

*Preface* xxvii  
*Acknowledgments* xxix  
*Using the Videos* xxxi

## 1 RELEVANCE 1

**A. Introduction to Evidence Law 1**

**B. Introduction to Relevance 2**  
 Topic Overview 2  
 Chapter Organization 3  
 Basic Structure for Analysis 3

**C. Relevance and Admissibility, Defined and Distinguished 4**  
 Rule 401. Test for Relevant Evidence 4  
 Rule 402. General Admissibility of Relevant Evidence 4  
 Rule 403. Excluding Relevant Evidence for Prejudice, Confusion,  
 Waste of Time, or Other Reasons 5  
*Supreme Pork, Inc. v. Master Blaster, Inc.* 6  
 Notes to *Supreme Pork, Inc. v. Master Blaster, Inc.* 10

**D. Relevance and Substantive Legal Theory 12**  
*Kaechele v. Kenyon Oil Company, Inc.* 12  
 Notes to *Kaechele v. Kenyon Oil Company, Inc.* 15

**E. Recurring Relevance Patterns—Flight, Safety Record,  
 and Destruction of Evidence 16**  
*United States v. Dillon* 17  
 Notes to *United States v. Dillon* 19  
*Lovick v. Wil-Rich* 20  
 Notes to *Lovick v. Wil-Rich* 23  
*Spino v. John S. Tilley Ladder Co.* 23  
 Notes to *Spino v. John S. Tilley Ladder Co.* 27  
*Aloi v. Union Pacific Railroad Corp.* 27  
 Notes to *Aloi v. Union Pacific Railroad Corp.* 31

**F. Conditional Relevance 32**

Rule 104. Preliminary Questions 32

*Cox v. State* 33Notes to *Cox v. State* 35**G. Discretion to Exclude Relevant Evidence 36***Old Chief v. United States* 37Notes to *Old Chief v. United States* 43**H. Summary 43****2 SOCIAL POLICY RELEVANCY RULES 45****A. Introduction 45****Topic Overview 45****Chapter Organization 45****B. Special Treatment for Subsequent Remedial Measures 46**

Rule 407. Subsequent Remedial Measures 46

*Cyr v. J.I. Case Co.* 47Notes to *Cyr v. J.I. Case Co.* 50*Bethel v. Peters* 52Notes to *Bethel v. Peters* 54**C. “Feasibility” Rationale for Admitting Subsequent Remedial Measures 55***Flaminio v. Honda Motor Co., Ltd.* 56*Kenny v. Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority* 57Notes to *Flaminio v. Honda Motor Co., Ltd.* and *Kenny**v. Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority* 58**D. Special Treatment for Compromises and Settlements 61**

Rule 408. Compromise Offers and Negotiations 61

*Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Londagin* 62Notes to *Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Londagin* 64**E. Bias Admission of Settlement Evidence 65***Quirion v. Forcier* 66Notes to *Quirion v. Forcier* 69**F. Postinjury Payments, Insurance, and Pleas 70**

Rule 409. Offers to Pay Medical and Similar Expenses 70

Rule 410. Pleas, Plea Discussions, and Related Statements 70

Rule 411. Liability Insurance 71

**G. Summary 71**

### **3 PROOF OF CHARACTER 73**

#### **A. Introduction 73**

Topic Overview 73

Chapter Organization 74

Basic Structure for Analysis 75

#### **B. Basic Rule Against Propensity Evidence 75**

Rule 404. Character Evidence; Crimes or Other Acts 76

*Boyd v. United States* 76

Notes to *Boyd v. United States* 78

*John A. Russell Corp. v. Bohlig* 79

Notes to *John A. Russell Corp. v. Bohlig* 81

Rule 405. Methods of Proving Character 82

#### **C. Permitted Propensity Inferences 83**

Rule 404. Character Evidence; Crimes or Other Acts 83

*City of Kennewick v. Day* 84

Notes to *City of Kennewick v. Day* 86

*State v. Gowan* 88

Notes to *State v. Gowan* 91

#### **D. Permitted Propensity Inferences About the Victim 92**

Rule 404. Character Evidence; Crimes or Other Acts 92

*Commonwealth v. Adjutant* 93

Notes to *Commonwealth v. Adjutant* 96

*United States v. Taken Alive* 97

Notes to *United States v. Taken Alive* 100

#### **E. Nonpropensity Use of Evidence That May Also Show Propensity 101**

Rule 404. Character Evidence; Crimes or Other Acts 101

*State v. Foxhoven* 102

Notes to *State v. Foxhoven* 105

*United States v. Queen* 107

Notes to *United States v. Queen* 111

*State v. Winebarger* 112

Notes to *State v. Winebarger* 115

*Leyva v. State* 116

Notes to *Leyva v. State* 118

*State v. Willett* 119

Notes to *State v. Willett* 122

#### **F. Summary 124**

## **4 HABIT AND SEXUAL CONDUCT IN THE CONTEXT OF CHARACTER 127**

### **A. Introduction 127**

**Topic Overview 127**

**Chapter Organization 128**

### **B. Habit 128**

Rule 406. Habit; Routine Practice 129

*State v. Brown* 130

Notes to *State v. Brown* 132

*Aikman v. Kanda* 132

Notes to *Aikman v. Kanda* 135

*Gamerdinger v. Schaefer* 136

Notes to *Gamerdinger v. Schaefer* 138

### **C. Alleged Victims of Sex Crimes 139**

Rule 412. Sex-Offense Cases: The Victim's Sexual Behavior  
or Predisposition 139

*Williams v. State* 141

Notes to *Williams v. State* 144

*State v. Jones* 145

Notes to *State v. Jones* 148

*Fells v. State* 149

Notes to *Fells v. State* 150

### **D. Defendants Accused of Sex Crimes 151**

Rule 413. Similar Crimes in Sexual-Assault Cases 152

*United States v. Hollow Horn* 152

Notes to *United States v. Hollow Horn* 156

### **E. Summary 157**

## **5 HEARSAY: FOUNDATIONS OF THE DOCTRINE 159**

### **A. Introduction 159**

**Topic Overview 159**

**Chapter Organization 160**

**Basic Structure for Analysis 160**

### **B. Statements That Are Relevant Only if What They Assert Is True (Hearsay) 162**

Rule 801. Definitions That Apply to This Article... 162

Rule 802. The Rule Against Hearsay 162

*Vincelette v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Co.* 163

---

Notes to <i>Vincelette v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Co.</i>	165
<i>State v. Patterson</i>	166
Notes to <i>State v. Patterson</i>	168
<i>Schaffer v. State</i>	169
Notes to <i>Schaffer v. State</i>	171
<i>Biegas v. Quickway Carriers, Inc.</i>	172
Notes to <i>Biegas v. Quickway Carriers, Inc.</i>	173
<b>C. Statements That Are Relevant Regardless of Whether Their Assertions Are True (Not Hearsay)</b>	<b>174</b>
<i>United States v. Tenerelli</i>	175
Notes to <i>United States v. Tenerelli</i>	177
<i>Moen v. Thomas</i>	177
Notes to <i>Moen v. Thomas</i>	180
<i>Kenyon v. State</i>	181
Note to <i>Kenyon v. State</i>	184
<i>Field v. Trigg County Hospital, Inc.</i>	185
Notes to <i>Field v. Trigg County Hospital, Inc.</i>	187
<i>Hickey v. Settlemier</i>	188
Notes to <i>Hickey v. Settlemier</i>	190
<i>State v. Dullard</i>	191
Note to <i>State v. Dullard</i>	196
<b>D. Summary</b>	<b>197</b>

## 6 OPPONENTS' STATEMENTS 199

<b>A. Introduction</b>	<b>199</b>
<b>Topic Overview</b>	<b>199</b>
Rule 801. Definitions That Apply to This Article; Exclusions from Hearsay	200
<b>Chapter Organization</b>	<b>200</b>
<b>B. Party's Own Statement</b>	<b>201</b>
<i>United States v. Sprick</i>	201
Notes to <i>United States v. Sprick</i>	203
<i>Shields v. Reddo</i>	203
Notes to <i>Shields v. Reddo</i>	204
<i>Application of City of New York re Lincoln Square Slum Clearance     Project</i>	205
Notes to <i>Lincoln Square Slum Clearance Project</i>	205
<b>C. Adoptive Statements</b>	<b>207</b>
<i>State v. Lambert</i>	207
Notes to <i>State v. Lambert</i>	209

*State v. Carlson* 209  
Notes to *State v. Carlson* 212

**D. Authorized Speakers 213**

*Barnett v. Hidalgo* 214  
Notes to *Barnett v. Hidalgo* 216

**E. Statements by a Party's Agent or Employee 216**

*B & K Rentals and Sales Co., Inc. v. Universal Leaf Tobacco Co.* 217  
Notes to *B & K Rentals and Sales Co., Inc. v. Universal Leaf Tobacco Co.* 220

**F. Coconspirators' Statements 221**

*State v. Cornell* 221  
Notes to *State v. Cornell* 224

**G. Summary 225**

**7 WITNESSES' OWN OUT-OF-COURT STATEMENTS 227**

**A. Introduction 227**

**Topic Overview 227**

Rule 801. Definitions That Apply to This Article; Exclusions from Hearsay 228

**Chapter Organization 228**

**B. Substantive and Nonsubstantive Use of a Witness's Prior Statements 229**

**C. Prior Inconsistent Statements by a Witness 229**

*United States v. Neadeau* 230  
*United States v. Gajo* 230  
Notes to *United States v. Neadeau* and *United States v. Gajo* 233  
*United States v. Day* 234  
Notes to *United States v. Day* 237

**D. Prior Consistent Statements by a Witness 238**

*Tome v. United States* 239  
Notes to *Tome v. United States* 243

**E. Statements Identifying a Person Made After Perceiving the Person 245**

*United States v. Lewis* 245  
Notes to *United States v. Lewis* 248  
*State v. Shaw* 249  
Notes to *State v. Shaw* 251

**F. “Subject to Cross-Examination” Requirement 252***Goforth v. State* 252Notes to *Goforth v. State* 255**G. Summary 256****8 HEARSAY EXCEPTIONS: SPONTANEOUS AND PERSONAL STATEMENTS 259****A. Introduction 259****Topic Overview 259****Chapter Organization 260****B. Present Sense Impression and Excited Utterance 260**

Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 260

*Fischer v. State* 261Notes to *Fischer v. State* 264*Pressey v. State* 266Notes to *Pressey v. State* 268*State v. Flores* 270Notes to *State v. Flores* 272*Graure v. United States* 272Notes to *United States v. Graure* 274**C. Statement of Then-Existing Mental, Emotional, or Physical Condition 275**

Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 275

*Stoll v. State* 276Notes to *Stoll v. State* 278*Schering Corp. v. Pfizer, Inc.* 280Notes to *Schering Corp. v. Pfizer, Inc.* 283*State v. James* 285Notes to *State v. James* 288*Camm v. State* 289Notes to *Camm v. State* 291**D. Statements for Purposes of Medical Diagnosis or Treatment 292**

Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 292

*Hansen v. Heath* 293Notes to *Hansen v. Heath* 295*Oldman v. State* 296Notes to *Oldman v. State* 299

*Colvard v. Commonwealth* 301  
Notes to *Colvard v. Commonwealth* 304

**E. Summary 306**

**9 HEARSAY EXCEPTIONS: RECORDED STATEMENTS 309**

**A. Introduction 309**

**Topic Overview 309**  
**Chapter Organization 310**

**B. Recorded Recollection (and Present Recollection Refreshed) 310**

1. Recorded Recollection 310  
Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 311  
*United States v. Jones* 311  
Notes to *United States v. Jones* 313  
*State v. Taylor* 314  
Notes to *State v. Taylor* 317  
*United States v. Dazey* 318  
Notes to *United States v. Dazey* 320
2. Refreshing Present Recollection 321  
Rule 612. Writing Used to Refresh a Witness’s Memory 322  
*Germain v. State* 322  
Notes to *Germain v. State* 326  
*Rush v. Illinois-Central Railroad Co.* 326  
Notes to *Rush v. Illinois-Central Railroad Co.* 330  
Rule 611. Mode and Order of Examining Witnesses and Presenting Evidence 330

**C. Records of Regularly Conducted Activity (Business Records) 333**

- Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 334  
*United States v. Briscoe* 334  
Notes to *United States v. Briscoe* 336  
*Lust v. Sealy, Inc.* 336  
Notes to *Lust v. Sealy, Inc.* 338  
*United States v. Blechman* 339  
Notes to *United States v. Blechman* 342  
*Beneficial Maine, Inc. v. Carter* 343  
Notes to *Beneficial Maine, Inc. v. Carter* 347  
*People v. Ortega* 348  
Notes to *People v. Ortega* 349  
Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 350



**D. Public Records 350**

Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 350

*United States v. Midwest Fireworks Mfg. Co., Inc.* 351

Notes to *United States v. Midwest Fireworks Mfg. Co., Inc.* 352

*United States v. Dowdell* 353

Notes to *United States v. Dowdell* 356

**E. Summary 357****10 HEARSAY: UNAVAILABILITY REQUIRED EXCEPTIONS 359****A. Introduction 359**

**Topic Overview 359**

**Chapter Organization 360**

**B. Former Testimony 360**

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 360

*O'Banion v. Owens-Corning Fiberglas Corp.* 361

Notes to *O'Banion v. Owens-Corning Fiberglas Corp.* 363

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 364

**C. Dying Declarations 365**

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 365

*Grant v. State* 365

Notes to *Grant v. State* 367

**D. Statements Against Interest 368**

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 368

*State v. Paredes* 369

Notes to *State v. Paredes* 374

**E. Statement by a Declarant Rendered Unavailable 375**

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 376

*United States v. Gray* 376

Notes to *United States v. Gray* 379

**F. Summary 381**

## **11 MODIFICATIONS OF THE BASIC HEARSAY RULES 383**

### **A. Introduction 383**

**Topic Overview 383**

**Chapter Organization 384**

### **B. Residual Exception 384**

Rule 807. Residual Exception 385

*Broderick v. King's Way Assembly of God Church* 385

Notes to *Broderick v. King's Way Assembly of God Church* 388

*People v. Katt* 390

Notes to *People v. Katt* 394

### **C. Due Process Clause 395**

*State v. Cazares-Mendez* 395

Notes to *State v. Cazares-Mendez* 402

### **D. Confrontation Clause 403**

1. The Constitutional Issue and Its Treatment Prior to 2004 403

United States Constitution, Sixth Amendment 404

2. New in 2004: The *Crawford* Analysis 404

*Davis v. Washington (Hammon v. Indiana)* 405

Notes to *Davis v. Washington* 410

*Giles v. California* 411

Notes to *Giles v. California* 414

3. Evolving Understanding of *Crawford*: Statements

About Recent Criminal Conduct 414

*Michigan v. Bryant* 415

Notes to *Michigan v. Bryant* 421

*Ohio v. Clark* 422

Notes to *Ohio v. Clark* 426

4. Evolving Understanding of *Crawford*: Routine Documents in the  
Criminal Investigation Process 427

*Melendez-Diaz v. Massachusetts* 427

Notes to *Melendez-Diaz v. Massachusetts* 431

*Bullcoming v. New Mexico* 431

Notes to *Bullcoming v. New Mexico* 437

*Williams v. Illinois* 437

Notes to *Williams v. Illinois* 443

### **E. Summary 444**

## 12 IMPEACHMENT 447

### A. Introduction 447

#### Topic Overview 447

Rule 607. Who May Impeach a Witness 447

#### Chapter Organization 448

### B. Reputation, Opinion, and Past Acts to Show Character for Truth Telling 449

Rule 608. A Witness's Character for Truthfulness or Untruthfulness 449

*State v. Caldwell* 450

Notes to *State v. Caldwell* 454

Rule 608. A Witness's Character for Truthfulness or Untruthfulness 456

*People v. Segovia* 456

Notes to *People v. Segovia* 460

*State v. Guenther* 461

Notes to *State v. Guenther* 465

### C. Criminal Convictions to Show Character for Truth Telling 467

Rule 609. Impeachment by Evidence of a Criminal Conviction 467

*State v. Hardy* 470

*State v. Williams* 473

Notes to *State v. Hardy* and *State v. Williams* 475

### D. Bias 478

*United States v. Abel* 478

Notes to *United States v. Abel* 483

*Olden v. Kentucky* 484

Notes to *Olden v. Kentucky* 487

*Woolum v. Hillman* 488

Notes to *Woolum v. Hillman* 492

*Wrobleski v. de Lara* 492

Notes to *Wrobleski v. de Lara* 496

### E. Contradiction and Prior Inconsistent Statements 497

Rule 611. Mode and Order of Examining Witnesses and Presenting Evidence 498

*Langness v. Fencil Urethane Systems, Inc.* 499

Notes to *Langness v. Fencil Urethane Systems, Inc.* 501

*McKee v. State* 501

Notes to *McKee v. State* 503

Rule 613. Witness's Prior Statement 504

*United States v. Schnapp* 505

Notes to *United States v. Schnapp* 508

**F. Impeaching Hearsay Declarants 509**

Rule 806. Attacking and Supporting the Declarant's Credibility 509

**G. Summary 510****13 WITNESSES 513****A. Introduction 513**

Topic Overview 513

Chapter Organization 513

**B. Personal Knowledge 514**

Rule 602. Need for Personal Knowledge 514

*State v. Long* 514Notes to *State v. Long* 516**C. Competency: Personal Traits 517**

Rule 601. Competency to Testify in General 518

*United States v. Allen* 518Notes to *United States v. Allen* 521

Rule 603. Oath or Affirmation to Testify Truthfully 522

*Roark v. Commonwealth* 523Notes to *Roark v. Commonwealth* 528**D. Competency: Status 529**

Dead Man's Statutes 529

*Trammel v. United States* 532Notes to *Trammel v. United States* 537

Rule 605. Judge's Competency as a Witness 539

Rule 606. Juror's Competency as a Witness 539

*Kendrick v. Pippin* 540Notes to *Kendrick v. Pippin* 544*Peña-Rodriguez v. Colorado* 545Notes to *Peña-Rodriguez v. Colorado* 549**E. Summary 551****14 OPINIONS 553****A. Introduction 553**

Topic Overview 553

Basic Structure for Analysis 554

Chapter Organization 555

**B. Science-Based Opinions 555**

- Rule 702. Testimony by Expert Witnesses 555  
*Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.* 556  
Notes to *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.* 561  
*Schafersman v. Agland Coop* 563  
Notes to *Schafersman v. Agland Coop* 568  
*United States v. Baines* 570  
Notes to *United States v. Baines* 573

**C. Experience-Based Opinions 574**

- Experience-Based Expertise: *Kumho Tire* 574  
*United States v. Walker* 574  
Notes to *United States v. Walker* 577  
Rule 704. Opinion on an Ultimate Issue 577  
*State v. Torrez* 578  
Notes to *State v. Torrez* 582

**D. Topics for Expert Testimony 583**

- State v. Spigarolo* 584  
*Hobgood v. State* 585  
Notes to *State v. Spigarolo* and *Hobgood v. State* 587  
*Specht v. Jensen* 590  
Notes to *Specht v. Jensen* 594

**E. Inadmissible Evidence as a Basis for Expert Testimony 595**

- Rule 703. Bases of an Expert's Opinion Testimony 595  
*Sphere Drake Insurance PLC v. Trisko* 595  
Notes to *Sphere Drake Insurance PLC v. Trisko* 598

**F. Lay Opinion 600**

- Rule 701. Opinion Testimony by Lay Witnesses 600  
*State v. Davis* 601  
Notes to *State v. Davis* 604

**G. Summary 605****15 PRIVILEGES 607****A. Introduction 607**

- Topic Overview 607**  
Rule 501. Privilege in General 608  
**Chapter Organization 608**

**B. Lawyers and Clients 609***Wesp v. Everson* 609Notes to *Wesp v. Everson* 615*Upjohn Co. v. United States* 617Notes to *Upjohn Co. v. United States* 622

Rule 502. Attorney-Client Privilege and Work Product; Limitations on Waiver 623

*Harp v. King* 625Notes to *Harp v. King* 630*In re Motion to Quash Bar Counsel Subpoena* 632Notes to *In re Motion to Quash Bar Counsel Subpoena* 636**C. Confidential Spousal Communications Privilege 636***State v. Christian* 637Notes to *State v. Christian* 642**D. Clergy-Penitent Communications 643***Varner v. Stovall* 644Notes to *Varner v. Stovall* 647**E. Mental Health Care Practitioners and Patients 649***Jaffee v. Redmond* 649Notes to *Jaffee v. Redmond* 653**F. Participants in Peer Review Processes 655***Lowy v. Peacehealth* 655Notes to *Lowy v. Peacehealth* 659**G. Summary 660****16 AUTHENTICATION AND THE ORIGINAL WRITING RULE 663****A. Introduction 663****Topic Overview 663****Chapter Organization 663****B. Authentication 664**

Rule 901. Authenticating or Identifying Evidence 664

*United States v. Newton* 665Notes to *United States v. Newton* 667*Tienda v. State* 668Notes to *Tienda v. State* 672*United States v. Johnson* 673Notes to *United States v. Johnson* 675

- C. Original Writing Rule 676**  
Rule 1001. Definitions That Apply to This Article 676  
Rule 1002. Requirement of the Original 676  
Rule 1003. Admissibility of Duplicates 677  
Rule 1004. Admissibility of Other Evidence of Content 677  
*United States v. Alexander* 677  
Notes to *United States v. Alexander* 681  
*United States v. Howard* 682  
Notes to *United States v. Howard* 684  
Rule 1008. Functions of the Court and Jury 684  
*Seiler v. Lucasfilm, Ltd.* 685  
Notes to *Seiler v. Lucasfilm, Ltd.* 689
- D. Summary 690**

## **17 PRESUMPTIONS AND JUDICIAL NOTICE 691**

- A. Introduction 691**  
**Topic Overview 691**  
**Chapter Organization 691**
- B. Presumptions: Federal Treatment 692**  
Rule 301. Presumptions in Civil Cases Generally 692  
*Marr v. Bank of America, N.A.* 692  
Notes to *Marr v. Bank of America, N.A.* 696
- C. Presumptions: Range of State Treatments 698**  
Rule 302. Applying State Law to Presumptions in Civil Cases 698  
Counterexamples 698  
*Schultz v. Ford Motor Co.* 701  
Notes to *Schultz v. Ford Motor Co.* 705
- D. Judicial Notice 706**  
Rule 201. Judicial Notice of Adjudicative Facts 706  
*Dippin' Dots, Inc. v. Frosty Bites Distribution, LLC* 707  
Notes to *Dippin' Dots, Inc. v. Frosty Bites Distribution, LLC* 710
- E. Summary 711**

*Table of Cases* 713

*Table of Authorities* 719

*Index* 723