

# Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xxvii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxix

## **Chapter 1    The Sources and Limitations of the Criminal Law                    I**

Overview	1
Sources of Criminal Law	2
The Common Law as a Source of Criminal Law	2
Legislative Sources	3
The Model Penal Code as a Source of Criminal Law	3
Constitutional Sources and Limits	4
Limitations on the Criminal Law	5
The Principle of Legality	5
The Common Law in England	5
The Common Law in the United States	6
The Strengths and Weaknesses of Common Law Crimes	6
Principle of Legality	7
Ex Post Facto	8
The Rule of Lenity	10
Void for Vagueness	10
The Burden of Proof	12
Examples	15
Explanations	17

## **Chapter 2    The Purposes of Punishment    21**

Overview	21
Defining Punishment	21
The Purposes of Punishment	22
Utilitarianism	23
Deterrence	23
Incapacitation	26
Rehabilitation	27
Empirical Critiques	29
Normative Critiques	29
Retribution	30
The Relationship of the Theories	32

## Contents

	The Importance of Sentencing	33
	“Civil” vs. “Punitive”	34
	The Difference Between “Criminal” and “Civil”	
	Confinement	34
	A Contemporary Example: Sexual Predator Laws	35
	Examples	36
	Explanations	37
<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>Actus Reus</b>	<b>41</b>
	Overview	41
	The Common Law	43
	Voluntary Act	43
	Intangible Acts	44
	Omission and Legal Duty	44
	Moral Duty	46
	Possession	46
	The Model Penal Code	47
	Voluntary Act	47
	Omission and Legal Duty	48
	A More Precise Definition for Actus Reus	48
	Possession	49
	Examples	49
	Explanations	54
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>The Doctrines of Mens Rea</b>	<b>63</b>
	Overview	63
	The Concepts of Mens Rea	64
	“Traditional” and “Statutory” Mens Rea	66
	Motive and Mens Rea	67
	Motive and Defenses	68
	Specific Kinds of Mens Rea	69
	Intent (Purpose)	69
	Knowledge	72
	Recklessness	73
	Negligence as a Predicate for Criminal Liability	75
	Proving Mens Rea	78
	Contemporaneity, Prior Fault, and Time Frames	79
	Statutory Interpretation and Mens Rea	80
	Principles of Statutory Construction	80
	Element Analysis	82
	The “Default Position”	84
	Mens Rea and the Constitution	86
	The Model Penal Code	86

## Contents

	“Elements” vs. “Material” Elements	86
	Kinds of Material Elements	87
	Levels of Mental States	88
	Element Analysis	90
	The Default Position Under the Code	93
	Summary	94
	Examples	94
	Explanations	98
<b>Chapter 5</b>	<b>Mistake</b>	<b>107</b>
	Overview	107
	Mistake and Ignorance of Law	108
	Ignorance of the Law	109
	Mistake of Law	111
	Exceptions to the Rule	113
	“Specific Intent” Crimes	113
	Noncriminal Law Mistake	113
	Estoppel	114
	The Model Penal Code	115
	Retention of the Ignorantia Legis Doctrine	115
	The “Reasonable Reliance” Approach to Mistake	115
	Mistake of Fact	117
	Reasonableness and Specific Intent	117
	Knowledge and Willful Blindness	119
	Mistake of Legal Fact	120
	The Model Penal Code	121
	A Note on the Future of Mistake	122
	Examples	123
	Explanations	126
<b>Chapter 6</b>	<b>Strict Liability</b>	<b>133</b>
	Overview	133
	The Reach of Strict Criminal Liability	134
	Definitions and Indicia of Strict Liability	136
	Public Welfare Offenses	136
	Mala in Se (“Real”) vs. Mala Prohibita (“Unreal”?) Crimes	137
	Innocent Actors	139
	The Litmus Test of Available Punishments	140
	Strict vs. Vicarious Liability	141
	Arguments for and Against Strict Liability	142
	Alternatives to Strict Liability	143
	“Greater Crime” Theory	144

## Contents

One More Way of Imposing Strict Liability: Elements, Material Elements, and Sentencing Factors	146
Constitutionality	147
The Model Penal Code	148
A Recap and a Methodology	149
Examples	150
Explanations	154
<b>Chapter 7 Causation</b>	<b>161</b>
Overview	161
The Rationale of Causation	162
The Elements of Causation	164
The Common Law	164
Responsibility for Causing Harm	164
Cause in Fact	164
Omission as a Cause	164
Concurrent Causation	165
Direct Cause	166
Proximate Cause	166
Contributory Negligence and Proximate Causation	174
The Model Penal Code	174
Responsibility for Causing Harm	174
“But For” Causation	174
Other Causation, Concurrent Causation, and Transferred Intent	175
Culpability as to Result	175
Examples	177
Explanations	182
<b>Chapter 8 Homicide</b>	<b>197</b>
Overview	197
Human Being	198
When Does Life Begin?	198
When Does Life End?	199
Cause and Death	199
Murder	199
“Original” Murder: Killing with “Malice Aforethought”	199
Presumed Malice	202
Gradations of Murder	202
“First-Degree” Murder	202
“Second-Degree” Murder	204
The Model Penal Code Approach	205
Some Further Thoughts	206

## Contents

Examples	206
Explanations	209
Felony Murder	216
Introduction	216
Restrictions on the Doctrine: “Cause” Questions	218
The “Proximate Cause” Theory	218
The “In Furtherance” (“Agency”) and “Provocative Act” Theories	218
Justified vs. Excused Killings	219
The Shield Cases: Exception to an Exception to an Exception	219
Other Restrictions	220
Duration of the Felony: Time Matters	220
Limitations on the Predicate Felony	220
Summary	223
Statutory Felony Murder: The Interplay of Courts and Legislatures	224
The Model Penal Code Approach	224
Examples	225
Explanations	228
Manslaughter	233
Voluntary Manslaughter	234
The Rules of Voluntary Manslaughter	234
Twentieth-Century Changes in the Doctrines	237
The Model Penal Code Approach	239
The Rules of Involuntary Manslaughter	242
Reckless and Negligent Manslaughter	242
Misdemeanor-Manslaughter	243
Examples	244
Explanations	249

## **Chapter 9 Rape 261**

Overview	261
The Common Law Approach	262
Definition	262
Spousal Immunity	263
Force	263
Threat of Force	265
Consent	265
Attacking the Credibility of the Complainant	265
Legally Ineffective Consent	266
Fraud	266
American Common Law	267

## Contents

The Actus Reus of Rape	267
The Mens Rea of Rape	268
The Model Penal Code	269
Second-Degree Rape	270
First-Degree Rape	271
Gross Sexual Imposition	271
Modern Rape Statutes	272
Rape by Force or Threat of Serious Bodily Injury	274
Force	274
Additional Force	274
Inherent Force	275
Nonphysical Force	276
Threat of Force	276
Dispensing with the Force Requirement	277
Resistance by the Victim	277
Consent	278
Deception	279
Rape in the First Degree	280
Spousal Immunity	280
Rape Because No Legally Effective Consent	280
Summary	281
Evidence Reforms	282
Rape Shield Laws	282
Examples	282
Explanations	287
<b>Chapter 10 Theft</b>	<b>297</b>
Overview	297
The Impact of History	298
The Death Penalty	298
Larceny	298
Trespass	299
Asportation and Taking	300
Personal Property	301
Of Another	302
With Intent	303
To Deprive	303
Permanently	304
Contemporaneity	305
Finders	305
Embezzlement	306
Conversion	307
In Lawful Possession	307
Fraud	308

## Contents

False Pretenses	308
Representation	309
Present or Past Fact	309
Title	310
Mens Rea, Knowledge, and Intent to Defraud	310
Confusion	311
Grading	312
The Model Penal Code	313
Examples	315
Explanations	318
<b>Chapter 11 Solicitation</b>	<b>325</b>
Overview	325
Definition	327
The Common Law	327
The Model Penal Code	327
Another Version of Solicitation	328
The Mens Rea of Solicitation	328
The Common Law	328
The Model Penal Code	328
The Actus Reus of Solicitation	329
The Common Law	329
The Model Penal Code	329
The Relationship Between Solicitation and Conspiracy	329
Responsibility for Crime Solicited	330
Solicitation and Immunity for Crime Solicited	330
Solicitation and Innocent Agents	331
Impossibility	331
The Common Law	331
Legal Impossibility	331
Factual Impossibility	332
The Model Penal Code	332
Abandonment	332
Solicitation and Law Enforcement	333
Punishment	334
Examples	334
Explanations	336
<b>Chapter 12 Attempt</b>	<b>339</b>
Overview	339
Definition	340
The Mens Rea of Attempt	341
The Actus Reus of Attempt	341

## Contents

The Common Law	341
Mens Rea	341
Intend the Act	342
Intend the Result	342
Intend the Circumstances	342
Actus Reus	342
Last Act	343
The Equivocality Test	343
Proximity Test	344
Probable Desistance	344
The Model Penal Code	345
Definition	345
Mens Rea	345
Conduct	345
Result	345
Circumstance	345
Actus Reus	346
Summary	347
Abandonment	348
The Common Law	348
The Model Penal Code	348
Impossibility: Legal, Factual, and Inherent	349
The Common Law	350
Legal Impossibility	350
Factual Impossibility	350
Analysis	352
Inherent Impossibility	353
The Model Penal Code	353
Legal Impossibility	353
Factual Impossibility	353
Inherent Impossibility	354
Stalking	354
Examples	355
Explanations	360
<b>Chapter 13 Conspiracy</b>	<b>373</b>
Overview	373
Definition	374
The Common Law	375
The Model Penal Code	375
Punishment and Grading	376
The Common Law	376
The Model Penal Code	376



## Contents

The Special Advantages of Conspiracy for Prosecutors	377
Choice of Venue	377
Joint Trials	378
Use of Hearsay Evidence	378
Responsibility for Crimes Committed by Co-Conspirators	379
The Common Law	379
The Model Penal Code	381
Duration	381
The Common Law	381
Extending the Life of a Conspiracy	382
The Model Penal Code	382
Consequences of Termination	383
The Mens Rea of Conspiracy	383
The Common Law	383
Act and Result	383
Circumstances	384
The Model Penal Code	385
Conduct and Result	385
Circumstances	385
Purpose or Knowledge When Providing Goods and Services	386
Case Law	386
The Model Penal Code	387
The Actus Reus of Conspiracy	388
Agreement	388
The Common Law	388
The Model Penal Code	390
Overt Act	391
In General	391
The Model Penal Code	391
The Scope of the Agreement or How Many Conspiracies?	392
Single Agreement with Multiple Criminal Objectives	392
Single or Multiple Agreements?	393
The Wheel and Spokes Approach	393
The Chain Approach	394
Wheel and Chain Conspiracies	395
The Model Penal Code	395
Parties to a Conspiracy	397
The Common Law's Bilateral Approach	397
The Model Penal Code's Unilateral Approach	398
Abandonment	399
The Common Law	399
The Model Penal Code	400
Withdrawal	400

## Contents

The Common Law	400
The Model Penal Code	401
Impossibility	402
Legal Impossibility	402
Factual Impossibility	402
Wharton's Rule	403
The Common Law	403
The Model Penal Code	404
Immunity for Substantive Offense	405
The Common Law	405
The Model Penal Code	405
Examples	406
Explanations	410
<b>Chapter 14 Complicity</b>	<b>419</b>
Overview	419
The Rationale of Accomplice Liability	420
Definitions	422
The Common Law	422
Principals and Accessories	422
Misprision of Felony	423
Treason	423
Misdemeanors	423
The Model Penal Code	423
Principals and Accessories Before the Fact	423
Accessories After the Fact	424
Procedural Consequences of Classification	426
The Common Law	426
Venue	426
Pleadings and Proof	426
The Requirement of a Guilty Principal	426
The Model Penal Code	426
Venue	426
Pleadings and Proof	427
The Requirement of a Guilty Principal	427
Contemporary Law	427
Principals and Accessories	427
Accessories After the Fact	427
Elements of Accessorial Responsibility	428
Mens Rea	428
The Mens Rea of the Crime Aided	428
The Mens Rea to Be an Accomplice: Purpose or Intent to Aid the Principal's Criminal Action	428

## Contents

Knowledge That Another Intends to Commit a Crime	430
Providers of Goods and Services	430
Liability for Unintended Crimes Committed by the Principal	431
Actus Reus	433
Actual Assistance	433
Omission	434
How Much Aid Is Enough?	434
Immunity from Conviction	435
Conduct Necessarily Part of the Crime	436
Legal Incapacity to Commit Substantive Crime	436
The Relationship Between Principal and Accessories	437
The Common Law	437
The Requirement of a Guilty Principal	437
The Pretending Principal	438
Differences in Degree of Culpability Between Principal and Accomplice	438
Withdrawal of Aid	439
The Model Penal Code	440
The Requirement of a Guilty Principal	440
The Pretending Principal	440
Differences in Degree of Culpability Between Principal and Accomplice	440
Withdrawal of Aid	440
Examples	441
Explanations	445

## **Chapter 15 Defenses: An Initial Survey 453**

Overview	453
Presumptions	454
Constitutional Aspects of Presumptions	456
The Model Penal Code	456
“Affirmative” Defenses	457
Legislative Clarity and the Offense-Defense Distinction	458
The Constitution and Affirmative Defenses	459
The Common Law and Affirmative Defenses	460
Excuse and Justification: The Debate and Confusion	461
The Distinction Drawn	461
The Distinction Questioned	462
The Problems with Explaining Justification	463
Mistake and Justification	463
Mistake: Honest or Reasonable?	464
Unknowing Justification: The Dadson Problem	465

## Contents

The Problem with Explaining Excuses	466
Procedural Implications of the Distinctions	467
The Burden of Proof Problem	467
The Abolition Problem	468
The Assistance and Resistance Problem	468
The Model Penal Code	469
Examples	470
Explanations	471
<b>Chapter 16 Acts in Emergency: Justification vs. Excuse</b>	<b>475</b>
Overview	475
Common Requirements, Common Problems	476
Actus Reus, Mens Rea, or Both? Or Neither?	476
Actus Reus	476
Mens Rea	476
Why Punish?	477
Duress	478
The Doctrines of Duress	478
Personal Injury	478
Source of the Threat	479
“Imminence”	479
Reasonableness of Fear	480
To “Himself”	480
Creating Conditions of Duress	480
Duress and Homicide	481
Termination of the Threat	481
The Guilt of the Duressor: A Note	481
The Rationale of Duress	482
The Model Penal Code	482
Necessity	483
The Doctrines of Necessity	483
Source of the Threat	484
Necessity and Homicide	484
The Problem of Imminence	486
Choice of Evils and Alternatives	486
Creating Conditions of Necessity	487
Excuse or Justification?	488
Duress vs. Necessity	489
The Problem of Democracy	489
The Model Penal Code	491
Examples	492
Explanations	495
Self-Defense	502

## Contents

The Rules of Self-Defense	503
Imminence; No Alternatives	504
Preemptive Strikes	504
To Retreat or Not to Retreat, That Is the Dilemma	504
“Stand Your Ground” Laws	506
Proportionality and Subjectivity	509
Mistake and Reasonableness	511
The Position of the “Aggressor”: Withdrawal	513
The “Not Unlawful” Aggressor	514
Time Frames	514
The Battered Wives Cases: A Challenge to the Doctrines	515
Doctrinal Problems of Self-Defense	518
The Mens Rea of Self-Defense	518
Defense of Others	519
The Model Penal Code	520
Examples	520
Explanations	526
Provocation—Excuse or Justification?	534
Defense of Property and Habitat	535
The Common Law	536
Other Lawful Means Available	536
Warning	536
Deadly Force Not Permitted	536
The Model Penal Code	538
Initial Aggression	538
Retaking Property	538
Use of Force	538
Examples	539
Explanations	540
Use of Force	543
Arrest	543
The Common Law	543
The Model Penal Code	546
Preventing Crime	546
The Common Law	546
The Model Penal Code	547
Examples	547
Explanations	549

## **Chapter 17 Defenses Based on Individual Characteristics 553**

Overview	553
Insanity	554

## Contents

The Relevance of Mental Illness in the Criminal Justice System	555
Competency to Stand Trial	555
Transfer from Prison to a Psychiatric Hospital	557
Release from Confinement	557
Execution Pursuant to a Sentence of Death	557
The Insanity Defense	558
The M’Naghten Test	558
The Irresistible Impulse Test	560
The Model Penal Code Test	560
The Federal Insanity Test	563
Reform of the Insanity Defense	563
Substantive Changes	563
Insanity Defense Myths and Facts	564
The Guilty But Mentally Ill Defense	564
Historical Origin	564
Jury Options	564
Dispositional Consequences	565
Arguments Pro and Con	565
The Empirical Consequences of the GBMI Defense	566
Examples	566
Explanations	569
Infancy	575
The Common Law	576
Under Age 7	576
Between Ages 7 and 14	576
Over Age 14	577
The Model Penal Code	577
Contemporary Law	577
Juvenile Court Jurisdiction	577
Criminal Responsibility	578
Determining Capacity	579
Examples	580
Explanations	580
Intoxication	582
Intoxication as an Element	583
The Relevance of Voluntary Intoxication to Mens Rea or Culpability	583
The Common Law	583
The Model Penal Code	586
The Relevance of Voluntary Intoxication to Defenses	587
Involuntary Intoxication	587
The Relevance of Voluntary Intoxication to Actus Reus	588
Alcoholism and Insanity	588

## Contents

Examples	589
Explanations	591
Diminished Capacity	595
A Brief History	596
The British Version: Diminished Responsibility	596
The California Version	596
The Rule of Evidence Approach	598
The Model Penal Code	600
Summary	600
Examples	600
Explanations	603
Entrapment	606
The History of the Entrapment Defense	606
The Defense Today	607
The Subjective Approach	607
The Objective Approach	608
Due Process	609
Examples	609
Explanations	613
New Excuses: The Future Is Upon Us	617
Physiologically (Biologically) Based Excuses for Criminality	619
Neuroscience and the Law—My Brain Made Me Do It	620
Genetics and Crime	622
Premenstrual Syndrome (PMS)	623
Other Physiologically Based Claims	625
Psychologically Based Excuses	625
Brainwashing	625
Mob Mentality	626
Cognitive Psychology, Law, and the Emotions	627
Sociologically Based Claims	627
Criminogenic Causes: Rotten Social Background	628
Urban Survival Syndrome and Black Rage	628
Recap	629
Examples	629
Explanations	631
<i>Table of Cases</i>	637
<i>Index</i>	643

