



NEW ZEALAND **QUALIFICATIONS** AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

Report of External Evaluation and Review

New Zealand Management Academies
Limited

Highly Confident in educational performance

Highly Confident in capability in self-assessment

Date of report: 13 December 2017

Contents

Purpose of this Report.....	3
Introduction	3
1. TEO in context.....	3
2. Scope of external evaluation and review	8
3. Conduct of external evaluation and review.....	9
Summary of Results	11
Findings	13
Recommendations	26
Appendix	27

MoE Number: 8661
NZQA Reference: C25293
Dates of EER visit: 12-15 September 2017

Final Report

Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this external evaluation and review report is to provide a public statement about the Tertiary Education Organisation's (TEO) educational performance and capability in self-assessment. It forms part of the accountability process required by Government to inform investors, the public, students, prospective students, communities, employers, and other interested parties. It is also intended to be used by the TEO itself for quality improvement purposes.

Introduction

1. TEO in context

Name of TEO:	New Zealand Management Academies Limited (NZMA)
Type:	Private training establishment (PTE)
First registered:	1991
Location:	56-60 Carbine Road, Sylvia Park, Auckland (Head Office)
Delivery sites:	12-16 Gordon Road, Otahuhu 56-60 Carbine Road, Sylvia Park, Mt Wellington 31 Moa Street, Otahuhu 621 Great South Road, Manukau Level 6, 131 Queen Street, Auckland CBD Level 2, Tower Building, 42-48 Ward Street, Hamilton Level 4, 54-56 Cambridge Terrace, Te Aro, Wellington Two Vocational Pathways for Service Industries and Hospitality level 2 programmes are delivered at the New Zealand School of Tourism Rotorua campus at 1178 Pukaki Street, Rotorua. One programme is also being delivered at Ngawha Prison in Northland.
Programmes currently delivered:	See: http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers/nqf-accreditations.do?providerId=866128001

Code of Practice signatory:	Yes
Number of students:	<p>3,347 EFTS (equivalent full-time students) in 2016</p> <p>Domestic: 2,978 (42 per cent Māori; 33 per cent Pasifika; 69 per cent under 25)</p> <p>International: 962 full-time students from China, India, South Korea, Sri Lanka and numerous other countries</p> <p>1,920 students were enrolled at the time of the NZQA site visit.</p>
Number of staff:	187 full-time and 24 part-time equivalents
Scope of active accreditation:	http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers/nqf-accreditations.do?providerId=866128001
Distinctive characteristics:	<p>NZMA is a part of a New Zealand-based multinational educational company, ACG Education, which operates in three countries from 50 campuses, with about 17,000 student enrolments annually.</p> <p>In 2016, of the domestic students enrolled, 42 per cent had no formal qualifications and 45 per cent were unemployed prior to enrolling. 'NZMA targets domestic students seeking alternative pathways for employment-focused education and training. These are often young Māori or Pasifika people, previously on welfare benefits, 'second-chance' learners, people with literacy and numbers needs, and/or those seeking a specialised vocational pathway'. (Source: NZMA Investment Plan 2016)</p> <p>NZMA has launched two new initiatives to prepare graduates for employment. The first, a new Employment Incubation Programme, has students undergo intensive pre-employment training to ensure they are 'work-ready'. Based on the principles of a business incubator, the programme takes students through the entire employment process, in a realistic workplace environment, with the full support of the company's academic, employment and careers teams. The second, a new Post Placement</p>

Support Programme, will see graduates and their employers receive ongoing support for six months to ensure a smooth transition to full-time permanent employment.

Recent significant changes: In 2014, NZMA opened the Sylvia Park campus which includes purpose-built hospitality training facilities. International student enrolments have increased. In late 2014, the PTE was purchased by ACG Education.

In 2016, ACG was purchased by Pacific Equity Partners.

In 2017 NZMA decided to close its Wellington campus as it was not deemed viable with the programme portfolio (the programmes are currently being taught out). A new trades campus will be opened on Great South Road, Mt Wellington at the beginning of 2018.

There have been various changes and adjustments made to the overall operating structure and sharing of services within the ACG Education PTEs.

Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) funding has increased significantly since the previous external evaluation and review (EER) based on NZMA's performance against its investment plan. NZMA is one of five PTEs to have received a three-year funding approval from the TEC.

Previous quality assurance history:

External evaluation and review

At the previous EER in September 2013, NZQA was Highly Confident in NZMA's educational performance and Highly Confident in its capability in self-assessment. The report made three recommendations, mainly relating to self-assessment and compliance. At that time, 2,368 students were enrolled.

Approvals and accreditations

NZMA made 28 applications to NZQA in 2017. These included site approval and programme approval or change applications. None were declined, one was withdrawn, all others were

approved.

Tertiary assessment and moderation

From 2014 to 2016, NZQA externally moderated assessment samples for standards from the following moderation systems: Accounting; Adult Education; Business and Management; Communication Skills; Computing 1-4; Core Skills; Early Childhood Education; Film and Electronic Media; Literacy; Numeracy; Performing Arts Technology; Technology; and Visual Arts 1-4. Results for 2014, 2015 and 2016 were deemed satisfactory by NZQA. Overall results for this moderation are tabulated below.¹

Consistency reviews

At an NZQA consistency review in October 2016, the graduates of the New Zealand Certificate in Retail (Level 3) were deemed to have met the graduate profile.

Other:

In May 2017, NZMA received a joint NZQA and Immigration New Zealand letter detailing concerns over Indian student visa decline rates. NZMA responded by outlining measures and steps in place to improve visa approval rates. NZMA has also received a follow-up notice confirming that NZMA had exceeded the initial approval rate target. The target visa approval rate for 31 December 2017 is 60 per cent approval, and at the time of the EER it was 58 per cent.

The TEC audited NZMA in 2016 in relation to funding provision for domestic students. There

1

Year	Standards moderated	'A' Approved	'M' Modify	'X' Not approved	'N' Evidence not required	Learner samples approved
2014	5	1	0	0	4	12/15
2015	7	3	1	0	3	20/21
2016	22	6	6	3	7	59/76

were seven recommendations which were largely administrative and/or related to modifying some processes as a result of structural changes in relation to the acquisition of the PTE by ACG.

Immigration New Zealand has visited NZMA in 2017 for monitoring purposes relating to international students. In a routine, unannounced visit to the NZMA Sylvia Park campus on 16 November 2016, Immigration New Zealand reviewed attendance and attendance recording systems. On 18 July 2017 Immigration New Zealand conducted another visit for the audit of the online visa approval system following a student document check. There were no irregularities identified.

NZMA has a memorandum of understanding outlining pathways for its graduates into Auckland University of Technology degree programmes. They have also joined the Māori and Pasifika Trades Training Auckland Consortium alongside Manukau Institute of Technology and Unitec.

NZMA's Sylvia Park campus won a Property Council New Zealand award in June 2014, gaining an award of excellence in the Coffey Education and Arts Property Award category.

NZMA assisted NZQA with the retesting and subsequent enrolment of 125 international students previously with another PTE which voluntarily gave up its accreditation for the affected programmes.

2. Scope of external evaluation and review

Focus areas and rationale for selection		
Five focus areas were included in this evaluation. Together they cover the majority of student enrolments and the mandatory focus area for international providers.		
1.	International Student Support and Wellbeing	NZQA is committed to the responsible development and delivery of education to international students. It is essential to New Zealand's 'brand' to ensure that all students are adequately supported in their programmes of study. To that end, from August 2016, NZQA introduced a standard focus area for all EERs of TEOs that enrol international students. This focus area examined how effectively the TEO under review is discharging its pastoral care responsibilities towards its international students.
2.	Food and Beverage Service (comprising New Zealand Certificate in Food and Beverage Service (Level 3 and 4))	This is a large area of delivery, with over 370 enrolments at the time of planning the EER. Programmes are offered at the Sylvia Park, Auckland South and Waikato campuses. International students also enrol in the Food and Beverage vocational area.
3.	Diploma in Professional Cookery (Level 5)	This is a large, higher-level area of delivery with over 360 enrolments (both domestic and international students) at the time of planning the EER. Enrolments are mainly at the Sylvia Park campus. The aim of this programme is to develop the skills and knowledge required by commercial chefs. It covers a broad range of basic and advanced cookery knowledge and the skills required for entry to the industry and progression as a chef in hospitality. The programme incorporates the New Zealand Certificates in Cookery (Level 3 and 4).
4.	Youth Guarantee learners	Youth Guarantee-funded programmes comprise some 350 16-19-year-old students across campuses (including a high proportion of Māori and Pasifika learners). This is a fees-free programme targeting those who may have struggled at school or have had a disrupted education. Students can achieve a level 2 or 3 hospitality-related qualification at NCEA Level 1 and 2. The programme is

		structured around an NZQA-approved Vocational Pathway in service industries. It is delivered at the Sylvia Park, Auckland South and Waikato campuses, and in Rotorua.
5.	Diploma in Applied Management (Level 7)	Along with a Diploma in Hospitality Management, this Applied Management programme is NZMA's highest level of programme delivery. There were 50 students enrolled at the time of the EER visit. The programme is delivered almost exclusively to international students at the Auckland city campus. Students can choose to study a strand in Procurement and Supply Chain Management; Professional Retailing; Project Management; Health Management. The diploma includes an internship arranged and overseen through NZMA where students work in a business context.

3. Conduct of external evaluation and review

All external evaluation and reviews are conducted in accordance with NZQA's published policies and procedures. The methodology used is described fully in the web document Policy and Guidelines for the Conduct of External Evaluation and Review available at: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/registration-and-accreditation/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction>. The TEO has an opportunity to comment on the accuracy of this report, and any submissions received are fully considered by NZQA before finalising the report.

Four NZQA evaluators visited NZMA over four days. They visited the Sylvia Park, Otahuhu, Manukau, Auckland city and Waikato campuses. They interviewed the chief executive and other senior staff: academic quality, learning and development, the literacy and numeracy team, careers, international student care, and recruitment staff. Teachers from the focus area programmes, students, a few graduates and industry stakeholders were also interviewed. Registry and other office staff provided access to student files and related quality assurance systems including the customer relationship management system and the intranet. The ACG group chief executive was interviewed by phone, as was a TEC investment manager, to obtain additional information.

Documentation and reports sampled and considered as part of this evaluation included: NZMA's self-assessment summary, a TEC audit report, NZQA and industry training organisation moderation, curriculum materials and assessments, timetables, student files, planning documents and meeting minutes. Most of the documentation viewed on site was selected at random based on reference by staff to NZMA's key tools and processes during the interviews.

Disclaimer

Final Report

The findings in this report have been reached by means of a standard evaluative process: <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>. They are based on a representative selection of focus areas and a sample of supporting information provided by the TEO under review or independently accessed by NZQA. As such, the report's findings offer a guide to the relative quality of the TEO at the time of the EER in the light of the known evidence, and the likelihood that this level of quality will continue.

For the same reason, these findings are always limited in scope. They are derived from selections and samples evaluated at a point in time. The supporting methodology is not designed to:

- *Identify organisational fraud²*
- *Provide comprehensive coverage of all programmes within a TEO, or of all relevant evidence sources*

Predict the outcome of other reviews of the same TEO which, by posing different questions or examining different information, could reasonably arrive at different conclusions.

² NZQA and the Tertiary Education Commission (TEC) comprehensively monitor risk in the tertiary education sector through a range of other mechanisms. When fraud, or any other serious risk factor, has been confirmed, corrective action is taken as a matter of urgency.

Summary of Results

Statements of confidence on educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

NZQA is **Highly Confident** in the educational performance and **Highly Confident** in the capability in self-assessment of NZMA.

Since the previous EER, NZMA has continued to perform well as reflected by:

- Strong course pass rates and employment or other positive outcomes occurring for students and graduates, and parity of achievement across groups (see Findings 1.1).
- Students gain skills, attributes and qualifications towards sectors where there is known demand for employment. Outcomes into employment are strong (as outlined under Findings 1.2) and additional resources have been added for identifying work opportunities and gathering useful information on graduate destinations.
- Priority group learners (Māori, Pasifika, students under 25) are very well supported, and achievement across all student groups is quite consistent over time when expressed through TEC educational performance indicator data. Course completion rates are consistently around 80 per cent overall, and progression from lower to higher-level programmes is also common.
- The professional, strategic and supportive PTE management encourages growth in staff, and innovation by staff.
- NZMA maintains compliance with NZQA rules and regulations, including updating their programme portfolio and actively engaging in all required quality assurance processes.
- NZMA is continuing to meet TEC funding requirements which reflect government tertiary education goals.
- The PTE has been successfully managing the growth in student numbers since the previous EER, with notable and ongoing investment in facilities, staffing and resources such as information technology and professional development.
- The PTE has introduced initiatives such as a Dual Pathways programme with six secondary schools; collaboration and review of careers development benchmarks with a government agency; and post-placement support once students enter employment.
- There have been numerous refinements and improvements to processes arising from planning and reviews. The quality of data and other information relating to self-assessment more broadly is consistently high and well embedded across the organisation.

At NZMA the recruitment, induction and teaching of students is well planned and effective. Policies and procedures minimise barriers for students, and the campus environments and services are designed to enhance a sense of professional development through high standards, with the intention of matching workplace requirements. The values of NZMA, which were co-constructed with staff, are used as a common point of reference to evaluate activities and manage performance.³ Where the performance of individuals (be they staff or students) falters, supportive but clear processes and sanctions are used to manage and improve the situation. In cases where quality and/or compliance has been tested by outside agencies (such as weaknesses in some external moderation samples, student visa approval rates, or external audits), NZMA responds constructively and promptly to fully understand and address issues in a non-reactive way.

As well as the typical, cyclical and planned self-assessment activities of a TEO at this scale (which include management-level planning, performance appraisal, staff forums, online surveys, structured tutor observation, advisory groups, etc), the evaluators noted numerous one-off projects occurring at various levels of the organisation. These are positive, illustrate staff ownership of review, and in numerous cases were linked to changes and modifications to the way work is done. Numerous NZMA staff are involved in various forms of applied research, both formally and informally. They are encouraged to do so, and this adds significantly to the provider's reflection on and knowledge of their own performance as this work is shared and discussed across teams. Self-assessment practices are robust, coverage is broad, and is well embedded across NZMA.

Most importantly, NZMA is clearly meeting and matching the needs of many learners across multiple sites in relation to their personal development and their goals for transition to sustainable employment. Also meriting mention is the care shown around the welfare needs of all students, including internationals: free breakfasts, suitable clothing, transportation in some cases, and helping to find accommodation when students face homelessness. All of these are pressing concerns for many among the NZMA domestic student cohort, in South Auckland in particular. NZMA is at a scale and has internal resources and networks among industry and social agencies which very clearly contribute to positive outcomes.

³ NZMA values 'quality, innovation, passion, respect, integrity'.

Findings⁴

1.1 How well do students achieve?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

NZMA students achieve very well. Achievement patterns over recent years indicate high levels of parity across priority groups, and programme relevance and content.

NZMA closely monitors student progress and achievement on a student-by-student, programme, campus and PTE-wide basis. Increasing use of information technology systems – which capture day-to-day matters such as non-attendance or students' particular challenges and goals – are used to monitor progress and bring attention to support needs. This information is updated at least weekly. Regional and campus managers have access to a wider field of parameters including targets and funder expectations which are monitored and reported to the leadership group. These processes – coupled with year-on-year comparisons, and comparisons with the PTE sector using the TEC educational performance indicators – provide the chief executive and governance with a comprehensive view of pass rates and any trends of concern (see Tables 1 and 2). A notable example of this are the improvements to recruitment and pastoral care based on information gathered and analysed around withdrawn students.

Notable features of the achievement data presented in Table 1 below include:

- The high numbers of Māori (1,249 in 2016) and Pasifika (989 in 2016) students and their pass rates are on a par with non-Māori/Pasifika students. For 2014-2016, course completions for students identifying as Māori averaged 86 per cent, while Pasifika were 85 per cent and 'non-Māori' 88 per cent. Qualification completions show a similar pattern.⁵
- 70 per cent (2,741) of all students enrolled were in the government's under-25 priority group in 2016. Many of these were previously not in employment, education or training.
- A decline in 2016 course and qualification completions rates is attributed to TEC rule changes in reporting⁶ and a change in the student profile in a context

⁴ The findings in this report are derived using a standard process and are based on a targeted sample of the organisation's activities.

⁵ All funding sources combined.

⁶ As confirmed by the TEC.

of high employment. Students with more complex social challenges or learning needs are being enrolled and are succeeding, which is positive.

- The sizeable increase in domestic student numbers has not negatively affected course pass rates. The same can be said of international students, although they enrol with a very different educational background. Twice as many international students are male as female, the reverse of the composition of domestic students.
- Variability in pass rates for the Cookery qualification are affected by domestic student numbers changing from year to year, but international student pass rates are more consistent.

Table 1. Course and qualification completions 2013-2016

	2013	2014	2015	2016
Number of students enrolled	2,264	2,190	1,900	3,940
All programmes - course (and qualification) completions*	89% (102%)	89% (96%)	92% (91%)	82% (83%)
Domestic students - course completions**				
Food and Beverage (including some Youth Guarantee learners)	93%	91%	94%	86%
Diploma in Applied Management (Level 7)	n/a	n/a	n/a	58% (3 students)
Diploma in Professional Cookery (Level 5)	100%	44%	78%	85%
Māori course completion (EFTS)	88% (612)	90% (763)	92% (618)	81% (712)
Pasifika course completion (EFTS)	89% (422)	88% (459)	92% (411)	79% (578)
International students				
All programmes - course completions**	98%	93%	95%	96%

Source: TEC single data return confirmed reporting* (or NZMA data**)

Not visible through this data, but important in both contributing to and interpreting it, are the consistent percentage pass rates year-on-year, which may be linked to intensive interview and acceptance processes ('right student on right programme'). The pathway many students (53 per cent in 2016) follow from lower-level 20-week programmes to higher-level qualifications also contributes.

Where students do not have a suitable level of literacy to undertake an entry-level programme (as determined by an in-house assessment), they are referred to a partner organisation with suitable preparatory programmes. This may also play a part in maintaining strong pass rates.

Students are informed of pathways with good information (including helpful graphics) on how each qualification relates to the workplace, and what roles become available with higher qualifications and on-job experience over time.

These are important motivational factors, also supporting the pass rates, given that NZMA needs assessment has determined that students want vocational skills and qualifications for sustainable, local employment.

The programme portfolio on offer is relevant to the Auckland and Waikato labour markets (the focus areas for this evaluation) in particular. Programmes are work-integrated wherever possible, with students' involvement ranging from simulated work environments such as on-campus cafes, through to work experience and internships, depending on the programme level. The links between industry and NZMA careers staff and workplaces, advisory groups and internship or work experience coordinators are active, ongoing and well documented and very effective.

Youth Guarantee student performance is among the highest in the country. This is mainly due to the individual attention and care given to each student and the holistic support systems of the organisation, enhanced by the dedication of all staff – academic and non-academic.

Table 2. Trends in completion rates 2013-2016 (Youth Guarantee-funded learners)

Group*	2013	2014	2015	2016
Number of students	129	146	134	589
Course (and qualification) completions	81% (98%)	85% (91%)	94% (96%)	75% (76%)
Students under-25 course completion (EFTS)**	81% (80)	85% (99)	94% (96)	75% (303)
Māori students course completion (EFTS)**	76% (40)	80% (45)	92% (49)	73% (107)
Pasifika students course completion (EFTS)**	85% (31)	78% (30)	90% (21)	73% (79)

*Some students may be included in more than one priority group category, limiting comparability of performance between the three groups.

**Equivalent full-time students enrolled shown in brackets.

1.2 What is the value of the outcomes for key stakeholders, including students?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

Students, whānau, employers and the government gain excellent value from the programmes delivered by NZMA. This value can be summarised as new skills and enhanced personal attributes, qualifications and opportunities to gain programme-relevant employment, especially for students who might otherwise have been disengaged. The international students gain value by adding to their qualifications through majoring in a management-related area and gaining more understanding of New Zealand business. They valued their internship with local businesses. However, although their employment outcomes are high, it is less clear how sustainable that employment is and, more importantly (to the graduates), whether it links to their goals of gaining work rights and/or residency.

Knowledge of this value is built from a comprehensive interview process to understand students' needs, through to well-resourced follow-up to establish and quantify the value of the outcomes. NZMA collates 'positive graduate destination outcomes' 12 months post-study which include employment and further study, either with NZMA or elsewhere. These show that between 70 and 96 per cent of graduates gain employment (with a very high proportion of graduates contacted). There has been a steady increase in positive outcomes since the previous EER.⁷ NZMA has a reasonably full picture of graduate destinations, reliable direct contact data, and a well-documented pattern of performance year-on-year. NZMA collects data about graduates' employment and the extent to which it aligns with the vocational content and quality of the programme in terms of employment type.

At entry, NZMA domestic students represent a group that has not been well served or has otherwise been unsuccessful in formal education and/or employment. For example, in 2016 over 1,000 domestic students studying at level 2 and 3 were tested for literacy and numeracy using the adult assessment test. Of these, 15 per cent achieved at the lowest steps, 1 and 2 of the 6-step scale.

NZMA data also indicates that well over 30 per cent of these students had no secondary school qualifications, and 37 per cent were beneficiaries or otherwise unemployed prior to enrolment. A literacy and numeracy-themed focus group for tutors in 2016 noted that some 'tutors commented that punctuation and spelling were issues at all levels and that comprehension is sometimes a problem [even] at level 5'. The importance of effectively embedding literacy and numeracy development within vocational programmes, which is an NZMA focus, is highlighted

⁷ 'Positive graduate destination outcomes' for 2017 year to date: international 96 per cent; New Zealand European 71 per cent; Māori 80 per cent; Pasifika 77 per cent; other domestic 70 per cent.

here, as is student need. The rates of post-study employment, and graduates with a qualification in an area with work opportunities, are pointers towards students improving their wellbeing and applying their new knowledge and skills in positive ways.

Of the 2016 student intake, 83 per cent left NZMA with a qualification suitable for entry level or higher employment across a range of industries. Careers staff brokered nearly 5,000 job placements, of which 29 per cent were permanent, full-time positions. The seventh of eight strategic focus areas in the NZMA's set of guiding values and goals is 'creating pathways to sustainable employment'. The human resources to achieve this are well embedded, and activities such as the large-scale careers expo (to which South Auckland secondary schools are also invited, and around 100 employers actively recruit staff on that day) complement a well-refined recruitment and acceptance process. Examples of follow-up communications with non-completing or poorly attending students showed considerable efforts in re-engaging students and providing catch-up classes or additional assessments within the programme's scheduled timeframe. This no doubt contributes to the pass rates and outcomes.

Other examples of value include data from the health-related programme on the Auckland campus. This shows strong rates of progression into higher-level training including university and institute of technology/polytechnic programmes, such as nursing and midwifery, and course-relevant employment. Examples of valuable outcomes from the simulated employment and work experience within some programmes include call centre students doing fundraising for charities and hospitality students serving at charitable events or assisting projects that provide school lunches to lower-decile school students.

NZMA has staff dedicated to following up graduates to obtain reliable data on employment outcomes. This is most often done by phone, email or social media. NZMA has comprehensive, fully analysed data for all its programmes including the focus area programmes for 2014-2017. Campus and programme-level analysis also occurs. Focus area programmes all perform well, with the high demand for employees in the hospitality sector clearly apparent. NZMA also commissioned a leading economics consultancy to develop a fuller picture of the social return to taxpayers of their programme in monetary terms. Formative findings and comparisons drawn from other countries are promising, but this work is still in progress. NZMA has a strong understanding of student and stakeholder needs. This is woven into the programme design and wider support, leading to valued outcomes for many.

1.3 How well do programme design and delivery, including learning and assessment activities, match the needs of students and other relevant stakeholders?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

NZMA programmes are well designed and delivered effectively and have the following common characteristics:

- Opportunities for work-integrated learning range from on-campus work experience (including realistic simulations in cafés and call centres for example) to industry work experience including short-term paid work and longer duration internships. This approach leads to work-readiness and high employment outcomes.
- There are excellent resources for students to develop applied skills and confidence: fully equipped training kitchens and cafes with multiple barista machines, cash registers and associated equipment and furnishings. NZMA encourages on-site events and functions to give students the opportunity to apply their learning in 'industry-like' settings. Teamwork, communication, hygiene and personal presentation and other soft skills are embedded in the training.
- NZMA pays attention to language, culture and wellbeing as a natural part of the programme delivery. Since the previous EER, additional staff have been added to the academic quality team, and a three-person literacy and numeracy team was created. 'In-house' delivery of the National Certificate in Adult Literacy and Numeracy Education is now occurring, ensuring a better match with NZMA needs. These staff groups – and the learning development adviser and staff who provide technical support through the various information technology platforms in active use – contribute to comprehensive, timely monitoring and review of student achievement and programme performance over time.

All programmes and all tutors are involved in a documented internal moderation system, which includes checking of all marking for new tutors (who are trained and certified in assessment practice and moderation as part of induction where required) and samples of marked work by all other markers. All assessment tasks are internally pre-moderated by an academic quality assurance staff member on each campus, and overall external moderation is centrally coordinated. Results of moderation with both NZQA and industry training organisations are largely positive, and the process of engaging with these systems and making changes as a response to post-moderation feedback is well documented. Online continuous improvement forms are used to update assessment materials. These are robust processes, assuring the quality of assessment.

Career preparation, guidance⁸ and tools are all well embedded and resourced, and this clearly supports programme development, work integration and NZMA knowledge of trends and needs across a broad range of industries. Some powerful examples of well-constructed pathways into employment at hotels across New Zealand and airport lounges were noted within the related focus areas.

1.4 How effectively are students supported and involved in their learning?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

A number of key features – which are well planned, suitably documented, understood by staff and in operation across campuses – support a view that NZMA students are very effectively supported and involved in their learning. There is some attrition from programmes; some students drop out and some of these reportedly return later, but on the whole the achievement data, employment outcomes and student survey results indicate excellent engagement.

NZMA produced a statement of intent (2017-2020) with the goal of Māori and Pasifika parity of achievement with other student groups. This document has a detailed implementation plan which is well advanced and was reflected in staff and student interviews. Students interviewed during this evaluation provided in-depth accounts of how staff support and involve them in their programmes of study, as well as how students support each other to succeed. Students valued the well-planned, interactive programmes and the relationships they have with the tutors. Scheduled online anonymous surveys give students regular opportunities to provide feedback on their experience and the teaching. Evidence from these is positive. There have been few concerns or complaints, and the process for students to raise issues is clearly laid out in handbooks and on notice boards.

Additional pastoral support is provided alongside students' programmes including mental health and budgeting advice.⁹ A sound and constantly reviewed induction

⁸ 'Evidence collected demonstrates NZMA predominantly sits within assessment statements 'Consolidating effectiveness' and 'Highly Effective' when measured against the dimensions... Organisation engagement, Student engagement and Employer and Industry Engagement [within the Careers NZ Career Development Benchmarks]. While NZMA is performing well against most statements in Organisation Engagement, there are a few areas where further improvement can be made in relation to policy, and specific strategies for Māori and Pasifika students'. (Source: NZMA review)

⁹ Provided through the Phoenix Programme developed by NZMA, involving internal staff and external agencies and speakers.

process supports international students on arrival, and they benefit from their interactions with domestic students who are on the same campus and may often be on the same programme. Some students choose to participate in kapa haka and cultural groups on campus, and opportunities for performance and personal development are provided.¹⁰ Qualified counsellors are available to students on each campus. Student interviews revealed a complex range of needs and aspirations being well met by staff. Individual learning plans are created with student input, and progress reports on the intranet allow staff and students (with controlled access) real-time graphical information on a student's progress. These are very useful tools. NZMA responds constructively to the wellbeing needs of their students and supports an inclusive environment.

Mandatory, company-supported professional development (for all tutors on programmes at level 2 and 3) includes adult education qualifications. Processes for assisting students to understand and use the results of the assessment tool for adult literacy, and strategies to support literacy and numeracy development within programmes, are well embedded. Staff interviewed by the evaluators were able to confidently describe the links between professional development, theory and practice in supporting students and maintaining an environment where students were very active and engaged. Many students are enrolled because of the experience their friends or family members had at NZMA.

1.5 How effective are governance and management in supporting educational achievement?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

NZMA management, with the oversight and support of their successive governance groups, has performed very convincingly in supporting educational achievement since the previous EER. The main points leading to these ratings are:

- The steady growth in student numbers since the previous EER has been well managed, with commensurate investment in facilities, staffing and resources such as information technology and professional development. The growth in international students (962 in 2016 compared with 368 in 2013) has been appropriately managed (the issue of Immigration New Zealand visa approvals noted), with some diversity of source nations and strong outcomes into employment.

¹⁰ In 2016 NZMA introduced a future leaders mentoring programmes designed for Māori and Pasifika students – Ngā Kaiarahi o mua and Ama taki loa.

- During this period, NZMA staff have also participated with NZQA and others in the redesign of qualifications and development of new programmes. This programme development has been informed by well-documented interactions with a diverse range of businesses in both formal advisory meetings and through staff visits to workplaces. Other aspects of community liaison contribute to linking NZMA to other stakeholders such as schools, community groups, police, corrections and others.
- Effective adoption and use of new technologies strengthens processes (e.g. centralised control of assessment materials and programme documentation on an intranet) and/or provide timely, accurate data for monitoring (e.g. daily attendance by student and campus; progress through course by student and programme; likely course and qualification completion rates).
- Investment in high-quality facilities supports students' learning, the quality of teaching, and the accommodation of allied services (such as employment and careers advisors who are an important component of the programme delivery model). Examples include the new campus at Sylvia Park, the refurbished Otahuhu campus, and an improved site for the city campus. These all reflect significant planning, investment and effective project planning and delivery.
- All campuses visited adopt similar enrolment and pastoral care strategies and curricula. They also participate in quality assurance activities such as teacher development and moderation in similar ways, increasing consistency across sites.
- The pending construction of a trades-related campus in South Auckland, along with joining the Māori Pasifika Trades Training Auckland Consortium, reflects innovation and responsiveness to community, industry and funder needs.
- NZMA invests in staff professional development and salaries. Staff are treated as valued professionals. Their views are actively sought, informally and formally. Professional development is mandated and encouraged, and is occurring throughout the organisation. Resourcing of this has increased since the previous EER. The leadership programme and in-house capacity-building to embed literacy and numeracy¹¹ are highly effective ways of meeting stakeholder and student needs. Teaching staff interviewed demonstrated very clear understanding of how embedding is occurring on their programmes at level 2 and 3. Achievement data around improvements in students' capability supports this view.

The findings in 1.1 and 1.2 above outline areas where self-assessment at all levels of the organisation is being effectively used to understand student needs and goals, monitor progress, and quantify outcomes. These processes are coupled with clear lines of accountability for meeting set goals. Examples of this range from the

¹¹ Deemed as 'mature' practices based on TEC parameters.

investment plan, the NZMA strategic plan, the chief executive's performance objectives and monitoring of these at governance level, through to five-weekly tutor performance dashboards which are monitored (and signed off) by the tutor and their line manager.

NZMA is an increasingly data-rich organisation, and the evaluators heard of benefits from being part of the wider ACG group – financial, information technology and property services for example. These components support educational achievement and contribute to NZQA's confidence looking forward.

1.6 How effectively are important compliance accountabilities managed?

The rating for performance in relation to this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this key evaluation question is **Excellent**.

NZMA governance, management, registry and quality teams are effectively managing the PTE's important compliance accountabilities. Compliance management processes are robust, as demonstrated by responses to the programme hours/credits questions raised across the sector in 2015¹² and responses to NZQA's Rule 18 English language testing changes. NZMA accepts only IELTS (International English Language Testing System) or Pearson tests from overseas applicants and uses a Category 1 PTE within the ACG group for any on-shore testing. A sample check of the PTE's web-based quality management system showed a well-administered process for updating and changing processes as policy requirements change.

Management clearly understands and prioritises the importance of maintaining high levels of compliance with the requirements of the TEC and NZQA. This is a documented and monitored component of their goals. Risk management monitoring and reporting is included in communications between NZMA and ACG, and includes relevant commentary on the implications of rule changes and policy trends that may have an impact on future decision-making. There is suitable in-house expertise and academic quality resources within the PTE. The TEC audit report indicates compliance in relation to enrolment and academic records, as well as funding conditions, with only a few occurrences requiring correction.

Code of Practice review processes are suitable in that they occur at least annually, are fully documented and involve a range of staff involved with international students. In 2017 they included a collaborative exercise with a focus on the

¹² As a result of this audit, changes were made to three Early Childhood Education programmes to adjust programme hours to better align directed and self-directed learning hours with approval. New programmes have been approved to replace these since then. Self-directed learning time has been closely examined to ensure it is used appropriately.

intended outcomes of the revised code. Staff with key roles are knowledgeable about the code, and engage in workshops, conferences and seminars relating to the code. The focus area International Student Support and Wellbeing is rated as 'excellent' in this evaluation. NZMA is also taking concrete steps to change their international recruiting to correct the approval rate concern raised by Immigration New Zealand and NZQA. The new, limited number of offshore recruiters were recently given an orientation to the code as part of this change process.

Over the past couple of years NZMA has imposed sanctions for plagiarism and other academic misconduct. An incident of poor practice by a tutor in relation to assessments involving 20 students was identified by management who responded well, requiring re-assessment of students and performance management of that staff member. These matters were communicated to both the TEC and NZQA. Policies and procedures detailed in applications to NZQA and administered within the PTE's quality management system are actively used.

NZMA has in some cases discontinued using certain workplaces where it was deemed students were at risk of being exploited. This information was passed on to the relevant authorities. Evidence presented also shows that poor performing overseas agents have had their contracts with NZMA cancelled, and in at least one instance Immigration New Zealand was notified of an agent presenting fraudulent student documentation. There is evidence that NZMA's practices are legal and ethical, and that the PTE requires the same of organisations they work with.

Focus Areas

This section reports significant findings in each focus area, not already covered in Part 1.

2.1 Focus area: International Student Support and Wellbeing

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

2.2 Focus area: Food and Beverage Service (comprising New Zealand Certificate in Food and Beverage Service (Level 3 and 4))

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

2.3 Focus area: Diploma in Professional Cookery (Level 5)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

2.4 Focus area: Youth Guarantee learners

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Excellent**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Excellent**.

2.5 Focus area: Diploma in Applied Management (Level 7)

The rating in this focus area for educational performance is **Good**.

The rating for capability in self-assessment for this focus area is **Good**.

As was reflected in the 2016 EER of the previous PTE in the ACG group offering this programme (NZCC, which previously delivered the programme but has now been incorporated into NZMA), this programme continues to perform well. The improved environment at the new Auckland campus is noted, as are the high-level qualifications of the research-active staff. The international students enrolled value the supportive learning environment and the professional standing of their teachers and the examples and case studies used. The opportunity to participate in an internship, which is well structured and monitored for quality, is a positive feature.

Final Report

Although moderation of each event occurs on a schedule, it was not clear that the overall view of assessment quality and coverage at programme level was known. Although approved by NZQA at the time of programme approval, but reportedly seldom used, the option of a third assessment (with a grade penalty) should be reviewed. The spread of classes across a teaching week is educationally sound. Although plagiarism controls and sanctions have been applied, this is an area that may warrant further analysis by management and staff based on interviews with the evaluators and the weight of evidence. The processes as described sounded slightly dated. A sample of 13 students' pre-entry English test results (verified IELTS and Pearson transcripts) showed that all met the stated entry criteria.

The ratings for this focus area reflect the less convincing evidence on the educational 'value add' of the programme for the international students enrolled (most of whom reportedly have undergraduate qualifications from their country of origin and use the programme as a pathway to a work rights visa), and some caution around the overall assessment design (see recommendations below).

Recommendations

NZQA recommends that NZMA:

- Conduct an in-depth analysis of each assessment event within the Diploma in Applied Management to ensure that each is appropriate to the level of the course and qualification being assessed, and cumulatively reflect the intended graduate profile at level 7.
- Ensure that all interns are visited regularly in their workplace (as intended by the design of the course), and that reporting of this to management is comprehensive and auditable.
- Undertake further analysis and measurement of the extent to which graduates' employment aligns with the vocational content and quality of the respective programme in terms of employment type.

Appendix

Regulatory basis for external evaluation and review

External evaluation and review is conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013, which are made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

Self-assessment and participation in external evaluation and review are requirements for maintaining accreditation to provide an approved programme for all TEOs other than universities. The requirements are set through the NZQF Programme Approval and Accreditation Rules 2013, which are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

In addition, the Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 require registered private training establishments to undertake self-assessment and participate in external evaluation and review, in accordance with the External Evaluation and Review Rules (EER) 2013, as a condition of maintaining registration. The Private Training Establishment Registration Rules 2013 are also made by NZQA under section 253 of the Education Act 1989 and approved by the NZQA Board and the Minister for Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment.

NZQA is responsible for ensuring non-university TEOs continue to comply with the rules after the initial granting of approval and accreditation of programmes and/or registration. The New Zealand Vice-Chancellors' Committee (NZVCC) has statutory responsibility for compliance by universities.

This report reflects the findings and conclusions of the external evaluation and review process, conducted according to the External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013.

The report identifies strengths and areas for improvement in terms of the organisation's educational performance and capability in self-assessment.

External evaluation and review reports are one contributing piece of information in determining future funding decisions where the organisation is a funded TEO subject to an investment plan agreed with the Tertiary Education Commission.

External evaluation and review reports are public information and are available from the NZQA website (www.nzqa.govt.nz).

The External Evaluation and Review (EER) Rules 2013 are available at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/assets/About-us/Our-role/Rules/EER-Rules.pdf>, while information about the conduct and methodology for external evaluation and review can be found at <http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/providers-partners/external-evaluation-and-review/policy-and-guidelines-eer/introduction/>.

NZQA

Ph 0800 697 296

E qaadmin@nzqa.govt.nz

www.nzqa.govt.nz