## **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

[m5G;November 29, 2020;14:10]

Journal of Infection xxx (xxxx) xxx

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect



Journal of Infection

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/jinf



# Review SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19) superspreader events

## Dasha Majra<sup>a,\*</sup>, Jayme Benson<sup>b</sup>, Jennifer Pitts<sup>c</sup>, Justin Stebbing<sup>d</sup>

<sup>a</sup> University of Manchester Medical School, United Kingdom

<sup>b</sup> Clare College, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom

<sup>c</sup> Newnham College, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom

<sup>d</sup> Department of Surgery and Cancer, Imperial College, London, United Kingdom

#### ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Accepted 21 November 2020 Available online xxx

Keywords: COVID-19 Infection Transmissible SARS-CoV-2 Superspreader

#### SUMMARY

*Background & objectives:* A significant number of reported COVID-19 cases can be traced back to superspreader events (SSEs), where a disproportionally large number of secondary cases relative to the standard reproductive rate, R0, are initiated. Although a superspreader is an individual who undergoes more viral shedding and transmission than others, it appears likely that environmental factors have a substantial role in SSEs. We categorise SSEs into two distinct groups: 'societal' and 'isolated' SSEs.

*Methods:* We summarise SSEs that have occurred using multiple databases that have been cross referenced to ensure numbers are as reliable as we can ascertain. This enables more focussed and productive control of the current pandemic and future pandemics, especially as countries and regions ease lockdown restrictions.

*Results and discussion:* 'Societal' SSEs pose a significant threat as members of the event are free to mingle and can infect individuals in the outside community. On the other hand, 'isolated' SSEs can be effectively quarantined as only a few individuals can transmit the virus from the isolated community to the outside community, therefore lowering further societal infection.

© 2020 The British Infection Association. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Is it possible that the Rose Garden event at the White House was a superspreading event (SSE)? The term 'superspreading events' was initially coined in 2005 by Lloyd-Smith et al. 'in which certain individuals infected unusually large numbers of secondary cases'.<sup>1</sup> Now, a 'COVID-19 At The White House Contact Tracker' has been made publicly available,<sup>2</sup> we suggest that there seems to be an emergence of an SSE via the front two rows resulting in 11 positive members (including President Trump), 22 negative members and 74 unknowns, to the best of our knowledge. The source and date of infections will never be definitive but the data we have thus far indicates this was an SSE.

An SSE can act as a catalyst for outbreaks. To catalogue this further, we searched multiple available databases including PubMed and Nexis, using terms including "superspreader", "spreader", "COVID-19", "SARS-CoV-2", "clusters of infection" and "superspreader event". Table 1 includes reported SSEs, which had a total infection number per location of greater than 6. Data sources included many news agency articles, which have been cross-referenced to ensure that numbers presented were reliable, as much as we can ascertain.

While many attribute SSEs to individuals who shed more virus particles than normal, environmental conditions appear to outweigh this. The quick identification of the type of SSE an environment favours is pivotal in correct implementation of preventative measures to minimise greater infection. It is clear that in order to prevent future outbreaks, far more control needs to involve the prevention of 'societal' SSE's where environmental factors predominate, while rapid staff isolation in 'isolated' SSEs is key.

There is heterogeneity in the calculated R<sub>0</sub> for SARS-CoV-2, and as such, various predictions from the estimated  $R_0$  need to be considered as a context-dependent variable with non-pharmaceutical interventions having a key role. Estimations, using epidemiological models that allow for heterogeneity, have now suggested that a population infection rate of  $\sim 40\%$  (or even as low as  $20\%^3$ ) can help achieve herd immunity.<sup>4,5</sup> Virus particles in droplets from coughs and sneezes of an infected person can travel many metres by forming a turbulent multiphase gas cloud, protecting the droplets from evaporation.<sup>6,7</sup> Only a small viral load is thought to be needed to establish an infection; in other infections it has been thought that a single virus can initiate an infection,<sup>8</sup> and this could potentially apply to SARS-CoV-2. It is clear why large gatherings, without appropriate personal protective equipment (PPE), ventilation, and hygiene, create an environment for efficient transmission. In some settings, the long-range transmission of the virus between

\* Corresponding author. E-mail address: dasha.majra@student.manchester.ac.uk (D. Majra).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2020.11.021

0163-4453/© 2020 The British Infection Association. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Please cite this article as: D. Majra, J. Benson, J. Pitts et al., SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19) superspreader events, Journal of Infection, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2020.11.021

D. Majra, J. Benson, J. Pitts et al.

distant locations is viable due to air flows driven by: i) the opening of particular windows and doors, ii) through the mass movement of people and, iii) via ventilation systems.<sup>9</sup> In these scenarios, due to 'superspreading', the  $R_e$  can reach higher levels because of environmental conditions that favour transmission.

During recent outbreaks, SSEs played a significant part in the burst of new infections early on, facilitating the MERS-CoV outbreak in South Korea, and the 2014/15 Ebola crisis in Western Africa.<sup>10</sup> One of the most widely reported SSEs related to a UK citizen contracting the disease in Singapore, who subsequently infected 11 others while on a skiing trip in the French Alps, as well as further individuals upon return to England. It is notable here that one child infected while displaying symptoms did not transmit the virus when visiting 3 schools.<sup>11</sup> Clearly, children are less likely to develop severe complications from the disease, where a significant proportion are asymptomatic/or have subclinical symptoms<sup>12</sup> and a meta-analysis shows those <20 years have an odds ratio of 0.56 for being an infected contact compared to those who are older, indicating children are less susceptible compared to adults.<sup>14</sup> Evidence suggests children are not the primary source of infection in most household clusters as 9.7% of 31 transmission clusters identified were thought to have children as a paediatric index case.<sup>13</sup> Further, transmission between children does not play a vital role in the formation of SSEs with explanations including lower levels of ACE2 present in the nasal epithelium of children compared to adults.<sup>15</sup> However, children can be seen as a source of contagion<sup>23</sup> despite being asymptomatic. Those in lower socioeconomic backgrounds are of particular concern since multigenerational cohabitation is more common which leads to higher chance of spread to the vulnerable elderly population.<sup>23</sup>

In Table 1, the Singapore school SSE concerned a child transmitting the virus: of 26 cases identified, only staff members in the school were infected (as well as family members of a previously identified COVID-19 patient).<sup>21</sup> In Salt Lake City, Utah, 3 outbreaks in childcare facilities occurred where 54% of the cases were linked to children:12 children in the childcare facilities had COVID-19 with transmission to at least 26% of non-facility contacts.<sup>81</sup> Here, 2 out of the 3 asymptomatic children had transmitted the infection (1 mother had been hospitalised as she was presumably infected by her asymptomatic child).<sup>81</sup> Due to transmission from children to their household, sufficient testing of close contacts and children (regardless of symptoms) together with prompt test results may improve control of spread. Some estimates suggest that 80% of adults with the virus are aymptomatic.<sup>82</sup> Similarly, we do not know the testing protocol for US politicians and other attendees of the Rose Garden event. While it seems that transmission from children is rare, the difficulty in maintenance of social distancing between children in schools can permit SSEs to arise; it seems the same applies to adults in the Rose Garden.

Table 1 shows data suggesting that specific environments favour large clusters of infection. Table 1A summarises all of the recorded SARS-CoV-2 'societal' SSEs, where no controls could be implemented to prevent individuals from transmitting the virus to people in the outside, or wider, community after the event. Table 1B displays the recorded SARS-CoV-2 'isolated' SSEs, where isolation of the particular event appeared to effectively prevent further transmission. The categorisation of SSEs into 'isolated' and 'societal' is pivotal here, permitting an understanding of how future outbreaks can be effectively controlled. 'Societal' SSEs pose a significant threat as members of the event are free to mingle and can infect individuals in the outside community. On the other hand, 'isolated' SSEs can be quarantined as only a few individuals can transmit the virus from the isolated community to the outside community. Although those in 'isolated' superspreading environments can transmit SARS-CoV-2 to people in the outside community, the lower societal contact may lessen the resulting rate of infection in comparison to a COVID-19 outburst deriving from a 'societal' SSE. Thus, while the percentage of COVID-19 cases derived from SSEs is impossible to calculate, 'societal' SSEs act to intensify the infection rate of the outside community in comparison to 'isolated' SSEs.

While many consider aeroplanes a critical superspreading environment, few SSEs have been traced back to air travel. Most modern aircraft have High Efficient Particle Absorption-Filter (HEPA) systems installed, acting to mix fresh air with filtered recirculated air., able to remove particles below 0.1 µm in size.<sup>24</sup> One study demonstrated the air quality in the cabins/cockpits of 69 measurement flights was 'similar or better than what is observed in normal indoor environments'.<sup>25</sup> However, the close proximity of passengers to one another can facilitate the transmission of disease, which can be outlined via the recent outbreak on an Emirates flight to Hong Kong where 26 passengers tested positive,<sup>26</sup> and on a commercial airline flight from Tel Aviv to Frankfurt.<sup>27</sup> It appears that minimal transmission occurred on the plane, and the majority were infected prior to the flight.

On the Charles de Gaulle aircraft carrier, a total of 1081 out of 2300 onboard were infected.<sup>26</sup> Comparably, the SSE on the USS Theodore Roosevelt culminated in 1156 crew members testing positive.<sup>29</sup> Cramped indoor spaces, shared cabins and in particular, the lack of ventilation, combined with unfiltered, recirculated air conditioning aided the virus's reproduction rate. On the Diamond Princess, it was believed that passengers first transmitted COVID-19 to crew members at the beginning of the outbreak, and subsequent spread amongst the crew was localised to food service workers. An investigation illustrated 20 confirmed crew member cases out of 1068 crew members of which 15 were food service workers – the infection rate was likely intensified due to the crowded nature of the kitchens.<sup>30</sup>

Care homes have been associated with a significant number of SSEs. Historically, the most common pathogen to cause outbreaks in long term health facilities has been influenza, with some studies reporting a median infection rate of 33% across residents and 23% across staff during other epidemics.<sup>17</sup> Similarly, in a study, all 408 residents of a large Boston shelter for the homeless were tested for SARS-CoV-2 by PCR: of all who tested positive, 87.8% were asymptomatic, demonstrating that symptomatic screening may not be an effective way to prevent large clusters of infection.<sup>18</sup> Outbreaks in care homes and ships can be controlled more effectively via complete isolation. While workers can still transmit infection to the outside community, the resulting outbreaks from these 'isolated' SSEs can be effectively lessened through the identification of the environment and the establishment of appropriate protocols that can minimise societal infection, such as the implementation of staff isolation rooms.

A Bavarian COVID-19 outbreak, at the end of January 2020 permitted longitudinal study of transmission events, as well as secondary attack rates and the incubation period of the disease. A median incubation period of 4 days was observed, and while lower than the previously reported 5.2 days, the timely reporting of prodromal cases may have brought down the number. The investigation discovered that the secondary attack rate of household contacts was 10%, whereas the secondary attack rate of a household cohort was 75%. The decrease in percentage correlated to the isolation of symptomatic patients. Contact tracing revealed that the secondary attack rate of 217 non-household contacts was 5% and while low, more proactive isolation could have further prevented spread. This illustrates that substantial transmission occurred pre-symptomatically, as well as during prodromal symptoms.<sup>19</sup> A further study examined a total of 110 cases among 11 clusters, where 24.6% were primary cases that generated secondary cases. They demonstrated that the odds that a primary case transmitted COVID-19 in a closed environment was 18.7 times higher than in an open-air enviornement.<sup>16</sup>

# <u>ARTICLE IN PRESS</u>

[m5G;November 29, 2020;14:10] Journal of Infection xxx (xxxx) xxx

D.	Majra,	J.	Benson,	I.	Pitts	et	al.
----	--------	----	---------	----	-------	----	-----

Religious         South Korea         2         4531         41           Religious         Germany         2         171         42, 43           Religious         USA         3         150         44-46           Religious         Netherlands         1         102         47           Religious         Netherlands         1         102         47           Religious         Netherlands         1         102         47           Religious         Singapore         2         33         48           Religious         Hong Kong         1         19         79           Worker Dormitories         Singapore         17         1690         48           Work (Food Processing Plant)         Germany         1         1029         49           Work (Food Processing Plant)         USA         3         779         50           Work (Food Processing Plant)         UK         4         469         52           Work (Food Processing Plant)         UK         4         469         52           Work         Singapore         2         34         48           Work         China         3         25         53-55
Religious         Germany         2         171         42. 43           Religious         USA         3         150         44-46           Religious         Netherlands         1         102         47           Religious         Netherlands         1         102         47           Religious         Netherlands         1         102         47           Religious         Singapore         2         33         48           Religious         Hong Kong         1         19         79           Worker Dormitories         Singapore         17         1690         48           Work (Food Processing Plant)         Germany         1         1029         49           Work (Food Processing Plant)         USA         3         779         50           Work (Food Processing Plant)         UK         4         469         52           Work (Food Processing Plant)         UK         4         469         52           Work         Singapore         2         34         48           Work         China         3         25         53-55           School         France         1         130         22
ReligiousUSA315044-46ReligiousNetherlands110247ReligiousSingapore23348ReligiousHong Kong11979Worker DormitoriesSingapore17169048Work (Food Processing Plant)Germany1102949Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
ReligiousNetherlands110247ReligiousSingapore23348ReligiousHong Kong11979Worker DormitoriesSingapore17169048Work (Food Processing Plant)Germany1102949Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)Ghana153451Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael13022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
ReligiousSingapore23348ReligiousHong Kong11979Worker DormitoriesSingapore17169048Work (Food Processing Plant)Germany1102949Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)Ghana153451Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
ReligiousHong Kong11979Worker DormitoriesSingapore17169048Work (Food Processing Plant)Germany1102949Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)Ghana153451Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
Worker DormitoriesSingapore17169048Work (Food Processing Plant)Germany1102949Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
Work (Food Processing Plant)Germany1102949Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)Ghana153451Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
Work (Food Processing Plant)USA377950Work (Food Processing Plant)Ghana153451Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
Work (Food Processing Plant)Ghana153451Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
Work (Food Processing Plant)UK446952WorkSingapore23448WorkChina32553-55SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
Work         Singapore         2         34         48           Work         China         3         25         53-55           School         France         1         133         56           School         Israel         1         130         22           School         New Zealand         1         96         57           School         Singapore         1         26         21
Work         China         3         25         53-55           School         France         1         133         56           School         Israel         1         130         22           School         New Zealand         1         96         57           School         Singapore         1         26         21
SchoolFrance113356SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
SchoolIsrael113022SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
SchoolNew Zealand19657SchoolSingapore12621
School Singapore 1 26 21
Shopping Singapore 3 122 48
Shopping China 3 44 55, 58, 59
Hospital South Korea 1 118 41
Hospital China 1 54 <sup>60</sup>
Hospital Japan 2 20 <sup>61</sup>
Bar Japan 6 100 <sup>61</sup>
Bar Zurich 1 6 <sup>38</sup>
Bar New Zealand 1 77 <sup>62</sup>
Bar Germany 1 16 <sup>63</sup>
Bar Austria 1 15 <sup>64</sup>
Bar Hong Kong 4 106 <sup>79</sup>
Building Site Singapore 3 90 48
Conference USA 1 89 <sup>65</sup>
Conference lapan 1 10 <sup>61</sup>
Sport South Korea 1 65 66
Sport Japan 2 20 <sup>61</sup>
Meal Singapore 2 55 <sup>48</sup>
Meal China 2 19 <sup>67</sup>
Aircraft Dubai $\rightarrow$ Hong Kong 1 26 $2^6$
Skiing France 1 11 <sup>11</sup>
Funeral India 1 16 <sup>77</sup>
Wedding Hong Kong 2 22 <sup>79</sup>
Bus riders China 1 30 <sup>80</sup>
Household China 5 39 67-70

### Table 1A

SARS-CoV-2 'societal' superspreader events.

Table 1B

SARS-CoV-2 'isolated' superspreader events.

Setting	Country	Clusters	Total Infected	
Navy Ship	USA	1	1156	29
Navy Ship	France	1	1081	28
Cruise Ship – Ruby Princess	N/A	1	662	71
Cruise Ship - Diamond Princess	N/A	1	620	72
Prison	USA	1	358	73
Elderly Care	USA	1	167	74
Elderly Care	Germany	1	74	75
Elderly Care	France	1	45	75
Elderly Care	Scotland	3	>30	76
Elderly Care	Italy	1	>27	75

Religious events are displayed at the top of Table 1A. The most notable SSE relating to a religious gathering involves the Shincheonji Church in Daegu, South Korea. An individual with the designated name 'patient 31' was thought to be the source. The outbreak caused exacerbated infection rates in South Korea, leading the country to have the most confirmed cases at that time outside of mainland China<sup>31</sup>; over 5000 cases were related to the Shincheonji SSE.<sup>32</sup> Tightly packed church services and a ban on face masks exacerbated infection rates.<sup>33</sup> Singing probably played a role too as has been evident for choirs: in another event attended by 61 individuals in Washington, an attack rate of 53.3% to 86.7% occurred.<sup>34</sup> Similarly, the Haj is known to involve an environment which favours the transmission of infectious diseases as illustrated by the Neisseria meningitidis serogroup W135 outbreak of 2001, that had an attack rate of 25 cases/100,000 pilgrims.<sup>35,36</sup>

Worker dormitories, especially in Singapore, and meat processing plants in countries such as the USA have been critical sources of COVID-19 infections. Such examples can be attributed to confined spaces and poor ventilation. We speculate that airconditioning lowers the relative humidity for a droplet expelled at body temperature (37<sup>o</sup>C, or higher if febrile), allowing for a warm droplet to become a smaller droplet that can be suspended for longer, travel further, and penetrate deeper into the lung. If the temperature is lower than body temperature, then the difference in ambient versus body temperature results in a lower relative humidity for the droplet. Therefore, from the perspective of the droplet, the colder the ambient temperature, the lower the relative humidity and more evaporation is facilitated. Evaporation then shrinks the droplet to make it smaller and more likely to be aerosolised. In the case of Singapore, migrants were crammed into rooms with up to 20 people sleeping in confined spaces.<sup>37</sup> While it is tempting to state that the first step to preventing SSEs from occurring might be the quick identification and isolation of potentially infectious individuals, as asymptomatic or pre-symptomatic spread is often the norm, the reality is this is not going to be possible.<sup>20</sup>

Care facilities, religious gatherings, and hospitals have been the primary source of COVID-19 clusters and multiple SSEs can be traced back to gyms, bars and nightclubs. Alcohol-induced carefree attitudes, coupled with asymptomatic transmission, culminates in

## ARTICLE IN PRESS

#### [m5G;November 29, 2020;14:10]

Journal of Infection xxx (xxxx) xxx

#### D. Majra, J. Benson, J. Pitts et al.

a cramped indoor environment which facilitates transmission. A Zurich nightclub experienced an SSE, whereby, a single asymptomatic male infected 5 club visitors resulting in all 300 employees and visitors being placed under guarantine.<sup>38</sup> An investigation of clusters in Japan noted that many SSEs arose as a result of 'heavy breathing in close proximity', such as conversations in bars and karaoke parties.<sup>39</sup> Places that offer eating and drinking on-site may contribute to SSEs as "adults with positive SARS-CoV-2 test results were approximately twice as likely to have reported dining at a restaurant than those with negative results".<sup>78</sup> A total of 112 fitness dance-related COVID-19 cases was recorded at 12 different sports facilities in Cheonan, South Korea. The 'moist, warm atmosphere in a sports facility coupled with turbulent airflow generated by intense physical exercise could cause more dense transmission of isolated droplets' is relevant.<sup>40</sup> As aforementioned, while virus particles can travel significant distances, social distancing eliminates close contact and acts to reduce transmission through breathing. The images of closely packed individuals at the White House's Rose Garden suggest disregard for social distancing.

SSEs cannot be identified a priori but are a major route of presymptomatic or asymptomatic transmission. From these cases, we suggest that the quick identification of 'societal' and 'isolated' SSEs can allow us to more effectively tackle virus transmission. Members of 'isolated' SSEs that could potentially spread the virus to the outside community can be quarantined which could decrease the likelihood of a 'societal' SSE occurring. Use of contact tracing and testing could be beneficial in detecting these individuals to prevent a national lockdown. From our data, there are generally more 'societal' SSEs compared to 'isolated'. The data from 'isolated' SSEs suggest that SARS-CoV-2 is much more infectious and has a lower infection fatality rate than many suggest.

#### Role of the funding source

None.

#### **Declaration of Competing Interest**

JS' conflicts which are not relevant to this piece can be found at: https://www.nature.com/onc/editors. No other authors declare a conflict.

#### References

- Lloyd-Smith J, Schreiber S, Kopp P, Getz W. Superspreading and the effect of individual variation on disease emergence. *Nature* 2005;438(7066):355–9. doi:10.1038/nature04153.
- 2. Peter James Walker. COVID-19 at the White House- Contact Tracker. Tableau Public online. https://public.tableau.com/profile/peter.james.walker#!/vizhome/ COVID-19attheWhiteHouse-ContactTracking/Home.
- Aguas R, Corder RM, King JG, Gonçalves G, Ferreira MU. Herd Immunity Thresholds for SARS-CoV-2 Estimated from Unfolding Epidemics; 2020. doi:10.1101/2020. 07.23.20160762.
- Britton T, Ball FPro VO A mathematical model reveals the influence of population heterogeneity on herd immunity to SARS-CoV-2. Science 2020;369(6505):846–9.
- Gomes M.G.M., Corder R.M., King J.G., Langwig K.E., Souto-Maior C. Individual variation in susceptibility or exposure to SARS-CoV-2 lowers the herd immunity threshold. 2020. 10.1101/2020.04.27.20081893.
- Bourouiba L. Turbulent gas clouds and respiratory pathogen emissions. JAMA 2020. doi:10.1001/jama.2020.4756.
- Zhang R, Profile VO, Li Y, Zhang AL, Profile VO, Wang Y, et al. Identifying airborne transmission as the dominant route for the spread of COVID-19. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 2020;**117**(26):14857–63.
- Asadi S, Bouvier N, Wexler A, Ristenpart W. The coronavirus pandemic and aerosols: does COVID-19 transmit via expiratory particles? *Aerosol Sci Technol* 2020;54(6):635–8. doi:10.1080/02786826.2020.1749229.
- Tang J, Li Y, Eames I, Chan P, Ridgway G. Factors involved in the aerosol transmission of infection and control of ventilation in healthcare premises. J Hosp Infect 2006;64(2):100–14. doi:10.1016/j.jhin.2006.05.022.
- Wong G, Liu W, Liu Y, Zhou B, Bi Y, Gao G. MERS, SARS, and Ebola: the role of super-spreaders in infectious disease. *Cell Host Microbe* 2015;**18**(4):398–401. doi:10.1016/j.chom.2015.09.013.

- 11. Danis K, Epaulard O, Bénet T, et al. Cluster of coronavirus disease 2019 (Covid-19) in the French Alps, 2020. *Clin Infect Dis* 2020. doi:10.1093/cid/ciaa424.
- Zeng L, Xia S, Yuan W, et al. Neonatal early-onset infection with SARS-CoV-2 in 33 neonates born to mothers with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China. JAMA Pediatr 2020. doi:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2020.0878.
- Zhu Y., Bloxham C., Hulme K. et al. Children are unlikely to have been the primary source of household SARS-CoV-2 infections. 2020. doi:10.1101/2020.03.26.20044826.
- Viner RM, Mytton OT, Bonell C, et al. Susceptibility to SARS-CoV-2 infection among children and adolescents compared with adults: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *JAMA Pediatr* 2020 Published online September 25. doi:10.1001/ jamapediatrics.2020.4573.
- Bunyavanich S, Do A, Vicencio A. Nasal gene expression of angiotensinconverting enzyme 2 in children and adults. JAMA 2020. doi:10.1001/jama.2020. 8707.
- Nishiura H., Oshitani H., Kobayashi T. et al. Closed environments facilitate secondary transmission of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). 2020. doi:10.1101/2020.02.28.20029272.
- Lai C, Wang J, Ko W, et al. COVID-19 in long-term care facilities: an upcoming threat that cannot be ignored. J Microbiol Immunol Infect 2020. doi:10.1016/j. jmii.2020.04.008.
- Baggett T, Keyes H, Sporn N, Gaeta J. Prevalence of SARS-CoV-2 infection in residents of a large homeless shelter in Boston. JAMA 2020. doi:10.1001/jama.2020. 6887.
- Böhmer M, Buchholz U, Corman V, et al. Investigation of a COVID-19 outbreak in Germany resulting from a single travel-associated primary case: a case series. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2020. doi:10.1016/s1473-3099(20)30314-5.
- Wei W., Li Z., Chiew C., Yong S., Toh M., Lee V. Presymptomatic transmission of SARS-CoV-2 – Singapore, January 23–March 16, 2020.
- MOH | News Highlights. Web.archive.org. http://web.archive.org/web/ 20200420074230/https://www.moh.gov.sg/news-highlights/details/16-morecases-discharged-35-new-cases-of-covid-19-infection-confirmed. Published 2020.
- 22. Kadari-Ovadia S., Hasson N., Efrati I. Schools in Jerusalem shut as dozens of students, staff test positive for the coronavirus. haaretz.com. https: //www.haaretz.com/israel-news/.premium-half-of-new-coronavirus-cases-in-schools-came-from-single-school-in-jerusalem-1.8885755. Published 2020.
- Yonker LM, Neilan AM, Bartsch Y, Patel AB, Regan J. Pediatric SARS-CoV-2: clinical presentation, infectivity, and immune responses. J Pediatr 2020.
- Iata.org. https://www.iata.org/contentassets/f1163430bba94512a583eb6d6b24aa56/ cabin-air-quality.pdf. Published 2020.
- 25. Schuchardt S., Bitsch A., Koch W., Rosenberger W. Final report preliminary cabin air quality measurement campaign (CAQ) EASA.2014.C15 and preliminary cabin air quality measurement campaign – CAQ II EASA.2014.C15.SU01. Easa.europa.eu. https://www.easa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/dfu/EASA% 20CAQ%20Study%20Final%20Report\_21.03.2017.pdf. Published 2014.
- Orban A. 26 passengers tested positive for Covid-19 on an Emirates flight to Hong Kong - aviation24.be. Aviation24.be. https://www.aviation24.be/airlines/ emirates-airline/26-passengers-tested-positive-on-an-emirates-flight-tohong-kong/. Published 2020.
- Hoehl S, Karaca O, Kohmer N. Assessment of SARS-CoV-2 transmission on an international flight and among a tourist group. JAMA Netw Open 2020;3(8):e2018044 2020.
- Porterfield C. More Than 1, 000 French Sailors Test Positive For Coronavirus—On A Single Ship; Published 2020. Forbes https://www.forbes. com/sites/carlieporterfield/2020/04/18/more-than-1000-french-sailors-testpositive-for-coronavirus-on-a-single-ship/#6755f1583732.
- Doornbos C. https://www.stripes.com/news/pacific/uss-theodore-rooseveltskipper-says-carrier-won-t-wait-for-all-sailors-to-clear-quarantine-beforegoing-back-to-sea-1.628458. Published 2020.
- Kakimoto K., Kamiya H., Yamagishi T., Matsui T., Suzuki M., Wakita T. Initial investigation of transmission of COVID-19 among crew members during quarantine of a cruise ship – Yokohama, Japan, 2020.
- Hernandez M., Scarr S., Sharma M. 2019 coronavirus: the Korean clusters. Reuters. https://graphics.reuters.com/CHINA-HEALTH-SOUTHKOREA-CLUSTERS/ 0100B5G33SB/index.html. Published 2020. Accessed May 14, 2020.
- South Korea: Shincheonji church related COVID-19 cases 2020 | Statista. Statista. https://www.statista.com/statistics/1103080/ south-korea-covid-19-cases-related-to-shincheonji-church/. Published 2020.
- Hancocks P, Seo Y. How Novel Coronavirus Spread Through the Shincheonji Religious Group in South Korea. CNN; Published 2020 https://edition.cnn.com/2020/ 02/26/asia/shincheonji-south-korea-hnk-intl/index.html.
- Hamner L., Dubbel P., Capron I. et al. High SARS-CoV-2 attack rate following exposure at a choir practice – Skagit County, Washington, March 2020.
- 35. Wilder-Smith A, Goh K, Barkham T, Paton N. Hajj-associated outbreak strain of Neisseria meningitidis serogroup W135: estimates of the attack rate in a defined population and the risk of invasive disease developing in carriers. *Clin Infect Dis* 2003;**36**(6):679–83. doi:10.1086/367858.
- Saudi Arabia restricts Hajj to 'small, limited' number due to COVID-19. Voice of America Published 2020. https://www.voanews.com/covid-19-pandemic/ saudi-arabia-restricts-hajj-small-limited-number-due-covid-19.
- Ratcliffe R. 'We're in a prison': Singapore's migrant workers suffer as Covid-19 surges back. the Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/apr/23/ singapore-million-migrant-workers-suffer-as-covid-19-surges-back. Published 2020.

# **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

#### [m5G;November 29, 2020;14:10]

Journal of Infection xxx (xxxx) xxx

D. Majra, J. Benson, J. Pitts et al.

JID: YJINF

- «Superspreader»: 300 Visiteurs d'un Club Zurichois en Quarantaine. Le Temps. https://www.letemps.ch/suisse/superspreader-300-visiteurs-dun-clubzurichois-quarantaine?utm\_source=POLITICO.EU&utm\_campaign=4cfd6ca4cf-EMAIL\_CAMPAIGN\_2020\_06\_28\_03\_00&utm\_medium=email&utm\_term= 0\_10959edeb5-4cfd6ca4cf-190608896. Published 2020.
- Furuse Y, Sando E, Tsuchiya N, et al. Clusters of coronavirus disease in communities, Japan, January–April 2020. Emerg Infect Dis 2020;26(9). doi:10.3201/ eid2609.202272.
- 40. Jang S, Han S, Rhee J. Cluster of coronavirus disease associated with fitness dance classes, South Korea. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2020;**26**(8). doi:10.3201/eid2608. 200633.
- Shim E, Tariq A, Choi W, Lee Y, Chowell G. Transmission potential and severity of COVID-19 in South Korea. Int J Infect Dis 2020;93:339–44. doi:10.1016/j.ijid. 2020.03.031.
- 42. Corona-Ausbruch bei Baptisten: Zahl der Infizierten steigt auf 200. https: //www.fuldaerzeitung.de. https://www.fuldaerzeitung.de/kinzigtal/coronavirusausbruch-gottesdienst-frankfurt-hanau-main-kinzig-kreis-gemeindegesangkritik-kaminsky-stolz-90001759.html. Published 2020.
- Connolly K. Germany to set out rules for religious services including singing ban. The Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/apr/ 29/germany-to-set-out-rules-for-religious-services-including-singing-ban. Published 2020.
- 44. Moffitt B. Sacramento County Says Church With 71 COVID-19 Cases Ignoring Stay-At-Home Order, Leaders Dispute Claim. Capradio.org; Published 2020 https://www.capradio.org/articles/2020/04/02/sacramento-county-says-churchwith\_71-covid\_19-cases\_input\_say\_at\_home\_orders\_leaders\_disput\_ectain/
- with-71-covid-19-cases-ignoring-stay-at-home-order-leaders-dispute-claim/.
  45. Zauzmer J. Take It Very Seriously': Pastor at Arkansas Church Where 34 People Came Down with Coronavirus Sends a Warning. Washington Post; Published 2020 http://web.archive.org/web/20200420073657/https://www.washingtonpost.com/religion/2020/03/24/pastor-arkansas-church-coronavirus-warning-greers-ferry/.
- 46. Read R. A Choir Decided to go Ahead with Rehearsal. Now Dozens of Members Have COVID-19 and Two are Dead. Los Angeles Times; Published 2020 http://web.archive.org/web/20200420073023/https://www.latimes.com/worldnation/story/2020-03-29/coronavirus-choir-outbreak.
- McKie R. Did singing together spread coronavirus to four choirs?. the Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/may/17/did-singingtogether-spread-coronavirus-to-four-choirs. Published 2020.
   COVID-19 Singapore Dashboard. Web.archive.org. http://web.archive.org/
- COVID-19 Singapore Dashboard. Web.archive.org. http://web.archive.org/ web/20200420073524/https://www.againstcovid19.com/singapore?start= 21-01-2020&end=20-04-2020. Published 2020.
- Coronavirus: German slaughterhouse outbreak crosses 1000 | DW | 20.06.2020. DW.COM. https://www.dw.com/en/coronavirus-german-slaughterhouseoutbreak-crosses-1000/a-53883372. Published 2020.
- Cannon A. Eu.desmoinesregister.com. https://eu.desmoinesregister.com/story/ news/2020/04/19/coronavirus-iowa-largest-single-day-increase-iowa-covid-19cases-tied-meatpacking-plants/5162127002/. Published 2020.
- Adebayo B. A Worker Infected 533 Others With Coronavirus at a Factory in Ghana, President Says. CNN; Published 2020 https://edition.cnn.com/2020/05/11/africa/ ghana-factory-coronavirus-infection-intl/index.html.
- Halliday J. Over 450 Covid-19 cases reported at food factories in England and Wales. the Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2020/jun/ 25/over-450-covid-19-cases-reported-at-food-factories-in-england-and-wales. Published 2020.
- Park S, Kim Y, Yi S, et al. Coronavirus disease outbreak in call center, South Korea. Emerg Infect Dis 2020;26(8). doi:10.3201/eid2608.201274.
- Cai J, Sun W, Huang J, Gamber M, Wu J, He G. Indirect virus transmission in cluster of COVID-19 cases, Wenzhou, China, 2020. Emerg Infect Dis 2020;26(6). doi:10.3201/eid2606.200412.
- Liu YF e. [Analysis on cluster cases of COVID-19 in Tianjin]. PubMed -NCBI. Ncbi.nlm.nih.gov. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/32213269. Published 2020.
- Fontanet A., Tondeur L., Madec Y. et al. Cluster of COVID-19 in northern France: a retrospective closed cohort study. 2020. doi:10.1101/2020.04.18.20071134.
   COVID-19 - Significant clusters. Ministry of Health NZ. https://www.
- COVID-19 Significant clusters. Ministry of Health NZ. https://www. health.govt.nz/our-work/diseases-and-conditions/covid-19-novel-coronavirus/ covid-19-current-situation/covid-19-current-cases/covid-19-significant-clusters. Published 2020.
- Wu WS e. [Investigation and analysis on characteristics of a cluster of COVID-19 associated with exposure in a department store in Tianjin]. - PubMed -NCBI. Ncbi.nlm.nih.gov. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/32133830. Published 2020.
- 59. Cai J, Sun W, Huang J, Gamber M, Wu J, He G. Indirect virus transmission in cluster of COVID-19 cases, Wenzhou, China, 2020. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2020;**26**(6). doi:10.3201/eid2606.200412.
- Chu J, Yang N, Wei Y, et al. Clinical characteristics of 54 medical staff with COVID-19: a retrospective study in a single center in Wuhan, China. J Med Virol 2020. doi:10.1002/jmv.25793.

- SIM W. Japan identifies 15 clusters as Covid-19 cases mount. The Straits Times; Published 2020 http://web.archive.org/web/20200420073241/ https://www.straitstimes.com/asia/east-asia/japan-identifies-15-clusters-as-covid-19-cases-mount.
- Coronavirus: Matamata bar owner on NZ's biggest Covid-19 cluster outbreak. Stuff. https://www.stuff.co.nz/national/health/coronavirus/121462144/ coronavirus-matamata-bar-owner-on-nzs-biggest-covid19-cluster-outbreak. Published 2020.
- 63. After one infected 16 at Berlin nightclub, coronavirus fears grow. www.aljazeera.com. http://web.archive.org/web/20200420071353/https://www. aljazeera.com/news/2020/03/infected-16-berlin-nightclub-coronavirus-fearsgrow-200310132859234.html. Published 2020.
- CNN D. How an Austrian Ski Resort Helped Coronavirus Spread Across Europe. CNN; Published 2020 https://edition.cnn.com/2020/03/24/europe/austria-ski-resort-ischgl-coronavirus-intl/.
- Marcelo P, O'brien M. Cluster of coronavirus cases tied to U.S. Biotech Meeting. Time.com. http://web.archive.org/web/20200401222019/https:// time.com/5801554/coronavirus-cluster-biotech-biogen-boston-cambridge/. Published 2020.
- 66. Investigation of COVID-19 outbreaks through Zumba dance classes in Korea. KCDC - COVID-19 national emergency response center.
- Liu Y, Eggo R, Kucharski A. Secondary attack rate and superspreading events for SARS-CoV-2. Lancet N Am Ed 2020;395(10227):e47. doi:10.1016/s0140-6736(20) 30462-1.
- Qiu YY e. [Epidemiological analysis on a family cluster of COVID-19]. PubMed - NCBI. Ncbi.nlm.nih.gov. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/32133831. Published 2020.
- 69. Qian G., Yang N., Ma A. et al. COVID-19 transmission within a family cluster by presymptomatic carriers in China.
- Pai SL e. [Analysis of the first cluster of cases in a family of novel coronavirus pneumonia in Gansu Province]. PubMed NCBI. Ncbi.nlm.nih.gov. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/32064855. Published 2020.
   Smee B. NSW health minister defends experts who handled Ruby
- Smee B. NSW health minister defends experts who handled Ruby princess coronavirus outbreak. the Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/ australia-news/2020/apr/04/nsw-health-minister-defends-experts-who-handledruby-princess-coronavirus-outbreak. Published 2020.
- Mizumoto K, Kagaya K, Zarebski A, Chowell G. Estimating the asymptomatic proportion of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) cases on board the diamond princess cruise ship, Yokohama, Japan, 2020. *Eurosurveillance* 2020;25(10). doi:10.2807/1560-7917.es.2020.25.10.2000180.
- Williams T. Chicago's jail is top U.S. hot spot as virus spreads behind bars. Nytimes.com. https://www.nytimes.com/2020/04/08/us/ coronavirus-cook-county-jail-chicago.html. Published 2020.
- McMichael T, Currie D, Clark S, et al. Epidemiology of Covid-19 in a longterm care facility in king county, Washington. N Engl J Med 2020. doi:10.1056/ nejmoa2005412.
- 75. Connolly K. Care homes across globe in spotlight over Covid-19 death rates. the Guardian. http://web.archive.org/web/20200420072433/https://www. theguardian.com/world/2020/apr/09/care-homes-across-globe-in-spotlightover-covid-19-death-rates. Published 2020.
- 76. Pyman T. Nine elderly residents at Scottish nursing home 'die from coronavirus'. Mail Online. https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-8204385/ Nine-elderly-residents-single-Scottish-nursing-home-die-coronavirus.html. Published 2020.
- Kant R., Zaman K., Shankar P., Yadav R. A preliminary study on contact tracing & transmission chain in a cluster of 17 cases of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 infection in Basti, Uttar Pradesh, India. 2020. Indian J Med Res. doi:10.4103/ijmr.IJMR\_2914\_20.
- 78. Fisher KA, Tenforde MW, Feldstein LR, et al. Community and close contact exposures associated with COVID-19 among symptomatic adults ≥18 years in 11 outpatient health care facilities United States, July 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2020;69:1258–64. doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm6936a5externalicon.
- Adam DC, Wu P, Wong JY, et al. Clustering and superspreading potential of SARS-CoV-2 infections in Hong Kong. Nat Med 2020. doi:10.1038/ s41591-020-1092-0.
- Shen Y, Li C, Dong H, et al. Community outbreak investigation of SARS-CoV-2 transmission among bus riders in Eastern China. JAMA Intern Med. 2020 September 01. doi:10.1001/jamainternmed.2020.5225.
- Lopez AS, Hill M, Antezano J, et al. Transmission dynamics of COVID-19 outbreaks associated with child care facilities Salt Lake City, Utah, April–July 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2020;69:1319–23. http://dx.doi.org/10. 15585/mmwr.mm6937e3.
- Milani GP, Bottino I, Rocchi A, et al. Frequency of children vs adults carrying severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 asymptomatically. *JAMA Pediatr* 2020 Published online September 14. doi:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2020.3595.