

Preface	xix
Acknowledgments	xxi
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
A. The Religion Clauses and Underlying Values: The Case of Sabbath Observances	2
<i>Stansbury v. Marks</i>	3
<i>Estate of Thornton v. Caldor, Inc.</i>	7
Notes and Questions	10
Chapter 2 History	13
A. The Theory and Practice of Religious Establishments	13
Thomas Hobbes, <i>Leviathan</i>	16
Notes and Questions	16
George Washington, Farewell Address	18
Constitution of Massachusetts (1780)	18
<i>Barnes v. First Parish in Falmouth</i>	20
Notes and Questions	23
B. Evangelical and Enlightenment Ideas of Church-State Separation	24
Thomas Jefferson, Notes on the State of Virginia	25
Elisha Williams, The Essential Rights and Liberties of Protestants	26
John Locke, A Letter Concerning Toleration	28
Notes and Questions	32
George Washington, Letter to the Religious Society Called Quakers	36
Thomas Jefferson, Letter to a Committee of the Danbury Baptist Association	36
Notes and Questions	37
C. The Virginia Assessment Controversy	39
Virginia Declaration of Rights (1776)	39
Notes and Questions	40

A Bill Establishing a Provision for Teachers of the Christian Religion (1784)	41
Notes and Questions	42
James Madison, Memorial and Remonstrance Against Religious Assessments	43
Notes and Questions	47
A Bill for Establishing Religious Freedom (1786)	48
Notes and Questions	49
D. The Constitutional Provisions	50
1. Framing the First Amendment	50
Annals of Congress, Aug. 15, 1789	52
Journal of the First Session of the Senate of the United States of America, Sept. 3, 1789	54
Senate Journal, Sept. 9, 1789	55
Annals of Congress, Aug. 17, 1789	55
a. Issues Concerning Establishment	56
b. Issues Concerning Free Exercise	59
2. Perspectives and Developments in the Early Republic	61
James Madison, Detached Memorandum	61
Notes and Questions	63
3. Incorporation in the Fourteenth Amendment	65
<i>Permoli v. New Orleans</i>	65
Notes and Questions	66
<i>Elk Grove Unified School District v. Newdow</i>	69
<i>Abington School District v. Schempp</i>	71
Notes and Questions	72
Robert Nozick, Anarchy, State, and Utopia	74
Notes and Questions	74
Chapter 3 Religion in the Regulatory State	77
A. Free Exercise: Is Accommodation Required?	78
1. The Historical Debate	78
Michael W. McConnell, The Origins and Historical Understanding of Free Exercise of Religion	78
Philip A. Hamburger, A Constitutional Right of Religious Exemption: An Historical Perspective	86
Notes and Questions	92
2. The First Free Exercise Cases	93

Contents	xi
<i>People v. Philips</i>	94
<i>Simon's Executors v. Gratz</i>	99
Notes and Questions	100
3. Belief and Conduct: The Mormon Cases	101
<i>Reynolds v. United States</i>	103
Notes and Questions	106
4. The Rise of Exemptions	109
<i>Sherbert v. Verner</i>	110
Notes and Questions	115
<i>Wisconsin v. Yoder</i>	118
Notes and Questions	121
5. The Exemptions Period	122
<i>Thomas v. Review Board</i>	123
Notes and Questions	126
<i>Lyng v. Northwest Indian Cemetery Protective Association</i>	129
Notes and Questions	133
6. The Decline of Exemptions	137
<i>Employment Division v. Smith</i>	137
Notes and Questions	143
7. The Return of Exemptions	146
a. The Religious Freedom Restoration Act	146
The Religious Freedom Restoration Act	146
b. RFRA's Partial Invalidation: <i>City of Boerne</i>	147
c. The Modern Patchwork of Free Exercise	149
B. Free Exercise After <i>Smith</i>	150
1. The Free Exercise Clause Itself	150
<i>Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye v. City of Hialeah</i>	150
Notes and Questions	154
<i>Fraternal Order of Police v. City of Newark</i>	154
Notes and Questions	158
<i>Masterpiece Cakeshop, Ltd. v. Colorado Civil Rights Commission</i>	161
Notes and Questions	168
The COVID-19 Cases	171
<i>Roman Catholic Diocese of Brooklyn v. Cuomo</i>	172
Notes and Questions	177
<i>Fulton v. City of Philadelphia</i>	179
Notes and Questions	186
2. RFRA (and State RFRA's and State Constitutional Provisions)	189

<i>Gonzales v. O Centro Espirita Beneficente Uniao Do Vegetal</i>	189
Notes and Questions	194
<i>Burwell v. Hobby Lobby Stores, Inc.</i>	196
Notes and Questions	211
3. RLUIPA	213
<i>Holt v. Hobbs</i>	213
Notes and Questions	217
4. Targeted Legislative Accommodations	219
<i>Spencer v. World Vision</i>	221
Notes and Questions	230
C. The Establishment Clause: Is Accommodation Unconstitutional?	233
1. The Example of Draft Exemption	234
<i>Welsh v. United States</i>	235
Notes and Questions	238
2. Theoretical Arguments	240
a. The Argument from Text and from Symmetry	241
b. Religious Arguments for Religious Liberty	242
c. Secular Arguments for Religious Liberty	243
3. The Historical Understanding	244
1 Annals of Congress	245
Notes and Questions	247
4. The Current Doctrine	248
<i>Cutter v. Wilkinson</i>	249
Notes and Questions	253
D. Institutional Religion	257
1. Formation of Churches	258
a. Religious Structures	258
b. Civil Legal Structures	259
c. First Amendment Concerns	261
Madison's Veto Message	261
Notes and Questions	262
2. Internal Church Property Disputes: The Rise of "Neutral Principles of Law"	263
<i>Watson v. Jones</i>	263
Notes and Questions	266
<i>Jones v. Wolf</i>	267
Notes and Questions	272

Contents	xiii
<i>Masterson v. Diocese of Northwest Texas</i>	274
Notes and Questions	278
3. The Reaffirmation of Church Autonomy: <i>Hosanna-Tabor</i> (and <i>Our Lady</i>)	279
<i>Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church and School v. E.E.O.C.</i>	281
Notes and Questions	287
<i>Our Lady of Guadalupe School v. Morrissey-Berru</i>	289
Notes and Questions	292
4. Churches and Tort Law	293
<i>Kubala v. Hartford Roman Catholic Diocesan Corporation</i>	293
Notes and Questions	297
<i>Redwing v. Catholic Bishop for Diocese of Memphis</i>	299
Notes and Questions	302
Chapter 4 The Power of the Purse	305
A. Funding for Religious Schools from the Founding to World War II	306
1. Before the Civil War	306
Jeffries and Ryan, A Political History of the Establishment Clause	307
Notes and Questions	309
2. After the Civil War	311
a. Reconstruction	311
b. The Blaine Amendment	311
c. Intensification of the Conflict	317
<i>Pierce v. Society of Sisters</i>	317
Notes and Questions	318
<i>Brief for the Governor of Oregon in Pierce v. Society of Sisters</i>	319
Notes and Questions	320
d. The Supreme Court's First Cases	321
B. Modern Decisions: The Conflict Between "No Aid" and "Neutral Aid"	322
<i>Everson v. Board of Education</i>	322
Notes and Questions	331
Note on the Uses of History: Religious Assessments and the Establishment Clause	334
Board of Education v. Allen	335
Notes and Questions	336
C. The <i>Lemon</i> Approach: (Almost) No Aid to Religious Schools	337
1. The Basic Decisions	337

<i>Lemon v. Kurtzman</i>	337
Notes and Questions	343
Committee for Public Education v. Nyquist	345
Notes and Questions	348
2. <i>Lemon</i> Applied: Different Forms of Aid, Different Institutions	352
a. Forms of Aid to Nonpublic Schools	352
b. Distinctions Among Institutions	356
c. Tax Benefits Versus Grants	360
<i>Walz v. Tax Comm'n of New York</i>	360
Notes and Questions	365
D. The New Approach: The Permissibility of “Neutral” Aid	366
1. The Shift Toward Neutrality	366
2. Indirect Aid Through “Genuine Private Choice”	370
<i>Zelman v. Simmons-Harris</i>	370
Notes and Questions	381
3. Aid That Is Neutral But Direct	385
<i>Freedom from Religion Foundation v. McCallum</i>	386
Notes and Questions	388
E. State Restrictions on Aid to Religion: Is Neutrality Constitutionally Required?	389
<i>Locke v. Davey</i>	391
Notes and Questions	395
<i>Trinity Lutheran Church v. Comer</i>	397
Notes and Questions	407
<i>Espinoza v. Montana Dept. of Revenue</i>	408
Notes and Questions	410
F. Generally Applicable Conditions on Government Aid	412
1. Does the Free Exercise Clause (or RFRA) Ever Require Exemptions from Strings on Aid?	412
Application of the Religious Freedom Restoration Act to the Award of a Grant Pursuant to the Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention Act	412
Notes and Questions	418
2. Does the Establishment Clause Prohibit Exemptions from Strings on Aid?	419
<i>American Civil Liberties Union of Massachusetts v. Sebelius</i>	419
Notes and Questions	422
<i>Lown v. Salvation Army</i>	422
Notes and Questions	426

Contents	xv
3. The (Arguably) Special Case of Racial Discrimination in Religious Schools	428
<i>Bob Jones University v. United States</i>	428
Notes and Questions	430
G. Standing to Sue in Federal Court Under the Establishment Clause	431
1. Taxpayer Standing to Challenge Expenditures	432
<i>Hein v. Freedom from Religion Foundation</i>	433
Notes and Questions	443
Arizona Christian School Tuition Organization v. Winn	446
2. Establishment Clause Standing Outside of Challenges to Expenditures	447
Elk Grove Unified Sch. Dist. v. Newdow	447
Note on Standing in Cases Challenging Religious Displays	448
American Legion v. American Humanist Ass'n	449
Chapter 5 Religion and the Government's Influence on Culture	453
A. Efforts to Create a Public Culture	454
1. Compelled Oaths and Affirmations	455
Torcaso v. Watkins	455
Notes and Questions	456
<i>Commonwealth v. Cooke</i>	458
Notes and Questions	459
<i>Board of Education v. Barnette</i>	460
Notes and Questions	463
2. Prayers and Religious Exercises in the Public Schools	465
<i>Engel v. Vitale</i>	465
<i>Abington School District v. Schempp</i>	467
Notes and Questions	471
<i>Lee v. Weisman</i>	476
Notes and Questions	485
Note on the Pledge of Allegiance	488
3. Prayer Outside the Public Schools	492
George Washington, Thanksgiving Proclamation	492
Notes and Questions	493
Marsh v. Chambers	494
<i>Town of Greece v. Galloway</i>	495
Notes and Questions	503
4. Public Religious Displays	504
a. The "No Endorsement" Principle	504

<i>Lynch v. Donnelly</i>	504
County of Allegheny v. ACLU	513
Notes and Questions	515
b. The Historical Approach	520
<i>American Legion v. American Humanist Ass'n</i>	520
Notes and Questions	530
5. Evolution and Creationism	532
<i>Epperson v. Arkansas</i>	533
Notes and Questions	536
Edwards v. Aguillard	540
Notes and Questions	543
6. “Nor Inhibit” Religion	546
<i>Catholic League for Civil and Religious Rights v. City and County of San Francisco</i>	546
Notes and Questions	553
<i>Mozert v. Hawkins County Board of Education</i>	555
Notes and Questions	562
Note on Teaching About Religion in Public Schools	564
B. Regulation of Private Religious Speech	567
1. Free Speech Principles: Government as Regulator	568
a. Prior Restraints	570
<i>Lovell v. City of Griffin</i>	570
Note and Questions	571
b. Overbreadth and Vagueness	572
c. Content Discrimination	572
<i>Peck v. Sony Music Corp.</i>	573
Notes and Questions	574
2. Free Speech Principles: Government as Property Owner	579
<i>Commonwealth v. Davis</i>	580
Notes and Questions	580
<i>Widmar v. Vincent</i>	581
Notes and Questions	585
3. Applying <i>Widmar</i> : Religious Speech in Limited Public Forums	588
<i>Lamb’s Chapel v. Center Moriches Union Free School District</i>	588
Notes and Questions	590
Board of Education v. Mergens	592
Notes and Questions	593

4. Religious Free Speech: Does Free Exercise Add More Protection?	596
<i>Heffron v. International Society for Krishna Consciousness</i>	596
Notes and Questions	599
5. Freedom of Association	601
<i>Christian Legal Society v. Hastings College of Law</i>	602
Notes and Questions	605
C. The Line Between Government Speech and Private Speech	609
Capitol Square Review & Advisory Board v. Pinette	609
Pleasant Grove City v. Summum	611
<i>Santa Fe Independent School District v. Doe</i>	612
Notes and Questions	618
Guidelines on Religious Exercise and Religious Expression in the Federal Workplace	619
D. Religion and Democracy	623
1. Religious Voices in Politics: Case Law	623
<i>Lemon v. Kurtzman</i>	623
<i>McDaniel v. Paty</i>	624
Notes and Questions	625
<i>Roe v. Wade</i>	625
<i>Harris v. McRae</i>	626
<i>Webster v. Reproductive Health Services</i>	627
<i>Atkins v. Virginia</i>	629
<i>Bowers v. Hardwick</i>	630
<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	630
<i>Obergefell v. Hodges</i>	631
Notes and Questions	631
<i>Clayton v. Place</i>	632
Note and Questions	636
2. Religious Voices in Politics: Commentary	636
Robert Audi, The Place of Religious Argument in a Free and Democratic Society	636
Michael W. McConnell, Five Reasons to Reject the Claim that Religious Arguments Should Be Excluded from Democratic Deliberation	639
Notes and Questions	643
3. Religion and Judicial Decision Making	645
<i>Idaho v. Freeman</i>	645
Notes and Questions	649

4. Institutional Participation in Politics and Policymaking	652
<i>Branch Ministries v. Rossotti</i>	653
Notes and Questions	658
Larkin v. Grendel's Den	663
Notes and Questions	664
Chapter 6 What Is "Religion"?	669
A. The Framing-Era Definition of "Religion"	670
Virginia Declaration of Rights (1776)	670
Notes and Questions	670
B. Supreme Court Decisions	674
Torcaso v. Watkins	675
<i>United States v. Seeger</i>	677
Notes and Questions	681
Wisconsin v. Yoder	685
Thomas v. Review Board	686
Frazee v. Illinois Dep't of Employment Security	687
Notes and Questions	687
C. An Example from Abroad	688
<i>Grainger Plc v. Nicholson</i>	688
Notes and Questions	693
D. A Multi-Factor Approach	695
<i>Malnak v. Yogi</i>	695
Notes and Questions	701
Note on Income Taxes and the Definition of Religion	703
Table of Cases	707
Table of Statutes	715
Table of Authorities	719
Index	733