

Contents

<i>Preface to the First Edition</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Preface to the Second Edition</i>	<i>xxvii</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxix</i>
Introduction to American Legal Process	1
A. Introduction to Legal Process	1
B. Introduction to the American Legal System	2
1. The Federal System of Government	2
2. State Systems of Government	3
3. Sources of Law and the Priority of Authorities	3
4. A Few Words About Conflicts of Laws	6
C. The Rule of Law	7
Brian Z. Tamanaha, A Concise Guide to the Rule of Law	8
Notes and Questions	19
Part I: The Legislative Branch	23
Chapter 1: The Legislative Process and Statutes as Law	25
A. The Legislative Process	25
John V. Sullivan, Parliamentarian, United States House of Representatives, How Our Laws Are Made	26
Notes and Questions	41
B. Statutes as Law	42
Mary Whisner, The <i>United States Code</i> , Prima Facie Evidence, and Positive Law	42
Notes and Questions	47
	xi

Sidebar: Codes in Civil Law Countries	49
Sidebar: Treaties	49
Sidebar: Initiatives and Referendums	51
Practice Problem: The Federal Legislative Process	54
Chapter 2: The Interpretation of Statutes—Basic Concepts and Historical Development	57
A. The Interpretation of Statutes	57
1. Basic Concepts	57
Michael Zander, “Interpretation Is a Necessary Aspect of Communication,” <i>Statutory Interpretation</i>	58
Reed Dickerson, “Four Constitutional Assumptions”	59
Notes and Questions	61
2. Historical Development	62
a. Early Landmarks	62
<i>Heydon’s Case</i>	62
Notes and Questions	64
<i>Church of the Holy Trinity v. United States</i>	65
Notes and Questions	68
<i>Caminetti v. United States</i>	70
Notes and Questions	75
<i>United States v. American Trucking Associations, Inc.</i>	77
Notes and Questions	81
Henry M. Hart, Jr. & Albert M. Sacks, Note on the Rudiments of Statutory Interpretation	82
Notes and Questions	89
b. The Modern Standard	89
<i>Griffin v. Oceanic Contractors, Inc.</i>	90
<i>United States v. Ron Pair Enterprises, Inc.</i>	95
Notes and Questions	100
c. A Case Study in Modern Statutory Interpretation	102
<i>Smith v. United States</i>	102
Notes and Questions	114
<i>Bailey v. United States</i>	115
Notes and Questions	120
<i>Watson v. United States</i>	120
Notes and Questions	124
Chapter 3: Tools of Statutory Interpretation	127
A. The Parts of a Statute	127
B. Statutory Definitions	129

Contents	xiii
C. The Use of Dictionaries	131
<i>Nix v. Hedden</i>	131
Notes and Questions	132
Practice Problem: Dictionaries	136
Sidebar: Corpus Linguistics	136
D. The Use of Canons of Construction	137
Practice Problem: Canons of Construction	139
E. Rules of Clear Statement	139
<i>Equal Employment Opportunity Commission v. Arabian American Oil Co.</i>	139
Notes and Questions	145
F. Statutory History	146
G. The Use of Legislative History	147
Notes and Questions	148
Sidebar: The English Perspective	153
H. Legislative Inaction	154
1. The Rejected Proposal Rule	154
2. The Acquiescence Rule	156
Henry M. Hart, Jr. & Albert M. Sacks, <i>The Implications of the Failure of Congress to Legislate</i>	156
3. The Reenactment Rule	158
I. Subsequent Legislative History	160
J. The Interpretation of Borrowed Statutes	161
Notes and Questions	162
K. Special Problems in Statutory Interpretation	163
1. The Absurdity Doctrine and the Problem of Scrivener's Errors	163
<i>Green v. Bock Laundry Machine Co.</i>	163
Notes and Questions	168
Practice Problem: Sexual Battery in Florida	170
2. Dealing with the Unanticipated: The Problem of New Applications of Old Statutes	170
<i>McBoyle v. United States</i>	170
Notes and Questions	171
<i>In re Blanchflower</i>	172
Notes and Questions	176
L. Theories of Statutory Interpretation	177
William N. Eskridge, Jr. & Philip P. Frickey, <i>Statutory Interpretation as Practical Reasoning</i>	177
Notes and Questions	179

Henry M. Hart, Jr. & Albert M. Sacks, Why Should Word Meanings Be Respected at All?	179
Notes and Questions	181
Hillel Y. Levin, The Food Stays in the Kitchen: Everything I Needed to Know About Statutory Interpretation I Learned by the Time I Was Nine	181
Notes and Questions	185
Practice Problem: No Dogs in the Park	190

Chapter 4: Retroactivity, Prospectivity, and Other Aspects of Statutory Interpretation **193**

A. The (Mostly) Prospective Application of Statutes	193
1. Basic Concepts	194
Henry M. Hart, Jr. & Albert M. Sacks, A Further Note on the Conflict of Laws in Time	194
<i>Bradley v. School Board</i>	195
Notes and Questions	200
<i>Bowen v. Georgetown University Hospital</i>	201
Notes and Questions	203
<i>Landgraf v. USI Film Products</i>	203
Notes and Questions	219
<i>Vartelas v. Holder</i>	222
Notes and Questions	230
2. Possible Constitutional Limitations to the Retroactive Application of Statutes	230
<i>Calder v. Bull</i>	230
Notes and Questions	236
B. Statutory and Other Conflicts	238
Notes and Questions	239
C. The Fate of Unconstitutional Statutes	240
<i>Ayotte v. Planned Parenthood</i>	240
Notes and Questions	244
D. May Congress Retroactively Reopen Federal Court Judgments With Which It Disagrees?	247
<i>Plaut v. Spendthrift Farm, Inc.</i>	247
Notes and Questions	251

Part II: The Executive Branch 253

Chapter 5: Presidential Signing Statements, Executive Orders, and Regulations 255

A. Presidential Signing Statements	255
T.J. Halstead, Presidential Signing Statements: Constitutional and Institutional Implications	256
Notes and Questions	266
B. Executive Orders and Other Presidential Directives	269
Tara L. Branum, President or King? The Use and Abuse of Executive Orders in Modern-Day America	269
<i>Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer</i>	270
Notes and Questions	273
C. Administrative Agencies, Regulations, and the Regulatory Process	275
American Bar Association, Section of Administrative Law and Regulatory Practice	276
Notes and Questions	281

Chapter 6: The Role of Administrative Agencies in the Interpretation of Statutes 285

A. Historical Beginnings	285
<i>Skidmore v. Swift & Co.</i>	285
Notes and Questions	287
B. The Modern Standard	288
<i>Chevron U. S. A. Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	288
Notes and Questions	291
C. Back to the Future?	292
<i>United States v. Mead Corp.</i>	292
Notes and Questions	307
<i>Zuni Public School District v. Department of Education</i>	307
Notes and Questions	320
D. The Latest Word	322
<i>City of Arlington v. Federal Communications Commission</i>	322
Notes and Questions	326
E. The Effect of Judicial Interpretation on Administrative Interpretation	327
<i>National Cable & Tel. Assn. v. Brand X Internet Services</i>	327
Notes and Questions	335
<i>United States v. Home Concrete & Supply, LLC</i>	336
Notes and Questions	343

Part III: The Judicial Branch	345
Chapter 7: The Functions of Federal Courts, the Adjudicative Process in Perspective, and the Role of Formal Logic	347
A. The Functions of Federal Courts	347
B. The Adjudicative Process in Perspective	348
Henry M. Hart, Jr. & Albert Sacks, <i>The Great Pyramid of Legal Order</i>	349
Notes and Questions	350
Lon L. Fuller, <i>The Forms and Limits of Adjudication</i>	351
Notes and Questions	367
C. The Role of Formal Logic	368
Ruggero J. Aldisert, et al., <i>Logic for Law Students: How to Think Like a Lawyer</i>	368
Notes and Questions	379
Chapter 8: The Parts of a Judicial Decision, the Various Types of Opinions, and Holding and Dicta	383
A. The Parts of a Judicial Decision	383
Notes and Questions	385
1. Syllabus and Headnotes	385
Gil Grantmore, <i>The Headnote</i>	385
Notes and Questions	389
B. The Various Types of Opinions	390
Notes and Questions	392
Practice Problem: <i>The Various Types of Opinions</i>	399
Sidebar: <i>Opinion Delivery in Foreign Judicial Systems</i>	399
C. Holding and Dicta	401
Michael C. Dorf, <i>Dicta and Article III</i>	401
Notes and Questions	404
Sidebar: <i>A Word About Case Law Interpretation</i>	409
Sidebar: <i>A Word About Case Law Terminology</i>	410
Chapter 9: Precedent and Related Concepts	413
A. The Effects of Judicial Decisions on the Same and Other Cases	413
1. Law of the Case	414
<i>Christianson v. Colt Industries Operating Corp.</i>	414
Notes and Questions	418
Practice Problem: <i>Understanding Case Law</i>	420

2. Rehearing and Rehearing en Banc	421
<i>Easley v. Reuss</i>	421
Notes and Questions	423
Sidebar: The Doctrine of Judicial Estoppel	423
Sidebar: The Rooker-Feldman Doctrine	424
B. The Concept of Precedent and the Doctrine of Stare Decisis	425
1. Vertical Stare Decisis	426
Evan H. Caminker, Why Must Inferior Courts Obey Superior Court Precedents?	426
Notes and Questions	427
2. State Law in Federal Courts	430
<i>Commissioner of Internal Revenue v. Estate of Bosch</i>	430
Notes and Questions	431
3. Federal Law in State Courts	432
<i>James v. City of Boise</i>	432
Donald H. Zeigler, Gazing into the Crystal Ball: Reflections on the Standards State Judges Should Use to Ascertain Federal Law	433
Notes and Questions	434
4. Deference to Other Federal Courts as to the Law of a State Within Its Jurisdiction	435
<i>Salve Regina College v. Russell</i>	435
Notes and Questions	443
5. Certification to Another Court	444
Jonathan Remy Nash, The Uneasy Case for Transjurisdictional Adjudication	445
Jonathan Remy Nash, Examining the Power of Federal Courts to Certify Questions of State Law	447
Notes and Questions	451
6. Horizontal Stare Decisis	456
a. Stare Decisis in Practice	456
<i>Patterson v. McLean Credit Union</i>	456
<i>Payne v. Tennessee</i>	459
<i>Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pa. v. Casey</i>	463
Notes and Questions	469
Sidebar: English and Civil Law Views of Precedent	476
b. Horizontal Stare Decisis in the United States Court of Appeals	477
<i>In re Korean Air Lines Disaster of September 1, 1983</i>	477
Notes and Questions	481
c. Horizontal Stare Decisis in the District Courts	483
d. Stare Decisis in Theory	484
Henry M. Hart, Jr. & Albert M. Sacks, Note on the Reasons Supporting a General Practice of Adherence to Prior Holdings	484
Notes and Questions	485
Frederick Schauer, Precedent	485
Notes and Questions	503

7. Avoiding Precedent	505
8. Overruling by Implication	506
Practice Problem: Overruled by Implication	509
9. The Adoption of Precedent by Newly Created Courts	510
<i>Bonner v. City of Prichard</i>	510
Notes and Questions	514
Chapter 10: Other Aspects of Stare Decisis, Persuasive Authority, and the Use of Foreign Law	517
A. Other Aspects of the Doctrine of Stare Decisis	517
1. The Significance (or Insignificance) of Denials of Further Review	517
Notes and Questions	520
2. Vacatur	523
<i>United States Bancorp Mortgage Co. v. Bonner Mall Partnership</i>	524
Notes and Questions	528
3. The “Unpublished” Decision Problem	531
<i>Anastasoff v. United States</i>	531
<i>Hart v. Massanari</i>	536
Notes and Questions	547
Sidebar: Citation Practice in England	549
B. Persuasive Authority	550
Antonin Scalia & Bryan A. Garner, Master the Relative Weight of Precedents	550
Notes and Questions	551
Frederick Schauer, Authority and Authorities	552
Notes and Questions	567
C. The Use of Foreign Law	567
<i>Roper v. Simmons</i>	567
Notes and Questions	571
<i>Animal Science Products, Inc. v. Hebei Welcome Pharmaceutical Co. Ltd.</i>	572
Stephen Yeazell, When and How U.S. Courts Should Cite Foreign Law	573
Notes and Questions	578
Chapter 11: Current Issues in Judicial Process	581
A. What Is a “Hearing” and the Purpose and Value of Oral Argument	581
<i>Perez-Llamas v. Utah Court of Appeals</i>	581
Notes and Questions	585

Contents	xix
Antonin Scalia & Bryan A. Garner, Appreciate the Importance of Oral Argument, and Know Your Objectives	585
Notes and Questions	586
B. The Need to Provide Reasons for the Decision	591
<i>In re Shell Oil Co.</i>	591
<i>Taylor v. McKeithen</i>	592
Notes and Questions	593
Frederick Schauer, Giving Reasons	594
Notes and Questions	612
C. The Propriety of Sua Sponte Decisions	614
<i>Day v. McDonough</i>	615
Notes and Questions	621
<i>Greenlaw v. United States</i>	624
Notes and Questions	630
<i>Wood v. Milyard</i>	631
Notes and Questions	635
D. Amicus Curiae Practice	638
E. Deciding Issues for the First Time on Appeal	640
<i>Weisgram v. Marley Co.</i>	640
Notes and Questions	646

Chapter 12: Retroactivity, Prospectivity, and Other Aspects of Judicial Decisionmaking **653**

A. The Retroactive and Prospective Application of Decisions	653
1. The Basic Problem Revisited	653
2. A Brief Note on Terminology	654
3. The Modern Cases	655
<i>Linkletter v. Walker</i>	655
Notes and Questions	660
<i>Chevron Oil Co. v. Huson</i>	662
Notes and Questions	665
<i>Griffith v. Kentucky</i>	666
Notes and Questions	668
<i>Harper v. Virginia Department of Taxation</i>	671
Notes and Questions	683
4. Possible Constitutional Limitations on the Retroactive Application of Decisions	684
<i>Rogers v. Tennessee</i>	684
Notes and Questions	697

B. Legislative Versus Judicial Resolution	698
Notes and Questions	699
C. Judicial Impartiality	700
<i>Cheney v. United States District Court for the District of Columbia, No. 03-475, Memorandum of Justice Scalia</i>	701
Notes and Questions	708
<i>Caperton v. A.T. Massey Coal Co., Inc.</i>	710
Notes and Questions	721
Sidebar: Cameras in the Courtroom	724
<i>Table of Cases</i>	725
<i>Table of Authorities</i>	729
<i>Table of Constitutional Provisions, Statutes, Rules, Regulations, and Executive Orders</i>	737
<i>Index</i>	739