

Preface xxvii
Acknowledgments xxix
Using the Videos xxxi

1 RELEVANCE 1

A. Introduction to Evidence Law 1

B. Introduction to Relevance 2
 Topic Overview 2
 Chapter Organization 3
 Basic Structure for Analysis 3

C. Relevance and Admissibility, Defined and Distinguished 4
 Rule 401. Test for Relevant Evidence 4
 Rule 402. General Admissibility of Relevant Evidence 4
 Rule 403. Excluding Relevant Evidence for Prejudice, Confusion,
 Waste of Time, or Other Reasons 5
Supreme Pork, Inc. v. Master Blaster, Inc. 6
 Notes to *Supreme Pork, Inc. v. Master Blaster, Inc.* 10

D. Relevance and Substantive Legal Theory 12
Kaechele v. Kenyon Oil Company, Inc. 12
 Notes to *Kaechele v. Kenyon Oil Company, Inc.* 15

**E. Recurring Relevance Patterns—Flight, Safety Record,
 and Destruction of Evidence 16**
United States v. Dillon 17
 Notes to *United States v. Dillon* 19
Lovick v. Wil-Rich 20
 Notes to *Lovick v. Wil-Rich* 23
Spino v. John S. Tilley Ladder Co. 23
 Notes to *Spino v. John S. Tilley Ladder Co.* 27
Aloi v. Union Pacific Railroad Corp. 27
 Notes to *Aloi v. Union Pacific Railroad Corp.* 31

F. Conditional Relevance 32

Rule 104. Preliminary Questions 32

Cox v. State 33Notes to *Cox v. State* 35**G. Discretion to Exclude Relevant Evidence 36***Old Chief v. United States* 37Notes to *Old Chief v. United States* 43**H. Summary 43****2 SOCIAL POLICY RELEVANCY RULES 45****A. Introduction 45****Topic Overview 45****Chapter Organization 45****B. Special Treatment for Subsequent Remedial Measures 46**

Rule 407. Subsequent Remedial Measures 46

Cyr v. J.I. Case Co. 47Notes to *Cyr v. J.I. Case Co.* 50*Bethel v. Peters* 52Notes to *Bethel v. Peters* 54**C. “Feasibility” Rationale for Admitting Subsequent Remedial Measures 55***Flaminio v. Honda Motor Co., Ltd.* 56*Kenny v. Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority* 57Notes to *Flaminio v. Honda Motor Co., Ltd.* and *Kenny**v. Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority* 58**D. Special Treatment for Compromises and Settlements 61**

Rule 408. Compromise Offers and Negotiations 61

Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Londagin 62Notes to *Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Londagin* 64**E. Bias Admission of Settlement Evidence 65***Quirion v. Forcier* 66Notes to *Quirion v. Forcier* 69**F. Postinjury Payments, Insurance, and Pleas 70**

Rule 409. Offers to Pay Medical and Similar Expenses 70

Rule 410. Pleas, Plea Discussions, and Related Statements 70

Rule 411. Liability Insurance 71

G. Summary 71

3 PROOF OF CHARACTER 73

A. Introduction 73

Topic Overview 73

Chapter Organization 74

Basic Structure for Analysis 75

B. Basic Rule Against Propensity Evidence 75

Rule 404. Character Evidence; Crimes or Other Acts 76

Boyd v. United States 76

Notes to *Boyd v. United States* 78

John A. Russell Corp. v. Bohlig 79

Notes to *John A. Russell Corp. v. Bohlig* 81

Rule 405. Methods of Proving Character 82

C. Permitted Propensity Inferences 83

Rule 404. Character Evidence; Crimes or Other Acts 83

City of Kennewick v. Day 84

Notes to *City of Kennewick v. Day* 86

State v. Gowan 88

Notes to *State v. Gowan* 91

D. Permitted Propensity Inferences About the Victim 92

Rule 404. Character Evidence; Crimes or Other Acts 92

Commonwealth v. Adjutant 93

Notes to *Commonwealth v. Adjutant* 96

United States v. Taken Alive 97

Notes to *United States v. Taken Alive* 100

E. Nonpropensity Use of Evidence That May Also Show Propensity 101

Rule 404. Character Evidence; Crimes or Other Acts 101

State v. Foxhoven 102

Notes to *State v. Foxhoven* 105

United States v. Queen 107

Notes to *United States v. Queen* 111

State v. Winebarger 112

Notes to *State v. Winebarger* 115

Leyva v. State 116

Notes to *Leyva v. State* 118

State v. Willett 119

Notes to *State v. Willett* 122

F. Summary 124

4 HABIT AND SEXUAL CONDUCT IN THE CONTEXT OF CHARACTER 127

A. Introduction 127

Topic Overview 127

Chapter Organization 128

B. Habit 128

Rule 406. Habit; Routine Practice 129

State v. Brown 130

Notes to *State v. Brown* 132

Aikman v. Kanda 132

Notes to *Aikman v. Kanda* 135

Gamerdinger v. Schaefer 136

Notes to *Gamerdinger v. Schaefer* 138

C. Alleged Victims of Sex Crimes 139

Rule 412. Sex-Offense Cases: The Victim's Sexual Behavior
or Predisposition 139

Williams v. State 141

Notes to *Williams v. State* 144

State v. Jones 145

Notes to *State v. Jones* 148

Fells v. State 149

Notes to *Fells v. State* 150

D. Defendants Accused of Sex Crimes 151

Rule 413. Similar Crimes in Sexual-Assault Cases 152

United States v. Hollow Horn 152

Notes to *United States v. Hollow Horn* 156

E. Summary 157

5 HEARSAY: FOUNDATIONS OF THE DOCTRINE 159

A. Introduction 159

Topic Overview 159

Chapter Organization 160

Basic Structure for Analysis 160

B. Statements That Are Relevant Only if What They Assert Is True (Hearsay) 162

Rule 801. Definitions That Apply to This Article... 162

Rule 802. The Rule Against Hearsay 162

Vincelette v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. 163

Notes to <i>Vincelette v. Metropolitan Life Insurance Co.</i>	165
<i>State v. Patterson</i>	166
Notes to <i>State v. Patterson</i>	168
<i>Schaffer v. State</i>	169
Notes to <i>Schaffer v. State</i>	171
<i>Biegas v. Quickway Carriers, Inc.</i>	172
Notes to <i>Biegas v. Quickway Carriers, Inc.</i>	173
C. Statements That Are Relevant Regardless of Whether Their Assertions Are True (Not Hearsay)	174
<i>United States v. Tenerelli</i>	175
Notes to <i>United States v. Tenerelli</i>	177
<i>Moen v. Thomas</i>	177
Notes to <i>Moen v. Thomas</i>	180
<i>Kenyon v. State</i>	181
Note to <i>Kenyon v. State</i>	184
<i>Field v. Trigg County Hospital, Inc.</i>	185
Notes to <i>Field v. Trigg County Hospital, Inc.</i>	187
<i>Hickey v. Settlemier</i>	188
Notes to <i>Hickey v. Settlemier</i>	190
<i>State v. Dullard</i>	191
Note to <i>State v. Dullard</i>	196
D. Summary	197

6 OPPONENTS' STATEMENTS 199

A. Introduction	199
Topic Overview	199
Rule 801. Definitions That Apply to This Article; Exclusions from Hearsay	200
Chapter Organization	200
B. Party's Own Statement	201
<i>United States v. Sprick</i>	201
Notes to <i>United States v. Sprick</i>	203
<i>Shields v. Reddo</i>	203
Notes to <i>Shields v. Reddo</i>	204
<i>Application of City of New York re Lincoln Square Slum Clearance Project</i>	205
Notes to <i>Lincoln Square Slum Clearance Project</i>	205
C. Adoptive Statements	207
<i>State v. Lambert</i>	207
Notes to <i>State v. Lambert</i>	209

State v. Carlson 209
Notes to *State v. Carlson* 212

D. Authorized Speakers 213

Barnett v. Hidalgo 214
Notes to *Barnett v. Hidalgo* 216

E. Statements by a Party's Agent or Employee 216

B & K Rentals and Sales Co., Inc. v. Universal Leaf Tobacco Co. 217
Notes to *B & K Rentals and Sales Co., Inc. v. Universal Leaf Tobacco Co.* 220

F. Coconspirators' Statements 221

State v. Cornell 221
Notes to *State v. Cornell* 224

G. Summary 225

7 WITNESSES' OWN OUT-OF-COURT STATEMENTS 227

A. Introduction 227

Topic Overview 227

Rule 801. Definitions That Apply to This Article; Exclusions from Hearsay 228

Chapter Organization 228

B. Substantive and Nonsubstantive Use of a Witness's Prior Statements 229

C. Prior Inconsistent Statements by a Witness 229

United States v. Neadeau 230
United States v. Gajo 230
Notes to *United States v. Neadeau* and *United States v. Gajo* 233
United States v. Day 234
Notes to *United States v. Day* 237

D. Prior Consistent Statements by a Witness 238

Tome v. United States 239
Notes to *Tome v. United States* 243

E. Statements Identifying a Person Made After Perceiving the Person 245

United States v. Lewis 245
Notes to *United States v. Lewis* 248
State v. Shaw 249
Notes to *State v. Shaw* 251

F. “Subject to Cross-Examination” Requirement 252*Goforth v. State* 252Notes to *Goforth v. State* 255**G. Summary 256****8 HEARSAY EXCEPTIONS: SPONTANEOUS AND PERSONAL STATEMENTS 259****A. Introduction 259****Topic Overview 259****Chapter Organization 260****B. Present Sense Impression and Excited Utterance 260**

Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 260

Fischer v. State 261Notes to *Fischer v. State* 264*Pressey v. State* 266Notes to *Pressey v. State* 268*State v. Flores* 270Notes to *State v. Flores* 272*Graure v. United States* 272Notes to *United States v. Graure* 274**C. Statement of Then-Existing Mental, Emotional, or Physical Condition 275**

Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 275

Stoll v. State 276Notes to *Stoll v. State* 278*Schering Corp. v. Pfizer, Inc.* 280Notes to *Schering Corp. v. Pfizer, Inc.* 283*State v. James* 285Notes to *State v. James* 288*Camm v. State* 289Notes to *Camm v. State* 291**D. Statements for Purposes of Medical Diagnosis or Treatment 292**

Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 292

Hansen v. Heath 293Notes to *Hansen v. Heath* 295*Oldman v. State* 296Notes to *Oldman v. State* 299

Colvard v. Commonwealth 301
 Notes to *Colvard v. Commonwealth* 304

E. Summary 306

9 HEARSAY EXCEPTIONS: RECORDED STATEMENTS 309

A. Introduction 309

Topic Overview 309
Chapter Organization 310

B. Recorded Recollection (and Present Recollection Refreshed) 310

1. Recorded Recollection 310
 - Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 311
 - United States v. Jones* 311
 - Notes to *United States v. Jones* 313
 - State v. Taylor* 314
 - Notes to *State v. Taylor* 317
 - United States v. Dazey* 318
 - Notes to *United States v. Dazey* 320
2. Refreshing Present Recollection 321
 - Rule 612. Writing Used to Refresh a Witness’s Memory 322
 - Germain v. State* 322
 - Notes to *Germain v. State* 326
 - Rush v. Illinois-Central Railroad Co.* 326
 - Notes to *Rush v. Illinois-Central Railroad Co.* 330
 - Rule 611. Mode and Order of Examining Witnesses and Presenting Evidence 330

C. Records of Regularly Conducted Activity (Business Records) 333

- Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 334
 - United States v. Briscoe* 334
 - Notes to *United States v. Briscoe* 336
 - Lust v. Sealy, Inc.* 336
 - Notes to *Lust v. Sealy, Inc.* 338
 - United States v. Blechman* 339
 - Notes to *United States v. Blechman* 342
 - Beneficial Maine, Inc. v. Carter* 343
 - Notes to *Beneficial Maine, Inc. v. Carter* 347
 - People v. Ortega* 348
 - Notes to *People v. Ortega* 349
- Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 350

D. Public Records 350

Rule 803. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—Regardless of Whether the Declarant Is Available as a Witness 350

United States v. Midwest Fireworks Mfg. Co., Inc. 351

Notes to *United States v. Midwest Fireworks Mfg. Co., Inc.* 352

United States v. Dowdell 353

Notes to *United States v. Dowdell* 356

E. Summary 357**10 HEARSAY: UNAVAILABILITY REQUIRED EXCEPTIONS 359****A. Introduction 359**

Topic Overview 359

Chapter Organization 360

B. Former Testimony 360

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 360

O'Banion v. Owens-Corning Fiberglas Corp. 361

Notes to *O'Banion v. Owens-Corning Fiberglas Corp.* 363

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 364

C. Dying Declarations 365

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 365

Grant v. State 365

Notes to *Grant v. State* 367

D. Statements Against Interest 368

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 368

State v. Paredes 369

Notes to *State v. Paredes* 374

E. Statement by a Declarant Rendered Unavailable 375

Rule 804. Exceptions to the Rule Against Hearsay—When the Declarant Is Unavailable as a Witness 376

United States v. Gray 376

Notes to *United States v. Gray* 379

F. Summary 381

11 MODIFICATIONS OF THE BASIC HEARSAY RULES 383

A. Introduction 383

Topic Overview 383

Chapter Organization 384

B. Residual Exception 384

Rule 807. Residual Exception 385

Broderick v. King's Way Assembly of God Church 385

Notes to *Broderick v. King's Way Assembly of God Church* 388

People v. Katt 390

Notes to *People v. Katt* 394

C. Due Process Clause 395

State v. Cazares-Mendez 395

Notes to *State v. Cazares-Mendez* 402

D. Confrontation Clause 403

1. The Constitutional Issue and Its Treatment Prior to 2004 403

United States Constitution, Sixth Amendment 404

2. New in 2004: The *Crawford* Analysis 404

Davis v. Washington (Hammon v. Indiana) 405

Notes to *Davis v. Washington* 410

Giles v. California 411

Notes to *Giles v. California* 414

3. Evolving Understanding of *Crawford*: Statements

About Recent Criminal Conduct 414

Michigan v. Bryant 415

Notes to *Michigan v. Bryant* 421

Ohio v. Clark 422

Notes to *Ohio v. Clark* 426

4. Evolving Understanding of *Crawford*: Routine Documents in the
Criminal Investigation Process 427

Melendez-Diaz v. Massachusetts 427

Notes to *Melendez-Diaz v. Massachusetts* 431

Bullcoming v. New Mexico 431

Notes to *Bullcoming v. New Mexico* 437

Williams v. Illinois 437

Notes to *Williams v. Illinois* 443

E. Summary 444

12 IMPEACHMENT 447

A. Introduction 447

Topic Overview 447

Rule 607. Who May Impeach a Witness 447

Chapter Organization 448

B. Reputation, Opinion, and Past Acts to Show Character for Truth Telling 449

Rule 608. A Witness's Character for Truthfulness or Untruthfulness 449

State v. Caldwell 450

Notes to *State v. Caldwell* 454

Rule 608. A Witness's Character for Truthfulness or Untruthfulness 456

People v. Segovia 456

Notes to *People v. Segovia* 460

State v. Guenther 461

Notes to *State v. Guenther* 465

C. Criminal Convictions to Show Character for Truth Telling 467

Rule 609. Impeachment by Evidence of a Criminal Conviction 467

State v. Hardy 470

State v. Williams 473

Notes to *State v. Hardy* and *State v. Williams* 475

D. Bias 478

United States v. Abel 478

Notes to *United States v. Abel* 483

Olden v. Kentucky 484

Notes to *Olden v. Kentucky* 487

Woolum v. Hillman 488

Notes to *Woolum v. Hillman* 492

Wrobleski v. de Lara 492

Notes to *Wrobleski v. de Lara* 496

E. Contradiction and Prior Inconsistent Statements 497

Rule 611. Mode and Order of Examining Witnesses and Presenting Evidence 498

Langness v. Fencil Urethane Systems, Inc. 499

Notes to *Langness v. Fencil Urethane Systems, Inc.* 501

McKee v. State 501

Notes to *McKee v. State* 503

Rule 613. Witness's Prior Statement 504

United States v. Schnapp 505

Notes to *United States v. Schnapp* 508

F. Impeaching Hearsay Declarants 509

Rule 806. Attacking and Supporting the Declarant's Credibility 509

G. Summary 510**13 WITNESSES 513****A. Introduction 513**

Topic Overview 513

Chapter Organization 513

B. Personal Knowledge 514

Rule 602. Need for Personal Knowledge 514

State v. Long 514Notes to *State v. Long* 516**C. Competency: Personal Traits 517**

Rule 601. Competency to Testify in General 518

United States v. Allen 518Notes to *United States v. Allen* 521

Rule 603. Oath or Affirmation to Testify Truthfully 522

Roark v. Commonwealth 523Notes to *Roark v. Commonwealth* 528**D. Competency: Status 529**

Dead Man's Statutes 529

Trammel v. United States 532Notes to *Trammel v. United States* 537

Rule 605. Judge's Competency as a Witness 539

Rule 606. Juror's Competency as a Witness 539

Kendrick v. Pippin 540Notes to *Kendrick v. Pippin* 544*Peña-Rodriguez v. Colorado* 545Notes to *Peña-Rodriguez v. Colorado* 549**E. Summary 551****14 OPINIONS 553****A. Introduction 553**

Topic Overview 553

Basic Structure for Analysis 554

Chapter Organization 555

B. Science-Based Opinions	555
Rule 702. Testimony by Expert Witnesses	555
<i>Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.</i>	556
Notes to <i>Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, Inc.</i>	561
<i>Schafersman v. Agland Coop</i>	563
Notes to <i>Schafersman v. Agland Coop</i>	568
<i>United States v. Baines</i>	570
Notes to <i>United States v. Baines</i>	573
C. Experience-Based Opinions	574
Experience-Based Expertise: <i>Kumho Tire</i>	574
<i>United States v. Walker</i>	574
Notes to <i>United States v. Walker</i>	577
Rule 704. Opinion on an Ultimate Issue	577
<i>State v. Torrez</i>	578
Notes to <i>State v. Torrez</i>	582
D. Topics for Expert Testimony	583
<i>State v. Spigarolo</i>	584
<i>Hobgood v. State</i>	585
Notes to <i>State v. Spigarolo</i> and <i>Hobgood v. State</i>	587
<i>Specht v. Jensen</i>	590
Notes to <i>Specht v. Jensen</i>	594
E. Inadmissible Evidence as a Basis for Expert Testimony	595
Rule 703. Bases of an Expert's Opinion Testimony	595
<i>Sphere Drake Insurance PLC v. Trisko</i>	595
Notes to <i>Sphere Drake Insurance PLC v. Trisko</i>	598
F. Lay Opinion	600
Rule 701. Opinion Testimony by Lay Witnesses	600
<i>State v. Davis</i>	601
Notes to <i>State v. Davis</i>	604
G. Summary	605

15 PRIVILEGES 607

A. Introduction	607
Topic Overview	607
Rule 501. Privilege in General	608
Chapter Organization	608

B. Lawyers and Clients 609*Wesp v. Everson* 609Notes to *Wesp v. Everson* 615*Upjohn Co. v. United States* 617Notes to *Upjohn Co. v. United States* 622Rule 502. Attorney-Client Privilege and Work Product; Limitations on
Waiver 623*Harp v. King* 625Notes to *Harp v. King* 630*In re Motion to Quash Bar Counsel Subpoena* 632Notes to *In re Motion to Quash Bar Counsel Subpoena* 636**C. Confidential Spousal Communications Privilege 636***State v. Christian* 637Notes to *State v. Christian* 642**D. Clergy-Penitent Communications 643***Varner v. Stovall* 644Notes to *Varner v. Stovall* 647**E. Mental Health Care Practitioners and Patients 649***Jaffee v. Redmond* 649Notes to *Jaffee v. Redmond* 653**F. Participants in Peer Review Processes 655***Lowy v. Peacehealth* 655Notes to *Lowy v. Peacehealth* 659**G. Summary 660****16 AUTHENTICATION AND THE ORIGINAL
WRITING RULE 663****A. Introduction 663****Topic Overview 663****Chapter Organization 663****B. Authentication 664**

Rule 901. Authenticating or Identifying Evidence 664

United States v. Newton 665Notes to *United States v. Newton* 667*Tienda v. State* 668Notes to *Tienda v. State* 672*United States v. Johnson* 673Notes to *United States v. Johnson* 675

C. Original Writing Rule	676
Rule 1001. Definitions That Apply to This Article	676
Rule 1002. Requirement of the Original	676
Rule 1003. Admissibility of Duplicates	677
Rule 1004. Admissibility of Other Evidence of Content	677
<i>United States v. Alexander</i>	677
Notes to <i>United States v. Alexander</i>	681
<i>United States v. Howard</i>	682
Notes to <i>United States v. Howard</i>	684
Rule 1008. Functions of the Court and Jury	684
<i>Seiler v. Lucasfilm, Ltd.</i>	685
Notes to <i>Seiler v. Lucasfilm, Ltd.</i>	689
D. Summary	690

17 PRESUMPTIONS AND JUDICIAL NOTICE 691

A. Introduction	691
Topic Overview	691
Chapter Organization	691
B. Presumptions: Federal Treatment	692
Rule 301. Presumptions in Civil Cases Generally	692
<i>Marr v. Bank of America, N.A.</i>	692
Notes to <i>Marr v. Bank of America, N.A.</i>	696
C. Presumptions: Range of State Treatments	698
Rule 302. Applying State Law to Presumptions in Civil Cases	698
Counterexamples	698
<i>Schultz v. Ford Motor Co.</i>	701
Notes to <i>Schultz v. Ford Motor Co.</i>	705
D. Judicial Notice	706
Rule 201. Judicial Notice of Adjudicative Facts	706
<i>Dippin' Dots, Inc. v. Frosty Bites Distribution, LLC</i>	707
Notes to <i>Dippin' Dots, Inc. v. Frosty Bites Distribution, LLC</i>	710
E. Summary	711

Table of Cases 713

Table of Authorities 719

Index 723