
CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxv</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxix</i>
<i>Special Notice</i>	<i>xxxiii</i>

INTRODUCTION	1
A. The Career of a Criminal Case	1
1. Procedure Before Trial	2
Donald Dripps, Criminal Justice Process	2
2. Substantive Legal Issues Before Trial	5
3. Procedure at Trial	6
4. Substantive Legal Issues on Appeal	8
B. Sources of Criminal Law	9
1. Statutes	9
2. Precedent	10
3. Constitutions	12
C. The Analysis of Criminal Liability	13
1. The Purpose of Analysis	13
2. The Model Penal Code Scheme	14
3. The German Scheme	15
D. Burdens of Proof and Due Process	15

I

JUST PUNISHMENT 19

New York Penal Law (Mckinney 2020)	25
------------------------------------	----

	1	
	<hr/>	
	THE PURPOSES AND LIMITS OF PUNISHMENT	27
A.	An Introductory Problem	27
	Notes and Questions	28
B.	Utilitarianism and Retributivism	29
	John Braithwaite & Philip Pettit, Not Just Deserts: A Republican Theory of Criminal Justice	30
C.	Utilitarian Punishment	32
	1. The Utility Principle as a Limit on Punishment	32
	Jeremy Bentham, The Theory of Legislation	32
	2. Deterrence	33
	Jeremy Bentham, The Theory of Legislation	33
	James Q. Wilson, Thinking About Crime	34
	Anthony N. Doob & Cheryl Marie Webster, Sentence Severity and Crime: Accepting the Null Hypothesis	36
	Louis Seidman, Soldiers, Martyrs, and Criminal Law: Utilitarianism and the Problem of Crime Control	37
	Randolph Roth, American Homicide	38
	Notes and Questions	39
	3. Rehabilitation	42
	David Rothman, The Discovery of the Asylum	42
	Edward L. Rubin, The Inevitability of Rehabilitation	45
	Francis A. Allen, Criminal Justice, Legal Values, and the Rehabilitative Ideal	45
	Elliot Currie, Confronting Crime: An American Challenge	46
	Michael Tonry, Malign Neglect: Race, Crime, and Punishment in America	47
	Notes and Questions	47
	4. Incapacitation	48
	James Q. Wilson, Thinking About Crime	48
	Alfred Blumstein & Jacqueline Cohen, Characterizing Criminal Careers	51
	Franklin E. Zimring & Gordon Hawkins, Incapacitation: Penal Confinement and the Restraint of Crime	51
	Markus Dirk Dubber, Recidivist Statutes as Arational Punishment	52
	Notes and Questions	53
D.	Retribution	56
	1. Retribution as a Limit on Punishment	56
	H.J. McCloskey, A Non-Utilitarian Approach to Punishment	56
	John Rawls, Two Concepts of Rules	57
	Guyora Binder & Nicholas J. Smith, Framed: Utilitarianism and Punishment of the Innocent	58
	Herbert Packer, The Limits of the Criminal Sanction	58
	Alan H. Goldman, The Paradox of Punishment	59
	David Dolinko, Three Mistakes of Retributivism	60
	Michael L. Corrado, The Abolition of Punishment	60
	<i>Kansas v. Hendricks</i>	61

Notes and Questions	63
2. Retribution as an Affirmative Justification for Punishment	65
a. The Appeal to Intuition	65
Michael Moore, Law and Psychiatry	65
Notes and Questions	66
b. The Argument from Social Contract	66
Herbert Morris, On Guilt and Innocence	66
Jeffrie Murphy, Marxism and Retribution	67
Notes and Questions	68
c. The Expressive Argument	69
Joel Feinberg, Doing and Deserving	69
Jean Hampton, Punishment as Defeat	70
Notes and Questions	70
E. Alternatives to Mass Incarceration	70
John Braithwaite, Crime, Shame, and Reintegration	71
Angela Y. Davis, Are Prisons Obsolete?	72
Notes and Questions	75
Snapshot Review	75
F. Proportionality	75
<i>Graham v. Florida</i>	76
Notes and Questions	81
<i>Kennedy v. Louisiana</i>	84
Notes and Questions	87
<i>Ewing v. California</i>	88
Notes and Questions	90
<i>Miller v. Alabama</i>	93
Notes and Questions	94
G. Modern Guidelines Sentencing	96
Kevin Reitz, Sentencing: Guidelines	98
1. Due Process, the Jury, and Sentencing Designs	100
<i>Apprendi v. New Jersey</i>	102
Notes and Questions	104
2. The <i>Blakely-Booker</i> Revolution in Sentencing	105
Notes and Questions	109
Snapshot Review	111

II

THE ELEMENTS OF THE CRIMINAL OFFENSE 113

2

THE CRIMINAL ACT 115

A. The Need for an Actus Reus	116
<i>Proctor v. State</i>	116
Notes and Questions	119
B. Omissions	121
<i>Jones v. United States</i>	121

Notes and Questions	124
C. Possession	127
<i>United States v. Maldonado</i>	128
Notes and Questions	130
<i>State v. Barger</i>	134
Notes and Questions	137
D. The Requirement of Harm	139
<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	140
Notes and Questions	145
E. The Requirement of Voluntariness	147
<i>People v. Newton</i>	147
Notes and Questions	148
<i>Martin v. State</i>	149
Notes and Questions	149
<i>People v. Grant</i>	150
Notes and Questions	153
F. The Prohibition of “Status” Crimes	155
<i>Robinson v. California</i>	155
Notes and Questions	157
<i>Johnson v. State</i>	162
Notes and Questions	165
G. Legality	167
<i>Keeler v. Superior Court</i>	167
Notes and Questions	168
<i>United States v. Hudson and Goodwin</i>	170
Notes and Questions	171
<i>Rogers v. Tennessee</i>	174
Notes and Questions	178
H. Specificity	179
<i>Chicago v. Morales</i>	179
Notes and Questions	183
Snapshot Review	191

3

 THE GUILTY MIND

195

A. The Requirement of a Guilty Mind	198
<i>People v. Dillard</i>	198
Notes and Questions	200
<i>United States v. Wulff</i>	206
Notes and Questions	207
<i>Lambert v. California</i>	213
Notes and Questions	215
Snapshot Review	216
B. Categories of Culpability	217
<i>Regina v. Faulkner</i>	217
Notes and Questions	219
Model Penal Code	223

Notes and Questions	225
Snapshot Review	232
C. Mistake and Mens Rea Default Rules	232
<i>Regina v. Prince</i>	232
Notes and Questions	236
<i>People v. Ryan</i>	238
Notes and Questions	241
<i>Elonis v. United States</i>	244
Notes and Questions	247
Snapshot Review	248
D. “Mistake of Law”	250
1. Introduction to Mistake of Law	250
2. Mistake of Law and Mens Rea	252
<i>People v. Bray</i>	252
Notes and Questions	254
<i>United States v. Baker</i>	256
Notes and Questions	257
<i>Cheek v. United States</i>	258
Notes and Questions	262
3. Mistake of Law as an Excuse	263
<i>Commonwealth v. Twitchell</i>	263
Notes and Questions	266
E. Capacity for Mens Rea	268
<i>Hendershott v. People</i>	268
Notes and Questions	271
<i>State v. Cameron</i>	272
Notes and Questions	275
<i>Montana v. Egelhoff</i>	276
Notes and Questions	277
Snapshot Review	278
4	
CAUSATION	281
A. “But-For” Causation	283
<i>Regina v. Martin Dyos</i>	283
Notes and Questions	285
<i>R. v. Benge</i>	287
Notes and Questions	289
B. Violent Acts	291
<i>Hubbard v. Commonwealth</i>	291
Notes and Questions	293
C. Proximate Cause: Foreseeability and Related Limitations	295
<i>Commonwealth v. Rhoades</i>	295
Notes and Questions	296
Snapshot Review	296
D. Intervening Causes	300
<i>Commonwealth v. Root</i>	300

Notes and Questions	303
<i>United States v. Hamilton</i>	306
Notes and Questions	308
<i>Stephenson v. State</i>	310
Notes and Questions	313
<i>People v. Kevoorkian</i>	315
Notes and Questions	318
E. Causation by Omission: Duties	320
<i>Commonwealth v. Levesque</i>	321
Notes and Questions	323
Snapshot Review	327

III

HOMICIDE OFFENSES

331

Kan. Stat. Ann. (West 2020)	332
Ala. Code (West 2020)	334
Cal. Penal Code (West 2020)	335
Pa. Cons. Stat. Ann. Tit. 18 (West 2020)	338
Illinois Compiled Statutes Ann. (West 2020)	339
Minnesota Statutes Ann. (West 2020)	341
Model Penal Code (1962 Official Draft, 2012 Edition)	342
New York Penal Code (McKinney 2020)	343

5

INTENTIONAL HOMICIDE

349

A. Intentional Murder (Second Degree)	349
<i>Francis v. Franklin</i>	349
Notes and Questions	352
B. Premeditated Murder (First Degree)	357
<i>United States v. Watson</i>	357
Notes and Questions	361
C. Voluntary Manslaughter	368
1. The Theory of Mitigation	368
<i>People v. Walker</i>	368
Notes and Questions	370
2. “Cooling Time”	375
<i>Ex Parte Fraley</i>	375
Notes and Questions	376
3. Adultery as “Adequate Provocation”	379
<i>Rowland v. State</i>	379
Notes and Questions	381
Snapshot Review	386

4.	Provocation Under Reform Rules	387
	<i>People v. Berry</i>	387
	Notes and Questions	390
5.	Cultural Norms and the Reasonable Person	396
	<i>People v. Wu</i>	396
	Notes and Questions	405
	Snapshot Review	411
	6	
<hr/>		
	UNINTENTIONAL HOMICIDE	413
A.	Involuntary Manslaughter: Negligent and Reckless Homicide	413
	<i>Commonwealth v. Welansky</i>	413
	Notes and Questions	417
	<i>State v. Williams</i>	419
	Notes and Questions	422
B.	Reckless Murder	426
	<i>Mayer v. The People</i>	426
	Notes and Questions	428
C.	Homicide in the Course of Another Crime	436
1.	Felony Murder: An Introduction	436
	<i>State v. Martin</i>	436
	Notes and Questions	442
	<i>Commonwealth v. Brown</i>	451
	Notes and Questions	454
2.	Attribution of Death to the Felony	455
a.	Felony-Murder Liability of Accomplices	455
	Notes and Questions	457
b.	Felony-Murder Liability for Defensive Killings	459
	<i>People v. Washington</i>	460
	Notes and Questions	462
	<i>People v. Hickman</i>	464
	Notes and Questions	466
c.	Spatial, Temporal, and Purposive Scope of the Felony	467
3.	The Independent Felonious Purpose Limitation	468
	<i>State v. Shock</i>	468
	Notes and Questions	470
4.	Two Variants of Felony Murder	473
a.	Misdemeanor Manslaughter	473
b.	Death-Aggravated Felonies	474
	Snapshot Review	474

7

CAPITAL MURDER AND THE DEATH PENALTY	477
A. A Historical and Constitutional Summary	477
B. The New Capital Statutes	486
1. The Structure of “Guided Discretion”: An Exemplary Case	486
<i>Olsen v. State</i>	486
Notes and Questions	496
2. Mitigating Circumstances	501
3. Weighing the Circumstances	505
C. Categorical Limits on the Death Penalty	508
1. The Mens Rea Limit: A Reprise on Felony Murder	510
<i>Tison v. Arizona</i>	510
Notes and Questions	515
2. Victim/Race Discrimination and the Eighth Amendment	516
<i>McCleskey v. Kemp</i>	516
Notes and Questions	521
Snapshot Review	526

IV

JUSTIFICATION AND EXCUSE	527
A. Distinguishing Justification and Excuse	527
B. Justification, Excuse, and the Purposes of Punishment	529
C. Combining Justification and Excuse	532

8

DEFENSIVE FORCE, NECESSITY, AND DURESS	535
A. Defensive Force	535
1. Elements and Rationales	535
<i>People v. La Voie</i>	535
Notes and Questions	537
<i>People v. Gleghorn</i>	539
Notes and Questions	542
2. The Reasonable Self-Defender: The Case of the Battered Spouse	543
<i>State v. Leidholm</i>	543
Notes and Questions	551
3. Reprise on the Reasonable Self-Defender	563
<i>People v. Goetz</i>	563
Notes and Questions	567
4. Defensive Force to Protect Property; Defense of Habitation	568
<i>People v. Ceballos</i>	570
Notes and Questions	573
5. Defensive Force and Law Enforcement	575
<i>Tennessee v. Garner</i>	579

Notes and Questions	582
B. Choice of Evils—Necessity	589
1. The Moral Issue	589
<i>The Queen v. Dudley & Stephens</i>	589
Notes and Questions	593
2. Escape from Intolerable Prison Conditions	600
<i>People v. Unger</i>	600
Notes and Questions	603
3. “Political” Necessity	604
<i>State v. Warshow</i>	604
Notes and Questions	607
C. Duress	609
<i>State v. Crawford</i>	610
Notes and Questions	616
<i>State v. Hunter</i>	620
Notes and Questions	623
Snapshot Review	627

9

MENTAL ILLNESS AS A DEFENSE 631

A. Introduction	631
B. The <i>M’Naghten</i> Rule and Cognition	633
<i>People v. Serravo</i>	633
Notes and Questions	643
C. Cognition and Volition: The Road from <i>M’Naghten</i> and Back	651
<i>Smith v. State</i>	654
Notes and Questions	658
D. Reprise: Reassessing the Insanity Defense	667
E. “Quasi-Insanity” Defenses	671
1. Alcohol and Other Drugs	671
2. Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder	673
3. Postpartum Psychosis	677
4. “Multiple Personality” Disorder	677
5. The Antisocial Personality	680
Snapshot Review	681

V

ATTRIBUTION OF CRIMINALITY 683

10

ATTEMPT 685

A. The Punishment for Attempt	685
1. Why Punish Attempt?	685
2. The Emergence of Attempt Liability	686

George Fletcher, Rethinking Criminal Law	686
3. The Grading of Attempt	687
Model Penal Code	687
B. The Mens Rea for Attempt	689
<i>State v. Lyerla</i>	689
Notes and Questions	692
<i>People v. Bland</i>	696
Notes and Questions	702
C. The Actus Reus of Attempt	703
1. Preparation vs. Attempt	703
<i>People v. Murray</i>	703
Notes and Questions	703
<i>McQuirter v. State</i>	706
Notes and Questions	708
<i>People v. Rizzo</i>	708
Notes and Questions	711
Snapshot Review	712
2. Abandonment	715
<i>People v. Staples</i>	715
Notes and Questions	717
3. Solicitation	720
<i>People v. Lubow</i>	720
Notes and Questions	722
D. Impossibility	725
<i>Booth v. State</i>	725
Notes and Questions	731
<i>People v. Thousand</i>	739
Notes and Questions	741
<i>People v. Dlugash</i>	743
Notes and Questions	746
Snapshot Review	747
11	
<hr/>	
COMPLICITY	749
A. The Accessorial Act	752
<i>State v. Ochoa</i>	752
Notes and Questions	757
<i>State v. Tally</i>	764
Notes and Questions	773
<i>State v. Formella</i>	777
Notes and Questions	779
B. Mens Rea of Complicity	780
1. Intent to Aid or Encourage	782
<i>People v. Beeman</i>	782
Notes and Questions	785
2. The Mental Element of the Offense	789
<i>Wilson v. People</i>	789

Notes and Questions	792
3. Combined Standards and Unintended Harm	793
<i>State v. Anthony</i>	793
Notes and Questions	796
4. Culpability for Secondary Crimes	799
<i>Rosemond v. United States</i>	799
Notes and Questions	803
<i>People v. Kessler</i>	805
Notes and Questions	806
C. Relations of Parties	807
Snapshot Review	811
D. Criminal Liability of Corporations	813
1. Respondeat Superior and the Premises of Corporate Liability	814
<i>State v. Christy Pontiac-GMC, Inc.</i>	814
Notes and Questions	816
<i>United States v. Hilton Hotels Corp.</i>	821
Notes and Questions	822
2. The MPC and the “Corporate Mind”	823
Notes and Questions	824
Snapshot Review	826
12	
<hr/>	
CONSPIRACY	827
A. The Nature of Conspiracy	828
<i>State v. Verive</i>	828
Notes and Questions	830
B. The Agreement	835
1. Proof of Formation	835
<i>Griffin v. State</i>	835
Notes and Questions	836
2. Termination of the Agreement	840
<i>United States v. Recio</i>	840
Notes and Questions	842
C. The Mens Rea of Conspiracy	845
<i>People v. Lauria</i>	845
Notes and Questions	851
D. Special Mens Rea Problems of Conspiracy	854
E. The Incidents of Conspiracy	857
<i>United States v. Diaz</i>	857
Notes and Questions	859
F. The Parties to and Objects of Conspiracy	863
1. The Problem of Disparate Liability	863
a. Bilateral and Unilateral Conspiracies	863
2. The Scope of the Conspiracy	866
a. Single vs. Multiple Conspiracies	866
b. Chains, Wheels, Etc.	870
<i>United States v. Caldwell</i>	874

Notes and Questions	876
G. The RICO Statute and the Frontier of Conspiracy	877
1. The Statute	877
2. Elements of Racketeering	879
3. RICO Conspiracies	881
Snapshot Review	884

VI

ADDITIONAL OFFENSES 889

13

RAPE 891

A. Introduction	891
1. Defining Rape	891
2. Some Facts About Rape in the United States	894
3. The Evolution of Rape Rules	896
B. The Requirement of “Utmost Resistance”	898
<i>Brown v. State</i>	899
Notes and Questions	900
C. “Reasonable” or “Earnest” Resistance	901
<i>People v. Dorsey</i>	902
Notes and Questions	905
D. Force	907
<i>People v. Barnes</i>	907
Notes and Questions	913
E. Nonconsent	919
<i>State v. Smith</i>	919
Notes and Questions	922
F. Lack of Affirmative Expression of Consent	927
In the Interest of M.T.S.	927
Notes and Questions	933
G. Mens Rea	939
<i>Commonwealth v. Lopez</i>	939
Notes and Questions	943
H. Incapacity to Consent	948
<i>People v. Hernandez</i>	948
Notes and Questions	950
<i>State v. Jones</i>	952
Notes and Questions	955
I. Rape by Extortion	958
<i>Commonwealth v. Mlinarich</i>	958
Notes and Questions	960
J. Rape by Fraud	962
<i>Boro v. People</i>	962
Notes and Questions	964

Contents	xxiii
K. Evidentiary Reforms	967
Snapshot Review	977
14	
<hr/>	
THEFT OFFENSES	979
A. Theft	979
1. The Meaning of Theft	979
<i>Commonwealth v. Mitchneck</i>	979
Notes and Questions	980
2. The Development of Theft Offenses	980
<i>The Case of the Carrier Who Broke Bulk Anon v.</i>	
<i>the Sheriff of London</i>	982
<i>Rex v. Chisser</i>	983
<i>The King v. Pear</i>	983
Notes and Questions	984
B. Fraud	991
1. False Pretenses	991
<i>People v. Sattlekau</i>	991
Notes and Questions	995
2. Scheme to Defraud in Federal Law	995
<i>Durland v. United States</i>	996
Notes and Questions	998
3. Bank Fraud	1002
<i>United States v. Phillips</i>	1003
Notes and Questions	1007
C. Extortion	1009
<i>People v. Dioguardi</i>	1009
Notes and Questions	1013
D. Robbery	1021
<i>Lear v. State</i>	1021
Notes and Questions	1022
E. Burglary	1026
<i>State v. Colvin</i>	1026
Notes and Questions	1029
Snapshot Review	1035

15

PERJURY, FALSE STATEMENTS, AND
OBSTRUCTION OF JUSTICE 1037

A. Perjury	1037
<i>Bronston v. United States</i>	1038
Notes and Questions	1042

Stuart Green, Lying, Misleading, and Falsely Denying: How Moral Concepts Inform the Law of Perjury, Fraud, and False Statements	1048
Notes and Questions	1053
B. False Statements	1053
<i>United States v. Moore</i>	1054
Notes and Questions	1056
<i>Brogan v. United States</i>	1057
Notes and Questions	1059
C. Obstruction of Justice	1060
1. The Omnibus Provision — §1503	1060
<i>United States v. Aguilar</i>	1060
Notes and Questions	1064
<i>United States v. Cueto</i>	1068
Notes and Questions	1074
2. Section 1512 and the <i>Arthur Andersen</i> Case	1077
<i>Arthur Andersen LLP v. United States</i>	1077
Notes and Questions	1080
Snapshot Review	1092
Appendix A	
<hr/>	
A NOTE ON THE MODEL PENAL CODE	1095
Appendix B	
<hr/>	
THE MODEL PENAL CODE	1099
<i>Table of Cases</i>	1151
<i>Table of Model Penal Code Sections</i>	1161
<i>Index</i>	1163