Notes on Garnishment	827
Notes on Other Means of Collecting	829
Note on Bankruptcy	834
2. Coercive Collection of Money	834
<i>In re Marriage of Logston</i>	834
Notes on Collecting Family Support	839
Notes on Coercing the Payment of Money in Other Contexts	844
More Notes on the Irreparable Injury Rule	849
3. Preserving Assets Before Judgment	849
<i>In re Hypnotic Taxi, LLC</i>	849
Notes on Attachment	855
Notes on Prejudgment Freeze Orders	857
<i>W.E. Erickson Construction, Inc. v. Congress-Kenilworth Corp.</i>	858
Notes on Receivership	861
Notes on Ne Exeat	864

## CHAPTER 10

### More Ancillary Remedies: Attorneys' Fees and the Costs of Litigation

	867
A. Fee-Shifting Statutes	867
<i>City of Riverside v. Rivera</i>	867
Notes on the American Rule	871
Notes on Exceptions to the American Rule	872
Notes on One-Way Fee Shifting	875
Notes on the Amount of the Judgment as a Constraint on Attorneys' Fees	878
Notes on the Prevailing-Party Requirement	880
Notes on Calculating the Lodestar	882
B. Attorneys' Fees from a Common Fund	884
<i>In re Cabletron Systems, Inc. Securities Litigation</i>	884
Notes on the Common-Fund Rule	888
Notes on Contingency Enhancements	890
Notes on Competing Approaches to Calculating Fee Awards	891
Notes on Costs	897
C. Ethical Issues in Fee Awards	899
<i>Evans v. Jeff D.</i>	899
Notes on Ethical Problems in Fee-Shifting Cases	906
Notes on Ethical Problems in Common-Fund Cases	910

## CHAPTER 11

### Remedial Defenses

	917
A. Unconscionability and the Equitable Contract Defenses	917
<i>James v. National Financial, LLC</i>	917
Notes on the Reach of Equitable Defenses	923
Notes on Unconscionable Contracts	925
Notes on Arbitration Clauses	926

B. Unclean Hands and <i>In Pari Delicto</i>	928
<i>Pinter v. Dahl</i>	928
Notes on Unclean Hands and <i>In Pari Delicto</i>	930
C. Estoppel and Waiver	934
1. Equitable Estoppel	934
<i>Geddes v. Mill Creek Country Club, Inc.</i>	934
Notes on Equitable Estoppel	937
Notes on Estoppel Against the Government	939
2. Waiver	941
<i>Carr-Gottstein Foods Co. v. Wasilla, LLC</i>	941
Notes on Waiver	944
Notes on Waiver by the Government	947
D. Laches	948
<i>Arizona Libertarian Party v. Reagan</i>	948
Notes on Laches	950
Notes on the Relation Between Laches and Statutes of Limitations	953
E. Statutes of Limitations	955
1. Continuing Violations	955
<i>Klehr v. A.O. Smith Corp.</i>	955
Notes on Continuing Violations	957
Notes on Limitations of Federal Claims	962
2. The Discovery Rule	964
<i>Debiec v. Cabot Corp.</i>	964
Notes on the Discovery Rule	969
3. Fraudulent Concealment	973
<i>Knaysi v. A.H. Robins Co.</i>	973
Notes on Fraudulent Concealment	976
Notes on Estoppel to Assert Limitations	978
Notes on the Policy Choices in Statutes of Limitations	979
 <b>CHAPTER 12</b>	
<b>Fluid-Class and Cy Pres Remedies</b>	981
<i>In re Pharmaceutical Industry Average Wholesale Price Litigation</i>	981
Notes on Class Actions for Damages	985
Notes on Fluid-Class Recoveries and Cy Pres Distributions	987
Notes on Affirmative Action as a Fluid-Class Remedy	991
Notes on Partly Identifiable Victims	995
 Appendix Present Value Tables	997
 <i>Table of Cases</i>	1001
<i>Table of Statutes, Rules, Constitutions, Treaties, Restatements, and More</i>	1027
<i>Table of Secondary Authorities</i>	1035
<i>Index</i>	1049