
CONTENTS

Preface	xxv
Acknowledgments	xxxii
PART 1 INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK	1
Chapter 1 The Nature and Functions of Administrative Agencies	3
A. The Origin and Mandate of Administrative Agencies	6
1. Theories of the Origin of Administrative Agencies	6
2. A Case Study: The Occupational Safety and Health Act	9
Questions	13
3. Introduction to Separation of Powers and the Administrative State	15
B. Legislative Control of Administrative Agencies	17
1. Authorization: The Problem of Delegation	18
a. The Traditional Understanding of the Nondelegation Doctrine	19
A.L.A. Schechter Poultry Corp. v. United States	20
Notes and Questions	22
Industrial Union Dept., AFL-CIO v. American Petroleum	
Institute (The <i>Benzene</i> Case)	24
Mistretta v. United States	26
Notes and Questions	27
<i>Whitman v. American Trucking Assns., Inc.</i>	30
Notes and Questions	34
b. Nondelegation Revival?	35
<i>Gundy v. United States</i>	35
Notes and Questions	39
C. Alternative Methods of Legislative Control	40
1. Revision: The Legislative Veto	40
<i>Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha</i>	41
Notes and Questions	54
2. Appropriations: Riders and the Line-Item Veto	57
Robertson v. Seattle Audubon Society	58
Notes and Questions	60
	xi

Clinton v. City of New York	62
Notes and Questions	65
3. Legislative Oversight	66
D. Executive Control of Administrative Agencies	69
1. Government by Presidential Command and Initiative	71
Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer	71
Notes and Questions	73
“Presidential Administration”: The Use and Abuse of Presidential Executive Orders and Presidential Directives	74
Tobacco Marketing	74
“Sanctuary City” Funding	75
President Trump’s Immigration Restrictions	77
Prosecutorial Discretion and Deferred Action in Immigration	77
Student Loan Debt Forgiveness	79
Notes and Questions	80
2. Appointment Powers	82
Buckley v. Valeo	83
Notes and Questions	86
<i>Morrison v. Olson</i>	93
Notes and Questions	96
3. Removal Power	100
Myers v. United States	100
Humphrey’s Executor v. United States	101
Notes and Questions	103
<i>Morrison v. Olson</i>	104
Notes and Questions	109
<i>Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight Board</i>	110
Notes and Questions	116
<i>Seila Law LLC v. Consumer Financial Protection Bureau</i>	119
Notes and Questions	135
Chapter 2 Judicial Review of Administrative Decisions	139
A. Standards of Judicial Review Under the Administrative Procedure Act	141
1. Standards of Review and the <i>Overton Park</i> Saga	141
<i>Citizens to Preserve Overton Park v. Volpe</i>	145
Notes and Questions	150
2. The Basis for Judicial Review: Records and Reasons	152
SEC v. Chenery Corp.	153

Contents	xiii
United States v. Morgan	153
Notes and Questions	154
B. Arbitrary and Capricious Review of Questions of Fact or Policy	156
1. The Evolving Understanding: From “No Reasonable Ground” to “Hard Look” Review	157
<i>Motor Vehicle Manufacturers Assn. v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co.</i>	160
Notes and Questions	166
<i>Department of Commerce v. New York</i>	170
Notes and Questions	180
2. Arbitrary and Capricious Review of Agency Changes of Policy	181
<i>Federal Communications Commission v. Fox Television Stations, Inc.</i>	181
Notes and Questions	187
Encino Motorcars, LLC v. Navarro	187
Department of Homeland Security v. Regents of the University of California	191
3. Arbitrary and Capricious Review of Agency Decisions Not to Act	193
<i>Massachusetts v. Environmental Protection Agency</i>	195
Notes and Questions	200
C. Judicial Review of Questions of Law	201
1. The Early Years	202
National Labor Relations Board v. Hearst Publications, Inc.	203
Skidmore v. Swift & Co.	204
Notes and Questions	206
2. The <i>Chevron</i> Decision	206
<i>Chevron U.S.A., Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	208
Notes and Questions	214
3. <i>Chevron</i> Step One	215
a. Modes of Statutory Interpretation	215
<i>MCI Telecommunications Corp. v. American Telephone & Telegraph Co.</i>	216
Babbitt v. Sweet Home Chapter of Communities for a Great Oregon	216
Notes and Questions	218
b. “Extraordinary Cases” and “Major Questions”	219
<i>Food and Drug Administration v. Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp.</i>	219
Notes and Questions	222
<i>West Virginia v. Environmental Protection Agency</i>	225
Notes and Questions	235

4. <i>Chevron</i> Step Two: “Permissible” or “Reasonable” Constructions	237
<i>Utility Air Regulatory Group v. Environmental Protection Agency</i>	237
Notes and Questions	241
5. <i>Chevron</i> Deference to Conflicting or Changing Interpretations?	244
National Cable & Telecommunications Assn. v. Brand X Internet Servs.	245
Notes and Questions	247
6. <i>Chevron</i> “Step Zero”: Interpretations Having the “Force of Law” and “Jurisdictional” Questions	248
a. Interpretations Not Having the “Force of Law”	249
<i>United States v. Mead Corp.</i>	250
Notes and Questions	257
b. Agency Interpretations of “Jurisdictional” Statutes	259
<i>City of Arlington v. Federal Communications Commission</i>	260
Notes and Questions	265
7. Judicial Deference to an Agency’s Interpretations of Its Own Rules	266
<i>Kisor v. Wilkie</i>	267
Notes and Questions	278
8. <i>Chevron</i> Reconsidered: Its Impact, Its Future	279
NFIB v. OSHA	284
Sackett v. EPA	287
American Hospital Association v. Becerra	288
Notes and Questions	289
D. Judicial Review of Questions of Fact or Policy Under the Substantial Evidence Test	289
1. Formal Adjudication	290
<i>In the Matter of Universal Camera Corporation</i>	293
<i>National Labor Relations Board v. Universal Camera Corp.</i>	294
<i>Universal Camera Corp. v. National Labor Relations Board</i>	296
<i>National Labor Relations Board v. Universal Camera Corp.</i>	300
Notes and Questions	302
<i>Biestek v. Berryhill</i>	304
Notes and Questions	308
2. Informal Rulemaking	309
<i>Industrial Union Dept., AFL-CIO v. American Petroleum Institute</i> (The Benzene Case)	310
Notes and Questions	316
E. Judicial Remedies for Unlawful Agency Action	318

Contents	xv
Chapter 3 Availability of Judicial Review	323
A. Jurisdiction	324
B. Reviewability	327
1. “Agency Action”	328
<i>Norton v. Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance</i>	329
Notes and Questions	335
Public Citizen Health Research Group v. Chao	338
Notes and Questions	339
2. Statutory Preclusion of Review	340
<i>Johnson v. Robison</i>	341
Notes and Questions	343
<i>Cuozzo Speed Technologies, LLC v. Lee</i>	344
Notes and Questions	350
<i>McNary v. Haitian Refugee Center, Inc.</i>	351
Notes and Questions	358
3. Committed to Agency Discretion by Law	360
a. General Principles	361
<i>Webster v. Doe</i>	361
Notes and Questions	370
<i>Department of Commerce v. New York</i>	372
Notes and Questions	375
b. Prosecutorial Discretion	375
<i>Heckler v. Chaney</i>	377
Notes and Questions	385
<i>Texas v. United States</i>	385
Notes and Questions	390
c. Resource Allocation and Appropriations	392
<i>Lincoln v. Vigil</i>	392
Notes and Questions	395
C. Standing to Secure Judicial Review	396
1. The Legal Right Test	397
2. Standing Under the Administrative Procedure Act	400
<i>Association of Data Processing Service Organizations, Inc. v. Camp</i>	400
Notes and Questions	402
3. Constitutional Standing Requirements: Injury, Causation, Redressability	404
<i>Lujan v. Defenders of Wildlife</i>	407
Notes and Questions	419
<i>Massachusetts v. Environmental Protection Agency</i>	425
Notes and Questions	432

xvi	Contents
D. The Timing of Judicial Review	436
1. Pre-Enforcement Challenges: Ripeness and Finality Requirements	437
<i>Abbott Laboratories v. Gardner</i>	438
Notes	442
<i>Gardner v. Toilet Goods Assn.</i>	444
Notes and Questions	446
2. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies Prior to Seeking Judicial Review	453
a. Exhaustion Outside the APA	454
b. Exhaustion Under the APA	459
 PART 2 ADMINISTRATIVE FUNCTIONS	 463
 Chapter 4 Choice of Policymaking Instruments	 465
A. Legal Constraints on Choice of Policymaking Instruments	466
1. Due Process Constraints	466
<i>Londoner v. Denver</i>	467
<i>Bi-Metallic Investment Co. v. State Board of Equalization</i>	468
Notes and Questions	468
2. Statutory Constraints	469
B. Agency Authority and Discretion to Make Policy by Rule	472
<i>United States v. Storer Broadcasting Co.</i>	475
Notes and Questions	478
<i>National Petroleum Refiners Assn. v. Federal Trade Commission</i>	483
Notes and Questions	489
<i>Chamber of Commerce of the United States v. National Labor Relations Board</i>	491
Questions	492
<i>Heckler v. Campbell</i>	494
Notes and Questions	497
C. Agency Discretion to Make Policy by Order After Adjudication	498
<i>SEC v. Chenery Corp.</i>	499
<i>Excelsior Underwear, Inc.</i>	501
Notes and Questions	504
<i>National Labor Relations Board v. Wyman-Gordon Co.</i>	504
Notes and Questions	511
<i>National Labor Relations Board v. Bell Aerospace Co.</i>	514
Notes and Questions	515

Contents	xvii
D. Agency Discretion to Make Policy by Manual or Informal Guidance	516
<i>Morton v. Ruiz</i>	516
Notes and Questions	521
Note on Policymaking via Guidance Documents and the Like	522
Note on Agencies' Obligation to Follow Their Own Procedural Rules	524
 Chapter 5 Rulemaking	 529
A. Formal and Informal Models of Rulemaking Under the Administrative Procedure Act	529
United States v. Allegheny-Ludlum Steel Corp.	530
United States v. Florida East Coast Ry. Co.	531
B. Rulemaking Procedure Under APA §553 and Related Statutes	532
1. Notice	533
<i>Chocolate Manufacturers Assn. v. Block</i>	534
Notes and Questions	539
Long Island Care at Home, Ltd. v. Coke	539
2. Explanation of the Decision: The Concise General Statement	541
United States v. Nova Scotia Food Prods. Corp.	541
Notes and Questions	543
3. Protecting the Integrity of the Rulemaking "Record": Ex Parte Contacts, Political Influence, and Prejudgment	545
a. Exclusivity of the Rulemaking Record and Ex Parte Contacts	545
<i>Home Box Office v. Federal Communications Commission</i>	548
Notes and Questions	552
b. Political Influence on Administrative Policy, Late Comments, and Ex Parte Contacts	554
<i>Sierra Club v. Costle</i>	557
Notes and Questions	564
District of Columbia Federation of Civic Assns. v. Volpe	565
c. Impartiality of the Rulemaker	567
<i>Association of National Advertisers, Inc. v. Federal Trade Commission</i>	573
Notes and Questions	579
4. Embellishing the APA Model of Informal Rulemaking Through "Hybrid" Procedures	581
a. Statutory Hybrids	581
b. Judicially Fashioned Hybrids	582
<i>Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. v. Nuclear Regulatory Commission</i>	585

<i>Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	589
Notes and Questions	593
American Radio Relay League, Inc. v. Federal Communications Commission	595
5. Exemptions from APA §553	598
<i>National Family Planning & Reproductive Health Assn., Inc. v. Sullivan</i>	599
Notes and Questions	604
<i>Hocor v. United States Department of Agriculture</i>	605
Notes and Questions	609
<i>Texas v. United States</i>	610
Notes and Questions	612
Lincoln v. Vigil	613
Notes and Questions	614
6. Agency Authority to Stay Promulgated Rules	620
<i>Natural Resources Defense Council v. National Highway Traffic Safety Administration</i>	621
Notes and Questions	623
7. Alternative Rulemaking Models	625
a. Negotiated Rulemaking	625
Notes and Questions	627
<i>USA Group Loan Services, Inc. v. Riley</i>	628
Notes and Questions	630
b. Alternatives to Negotiated Rulemaking	631
C. Strengthening the Analytic Basis of Policymaking	634
1. Cost-Benefit Analysis	634
American Textile Manufacturers Institute v. Donovan	639
Notes and Questions	640
<i>Whitman v. American Trucking Associations, Inc.</i>	641
Notes and Questions	646
<i>Entergy Corp. v. Riverkeeper, Inc.</i>	646
Notes and Questions	652
2. Presidential Oversight of Rulemaking	654
Notes and Questions	659
3. Impact Statements: The Case of the National Environmental Policy Act	662
Calvert Cliffs Coordinating Committee v. Atomic Energy Commission	664
Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. Natural Resources Defense Council	665

Contents	xix
Notes and Questions	666
<i>Robertson v. Methow Valley Citizens Council</i>	667
Notes and Questions	669
Chapter 6 Adjudication	673
A. Agency Constitutional Authority to Adjudicate	674
<i>Commodity Futures Trading Commission v. Schor</i>	677
Notes and Questions	684
Stern v. Marshall	684
Notes and Questions	686
B. Due Process Hearing Rights	689
1. The Interests Protected by Due Process	690
<i>Goldberg v. Kelly</i>	693
Notes and Questions	701
<i>Board of Regents v. Roth</i>	703
Notes and Questions	708
Arnett v. Kennedy	711
Bishop v. Wood	713
Cleveland Board of Education v. Loudermill	715
Notes and Questions	716
2. The Requirements of Due Process	721
a. The <i>Eldridge</i> Calculus	722
<i>Mathews v. Eldridge</i>	723
Notes and Questions	728
b. The Right to a Neutral Decisionmaker: Protection Against Bias and Self-Interest	732
Tumey v. Ohio	732
Ward v. Village of Monroeville	733
Notes and Questions	734
<i>Gibson v. Berryhill</i>	735
Notes and Questions	738
c. The Right to a Neutral Decisionmaker: Protection Against Prejudgment	739
<i>Cinderella Career and Finishing Schools, Inc. v. Federal Trade Commission</i>	740
Notes and Questions	743
Withrow v. Larkin	745
d. Combination of Functions Under the APA	746

C. Statutory Hearing Requirements	748
1. “Triggering” the APA’s Formal Adjudication Requirements	749
<i>Seacoast Anti-Pollution League v. Costle</i>	750
Notes and Questions	752
<i>Dominion Energy Brayton Point, LLC v. Johnson</i>	753
Notes and Questions	754
2. Procedural Issues in Formal Adjudication	755
a. Discovery and Cross-Examination	755
<i>Citizens Awareness Network, Inc. v. United States</i>	755
Notes and Questions	759
b. Official Notice	761
<i>Southern California Edison Co. v. Federal Energy</i> <i>Regulatory Commission</i>	761
Notes and Questions	763
c. Statement of Findings	766
<i>Armstrong v. Commodity Futures Trading Commission</i>	766
Notes and Questions	768
d. Intervention	769
<i>Envirocare of Utah, Inc. v. Nuclear Regulatory Commission</i>	769
Notes and Questions	773
e. Restrictions on Ex Parte Communications in Adjudication	773
<i>Portland Audubon Society v. Endangered Species Committee</i>	775
Notes and Questions	780
3. Appointment and Oversight of Administrative Hearing Officers and ALJ Impartiality: Achieving Consistency in a Regime of Mass Administrative Justice	782
<i>Association of Administrative Law Judges v. Heckler</i>	785
Notes and Questions	787
4. Informal Adjudication	792
<i>Pension Benefit Guaranty Corp. v. LTV Corp.</i>	793
Notes and Questions	794
Chapter 7 Enforcement and Liability	797
A. Government Enforcement	797
1. Monitoring and Investigation	799
a. Physical Inspections	800
<i>Marshall v. Barlow’s, Inc.</i>	803
Notes and Questions	810

Contents	xxi
b. Compulsory Production of Information	812
c. Record-Keeping Requirements	815
<i>Ruckelshaus v. Monsanto Co.</i>	817
Notes and Questions	825
2. Prosecution and Selective Enforcement	825
a. Prosecutorial Incentives	825
b. Remedies for Selective Enforcement	827
<i>Moog Industries, Inc. v. Federal Trade Commission</i>	829
<i>Federal Trade Commission v. Universal-Rundle Corp.</i>	830
Notes and Questions	833
c. Agency Enforcement Orders	835
<i>General Electric Co. v. Jackson</i>	836
Notes and Questions	841
B. Private Litigation and Regulatory Enforcement	844
1. Citizen Suits to Compel Public Enforcement	845
<i>Bennett v. Spear</i>	845
Notes and Questions	849
<i>Scott v. City of Hammond</i>	850
2. Implied Private Rights of Action to Enforce Public Laws	851
a. Expansion: Policy-Based Justifications for Implying Private Rights of Action	852
<i>J.I. Case Co. v. Borak</i>	853
Notes and Questions	853
b. Retrenchment: Reading Legislative Intent to Exclude Private Rights of Action	855
<i>Cort v. Ash</i>	855
Notes and Questions	859
<i>Cannon v. University of Chicago</i>	860
<i>Karahalios v. National Federation of Federal Employees, Local 1263</i>	862
Notes and Questions	864
3. Public-Law Preclusion of Existing Private Remedies: Primary Jurisdiction and Pre-emption	865
a. Primary Jurisdiction	866
b. Regulatory Pre-emption	868
<i>Geier v. American Honda Motor Co., Inc.</i>	871
Notes and Questions	878
C. Liability of Public Entities and Officers	884
1. Suits Against Sovereigns: Sovereign Immunity and the Federal Tort Claims Act	884

United States v. S.A. Empresa de Viação Aérea Rio-Grandense (VARIG Airlines)	887
<i>Berkovitz v. United States</i>	888
Notes and Questions	893
United States v. Gaubert	894
Notes and Questions	895
2. Suits Against Individual Government Officers	898
Chapter 8 Licensing	901
A. Occupational Licensing	902
1. Due Process, Equal Protection, and the Problem of Self-Interest	902
<i>Gibson v. Berryhill</i>	905
Friedman v. Rogers	905
Notes and Questions	906
2. Anticompetitive Behavior and Antitrust Restraints	907
<i>North Carolina State Board of Dental Examiners v. Federal Trade Commission</i>	908
Notes and Questions	914
3. Other Constraints on Occupational Licensing	914
B. Business Licensing	916
1. Entry Regulation: The Case of Broadcasting	916
a. Comparative Hearing Procedure	917
<i>Ashbacker Radio Corp. v. Federal Communications Commission</i>	917
Notes and Questions	921
b. Licensing Standards	922
c. License Removal	924
d. Licensee Supervision: The Problem of “Jawboning”	925
Writers Guild of America, West, Inc. v. American Broadcasting Cos.	925
Notes and Questions	927
e. “The Regulatory Ratchet”: Expansion of Regulatory Jurisdiction to Ancillary Activities	928
<i>United States v. Southwestern Cable Co.</i>	929
Notes and Questions	932
2. Rate Regulation: The Case of Telephone	936
<i>MCI Telecommunications Corp. v. American Telephone & Telegraph Co.</i>	938
Notes and Questions	942

Contents	xxiii	
PART 3	INDIRECT CONTROLS	945
Chapter 9	Public Access	947
A.	Public Access to Government Records	947
1.	Agency Records Under the Freedom of Information Act	949
	<i>Kissinger v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press</i>	949
	Notes and Questions	957
2.	Exemptions from FOIA’s Disclosure Requirement	959
a.	Personnel Matters	960
	<i>Milner v. Department of the Navy</i>	960
	Notes and Questions	965
b.	Deliberation	965
	<i>United States Fish and Wildlife Service v. Sierra Club, Inc.</i>	965
	Notes and Questions	970
c.	Law Enforcement	975
	<i>Federal Bureau of Investigation v. Abramson</i>	975
	Notes and Questions	980
d.	Privacy	983
	<i>Department of Justice v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press</i>	983
	Notes and Questions	988
B.	Public Access to Administrative Deliberations	991
1.	“Meetings of an Agency”	992
	<i>Federal Communications Commission v. ITT</i>	
	<i>World Communications, Inc.</i>	993
	Notes and Questions	995
2.	Exemptions	996
	<i>Common Cause v. Nuclear Regulatory Commission</i>	996
	Notes and Questions	1002
APPENDIX		1007
The Constitution of the United States of America (Selected Provisions)		1007
The Administrative Procedure Act and Related Provisions		1016
Table of Cases		1033
Table of Secondary Authorities		1049
Index		1061