

# Contents

---

<i>Preface</i>	xxi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv

<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>From Common Law to Regulation</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>A. The Limitations of Tort Law</b>	<b>3</b>
<i>MacPherson v. Buick Motor Co.</i>	6
Notes and Questions	9
<i>Rotche v. Buick Motor Co.</i>	10
Notes and Questions	13
The Law and Economics Perspective	15
Ford Motor Co., Fatalities Associated with Crash Induced Fuel Leakage and Fires	17
<i>Grimshaw v. Ford Motor Co.</i>	18
Notes and Questions	23
Note on the Limitations of Common Law Adjudication More Generally	24
<b>B. The Limitations of Contract Law</b>	<b>27</b>
Notes and Questions	28
<b>C. The Justifications for Regulation</b>	<b>29</b>
1. Economic Justifications for Regulation	29
OMB, Circular A-4, To the Heads of Executive Agencies and Establishments, Subject: Regulatory Analysis	30
Notes and Questions	32
2. Social Justifications for Regulation	34
Cass Sunstein, After the Rights Revolution: Reconceiving the Regulatory State	35
Notes and Questions	38
From Justification to Legislation: A Note on the Role of Politics	39
<b>D. What is an Agency?</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>Legislation</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>A. The Legislative Process</b>	<b>45</b>
Overview of the Legislative Process	46
Abbe R. Gluck, Anne J. O’Connell & Rosa Po, Unorthodox Lawmaking, Unorthodox Rulemaking	54
Notes and Questions	57
Notes on Theories of the Legislative Process	58

<b>B. Legislative Drafting</b>	<b>61</b>
1. The Basic Steps of Legislative Drafting	61
Legislative Drafting Manual, Office of the Legislative Counsel, U.S. Senate	62
House Legislative Counsel's Manual on Drafting Style, Office of the Legislative Counsel, U.S. House of Representatives	63
Notes and Questions	65
2. The Political Realities of Legislative Drafting	66
Victoria F. Nourse & Jane S. Schacter, The Politics of Legislative Drafting: A Congressional Case Study	66
Notes and Questions	72
<b>C. A Statute: The 1966 Motor Vehicle Safety Act</b>	<b>74</b>
1. The Story of Auto Safety Legislation	74
Notes and Questions	78
2. The National Traffic and Motor Vehicle Safety Act of 1966	80
The National Traffic and Motor Vehicle Safety Act of 1966	80
Notes and Questions	92
Senate Report (Commerce Committee) [To accompany S. 3005]	93
Notes and Questions	100
<b>D. The Structure of a Modern Statute</b>	<b>100</b>
Note on the Relationship Between Operative and Implementation Provisions	105
Note on Preemption Provisions, Savings Clauses, and Federalism Issues	105
Sherman Antitrust Act	106
Federal Trade Commission Act	107
Civil Rights Act of 1964	107
Occupational Safety and Health Act of 1970	108
The Telephone Consumer Protection Act	110
Homeland Security Act of 2002	111
Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act	112
The Dodd-Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act	114
Notes and Questions	117
<b>E. Specificity and Delegation</b>	<b>119</b>
1. Political Reasons for Delegation	120
David Epstein & Sharyn O'Halloran, The Nondelegation Doctrine and the Separation of Powers: A Political Science Approach	121
Notes and Questions	124
2. The Normative Implications of Delegation	125
David Schoenbrod, Power Without Responsibility: How Congress Abuses the People Through Delegation	126
Jerry L. Mashaw, Greed, Chaos and Governance: Using Public Choice to Improve Public Law	127

Edward L. Rubin, Law and Legislation in the Administrative State	129
Notes and Questions	130
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
<b>Statutory Interpretation by Courts</b>	<b>131</b>
<b>A. A Classic of Statutory Interpretation</b>	<b>132</b>
<i>Church of the Holy Trinity v. United States</i>	133
Notes and Questions	138
<b>B. Text-Based Tools</b>	<b>145</b>
1. Ordinary Meaning vs. Technical Meaning	146
<i>Nix v. Hedden</i>	146
Notes and Questions	148
<i>Barber v. Gonzales</i>	148
Notes and Questions	150
<i>Muscarello v. United States</i>	151
Notes and Questions	159
2. Textual Canons of Construction	160
a. A Classic Example of Textual Canons	160
<i>Babbitt v. Sweet Home Chapter of Communities for a</i>	
<i>Great Oregon</i>	161
Notes and Questions	173
b. Linguistic Canons	175
i. Eiusdem generis	175
ii. Noscitur a sociis	177
iii. Expressio unius est exclusio alterius	180
iv. Other Linguistic Canons	180
(1) Punctuation	180
(2) The Last Antecedent Rule	182
(3) Conjunctive vs. Disjunctive	184
(4) May vs. Shall	185
(5) Any	186
Notes and Questions	187
c. Whole Act Canons	189
i. The Whole Act Rule	189
(1) Identical Words—Consistent Meaning	190
(2) Avoiding Redundancy and Surplusage	192
ii. Titles and Provisos	192
(1) Titles	192
(2) Provisos	193
d. Whole Code Canons	193
i. In pari materia	193
ii. Inferences Across Statutes	196
iii. Repeals by Implication	198
e. The Court's Recent Word on Text	200
<i>Bostock v. Clayton County</i>	200
Notes and Questions	217

3. Substantive Canons	218
a. The Rule of Lenity	219
<i>United States v. Santos</i>	219
Notes and Questions	229
b. The Constitutional Avoidance Canon	230
<i>Zadvydas v. Davis</i>	231
<i>Almendarez-Torres v. United States</i>	236
Notes and Questions	242
c. The Federalism Clear Statement Rule	243
<i>Gregory v. Ashcroft</i>	244
Notes and Questions	253
d. The Presumption Against Preemption	254
<i>Geier v. American Honda Motor Company</i>	255
<i>Williamson v. Mazda Motor of America</i>	259
Notes and Questions	261
e. The Presumption Against Retroactivity	263
f. The Presumption Against Extraterritorial Application	264
4. Scrivener's Errors and Absurd Results	264
<i>United States v. Locke</i>	265
Notes and Questions	267
5. Criticisms of Canons of Construction	269
Nina A. Mendelson, Change, Creation, and Unpredictability in Statutory Interpretation: Interpretive Canon Use in the Roberts Court's First Decade	270
Abbe R. Gluck & Lisa Schultz Bressman, Statutory Interpretation from the Inside—An Empirical Study of Congressional Drafting, Delegation, and the Canons: Part I	274
Notes and Questions	276
<b>C. Intent and Purpose-Based Tools</b>	<b>277</b>
1. Forms of Legislative History	278
2. Judicial Reliance on Legislative History	281
<i>Moore v. Harris</i>	282
Notes and Questions	291
3. Principles for Reliance on Legislative History	295
Victoria F. Nourse, A Decision Theory of Statutory Interpretation: Legislative History by the Rules	295
Notes and Questions	301
<b>D. Tools for Considering Changed Circumstances</b>	<b>301</b>
<i>Bob Jones University v. United States</i>	302
Notes and Questions	314
<b>E. Theories of Statutory Interpretation</b>	<b>314</b>
1. Intentionalism	316
a. What Does Intent Mean?	317
b. Whose Intent Is Relevant?	317
c. Is Collective Intent Coherent?	318
d. Does Intent Reflect More Than Legislative Self-Interest?	319
e. Does Intent Constitute Law?	320
f. May Intent Trump Text?	320

2. Purposivism	321
Henry M. Hart, Jr. & Albert M. Sacks, <i>The Legal Process: Basic Problems in the Making and Application of the Law</i>	322
Notes and Questions	325
3. Textualism and New Textualism	326
a. Is Textualism Constitutionally Compelled?	328
b. Is Textualism More Constraining?	328
c. Is Textualism Distinctive?	331
d. Is Textualism Internally Consistent?	331
e. Is Legislative History an Impermissible Interpretive Tool?	332
Antonin Scalia, <i>A Matter of Interpretation: Federal Courts and the Law</i>	333
Notes and Questions	338
4. Dynamic Interpretation	340
William N. Eskridge, Jr., <i>Dynamic Statutory Interpretation</i>	340
T. Alexander Aleinikoff, <i>Updating Statutory Interpretation</i>	343
Notes and Questions	346
<b>Chapter 4</b>	
<b>Policymaking by Rule: A Case Study</b>	<b>349</b>
<b>A. NHTSA Gets Organized</b>	<b>351</b>
Michael R. Lemov, <i>Car Safety Wars: One Hundred Years of Technology, Politics, and Death</i>	351
Notes and Questions	353
<b>B. Standard 208 Takes Shape: 1967 to 1971</b>	<b>354</b>
NHTSA, Title 23—Highways and Vehicles	354
Notes and Questions	356
NHTSA, <i>Occupant Crash Protection in Passenger Cars, Multipurpose Passenger Vehicles, Trucks, and Buses</i>	359
Notes and Questions	361
<b>C. Standard 208 Hits a Wall: 1971 to 1976</b>	<b>364</b>
Transcript of Public Record; Conversation 488-15, Nixon Presidential Library and Museum, National Archives	365
Transcript of Public Record, Nixon Presidential Library and Museum, National Archives	368
Notes and Questions	371
<i>Chrysler Corp. v. Department of Transportation</i>	372
Notes and Questions	383
NHTSA, <i>Motor Vehicle and School Bus Safety Amendments of 1974</i>	385
Gerald R. Ford, <i>Statement on Signing the Motor Vehicle and School Bus Safety Amendments of 1974</i>	387
Notes and Questions	388
NHTSA, <i>Notice, Seat Belt Interlock Option (1974)</i>	390
Notes and Questions	390

<b>D. Standard 208's Death and Resurrection: 1976 to 1989</b>	<b>391</b>
NHTSA, Final Rule, Occupant Restraint Systems (1981)	391
Notes and Questions	393
<i>Motor Vehicle Manufacturers Ass'n of the United States, Inc.</i> <i>v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co.</i>	394
Notes and Questions	394
NHTSA, NPRM, Occupant Crash Protection	398
Notes and Questions	401
NHTSA, Final Rule, Occupant Crash Protection	402
Notes and Questions	405
<b>Concluding Questions</b>	<b>407</b>
1. GM vs. NHTSA	407
Jody Freeman, Collaborative Governance in the Administrative State	410
2. The Shape of the Industry and the Goals of the Regulation	412
<b>Chapter 5</b>	
<b>Statutory Implementation by Agencies</b>	<b>415</b>
<b>A. The Notice-and-Comment Rulemaking Process</b>	<b>416</b>
Notes and Questions	420
<b>B. An Example of Notice-and-Comment Rulemaking: NHTSA Standard 208</b>	<b>421</b>
NHTSA, NPRM, Occupant Crash Protection (1981)	424
Notes and Questions	429
NHTSA, Final Rule, Occupant Crash Protection (1981)	430
Notes and Questions	446
<b>C. The Standard Form of Notice-and-Comment Rules</b>	<b>447</b>
Note on the "Formalization" of the Agency Explanation	449
<b>D. The Tools of Statutory Implementation</b>	<b>451</b>
1. Statutory Analysis	453
a. An Example of Statutory Analysis	454
NHTSA, Passenger Automobile Average Fuel Economy Standards; Denial of Petitions for Rulemaking	454
Notes and Questions	457
b. The Practice of Agency Interpretation	458
Jerry L. Mashaw, Agency Statutory Interpretation	459
Notes and Questions	462
Kevin M. Stack, Purposivism in the Executive Branch: How Agencies Interpret Statutes	465
Notes and Questions	467
2. Scientific Analysis	468
a. Two Examples of Scientific Analysis	469
NHTSA, Final Rule, Occupant Crash Protection (2000)	469
Notes and Questions	471
NHTSA, Part 581—Bumper Standard	472
Notes and Questions	474
b. The Use of Science	475
Sidney Shapiro, Elizabeth Fisher & Wendy Wagner, The Enlightenment of Administrative Law: Looking Inside the Agency for Legitimacy	475

c. Assessing Risk	478
David Ropeik & George Gray, Risk!	480
Notes and Questions	484
3. Economic Analysis	488
Cass Sunstein, Cost-Benefit Default Principles	489
Notes and Questions	492
a. An Example of Cost-Benefit Analysis	493
OIRA, Return Letter	494
NHTSA, Final Rule (Part Two)	502
Notes and Questions	509
b. The Mechanics of Cost-Benefit Analysis	510
i. Monetizing	510
W. Kip Viscusi, Fatal Tradeoffs	510
Notes and Questions	512
Further Note on Monetization	512
ii. Discount Rate	516
Cass R. Sunstein, Cost-Benefit Default Principles	516
Notes and Questions	518
NHTSA, Final Rule, Average Fuel Economy Standards for Light Trucks Model Years 2008-2011 (2006)	519
Notes and Questions	521
OMB, Circular A-4 , To the Heads of Executive Agencies and Establishments, Subject: Regulatory Analysis	522
Notes and Questions	523
c. The Controversy over Cost-Benefit Analysis	523
Cass R. Sunstein, Cost-Benefit Default Principles	523
Frank Ackerman & Lisa Heinzerling, Pricing the Priceless: Cost-Benefit Analysis of Environmental Protection	526
Notes and Questions	528
4. Equity and Distributional Analysis	530
OMB, Circular A-4 , To the Heads of Executive Agencies and Establishments, Subject: Regulatory Analysis	531
Control of Air Pollution from New Motor Vehicles: Heavy-Duty Engine and Vehicle Standards	533
Notes and Questions	535
5. Political Analysis	535
EPA, Notice of Denial of Petition for Rulemaking, Control of Emissions From New Highway Vehicles and Engines (2003)	536
Notes and Questions	538
<b>E. Other Policymaking Formats</b>	<b>539</b>
1. Adjudication	539
a. Formal Adjudication	541
Boston Medical Center Corporation and House Officers' Association/Committee of Interns and Residents	542
Notes and Questions	552

b. “Informal” Adjudication	554
NHTSA, Civil Penalty Procedures and Factors	554
Notes and Questions	561
Statement of David Friedman, Acting Administrator, NHTSA, Before the Subcommittee on Consumer Protection, Product Safety and Insurance	563
Office of Inspector General, Audit Report	566
Notes and Questions	575
2. Guidance	576
OMB Final Bulletin for Agency Good Guidance Practices	577
Notes and Questions	579
Nina Mendelson, Regulatory Beneficiaries and Informal Agency Policymaking	580
Federal Communications Commission: Industry Guidance on the Commission’s Case Law Interpreting 18 U.S.C. §1464 and Enforcement Policies Regarding Broadcast Indecency	582
Notes and Questions	590
NHTSA’s Interpretation Files Search	593
Paul Hemmersbaugh, NHTSA Chief Counsel, to Brian Latour, Exec. Director of Global Safety and Field Investigations, General Motors Corp.	594
Notes and Questions	597

## **Chapter 6**

### **Control of Agency Action** **599**

<b>A. Presidential Control of Agency Action</b>	<b>599</b>
1. The Constitutionality of Independent Agencies and Presidential Control Thereof	601
<i>Myers v. United States</i>	603
<i>Humphrey’s Executor v. United States</i>	607
<i>Morrison v. Olson</i>	612
Notes and Questions	620
<i>Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting         Oversight Board</i>	622
<i>Seila Law, LLC v. Consumer Financial Protection Bureau</i>	631
Notes and Questions	641
2. Control of Agency Personnel	645
3. Control of Appropriations	646
Eloise Pasachoff, OMB’s Resource Management Offices and Agency Policy Control	647
Notes and Questions	649
4. Regulatory Planning and Review	651
Executive Order No. 12866, Regulatory Planning and Review	652
Notes and Questions	665
a. Return and Prompt Letters	667
b. The Debate About Regulatory Planning and Review	676
Notes and Questions	680



5. Presidential Directives	680
6. Other White House and Agency Involvement	681
<b>B. Congressional Control of Agency Action</b>	<b>682</b>
1. New Legislation	685
2. Appropriations Legislation	685
3. Oversight Hearings	689
Brian D. Feinstein, Congress in the Administrative State	690
4. Fire Alarms	693
5. Legislative Vetoes	694
<i>Immigration &amp; Naturalization Service v. Chadha</i>	696
Notes and Questions	709
6. Congressional Review Act	711
Food and Drug Administration: Congressional Review Act Report	712
Notes and Questions	715
7. Congressional Control of Agency Officials	716
<i>Bowsher v. Synar</i>	716
Notes and Questions	727
<b>C. Judicial Control of Agency Action</b>	<b>728</b>
1. Judicial Control of Agency Statutory Interpretation	728
a. Skidmore	729
<i>Skidmore v. Swift &amp; Co.</i>	729
Notes and Questions	732
b. Chevron	733
<i>Chevron U.S.A. Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc.</i>	733
Notes and Questions	742
i. Clear Meaning or Ambiguity	744
<i>MCI Telecommunications Corp. v. AT&amp;T</i>	745
Notes and Questions	753
<i>Food &amp; Drug Administration v. Brown &amp; Williamson Tobacco Corp.</i>	753
Notes and Questions	766
<i>King v. Burwell</i>	768
Notes and Questions	769
ii. Reasonable Agency Interpretations	769
c. Mead and Barnhart	770
<i>United States v. Mead Corp.</i>	771
Notes and Questions	781
<i>Barnhart v. Walton</i>	783
Notes and Questions	785
d. The Major Questions Doctrine and the Movement Away from <i>Chevron</i>	786
<i>West Virginia v. EPA</i>	789
Notes and Questions	810
2. Judicial Control of Agency Regulatory Interpretation	814
<i>Auer v. Robbins</i>	815
<i>Kisor v. Wilkie, Secretary of Veterans Affairs</i>	819
Notes and Questions	827
Note on the Interpretation of Regulations	828
Notes and Questions	830

3. Empirical Evidence on Deference Frameworks	831
Kent Barnett & Christopher J. Walker, <i>Chevron</i> in the Circuits	831
Notes and Questions	834
4. Judicial Control of Agency Statutory Implementation	835
a. Review of Agency Policy	836
<i>Citizens to Preserve Overton Park, Inc. v. Volpe</i>	837
Notes and Questions	841
<i>Motor Vehicle Manufacturers Ass'n of the United States, Inc.         v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co.</i>	844
Notes and Questions	856
<i>FCC v. Fox Television Stations, Inc.</i>	859
Notes and Questions	866
<i>Federal Communications Commission v. Prometheus Radio         Project</i>	867
Notes and Questions	873
b. Empirical Evidence on Judicial Control of Agency Policymaking	874
Cass R. Sunstein & Thomas J. Miles, Depoliticizing Administrative Law	874
Notes and Questions	876
c. Judicial Control of Agency Procedure	876
<i>Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. Natural Resources         Defense Council, Inc.</i>	878
Notes and Questions	886
<i>United States v. Nova Scotia Food Products, Inc.</i>	887
Notes and Questions	892
d. Judicial Control of Agency Fact-Finding	893
<i>Dickinson v. Zurko</i>	893
Notes and Questions	895
3. Availability of Judicial Review	895
a. Standing	896
<i>Massachusetts v. EPA</i>	896
Notes and Questions	907
b. Reviewability	909
c. Timing	911
Appendix A Selected Provisions of the Constitution of the United States of America	915
Appendix B Selected Provisions of the Administrative Procedure Act	937
Appendix C Presidential Administrations and Secretaries of Department of Transportation, 1967-87	961
<i>Table of Cases</i>	965
<i>Index</i>	973