

This motion sheet is a **starting point** for further research into this subject. There are articles linked throughout to explore the issue in more depth as well as statistics to support arguments. Below are **three example arguments** for sides proposition and opposition. Feel free to use these as a starting point for your speeches or develop your own ideas through independent research!

WHAT IS THIS MOTION ABOUT?

This debate is centred around the concept of 'Shifting the Power'. It's all about who is best suited to deliver aid to those most in need. When discussing aid, the most familiar form for many people is organisations like Children in Need, Comic Relief, and Water Aid.

While some of these organisations do offer aid to those in need in the UK, many also operate in disadvantaged areas overseas. This debate focuses on the main question of who is best placed to organise and distribute aid internationally.

The 'traditional' method of delivering aid relies on foreign governments, charities and NGOs (non-government organisations) organising and distributing aid through initiatives set up by international experts who control how much funding is given to what project.

The 'Shifting the Power' model focuses on providing local charities and organisations with funding and resources to create and sustain their **own** initiatives and projects based on what they see as issues in their own communities.

Key Definitions:

International Aid - support given by an external source to a community in need, often by NGOs (non-governmental organisations) or non-profit organisations.

Effective - has the greatest impact, and most success in meeting the needs of local communities. **Local Communities -** the groups of people who are directly affected by the issues international aid aims to address.

Sustainability - the ability of the projects and initiatives set-up to continue delivering benefits over the long term without relying indefinitely on external support.





PROPOSITION ARGUMENTS

01 Local organisations know what problems people face the most in their communities

Local organisations are able to design and carry-out projects and initiatives that tackle issues they feel are most important in their communities. They live and operate within the area they work with and witness the changes in their local society first-hand. Because of their hands-on understanding of the dynamics within their communities, they are able to decide which projects would help their community the most. For example, in 2020 ChildConnect Ghana was able to adapt their usual projects from focussing on bridging the educational gap for all children in Ghana, to focussing more on COVID-19 relief for local communities most in need of resources and support.

https://childconnectghana.wordpress.com/projects/

02 Aid delivered by local communities encourages long-term sustainability

By providing local community organisations with the knowledge, tools and funding to either create or improve existing projects, it encourages a more sustainable future. Historically, having a foreign organisation come into the community, set up a project and then leave (sometimes without setting up a long-term plan to carry the project out), often led to projects falling short of meeting their target. On the other hand, providing local community organisations with the resources they need to execute their project within the community would lead to better and longer-lasting results.

Real change doesn't happen overnight, and having the people in charge of the project physically existing within the community allows for the project to develop and change when the needs of the people it's targeting develop and change.





03 Local community-driven aid challenges harmful stereotypes

Charities have been criticised in the past for sending wealthy celebrity ambassadors to disadvantaged communities overseas to film short clips for televised events. Foreign Secretary David Lammey described this as promoting the phenomenon of a 'white savour', and criticised Comic Relief for sending Stacey Dooley to make a documentary in Uganda.

The 'white saviour complex' refers to a person from the Global North, like the UK, usually from a privileged position, like a celebrity, going to disadvantaged areas to support existing projects or to set up a project initially.

Recently, this has been criticised for sustaining the idea that disadvantaged communities cannot help themselves. It promotes the colonial-based idea that it must be up to the Global North to implement any real change or 'improvement' in disadvantaged areas. By funding and promoting community-driven aid projects, it shows that no matter where you are from or where you live, you are capable of making real change.



https://www.theguardian.com/tv-and-radio/2019/may/24/stacey-dooley-comic-relief-row-david-lammy-white-saviour



https://www.theguardian.com/tv-and-radio/2020/oct/27/comic-relief-stops-sending-celebrities-to-african-countries



https://www.theguardian.com/tvand-radio/2019/feb/28/davidlammy-stacey-dooley-comic-reliefwhite-saviour-row-uganda-rednose-day-film





OPPOSITION ARGUMENTS

01 Larger scale organisations have access to experts from all over the world

Organisations such as UNICEF are a lot larger in scale than many community-driven organisations. They can access a wealth of knowledge from world-leading experts in their fields. This allows projects to be designed with intensive and specific aims and research. These experts are people with experience in dealing with the problems that face many communities and often have experience in leading successful local projects.

Furthermore, the experts involved in organisations like UNICEF have a wide range of expertise, from technology and science, to humanitarian work. By engaging with people from different backgrounds, the projects developed will address a wider range of challenges and opportunities.

https://www.unicef.org/media/experts

02 International organisations are trusted by donors

Donors often trust international organisations like Comic Relief because they are believed to be more capable, with stronger systems compared to local initiatives. These organisations are believed to have the expertise and infrastructure necessary to manage large-scale projects effectively, while minimising risks such as corruption or inefficiency. This perception of credibility and professionalism fosters greater donor confidence, encouraging more substantial contributions. As a result, international organisations can attract and manage significant levels of funding, allowing them to support a broad range of impactful projects worldwide. For example, Red Nose Day is a well-known televised event shown on the BBC nationwide. in 2024, over £40 million was raised for Comic Relief, with many donations coming from the general public who know and trust Comic Relief.

https://www.bbc.co.uk/newsround/68584604





03 International fundraising organisations support local initiatives anyway

Organisations such as ActionAid support the initiatives and projects set in place by local community organisations. This also means that a wider range of projects can be funded and supported. For example, ActionAid supports many different organisations with different purposes, from projects aimed at improving food quality and quantity, to initiatives aimed at tackling violence against women. These international organisations are able to broaden the reach that they have – not just focusing on a single project. People aren't only affected by one issue at a time, and these types of organisations provide larger-scale relief.

https://www.actionaid.org.uk/our-work/womens-rights/our-local-initiatives

FURTHER RESEARCH

Development & Aid - a help or a hinderence?

https://www.bbc.co.uk/bitesize/guides/zxw2cwx/revision/6

Types of aid

https://www.bbc.co.uk/bitesize/guides/z3spj6f/revision/4

International Aid: Types and Impact

https://youtu.be/qoXKhEDtYPg?si=B2zifwY8WYcAfAmm

About Aid Agency

https://kids.britannica.com/kids/article/aid-agency/476217

About Foreign Aid

https://kids.britannica.com/students/article/foreign-aid/274381

